

# Choral Reviews

Steven Grives, editor <[sgrives@depaul.edu](mailto:sgrives@depaul.edu)>

## Requiem, Op. 48

Gabriel Fauré (1845-1924: 1900/1)  
ed. Marc Rigaudière (2005)  
SATTBB, soprano and baritone soloists,  
organ, orchestra (36)



Carus 27.312

**e-address:** [www.carus-verlag.com](http://www.carus-verlag.com)

- Vocal Score: 27.312/03, 9.50€ (NOTE:  
The Choral Score, 27.312/05 (3.90€),  
does not have a piano reduction.)

- Instrumental Accompaniment:  
27.312/19, 167€

(2.0.2.2/4.2.3.0, timp, hp, org, str—10  
violin, 4 viola 1, 4 viola 2, 4 cello 1, 4 cello  
2, 4 bass) (NOTE: The string and organ  
parts are also sold individually and can  
be used with the wind and harp parts,  
which are sold together in one packet.)

- Full Score: 27.312/00, 56€

**score:** <http://www.carus-verlag.com/images-intern/medien/20/2731200/2731200n.gif>

**text:** sacred, Latin: requiem mass  
[www.requiemsurvey.org/latintext.php](http://www.requiemsurvey.org/latintext.php)

The last several decades have seen a resurgence in scholarship regarding Fauré's *Requiem*. The work's evolution spanned more than two decades, and researchers strive to trace its stages from early sketches to intermediary performances to premiere/publication.

Americans may be most familiar with the chamber orchestra (1893) edition by John Rutter published by Oxford/Hinshaw in 1983–1984, but several editions have been created since. Musicologist Marc Rigaudière (University Paul Verlaine, Metz) has edited a new score for Carus. Published in 2005, this score returns to the final full orchestra version of 1900 (a history of three "phases" of the work's composition are outlined in the score's Foreword). A chamber orchestration, such as that present in Rutter's score, has been championed as the more authentic version; however, editions of earlier versions must



rely on deciphering layers of accretions in manuscripts and contend with the fact that the complete manuscripts of the *Offertoire*, *Pie Jesu*, and *Libera* movements are missing. As Fauré himself did conduct the world premiere performance of the fully orchestrated version that was consequently published by Hamelle in 1900–1901, this final 1900 version is quite easy to define.

The full orchestral version was almost certainly written at the request of the publisher since, at the time, a standard orchestration of the work would be more marketable than the pared down version performed at Fauré's church (whether Fauré was the sole creator of this full orchestration still remains a question). As acknowledged by the composer, this original publica-

tion was full of faults—"I've also asked him [Hamelle] to send you another two scores [of *Requiem*] reduced for piano, in addition. Unfortunately those little scores are full of mistakes!" (Letter to Eugène Ysaÿe, [October 1900]) The mistakes were considered sufficiently significant to require a corrected score to be published in February 1901 (Fauré's vocal score with corrections has been preserved and is one of the sources to this edition). However, many mistakes still remain in the Hamelle print, which is the edition reprinted by several publishers including Kalmus and Luck's, and require careful editing when the edition is used for performance.

Rather than attempt to recreate and arrange an earlier version, this new edition serves more as a diplomatic transcription of the published version using a significant number of primary and secondary sources; these are conveniently spelled out in the Critical Notes, as are the nearly measure by measure notes explaining editorial decisions. This score does prioritize the 1900–1901 publications over the manuscripts other editors have used as the basis of the chamber versions. In addition, Rigaudière consulted Nadia Boulanger's score (autographed by Fauré) for her markings and corrections. A disciple of Fauré, Boulanger not only conducted this work but also recorded it in 1948 (coincidentally with Maurice Duruflé at the organ) and 1968. In his review of this edition in *Choir & Organ* (March-April 2007), Roger Nichols questioned Rigaudière's decision to preserve the unusual final harmony—the A<sup>2</sup> sus-

# Choral Reviews

tained by the choral basses results in a second inversion chord. However, even though the manuscript has a sustained  $D^2$  in the organ pedal and contrabasses, this is the ending offered in the original Hamelle publication and preserved in Boulanger's score.

Primarily, this full orchestra edition is valuable for its richer musical texture. In the Preface to his edition, Rutter labels the bassoons and trumpets as "entirely dispensable" and two of the horns and the timpani "dispensable" while also suggesting that other instruments can be omitted from particular movements, removing doubled lines. Although such decisions can save space and money they can also take away from the composer's intentions regarding instrumental color.

The most striking orchestration "change" in Rigaudière's edition might be the assignment of the famous violin solo from the Sanctus to all the violins (a practice which continues in the *In Paradisum* movement). This is a decision Fauré himself celebrated, thereby

demonstrating a clear preference for contrasting instrumental colors—"You'll see, after all those violas, how angelic the violins sound in the *Sanctus*!!!" (Letter to Eugene Ysaÿe, [October 1900])

Other differences include the use of flutes and clarinets in the *Pie Jesu* (adding their more "celestial" color) and three trombones in the *Libera me* (not unlike Mozart's use of three trombones to represent damnation at the end of *Don Giovanni*). Unlike Rutter's edition, the full orchestra version also includes organ registrations, and, whereas in the chamber edition the organ plays throughout the piece like a continuo instrument, in the full orchestra version, there are moments, such as the very dramatic opening of the piece, where the organ does not play and creates a contrasting color when it does enter, such as in the subsequent gentle *Andante moderato* section.

Other than the original Hamelle publication, additional noteworthy full orchestra performing editions include Jean-Michel Nectoux's 1998 edition by Hamelle and Christina M. Stahl and Michael Stegemann's 2011 edition published by Bärenreiter (as part of the complete works). Hans Ryschawy of Carus particularly levels criticism at the edition by the Fauré scholar Nectoux:

He [Nectoux] has made some editorial decisions which I regard as doubtful with regard to practices followed in modern scholarly editions. Our edition makes a clear distinction between the readings of the sources and but a very few editorial additions. The result is a version without the note errors of the original though clearly editorial decisions influenced some of the outcomes. (E-mail to the author, September 24, 2008).

Carus has created very clean scores and parts at a very reasonable price. In

the likely case that your library already has vocal scores, they would be compatible with these parts with a few text underlay and rhythmic changes in the vocal lines. However, this edition has only measure numbers and no rehearsal letters whereas some vocal scores (using the original plates) may have only rehearsal letters. The instrumental parts are well laid out with consideration for page turns and contain vocal and instrumental cues as needed.

While perhaps not well suited to small church or community ensembles with both space and budgetary limitations, Rigaudière's full orchestra edition does permit those interested in a symphonic version (perhaps performed in concert with another work using full orchestra) akin to the one Fauré himself conducted at its world premiere an efficient option. Since this edition, Carus has also published a chamber edition based upon the work's state in 1889 (before Fauré added the "O Domine" choral sections to the second movement). While beyond the scope of this review, it would be worthwhile to examine it particularly in counterpoint to John Rutter's practical edition of the 1893 version.

Karen Cooksey  
Los Angeles, CA

**R&S:** HS, 2Yr; Col/U, Comm, Wrshp  
**Keywords:** funeral, death, requiem, light, comfort, d minor



## Want something NEW?

### CHORAL MUSIC by Sue E. Bohlin

"P.S. Your music is engaging, smart, well-written, architectural and singer-friendly."  
Dr. Martin Benvenuto, Director Peninsula Women's Chorus,  
WomenSing, & Contra Costa Children's Chorus

#### I'VE BEEN TO HAARLEM

Arr. SSA, Trebles, & Piano  
**SUMMER'S HERE**

SSAA & Piano

Alliance Music Publications

www.alliancemusic.com

#### LITTLE BIRCH TREE

Arr. SA, Piano & opt. Cello  
**IN ANCHOR BAY**

SA (div), Piano & opt. Percussion

Santa Barbara Music Publishing

www.sbmp.com

"This is ear-head music."