

November 1, 2017

REPORT ON COMPLETION OF THE CLUBHOUSE 2017 RESTORATION PROJECT

Clubhouse Restoration, the Plan

The Woman's Club undertook a professional Structural Assessment of the clubhouse in the fall of 2016. The purpose of the study was to determine the structural maintenance needs of the clubhouse and to prioritize these needs based on health and safety and ADA access requirements. The team of professionals, historic architect, structural engineer, acoustician and contractor, completed the study in January 2017.

The conclusions of the Structural Assessment were presented to the members in a special meeting and at a luncheon (General Meeting). The presentation divided the project into to Phases, based on the most urgent needs tempered by availability of funds.

- Phase 1 focused on public safety, food safety and ADA accessibility. Phase 1 included securing the chimneys and foundation for seismic safety, completing the club's ADA access plan including a lift to the stage, upgrading the kitchen to commercial standards, repairing the front entry and restoring its historic character including removing the ramp that was replaced by one to current ADA standards in the side yard; and upgrading the electrical and emergency lighting system.
- Phase 2 included more ballroom seismic strengthening (walls and ceiling), acoustic upgrades including wall and ceiling finishes, drapes, stage curtains, upgrading the air conditioning/heating systems reroofing including gutters and downspouts, and paint and refinish inside and out.

A key concern to the members and Board was the loss of rental income. So it was decided to divide the work of Phase 1 into two 6-week projects one in the summer of 2017 (the 2017 Restoration Project) and one in the summer of 2018 (the 2018 Restoration Project).

The 2017 Restoration Project was defined to include:

- The chimney seismic stabilization (Office and Fireside Room)
- Anchoring the foundation at the ballroom perimeter and under the floor span for seismic repair.
- Upgrading the attic framing for seismic stability and to help support the chimneys.
- Completing the Club's ADA access plan including a lift to the stage and work throughout the clubhouse on thresholds, this would also address the legal ADA requirements for the 2018 Restoration project.
- Repairing the front entry, removing a tripping hazard, removing the access ramp no longer required because of the new code compliant one in the side yard, and restoring the front entry and stairs to their historic appearance.
-

The 2018 Restoration Project was defined to include:

- The upgrade of the kitchen to commercial standards.
- Electrical and emergency lighting systems
- Fence on Cowper side at trash receptacles.

History of the 2017 Restoration Project Construction (Mid-June –September 11, 2017)

The 2017 Restoration Project part of Phase 1 (as defined above) was endorsed to proceed by a membership vote in March 2017. This vote to authorize a capital budget amendment so that work on the 2017 Restoration Project could be started in April 2017 for construction during the slow rentals period, late June through early September 2017.

Selection of Consultants for the 2017 Restoration Project

Based on the competitive selection process used to select consultants to prepare the Structural Assessment, the Capital Projects Committee¹ requested bids from CAW Architects and Cody Brock Construction for the defined 2017 Restoration Project.

Funding for the 2017 Restoration Project

Further authorization of funding for all of Phase 1, both the 2017 and 2018 projects, came from the membership with the approval of the 2017-18 Capital Budget in May 2017. By June the Capital Projects Committee had determined that some elements that were needed for the 2018 portion of the project were more efficiently accomplished in the 2017 project. These items included closing the pass through from the Fireside Room into the Kitchen, upgrading the gas service to the entire building, painting the entire Fireside Room and touchup in the kitchen, completing the ADA program.

Based on this new information regarding the scope of the 2017 project, in June the Capital Projects Committee asked the Board to authorize the use of some of the 2018 Restoration Project capital budget authorization for the 2017 Project. In mid-June the Board approved use of \$107,846 of the funds allocated for the 2018 project to be used for the 2017 Restoration Project. The total budget for the 2017 Project was increase from \$307,000 to \$414,846, including a 9% contingency.

Construction of the 2017 Restoration Project

The Board assigned the supervision of the 2017 Restoration Project construction to the Capital Projects Committee. Carol Lippert served as point person with daily/weekly construction oversight. Meg Monroe oversaw the contracts and finances.

¹ Appointed by the Board in FY2016-17 to assist in organizing for the Structural Assessment and to oversee whatever implementation of the Structural Assessment was undertaken. Members include Carol Lippert Chair, Gwen Barry, Helen Gracon, Meg Monroe, Lisa Sten, Caroline Willis (resigned June 2017) and ex officio Sue Krumbein.

By May CAW Architects had made submittals to the Building Department and by mid-June received the initial building permit. **Some issues with the historic review and the building permit required public review process required that the building permit be revised separating interior work from exterior work.** These issues were addressed by CAW submitting a building permit revision. All the permits were issued by early July.

As often happens, particularly with historic structures, during construction there were discoveries/issues that required change orders. Among these were:

- That after demolition to the attic floor, the Fireside Room chimney was even less stable than the structural engineer thought and for safety the entire brick chimney had to be removed to the firebox, and previous framing of the chimney had to be redone. Because of the timing the flue from the fireplace insert had to be changed from flexible to rigid.
- During demolition of the chimney the original shape of the Fireside Room fireplace was revealed and for historic reasons it was restored to its original size and shape, requiring a new mantel including plastering and painting.
- The upgrade of the entire gas service to the building was required in order to install the Fireside Room fireplace insert (Current service was at its maximum load.)
- The location of the lift required significant relocation of the stage curtains including additional safety lighting in the lift area;
- In lieu of buying new stage curtains at this time the rear and side walls of the stage were painted matte black,
- New City regulations required installation of a domestic water back flow valve.

In addition to regular, as needed communications, there were weekly on-site progress meetings throughout the construction, June 26 through September 11, 2017. The architect, contractor and Club pointperson attended these meetings. The architect submitted a final punch list of items for the contractor to address. The contractor addressed all the items on the architect's list. The city also inspected and provided a punch list of issues to be addressed. The Contractor addressed these issues and a final building permit was issued by the City of Palo Alto on October 20, 2017.

At the end of the project, there were two items of concern to the Capital Committee. One was the quality of the repair/repainting of the office ceiling where work in the attic had inadvertently damaged the ceiling. (This was the contractor's responsibility.) This repair and repainting was completed satisfactorily by the end of October. In addition the Committee asked the contractor to add another light within the lift area. This issue will be addressed before November 10, 2017.

Final 2017 Project Costs and Budget

As noted in the Funding section above and as shown on the project financial summary below, the 2017 Project budget as amended was \$414,846. The total cost of the 2017 Restoration Project was \$417,527. The project was \$2,946 over budget, less than 1 percent.

Table: Summary of 2017 Contracts, Costs and Budget (October 21, 2017)

Vendor	Contracted Amount (1)	Total Cost (Actual)	Comments
City of Palo Alto-Permits		\$10,901.00	Planning Review, Building Permit fees, including bldg permit revision fee
Miscellaneous Expense		\$4,592.00	Includes mailbox and structural engineering inspection req. by City
CAW Architects	\$42,995.00	\$42,945.00	Fixed Fee, Inc. repro. costs
Cody Brock Contractors	\$332,726.00	\$359,344.00	Includes \$26,618 in change orders
Total Paid		\$417,792.00	
Total Contracted	\$375,721.00		
Total Expense after contract			
Authorized Budget	\$414,846.00	\$414,846.00	
Over run		\$2,946 .00	Over budget 0.007%

(1) Numbers are rounded. Architect’s contract was fixed fee/not to exceed. For this work the fee in the March 26, 2017 CAW contract for Phase 1 was divided into two projects, 2017 and 2018. The \$42,945 is the contracted amount for the 2017 Project.

Successful Conclusion

The Capital Projects Committee feels that the 2017 Renovation Project was successfully completed within its approved budget. This success was in spite of the unanticipated expenses, including the city required outside structural engineering inspection cost, backflow prevention valve and the necessary change orders referred to above in the discussion about construction. Further, the 2017 Project was completed without requiring the cancellation of more than two months of rentals, and the clubhouse was cleared by the City and available for a new member reception on September 13 and for the rental scheduled for September 14.

The successful and timely completion of the 2017 Project was due in large part to the efforts and good work of CAW Architects, Chris Wasney, Principal, and Mousam Adcock, Project Manager, as well as the very professional construction team at Cody Brock, lead by Rich Cody, who took a personal interest in the project. Finally, we were fortunate to have the dedicated oversight of Carol Lippert who served as daily point person, looking out for the Club’s interests and needs from plan submittal to the city through completion of the Project. Without a cooperative and

professional team we could not have completed the work within such a tight schedule.

Things Learned from the 2017 Restoration Project

At the conclusion of the project, Carol Lippert, Club Project Manager, and Meg Monroe, Club Contract Manager, met with each contractor to see what we could learn from this project to improve performance on the remaining work in Phase 1. There were several things learned.

- Have a clearly defined project, vetted, agreed to and understood by the membership, including financial needs, before starting on plans for submittals for city permits.
- Have one member represent the club as on-site decision-maker during construction, supported by one member responsible for project contracts and finances.
- Given regular changes in City fees and requirements, contingency should be 15% of the total project costs, including estimated permit fees.
- Have all required building permits in hand before commencing any part of construction. This means planning better for the time needed between (1) deciding the content of the project, preparing construction drawings and submitting for a building permit, and (2) allowing enough time for completing City review and receiving a building permit before commencing construction.
- Historic structures are important in Palo Alto. Understand that working on an historic building can require additional City reviews and approval time.
- Be more realistic about the timeframe for project construction; for the remainder of Phase 1 provide at least 8 weeks after receiving a building permit to final inspection. With a commercial kitchen it is necessary to include additional time for County Health Department inspections during construction and at the conclusion to sign off the permit. Particularly for a kitchen, mentally build in a cushion of a couple of extra weeks at the end for “break-in” before the first rental after construction.
- Be aware and consider in funding that when working with a 101-year-old structure, lovingly modified by members over those years, that there will be unexpected surprises (some good and some not so good) in the course of project work. These issues may take time or money or both to resolve.

Next Steps

When the Board made the decision in mid-June to shift some of the 2018 funding allocation to the 2017 portion of the restoration project, they also realized that the 2018 Project (second half of Phase 1) would be delayed past the summer of 2018. In addition, based on the experience just completed and the lessons learned, it is clear that more time should be required for the project planning, design and preparation for city submittals/permits than was allowed for the 2017 work. Nonetheless, the Board and the Capital Projects Committee both agree that because of the

potential health and safety issues related to the kitchen, the completion of the remainder of Phase 1 should continue to be a priority. The Board also agreed in June that at the end of the 2017 Project, the Club should evaluate the capital funds available for maintenance/structural improvements and then plan for the completion of Phase 1, principally the kitchen work.

This fall the Capital Projects Committee will meet to discuss a plan for undertaking and financing the remainder of Phase 1. By January 2018, the Committee intends to make a recommendation to the Board. This plan will include ample opportunity for interested members of the club to participate in the planning for the commercial kitchen as well as time for formal designs to be developed and good cost estimates made. Meanwhile, the Club can continue to build capital funds for the improvements. Following an agreed to plan, clear cost estimate and funds available, a timeframe for construction of the remainder of Phase 1 can be selected and a contractor sought.

Respectfully submitted,

Capital Projects Committee: Carol Lippert, Chair; Gwen Barry, Helen Gracon, Meg Monroe, Lisa Sten, Ex Officio member, Sue Krumbein, President.

Finance Officer: Meg Monroe