Overview

- What is duplicate publication?
- Is it a problem for veterinary journals?
- What can we do about it?
What Is Duplicate Publication?

- Authors using their own work in more than one publication
- Partial (substantial, \( \geq 10\% \)) or full overlap
  - Text, figures, tables, data, samples, cases
- In print or electronic media
- Same or different language
- At least one common author
- Not acknowledged or disclosed
Multiplicate Terms

- Duplicate publication*
- Redundant publication
- Overlapping publication
- Dual publication
- Prior publication
- Repetitive publication
- Text recycling
- Self-plagiarism
- Republishation
- Triplicate (...) publication

- Fragmented publication
- Segmented publication
- Salami publication
- Disaggregated publication
- Sibling publications

*MeSH heading/tag used by the National Library of Medicine
## Bailey’s Classification Scheme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Level of Duplicate Publication</th>
<th>Example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Level 1</td>
<td>Exact duplication, using identical words or illustrations, of 10% or more of the article</td>
<td>Co-submission of same manuscript</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level 2</td>
<td>Highly similar content, in terms of meaning and message, of 10% or more of the article</td>
<td>Re-use of data and text from a prior article</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level 3</td>
<td>Segmented research articles in which related aspects of the same study were published separately</td>
<td>Separate methods articles, reports of different subsamples</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level 4</td>
<td>Sequential research articles, in which the same message is published, without new conclusions or recommendations</td>
<td>Pilot study followed by a larger study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level 5</td>
<td>Interdisciplinary duplication in which the same message was prepared and published for somewhat different readership</td>
<td>Same article in two languages or in different journals for different disciplines</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As modified by Blancett et al. *J Nurs Schol*, 1995
How Does It Happen?

• Honest mistake
• Negligence
• Purposeful misrepresentation
How Does It Happen?

• Concurrent submission of a manuscript
• Same manuscript, different language
• Conference proceedings
• Press reports
• Clinical trial registries, public datasets
• Government or manufacturer reports
• Books, newsletters, CDs
• Online: preprint server, repositories
Why Does It Happen?

• Most authors:
  ▫ Feel academic pressure to publish
  ▫ Feel some types of duplicate publication are justified (conference proceedings, segmented publication)
  ▫ Don’t inform editor of overlapping publications

• Most editors/journals:
  ▫ Do not do enough to deter redundancy
  ▫ Do not always inform authors of policy

Yank and Barnes, J Med Ethics, 2003
Is It a Problem?

- Wastes journal time, effort, space
- Inflates author publication record
- Inflates the scientific literature
- Wastes indexing, abstracting effort
- Deviates from accepted (ethical) practice
- Could violate international copyright
- Distorts the research evidence; misleads readers; leads to flawed meta-analysis
When Is It a Problem?

• When the primary intent is to deceive peers, supervisors, or journal editors with false claims of original work
When Might it not be a Problem?

- When it benefits the scientific community
  - Publication of conference proceedings
  - Translations of important findings
  - Important updates to studies
  - Confirmation of contested results

- Requires approval by both editors, appropriate acknowledgment and citation, publication window

ICJME, 2011
How Prevalent is Duplicate Publication?

- Various studies
  - Surgery, nursing: ~600 articles each → 14-28%
  - Math and physics: 280,000 entries → 10.5%
  - Medline: 62,213 citations, 12 yrs → 1.35%
- COPE: 1 of 2 most common disputes
- 24% of ethical issues affecting journals
- Authors: 4% admit to having done it
- Editors: tend to underestimate at 0.1%
How Prevalent is Duplicate Publication?

How Prevalent is Duplicate Publication?

• A problem in all countries, relative to their publication rate
• But, it’s common practice in some countries to:
  ▫ Publish first in a local journal (in native language or in English) and then in an international journal
  ▫ Submit the same manuscript to more than one journal at the same time

Is It a Problem in Veterinary Journals?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Problem</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Author Origin</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Duplicate publication</td>
<td>8*</td>
<td>USA (4), UK (1), China (2), Italy (1)</td>
<td>4 retracted; 1-2 due to editorial error</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plagiarism</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>China (2), Croatia (1), Gabon (1)</td>
<td>Retracted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data integrity</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>USA (3), India (1), Japan (1)</td>
<td>Further doc. of figures needed; error in sequence analysis; data presentation misleading; lab contamination (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data falsification/fabrication</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Korea (2), UK (1)</td>
<td>Stem cell hoax; manipulation of a figure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authorship dispute</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>Author retracted paper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uncertain</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>NCSU requested retraction of figure; editor and authors retracted whole paper</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*0.08% of vet med citations; 0.8% of all duplicate pubs in PubMed
Is It a Problem in Veterinary Journals?

- Duplicate, Not Retracted
- Duplicate, Retracted
- Other Retractions
What Can Editors Do?

• Prevention vs treatment
• Prior to submission
  ▫ Clear editorial policy in author guidelines
    • Only original content
    • Define redundant content, exceptions
  ▫ Encourage author originality
  ▫ Journal committee on scientific integrity
What Can Editors Do?

• At submission
  ▫ Require authors to sign statement
  ▫ Request copies of overlapping publications
  ▫ Evaluate the manuscript for redundancy
    • Check ‘related citations’ in PubMed
    • Detection software (eTBLAST, CrossCheck)

• Ask reviewers to be alert to redundancy
Evaluating a Manuscript for Redundancy

- Amount of overlap
- Nature of overlap (text, data, conclusion)
- Distribution and audience of the prior publication
- Importance for readers
- If published, ensure appropriate acknowledgment, agreements
What Can Editors Do?

- **After publication**
  - Corrective action
    - Notice of duplicate publication
    - Retraction
    - Apology, correction, clarification
  - Punitive action
    - Restrictions on future submission
    - Notification of other journals
    - Notification of author’s institution

- Frowned upon
- Corrective measures
- Punitive action
Issues in Duplicate Publication

- Journal proliferation and access
- Where to “draw the line” on redundancy
- Academic system of reward
- The ongoing life of retracted articles
Policy Guidelines & Resources

• **ICJME**: Uniform Requirements for Manuscripts Submitted to Biomedical Journals
• **COPE**: Code of Conduct, Ethics Flowcharts, Guidelines on Article Retraction
• **ORI**: Office of Research Integrity, US Dept of Health and Human Services
• **WAME**: Policy Statement on the Responsibilities of Medical Editors