



Pygmy POP. A Genealogy of Schizophonic Mimesis

Author(s): Steven Feld

Source: *Yearbook for Traditional Music*, Vol. 28 (1996), pp. 1-35

Published by: International Council for Traditional Music

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/767805>

Accessed: 22/01/2009 14:48

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Please contact the publisher regarding any further use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at <http://www.jstor.org/action/showPublisher?publisherCode=ictm>.

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

JSTOR is a not-for-profit organization founded in 1995 to build trusted digital archives for scholarship. We work with the scholarly community to preserve their work and the materials they rely upon, and to build a common research platform that promotes the discovery and use of these resources. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



International Council for Traditional Music is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Yearbook for Traditional Music*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

pygmy POP
A Genealogy of Schizophonic Mimesis

by Steven Feld

in memory of Colin Turnbull
ndura a lufa, ndura ekondi ekimi,
“the forest is listening, the forest loves quiet”

STORIES BEGIN WHEN A BEGINNING IS CHOSEN . . .

Colin Turnbull's death, on July 28, 1994 (Pace 1994) hurled me back into lengthy daydreams about the classes in anthropology I took with him from 1969-71 as a college junior and senior, classes that featured patiently detailed story after story drawn from his years of living with the Mbuti pygmies in the Ituri forest of Zaïre. Colin was a humanist who came into anthropology from studies in philosophy and religion, and from a substantial background as a skilled keyboardist as well. He was my first model of an anthropologist whose understanding of sociability was nurtured by a deep musical engagement.

Although the anthropology Colin learned at Oxford in the 1950s was largely functionalist and oriented toward the understanding of social institutions and organizations, the anthropology he taught was principally focused on issues of morality and conflict. He was deeply moved by the need to chronicle the experiential ravages of change in a world of rapidly escalating inequalities. What his critics called the romanticism in books like *The Forest People* (1961), *The Lonely African* (1962), or *The Mountain People* (1972), came through somewhat differently in Colin's teaching, as a passionate discussion of why neither Western nor African societies had morally superior claims to the most humane ways of imagining and treating others. As a way of promoting debate on these issues Colin began each of our classes with a reading and critique of the ideas about exchange and reciprocity in Marcel Mauss' *The Gift* (1976).

My story begins with wanting to read and critique *The Gift* yet again, for and with Colin, from the standpoint of the schizophonic mimesis of pygmy music. My reading is about the turbulent morality of today's increasingly blurred and contested lines between forms of musical invasion and forms of cultural exchange. I want to critique Mauss by indicating how acts of schizophonic exchange simultaneously create powerful bonds and produce equally powerful divisions. This is a story about the musical discourses and practices that link colonial and postcolonial Africa to worlds of music, particularly via the world's new ubiquitous global pop sales genre: world beat music.

JUST AS WHEN, WITHOUT WARNING, READING AN ETHNOGRAPHY OPENS A SPACE FOR ALLEGORY . . .

It's hard for me to start with thoughts of Colin without opening up a significant moment on the ethnography and ethnomusicology of the Central African forests, namely his exposition, in *The Forest People* and *Wayward Servants*,

of the moral vicissitudes of sound in Mbuti cosmology and habitus (1961, 1965, esp. 254-267, 286-291). Perhaps a brief ethnographic recounting can form a ground against which we can figure some of the complexities of new representational histories, like the ones emergent in the world beat sub-genre of “pygmy pop.”

Turnbull explicates the Mbuti saying *akami amu ndura*, “noise kills the forest,” and the parallel one *akami amu mukira*, “noise kills the hunt,” by insisting that they are central to understanding the connection between social organization and ritual in Mbuti life. To draw out this assertion, he elaborates on how Mbuti imagination and practice constructs the forest as both benevolent and powerful, capable of giving strength and affection to its “children.” For this to happen Mbuti must attract the attention of the forest, must soothe it with the strength of sound that is fully articulated in the achievement of song. “Song is used to communicate with the forest, and it is significant that the emphasis is on the actual sound, not on the words” (1965:259). “The sound ‘awakens’ the forest . . . thus attracting the forest’s attention to the immediate needs of its children. It is also of the essential nature of all songs that they should be ‘pleasing to the forest.’ ” (1965:257). As a cooperative social activity, singing fosters heightened sociability both directed to and in the presence of the forest.

The positive position of song in pleasing and awakening the forest ties it to the notion of *ekimi*, of “quiet,” central to Turnbull’s interpretation of an Mbuti idealization of a benevolent forest that provides all.

The ideal is quiet, and quietness is associated with the forest. The concept is inseparable from the concept of joy, which is *ekimi mota*, or ‘powerful quietness.’ Joy is an intensification of quietness and is brought about by the occurrence of the norm: good hunting, good weather, good health, harmonious relations, plenty of children (1965:289).

The positive emphasis on *ekimi*, or quiet, is in no way thought of being in conflict with song, for *ekimi* is cool, and so is song, and both are pleasing to the forest (1965:255).

The process of ‘rejoicing the forest’ is a process of creating *ekimi mota* where it does not exist, of intensifying mere *ekimi* through song (1965:290).

Perhaps the exact connotation of ‘rejoicing the forest’ is best described by the process itself, which brings joy through joy. Singing gives the Mbuti intense satisfaction. They say that it makes them feel good, in the sense of feeling joyful . . . By creating a mood of joy within themselves the Mbuti convey that joy to the forest, which returns it, restoring *ekimi* or even *ekimi mota* to the camp (ibid.). The Mbuti say ‘*su bongisa ndura, ndura pisu ekimi*’ — ‘we rejoice the forest, the forest gives us quiet’ (ibid.).

This quiet, which Turnbull interprets as the coolness of songs and the highly cooperative process of singing them to awaken and rejoice the forest, directly opposes the force of noise, *akami*. As quiet pleases the forest, so noise displeases it, and Turnbull reads the opposition of *ekimi* and *akami* as indexical

to the polarities of sociability. Thus quiet is social cooperation, embodied in good hunting, singing, dancing, feasting. And noise embraces “laziness and aggressiveness and disputatiousness” (1965:278), embodied in ill humor, shouting, crying and anger, bad hunting and death. This noise resonates between human action and a forest that “stops ‘talking’ . . . a sign that something is very wrong” (1965:259) or becomes silent, *kobinengo*, “an indication of great and imminent danger” (1965:287). The cries announced by noise and silence, where poor hunting, social disintegration, sickness, or death emerge and linger, indicate that the forest is “sleeping.”

These crises are typically countered by singing; singing both opposes “noise” and “silence” and stimulates the forest to resume “talking.” More importantly, singing opposes the strongest and most destructive form of noise and silence — death.

The felt need to ‘awaken’ the forest and ‘rejoice’ the forest is occasioned more by the fact that all the living have been brought closer to death, and have, to some extent, been touched by it (1965:262).

The ritual response to death brings forth the most organized and complexly articulated form of singing, the songs of *molimo* that have the powers to stimulate and thus reawaken a sleeping and silent forest. *Molimo* rituals themselves have moments of the extremes of silence, noise, and song, and Turnbull analyses their sequence and their juxtaposition in terms of a ritual symbology of oppositional themes like life and death, unity and division, cooperation and divisiveness.

But the full and final power of sound, and the height of ritual efficacy itself, is the notion of amplification, announced by the role of the *molimo* trumpet that echoes the core of Mbuti song.

The main function of the trumpet is to sing, and to pass on the song of the Mbuti into the forest. It is taken off to a distance from where it picks up the song from the men around the *molimo* hearth and echoes it into the night. This way, the Mbuti say, the forest is sure to hear it and be pleased (1965:265).

This is a form of amplification that radiates quiet by bringing the reverberations and echoes of song ever deeper into the forest.

WHICH QUICKLY BLURS TO ANOTHER POINT OF CROSSING . . .

I am riding the ferry across Hong Kong Harbor on a bright afternoon in October of 1994. Somewhat distracted by vibrant motions and sounds all around I am reading Jon Pareles’ *International Herald Tribune* review of Madonna’s brand new CD, *Bedtime Stories*. In conversation with Pareles, Madonna reveals her artistic desire *du jour*, a makeover from feisty eroticist to gentle whisperer. “There’s lots of ways to get your point across and lots of ways to try and influence people,” she says. “You can be aggressive and loud and you can shock people and you can hit them over the head. But then there are other ways. You can subliminally seduce someone . . .” (1994:20). Pareles tells how Madonna practices this subliminal seduction, for example, of one track he writes: “In ‘Sanctuary’ pygmylike hoots and throbbing low bass notes frame Madonna’s declaration ‘It’s here in your heart I want to be carried’ ” (ibid.).

“Pygmylike hoots?” My mind went racing ahead, and as soon as the boat landed at Star Ferry I found the first record shop, listened to the just arrived *Bedtime Stories* CD, and realized that the material girl — “virtuoso of the superficial” in Pareles’ memorable phrase that Madonna ever so strongly approved of — had once again outdone herself. But before I even hear the song I see that the song-writing citation for “Sanctuary” is co-credited to Madonna, Dallas Austin, Anne Preven, Scott Cutler and Herbie Hancock. Herbie Hancock, the famous African-American jazz pianist? Yes, as soon as I listen his presence is right there in the song’s early moments, but soft, in the understructure, the repeating digital sample of musical lingerie swaying gently beneath the satin sheets of Madonna’s bedtime voice.

Listeners familiar with jazz recordings of the last twenty-five years will quickly recognize the Herbie Hancock connection upon hearing Madonna’s “Sanctuary.” The short digital sample introduced early in the song comes directly from Hancock’s 1973 Columbia LP hit *Headhunters*, the first jazz recording to go gold in sales figures, and until quite recently the biggest selling jazz album in history. The LP included a remake of Hancock’s best known composition, “Watermelon Man” and its original opening is the obvious source material for Madonna’s looped samples.

WHERE SIGNATURES, CAREERS, AND MORE STORIES ARE JOINED . . .

Herbie Hancock’s reputation and the song “Watermelon Man” are closely connected. Hancock’s career was launched forcefully by his first LP date as a leader, the 1962 Blue Note album *Takin’ Off*, featuring veteran saxophonist Dexter Gordon. The LP included the first recording of Hancock’s gospel-tinged composition “Watermelon Man,” a tune that came into much greater circulation and popularity when it was recorded the following year by the Afro-Latin ensemble of Cuban percussionist Mongo Santamaria. Meanwhile Hancock’s meteoric rise on the jazz scene in the 60s, often as the pianist in the Miles Davis quintet, involved some catchy compositions, but none were as widely re-recorded or performed as “Watermelon Man.”

By the end of the 1960s and early 1970s Hancock’s playing extensively involved soul-funk-rock-fusion forms, and he increasingly performed on electric and electronic pianos and synthesizers. His stylistic reorientation to more commercial music was signaled by *Headhunters*. Within a year of that reorientation Hancock’s new success was clear: he had three albums on *Billboard’s* top pop LP charts, and in the following ten years he recorded numerous commercially successful pop-funk hits, in addition to film scores and more mainstream jazz work. The hit song on *Headhunters* was a composition called “Chameleon.” But the surprise of the LP, probably second in airplay, was the remake of “Watermelon Man,” credited to Hancock as author and co-credited to Harvey Mason, the band’s drummer, for arrangement.

But why does Pareles refer to the sample of this song so indirectly, as Madonna’s use of “pygmylike hoots?” In Scott Thompson’s liner notes to the 1992 CD reissue of *Headhunters*, Hancock talks about the remake of “Watermelon Man:” “. . . the beginning of the tune, that was Bill Summers’ idea. The intro was actually from Pygmy music with Bill blowing in a beer bottle . . .” Bill Summers, the band’s percussionist is credited on the LP’s instrumentation list for playing “hindewho.” But this term, “hindewho,” is

not the name of an instrument, but rather the onomatopoeic imitation by BaBenzélé pygmies of the Central African Republic for the alternation of voice with the sound of a single pitch papaya stem whistle. The introduction for “Watermelon Man” was clearly copied from a performance of this instrumental and vocal interplay, heard on the opening track of an ethnomusical LP of 1966, Simha Arom and Geneviève Taurelle’s *The Music of the Ba-Benzélé Pygmies*. In their liner notes Arom and Taurelle write:

Whistle, *hindewhu*. This is a tube, between seven and eight centimeters long, cut from a hollow twig of a pawpaw tree in which the natural membrane at the node forms the base of the whistle. The circular orifice at the end provides the mouthpiece, the player presses his lower lip against the outer surface of this and breathes out as into a hollow key. In this way the one and only sound of the instrument is produced. The way in which it is played is unusual; in the musical practice of the Ba-Benzélé it is never used as a whistle but as a musical instrument, although this expression is somewhat inadequate. In fact it is a fusion between vocal and instrumental art: the technique of the player consists in alternately blowing the whistle and singing or yodeling one or more notes, thus producing an unusual synthesis. The result is a continuous musical structure in which the whistled sound, of unchanging pitch but occurring frequently, constitutes the inevitable melodic axis around which the melody gravitates. This is characterized by the use of disjunct intervals, octaves, fifths, sixths and fourths, of which the upper notes are usually the whistled notes. The expression *hindewhu* does not signify the whistle, it is an onomatopoeic form which imitates the effect produced by the alternation of sung and whistled notes.

Hindewhu can be performed solo or duo or multiple, in all cases with or without a group of accompanying singers. Track A-1 of Arom and Taurelle’s LP is a solo performance, and this is obviously the recording that Bill Summers heard, and the one he imitated using a beer bottle version of the papaya whistle for the opening of “Watermelon Man.” Arom & Taurelle’s liner note description of track A-1, “*hindewhu* (whistle) solo” reads:

Having returned from a successful hunt, the hunters use this instrument to announce the news to the women and old people who stayed in the camp. The women answer by whistling and singing. This piece was played by a young Benzélé woman who alternately whistled and sang. The main intervals which occur are ascending sixths, fifths, and fourths.

In the “Watermelon Man” version of the *hindewhu* the alternation and intervals are preserved quite directly. The timbre is smoothed out, and the sounds are put in a strictly metric framework.

LIKE “A BROTHERS KIND OF THING” . . .

In 1985 I called Herbie Hancock and asked him if he felt any legal or moral concern surrounding the *hindewhu* copy on *Headhunters*. He was quite cordial, and quick with his comeback. “You see,” he answered, “you’ve got to understand, this is a brothers kind of thing, you know, a thing for brothers

to work out. I mean, I don't actually need to go over there and talk to them, I could do it but I know that it's OK 'cause its just a brothers kind of thing." I then asked if musicians could side-step the music industry and copyright conventions to directly remunerate the sources of their inspiration. "Look," he replied, "we're the people who've lost the most, who've had the most stolen from us. We know what it means to come up with, you know, a sound or a tune, then to have it copped and turned into a big hit or something like that. We've been through all of that. But this isn't like that. This is a different thing, you see, brothers, we're all making African music, that's what I'm talking about" (Hancock 1985).

Readers espousing certain critical orientations might want to jump in here with the response that Herbie Hancock's comments are politically naive or just duplicitous. But I want to resist either that snap judgment or the ready-made interpretation in order to scrutinize the complexity of his subject position, to inquire about the musical-political-industrial habitus in which particular acts of schizophonic mimesis take place, and to locate the discourses which surround their circulation. For in the case of *Headhunters* Hancock obviously did not think he was hunting anyone's head. Besides, his action was hardly unique.

The *hindewhu* appropriation for "Watermelon Man" took place in a Western music industry context where hundreds of performers rather closely "adapt" (the masking, yet legally correct term) and thereby come to own other sounds, compositions, and styles without directly crediting the source material or paying the original performers or owners (for historical perspectives on this issue see Wallis and Malm 1984:165-215, Seeger 1991, 1992, and the essays in Frith 1993). But, quite significantly, Hancock didn't invoke music copyright law (even as of 1973) on "traditional" songs and their "adaptation" as his rationale. Nor did he cite industry-wide common practice as his justification. Rather he positioned himself as an actor in a particular moral universe, one that authorizes him to take certain actions and to promote or defend them as politically and culturally acceptable. His statement basically claims oral tradition recycling as an African-American ethic and aesthetic. This approach is historically consistent with a wide variety of African-American citation practices, of which the best-known and most currently discussed is the dramatic copy-and-splice self-referentiality of rap and hip-hop.¹

It is also important to note with regard to Hancock's "brothers kind of thing" comment that the entirety of the *Headhunters* LP was clearly couched in symbols of early 1970s African-American nationalism and that Hancock later took the performance name *Mwandishi*, Swahili for "composer." Nonetheless, the layers of signification attached here to Afro-nationalist tropes also present certain ironies, beginning, of course, with the very title of the LP. The *Headhunters* covers, in addition, are designed in vibrant purple and yellow colors with jungle-primitivo lettering, creating a sort of African-American version of a 1960s psychedelic Fillmore Auditorium rock concert poster. On the front and back covers one finds virtually identical images of the band with Hancock seated in the center at the Fender Rhodes electric piano. On the front cover his head is transformed into a Baule mask, with an analog VU meter in the mouth position. On the rear photo the mask

is gone, revealing his face, a huge Afro hair style, and a large African necklace around his neck. Completing the iconography is, at Hancock's side, percussionist Bill Summers holding two Yoruba *shekere* gourd rattles.²

While Hancock's Afro-centrism was certainly on display, Columbia (now Sony Music) clearly does not operate on the level of "a brothers kind of thing," and it is at the juncture of this distinction that another set of stories begin. As Herbie Hancock's record company, Columbia/Sony is in the business of musical ownership, financial growth and protection. The specific property that concerns them here is not the cultural property of people in the forests of Central Africa, and the commodity that concerns them is not the out-of-print, high-priced, hard-to-get, UNESCO-sponsored German import LP that happened to be incorporated by one of their artists. This is obviously why my repeated inquiries to various offices at Columbia and Sony about copyright clearance or acknowledgement of the *hindewhu* sound on the Hancock LP and song went unanswered. Ten years later, reflecting both legal and social changes, Madonna's label, Warner Brothers, clearly licensed and paid for the sample used on "Sanctuary," and openly acknowledged the source LP, its owner Sony Music, and gave Herbie Hancock a co-author credit in the liner notes to the *Bedtime Stories* CD. Warner Brothers also faxed back to me almost instantly in response to my request for information on the nature of their current practice for fair compensation and credit related to use of digital samples.

IN A CHAIN OF IMITATION AND INSPIRATION . . .

Significantly, Hancock's prototypic pygmy pop was not entirely unique in its time or musical context. Juxtaposing it with two other late 1960s to mid-1970s examples of pygmy-inspired mimetic practices in the jazz arena might allow us to scrutinize more closely how appropriations are neither musically nor politically singular, even when they copy the same source or claim to honor or acknowledge similar cultural heritage.

For example, there is the case of Leon (a.k.a. Leontopolis, Leone) Thomas. Jazz listeners know the power of his big full voice and 6'2" frame; his sound signature is immediately reminiscent of both Joe Williams' blues delivery and the warm velvety intonation of Billy Ekstine or Arthur Prysock, with tinges of 1960s soul and gospel shouting filling out the mix. Although Thomas crooned the Joe Williams role with Count Basie's band in the early 1960s, he is more closely associated with the Afro-centric jazz avant-gardes of the late 1960s and early 1970s, particularly the ensembles of Rahsaan Roland Kirk and Pharoah Sanders. In these groups Thomas sang some conventionally texted lyrics, but more often vocally improvised untexted solos. In these solos Thomas freely mixed a modified rapid alternation yodel technique with a kind of vocaballic scat singing that sounded more glottal than the dominant King Pleasure or Eddie Jefferson male jazz scat style typical of the era. These stylizations were set in a larger performance context which included African clothing and frequent references to Afro-Islamic humanism and African-American nationalism.

Thomas credited the source of his yodel techniques to Central African pygmy recordings, and he spoke often of his experiences listening to pygmy music on record, including listening with John Coltrane and other 1960s

jazz avant-garde icons (see for example the Thomas interviews in Klee 1970, Rawlings 1970). Like Hancock, his African connection was imagined as a “brothers kind of thing.” In a 1970 interview there is the following exchange:

Q: “Have you been to Africa?”

A: “Naw. Africa is where *I* am. Africa is here. The most primitive people in Africa sing like me” (Rawlings 1970:18).

Among the most often played examples of Thomas’ pygmy-inspired yodeling is the lengthy scat improvisation over an ostinato on “The Creator Has a Master Plan,” a composition co-authored with Pharoah Sanders and performed on Sanders’ 1969 LP *Karma*.

SUBTLELY SPANNING OPPOSITIONAL IDEOLOGY AND LYRICAL ROMANTICISM . . .

The Afro-centrism of African-American artists did not constitute the only arena in which jazz musicians expressed an affinity for Central African pygmy musics in the 1960s and 1970s. From another portion of the jazz spectrum, take Jimmy Rowles, the well-known pianist who moved from the West Coast to New York in 1973. Rowles performed and recorded backing Peggy Lee, Carmen McRae, Billie Holiday, Sarah Vaughan, Frank Sinatra, Ella Fitzgerald and many other singers and instrumentalists on both coasts. Noted by jazz writers as a favorite accompanist (Watrous 1996), he was also known for impressionist improvisatory stylings, marked by touches of Debussy and Ravel (Lyons 1983). An example is Rowles’ jazz ballad “The Peacocks”, written in the early 1970s after hearing a Central African LP on the radio.

♩ = 52

Chords: B^bmi, B^bmi(ma7), B^bmi7, B^bmi6, B^bmi, B^bmi(ma7), F[#]mi7, Fmi7, B^b13, E^bmi7, C7(#9), F7(#9), 1. B^bmi, F7(alt)

Example 1:

The A theme from Jimmy Rowles’ “The Peacocks” ©1976 Kudo Music; the full lead sheet is published in Sher 1991:303.

Instantly evoking the melodic material and vocal techniques of Central African forest music, the introductory motif of three tones begins by springing up a 5th and then a minor 3rd to sound a minor 7th. It then returns by rapidly alternating the tones of the opening 5th to evoke the fluttering sound of echoed yodel. This phrase repeats and leads to a second part of the A theme, using a cascading, descending pentatonic pattern to develop the initial evocation of the yodel patterns so familiar to listeners of Central African forest musics.

This song has become part of the repertory of many jazz musicians. The best known rendition is still the one Rowles recorded with tenor saxophonist Stan Getz on the 1977 LP *Stan Getz Presents Jimmy Rowles, The Peacocks*. Recordings across color and age lines in the jazz world are some evidence of the song's stature in the ballad repertory — for example, by Bill Evans in 1977 on *You Must Believe In Spring*; by Branford Marsalis in 1987 on *Renaissance*; by John McLaughlin in 1995 on *The Promise*; and, by Wayne Shorter, in the 1986 Bertrand Tavernier film *'Round Midnight* that starred Dexter Gordon and featured a soundtrack arranged by Herbie Hancock.

On the surface Hancock's appropriation, Thomas' imitation, and Rowles' inspiration are distinct. Yet, as all jazz musicians know, the bounds of mimesis are wide open, and what constitutes a small imitative mutation in one instance appears more as artistic transformation in another. These examples are united by the way they all take place and make sense within a tradition which is deeply oral, despite a long history of music writing and arranging. It is also a tradition with a long history of celebrating Africa, including parts of Africa to which it has no direct historical connection. And because the jazz aesthetic of citation can be orally constituted at any point in improvisation and composition, the term "theft" doesn't apply when taking from oneself, when revitalizing one's own tradition. Or at least that's the way almost all jazz players, white and black, young and old, have phrased it to me when I've played these three examples back to back with source materials from LPs of BaMbuti and BaBenzélé song. While players clearly recognize that some copies are closer to the source than others, or that some recordings copy pieces while others copy processes, textures, or grooves, all tend to either nonchalantly note or defensively argue that this is just "in the tradition," which is presumably similar to Herbie Hancock calling it "a brothers kind of thing."

IN A GLOBAL SPACE OF CIRCULATING COMMODITIES . . .

These stories would be a lot less interesting did they not represent a small portion of a much larger pattern, one that has intensified considerably in the last thirty years. I'll later return to some of the current tokens of the pattern. But first I want to locate the Hancock-Thomas-Rowles inventions within another world of recordings. That "other" world is the extraordinary popularity and commercial viability of recordings of Central African forest peoples, particularly the BaMbuti LPs recorded by Colin Turnbull in the Ituri forest of Zaïre in the 1950s and 1960s, and the BaBenzélé and Baka LPs recorded by Simha Arom in the Central African Republic during the 1960s and 1970s.³

Although these recordings were made by scholars and were realized specifically as anthropological and ethnomusicological documents, they have reached an unusually large and diverse audience. The space of imagining that encompasses the great popularity of these recordings also reveals their role in allowing academics to characterize the elements of a music. Such analyses are central to claims for the historical and cultural uniqueness of this "pygmy music," and they mediate a claim to unique cultural and intellectual property.

One discursive location for “pygmy music” as a distinct invention is signaled by the specific entry by that title in the *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*.

Its most striking features, apparently common to all groups, are an almost unique wordless yodeling, resulting in disjunct melodies, usually with descending contours; and a varied and densely textured multipart singing, as complex as any other indigenous African style. This choral music is built up from continuously varied repetitions of a short basic pattern, which takes shape as different voices enter, often with apparent informality, and fill out the texture with a variety of techniques that include hocket, ostinato, canonic imitation and parallel part movement. Penta- or sub-pentatonic forms are used, with harmonies mainly based on 4ths or 5ths. The frequently clear division of the total cyclic pattern between leader and chorus, common in other African styles, is absent in their most typical music, or obscured by a high degree of overlap between parts, by the passing round of what might be regarded as soloistic parts from one to another, and by a considerable freedom to improvise solo within the metrical and harmonic constraints of the pattern. Some scholars see in this a reflection of the essentially democratic, non-hierarchical structure of pygmy social units (Cooke 1980:483).

This entry is particularly significant when juxtaposed with those by two other scholars of Central African musics, Alan P. Merriam and Simha Arom. In his Grove entry on Zaïre, Merriam (1980) devotes a distinct section to pygmy music drawing on his own fieldwork and on lengthy reference to Colin Turnbull’s analysis of Mbuti song in *Wayward Servants* (1965). Merriam writes:

Pygmy vocal music is characterized by yodeling and by descending melodic lines which are often disjunct. A dense texture is achieved in partsongs by hocketing with a variety of vocal qualities, and by polyphony. Up to three leading voices may overlay the choral parts. Other traits of pygmy music are repetition by echo or ornamented imitation; the augmentation, diminution and extension of intervals; the use of tritonic, tetratonic and, most often, pentatonic scales; the superimposition of diverse rhythmic structures above a rhythmic ostinato; polyrhythm; and canon and improvisation. These musical characteristics are shared by pygmy groups in other parts of Zaïre and Africa; if indeed, pygmies are of ancient origin, their music may represent an ancient style absorbed by later Bantu arrivals (1980:623).

Likewise Simha Arom, in his Grove entry on musics of the Central African Republic (1980) includes notes on the distinctive coherence of a pygmy style:

The polyphony of the Pygmies is particularly noteworthy; unison singing hardly exists. When two Pygmies sing together, their voices interweave and cross, creating a close-textured polyphony in which each melodic line is allowed to develop largely independently of the other. But contrapuntal development finds its complete expression in group songs; the voice of one or more soloists and the different

parts of the chorus answer one another, intermingle, and superimpose themselves on each other within strict bounds, yet with great variety. The elements of this polyphony are ostinato figures, continuous or broken pedal points, melodic imitations, melismatic improvisations, movements of parallel fifths, half-spoken, half-sung interjections, or even strict contrapuntal variations in a style reminiscent of *passacaglia*. The verbal element occupies a minimal place in these songs; a single word constantly repeated, even a few isolated syllables, may constitute all the textual support provided. Pygmy music is unique in its use of disjunct intervals, which help to create a wide range, and in its sound production, the technique being similar to that of yodeling in which chest notes alternate with head notes (1980:359; for more detailed musical analysis see Arom 1976, 1991).

There is an obvious connection here between first-hand research, the production of field recordings and the stylistic analyses that spring from them. But don't these activities also create the basic conditions for renegotiations of the sounds as recorded and presented? Doesn't research rationalize schizophrenia? This conclusion may be uneasy for researchers to swallow, but it is a critical reality that must be acknowledged. The intentions surrounding a recording's original production, however positive, cannot be controlled once a commodity is in commercial circulation. Both as tokens of academic and of marketplace authenticity, documentary field recordings have served to validate very diverse agendas, many of which were unanticipated and may now be unwelcome or distasteful to recordists or those recorded. This is a position of considerable anxiety for some researchers, particularly those who carried out recording projects according to what they, and in many cases their interlocutors, considered optimistic, idealistic or even politically anti-imperial or anti-racist goals. Nonetheless, anthropologists and ethnomusicologists have no moral high ground here, no convenient outside position. Unwittingly or not, they — we — have been central players in creating a global schizophrenic condition whose consequences are now vastly more complex and open to contestation than any of its participants could have anticipated.

But the story is more complicated in this specific case because we have another connection to explore, one linking the tremendous popularity of Turnbull's *The Forest People* (1960), clearly a literary classic in the ethnographic genre, and the popularity of the Turnbull and Arom recordings, including, in the case of Arom's *Centrafrique: Anthologie de la Musique des Pygmées Aka* (1978/1993), an audio classic in the ethnomusicological genre. The existence of all of this research and publication clearly relates to a cumulative historical imaginary. Whatever its current manifestations, this imaginary is layered up over time from exotic and romantic narratives, and particularly from a colonial history that created a hierarchy of racialized others in which the radical physical distinctiveness of "pygmies" figured prominently (Haller 1975, Fiedler 1978, Gould 1981, Gogdan 1988, Thompson and Bahuchet 1991, Bradford and Blume 1992, Pieterse 1992, Stewart 1993:108-111). Wedded to this is a less anticipated narrative: the enormous appeal of pygmy music as

music, that is, as an extraordinary form of cultural invention in its own right, whether in the eyes of ancient Egyptians, of African villagers, of colonials and missionaries, of anthropologists and ethnomusicologists, of African and Western pop stars, or the accumulation of all of the above in the current world music marketplace. This whole fascination and appeal, this history of pygmyphilia, has been manifest, unevenly, both within and outside Africa. With apologies to Roger Wallis and Krister Malm's unrelated 1984 book title, this is a story about big sounds from small people, with the emphatic connection between the two adjectives.

LIKE WHERE MADONNA SAYS, "LET'S GET PHYSICAL" . . .

Taking in portions of current Zaïre, Peoples Republic of the Congo, Gabon, Cameroon, and Central African Republic, the equatorial forest is home to some perhaps 200,000 people. Locally circulating names like Mbuti, Aka, Mbenzélé, Binga, Ngombe, mask the fact that these original forest dwellers are lumped together by outsiders with the term "pygmy" in reference to once-common sub-150 cm height. More important than commonality of physical stature, the people in question share, across geographical region and languages, striking historical commonalities in their hunting and gathering practices, their relatively egalitarian and non-hierarchical social patterns, their aesthetic expressions, and their long-standing patterns of exchange, symbiosis and accommodation with surrounding Bantu agriculturists (Cavalli-Sforza 1986, Thompson and Bahuchet 1991).

Schizophonic makeovers of musics originating from Central Africa's rainforest peoples are particularly striking because the small physical stature of the people involved resembles their un- and dis-empowered material position. I say "unempowered" because they are historically dominated by various outsiders to their forest homes — Bantu agriculturists, European colonizers, national states, and, increasingly, transnational extractors of rainforest resources (Howe 1972, Bahuchet and Guillaume 1982, Turnbull 1983, Bahuchet 1985, Cavalli-Sforza 1986, Hewlett 1992, Grinker 1992, Sarno 1993, 1995, Mark 1995, Chadwick 1995). But they also are "disempowered," precisely because they have never gained control over how they are discursively represented. I refer to the reproduction of the term "pygmy" as their generic name (Turnbull 1983:1, Thompson and Bahuchet 1991). Slightness in height is what historically tied the notion of "pygmy" to the childlike and chimplike representations emanating from diverse observers, from Egyptians to Greeks, social Darwinists to social scientists. Half way to adult, half way to human, "pygmy" remains a specific physical essence, a primordial diminutive other.

Lest one worry about the drama in this phrasing, recall for a brief moment one of its historical consequences, namely, the dehumanization endured by Ota Benga, the first Central African forest hunter to take up residence in the United States. "Residence" is merely an ironic reference here, for Ota Benga was brought from Africa for display at the 1904 World's Fair in Saint Louis. He showed his filed teeth for a nickel per smile. His next home was a cage at the Bronx Zoo with a pet chimpanzee. His story, from capture to suicide, is told in detail in Phillips Verner Bradford and Harvey Blume's *Ota Benga: The Pygmy in the Zoo* (1992). It is a chilling account of the compli-

city of scientists and museums in turn of the century racism and freak show commerce.⁴

But most of the world did not encounter pygmies at the fair and zoo. And this is why the varieties of schizophonia that emerge from the colonial encounter are particularly important to map: they mark the historical moments and contexts where oral performance and cultural participation are transformed into material commodity and circulable representation. Ethnomusicologists and anthropologists could once claim innocence about the activities of recording and marketing what was variously called tribal, ethnic, folk, or traditional music. Now there is little doubt that this whole body of work, since the time of the invention of the phonograph, has been central to complex representations and commodity flows that are neither ideologically neutral, unflinchingly positive, or particularly equitable.

This is why, as a merchandising trade in otherness, ethnomusicological recordings demand fresh scrutiny. Scrutiny first of the ownership, copyright and royalty relationships between recordist, recorded, and recording and distributing companies (Seeger 1992). And scrutiny too of the unquestioned ability and power these recordings provide consumers to actively renegotiate the contents — the intellectual and cultural property — of the sounds that have been split from their sources. For from this ability and power stems both conditions for new musical genesis and an escalation in possibilities for musical subjugation. This raises the issue of whether the first splitting and its resultant image is most significant, or, rather, the way the marketed circulation of this initial split licenses the proliferation of other kinds of mutated and transformed copies. This type of proliferation, to follow Michael Taussig's thesis in *Mimesis and Alterity* (1993), encodes how the newly created object or event may desire and absorb the cumulative powers imagined to reside in what it has copied or taken over.

WHICH BRINGS US TO SCHIZOPHONIC MIMESIS . . .

A serious by-product of the popularity of the recordings by Turnbull, Arom and others is their heightened mediating positions in new chains of schizophonic mimesis. I coin the phrase “schizophonic mimesis” here to point to a broad spectrum of interactive and extractive practices. These acts and events produce a traffic in new creations and relationships through the use, circulation, and absorption of sound recordings. By “schizophonic mimesis” I want to question how sonic copies, echoes, resonances, traces, memories, resemblances, imitations, duplications all proliferate histories and possibilities. This is to ask how sound recordings, split from their source through the chain of audio production, circulation, and consumption (Schafer 1977:90-1, Feld 1994:258-260) stimulate and license renegotiations of identity. The recordings of course retain a certain indexical relationship to the place and people they both contain and circulate. At the same time their material and commodity conditions create new possibilities whereby a place and people can be recontextualized, rematerialized, and thus thoroughly reinvented. The question of how recordings open these possibilities in new, different or overlapping ways to face-to-face musical contacts, or to other historically prior or contiguous mediations remains both undertheorized and contentious.

Nonetheless, nobody questions the way in which musical commoditization is now dominated by acceleration and amplification (Erlmann and Pacini Hernandez 1993). The critical factors — the omnipresent possibilities for musical mixing and synthesis, and the rapid transit speeds at which such musical interchanges routinely occur — are themselves part of a broader set of focal conditions in what Arjun Appadurai links as global ethnoscaples and mediascaples (1991; for an accounting of several theoretical lineages of globalization theory see Foster 1991, Kearny 1995). I want to question the role schizophrenic mimesis plays in this acceleration, and ask what kinds of meanings are thus circulated by the resulting commodities. This also leads to a questioning of how a global apparatus links material, aesthetic, and legal arenas:

Laws of intellectual property generally — copyright, trademark, and publicity rights, in particular — constitute a political economy of mimesis in capitalist societies, constructing authors, regulating the activities of reproduction, licensing copying, and prohibiting imitation — all in the service of maintaining the exchange value of texts (Coombe 1996:206).

In a recent essay on discourses and practices of world music and world beat (Feld 1994) I tried to historicize the idea of schizophrenia by recalling Walter Benjamin's 1936 essay on "The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction" (Benjamin 1969). Benjamin's concern with the transformation from unique to plural existences invoked the idea of "aura," that which is lost from an original once it is reproduced. This "aura" frames the consequent status of the "copy," particularly as regards contestation of its "authenticity" or "legitimacy" vis-a-vis an "original." Against this earlier and somewhat monolithic anxiety about the jeopardy to primal originality, I urged that schizophrenia needs now to be imagined as more varied and uneven, as practices located in the situations, flows, phases, and circulation patterns that characterize how recordings move in and out of short- and long-term commodity states.

This perspective on schizophrenia comes as part of a general debate developed in dialogue with Charles Keil (Keil and Feld 1994:290-330), concerning how celebrations of global musical heterogeneity marketed as "world music" are now dynamically interdependent with the parallel musical homogeneity marketed as "world beat." I imagine this tension and interaction between "world music" and "world beat" as a rapidly reciprocating and symbiotic traffic, one that links schizophrenia to schismogenesis. By this I mean that the cultivation of a transnational arena of global musical discourses and practices is now characterized by a mutualism of splitting and escalation. This escalation — of difference, power, rights, control, ownership, authority — politicizes the schizophrenic practices artists could once claim more innocently as matters of inspiration, or, as a purely artistic dialogue of imitation and inspiration.

It is important to come to terms with the fact that despite the now widespread debates on music and cultural imperialism (e.g., Garofalo 1993), most schizophrenic practices are often referred to and sanctioned as transcultural inspiration by artists and critics alike. Which is to say that they are largely

asserted as purely musical forms of encounter. What is typically emphasized is the imagination or intuition that links one kind of artistry to another. And what is typically excluded is how the practices are asymmetrical, specifically assuming that “taking without asking” is a musical right of the owners of technology, copyrights, and distribution networks. From a more commercial standpoint we can locate this assumption of a “musical right” at the juncture of the cash transaction, where it is imagined equally as a “consumer right.” This notion is particularly poignant in the age of ubiquitous — and for some people, inexpensive — recording and digital sampling technologies, technologies whose use patterns contribute substantially to reproducing the positions of musical “givers” and “takers.”

JUST AS WHEN, WITHOUT WARNING, READING AN ALLEGORY OPENS A SPACE FOR ETHNOGRAPHY . . .

Jacques Attali's *Noise: The Political Economy of Music* (1985) opens another window onto this space of giving and taking, splitting and copying. He provides a sweeping allegorical remove for re-reading the BaMbuti metaphor of *akami*, “noise,” in the current audio-enviro-cosmology linking rainforest to record factory.

Music is inscribed between noise and silence, in the space of the social codification it reveals. Every code of music is rooted in the ideologies and technologies of its age, and at the same time produces them. If it is deceptive to conceptualize a succession of musical codes corresponding to a succession of economic and political relations, it is because time traverses music and music gives meaning to time (1985:19).

Attali thus imagines music as a succession of networks, the third and current of which he calls the network of “repetition,” the network that emerges with recording technology.

This technology, conceived as a way of storing representation, created in fifty years' time with the phonograph record, a new organizational network for the economy of music . . . The network is no longer a form of sociality, an opportunity for spectators to meet and communicate, but rather a tool making the individualized stockpiling of music possible on a large scale. Here again, the new network first appears in music as the herald of a new stage in the organization of capitalism, that of the repetitive mass production of all social relations (1985:32).

Attali sees the network of repetition dominated by processes of unification, of centralization, of molding, of depersonalization, of integration, of systems, of management — a cybernetic matrix of programming and control he calls “imperial universality” (1985:113). It is here that he locates elite musicians as ideologues working alongside powerful technocrats and a knowledge-rich minority.

Today the repetitive machine has produced silence, the centralized political control of speech, and more generally, noise. Everywhere, power reduces the noise made by others and adds sound prevention

to its arsenal. Listening becomes an essential means of surveillance and social control (1985:122).

Repetition stockpiles use-time. In repetition, the social demand for a service is expressed more in terms of the possession of an object than its usage: the social demand for music is channeled into a demand for records . . . Replicated man finds pleasure in stockpiling the instruments of a deritualized substitute for the sacrifice (1985:124).

If, within Attali's network of repetition "identity . . . creates a mimicry of desires" (1985:121), how are we to imagine the contradictory logics embodied in both the silence that mutes difference and the "conquest of the right to make noise" that affirms it? What powers of mediation does mimesis embody and unleash at the site of exchange?

The discourse on mimesis — on copies, on resemblance, on duplication — has been central to Western aesthetics since Plato's warning, in the *Republic*, that the depiction of likeness is a dangerous subversion of art's essential quest for truth. Aristotle's reply, that mimetic production involved creative impulses no less complex than those in nature to which they are a response, set in motion a debate that has reverberated endlessly into our times (a thorough review is Gebauer and Wulf 1995).

To turn directly to the contemporary debates: under modernism, the notion of representation often appears transformed into the notions of reflection and revelation — a direct appeal to the senses to imagine an interconnected world of objects. The process of mimetic production thus takes over from the problem of the split original, the schizoid iconicity of a simultaneous unity and multiplicity. This rupture is precisely the linchpin of postmodern discourse, where the appropriation born of mimesis is both the official bastard of social hierarchy and the living mark that every relationship of copy to copied is an icon of unequal power relations. Jacques Derrida, in particular, was persuasive rephrasing this critique towards the ambivalent status of strategic ploy, one resolutely devoted to challenging whether a truth is mimicked by a fiction, or a fiction by a truth (Derrida 1976). This deconstructive view tends toward a discourse on mimesis that makes it about crisis, that is, destabilization and disruption, more than it is about "truth," that is, primal reference or originality.⁵

This is curiously close to another theorization of mimesis at the double-edge of affirmation and critique, namely the one found in Theodore Adorno's final project, on aesthetic theory (1983). Here mimesis makes a theatrical appearance cloaked as the warped logic of domination, dialectically unleashing repressed desire, a longing for the other, while regressively controlling it so as to bury its history forever. Adorno repeatedly insists that as distance, separation and isolation are illuminated as the products of domination, so too do they glow as signals of a desire to reach out of subjection and into connection. Thus the janus face of social history central to Adorno, that of liberation and repression, always smiles and smirks through mimetic expression.

If these ideas seem eerie and even local to anthropologists and ethnomusicologists, it is no doubt because a parallel dialectic historically links their

fields to mimesis. This is the process of continually subverting and inverting what is familiar and what is strange. Like aesthetic mimesis, anthropology or ethnomusicology's own involves an erotic embrace of the other framed by the negative potential of dominating love. That is perhaps why they often acknowledge mimesis as memory. In Adorno's own phrasing: ". . . longing, which posits the actuality of the non-existent, takes the form of remembrance" (1983:192).

BUT MEANWHILE, AN AVANT-GARDE TECHNO-JUNGLE KIND OF THING . . .

The jazz avant-gardes of the 1960s and 1970s extended well beyond New York. One connection was to Brazilian guitarist and composer Egberto Gismonti, well known internationally for his eight string guitar virtuosity and his performances with percussionists and jazz improvisers like Airto Moriera, Paul Horn, Nana Vasconcelos, and Charlie Haden. Trained in composition in Paris with Nadia Boulanger and Jean Barraqué, Gismonti devoted 1977 to the study of Xingu Indian music (Stern 1978). This project was directly reflected by his LP released in the following year, *Sol Do Meio Dia (Midday Sun)*. The album features Gismonti with percussionists Nana Vasconcelos and Collin Walcott, guitarist Ralph Towner, and saxophonist Jan Garbarek. The LP was recorded in Oslo for the ECM label, which released it internationally in 1978 to enthusiastic reviews.

Through the 1970s ECM developed a particular technological aesthetic featuring crystalline audio transparency, a brittle if ice-clear sound, marked by hauntingly stark reverberation. This ECM sound shaped one of the significant aesthetic spaces of global improvisational avant-gardism in the late 1970s, intensifying atmospheric presence and focusing attention on audio resonance. It is in this context that we can hear the deep fundamentals and open overtones of a moment in Gismonti's "Sapain." Here, in a densely layered Villa-Lobos to global-village interlude featuring bottles and wood flutes, the same musical material from both the Arom and Taurelle and the Hancock presentation of the BaBenzélé *hindewhu* is merged with an evocation of the overlapping echo-phonies of Amazonian Indian flutes. In this way, Gismonti joins the Amazonian rainforest and its inhabitants together with an imagined parallel world in Central Africa, producing an interconnected space of primal musical otherness. One can glimpse how Gismonti might imagine this connection by reading his dedication in the liner notes:

The music on this album is dedicated to Sapain and the Xingu Indians, whose teachings were so important to me during the time I spent with them in the Amazon jungle: The sound of the jungle, its color and mysteries; the sun, the moon, the rain and the winds; the river and the fish; the sky and the birds, but most of all the integration of musician, music and instrument into an undivided whole.

An interesting and immediate contrast similarly traversing art and pop avant-garde lineages is Jon Hassell and Brian Eno's 1979 LP *Fourth World Volume 1, Possible Musics*, which has a track titled "Ba-Benzélé," credited to Hassell. The source material was obviously the same BaBenzélé *hindewhu* recording but the transformative techniques and media employed are concrète

and electronic, yielding a muted, mysterious, muzak-like quality, a cross between synthesized panpipes and speeded-up tape loops. Like Gismonti, Hassell's work is framed by his impeccable international avant-garde credentials: jazz trumpeting, a European Ph.D. in musicology, composition studies in Cologne with Karlheinz Stockhausen, and performance studies in India with renowned vocalist Pran Nath (Palmer 1980). These experiences create the elements for Hassell's work in the jungle garden of primitive futurism. *Fourth World Volume 1, Possible Musics*, like Hassell's other projects from the same period, *Earthquake Island* and *Dream Theory in Malaya*, helped create a global avant-garde space whose sound is equally futuristic and primitivistic, ethnic and electronic.

But there is an additional appropriation to consider. "Ba-Benzélé:" a people so named are now a song title owned by another. And upon hearing the song the connection to a place or people is in every way sonically distant, while a human specificity is called into immediacy. The usual "us" vs. "them" positions are recreated, reversed, turned inside out. Or are they? Is the Fourth World the imaginary others with possible imaginary other music? Or are avant-garde composer-performers the Fourth World, making possible musics by going beyond all existing musics? What otherness is in fact invoked by this blur?

Possible musics, possible cultures, possible architecture, possible lifestyles, etc. This is an idea that boils down to the range of possible relations between individual, tribe and nation in the mass electronic age. Imagine a grid of national boundaries, and on to those project a new non-physical communications derived geography — tribes of like-minded thinkers. Since a situation like this has never before existed, it follows that old, narrow band approaches can't work and that new approaches must be creative. This means intuitive and improvisational. I would like the message of Fourth World to be that things shouldn't be diluted. This balance between the native identity and the global identity via various electronic extensions is not one that can be dictated or necessarily predicted. One should be very humble and respectful of our lack of knowledge about how those things combine, and be informed by knowledge of the way things used to be in smaller numbers — that's where it becomes very useful to look at other cultures, small cultures, and try to develop a *modus operandi* for the new age, not New Age (Hassell, in Toop 1995:168).

For Hassell, Eno, and their listeners, ambient music was an other world of the imagination and illusion. Electronic synthesis — always low key, ambient, repetitive, minimal, vaguely reminiscent but definitely non-referential — was its mode of techno-transport. The listener who has heard BaBenzélé music must strain to insert a memory trace, must imagine the original pattern in the wavy, watery, wishy-washy dissolution of its elements.

Fourth World Volume 1, Possible Musics and the ambient electrosynthesis of Hassell and Eno's "Ba-Benzélé" can be further contextualized in a larger body of avant-garde art and pop music. Hassell was clearly influenced by the high electro-modernism of Karlheinz Stockhausen, whose experiments

in “found objects” and “international gibberish” (e.g., “Hymnen,” using one hundred and thirty seven national anthems), East-West cutups (“Stimmung”), and global forecasting (“Telemusik”) are detailed in an important background text of 1973, his *Towards a Cosmic Music*, especially a chapter titled “Beyond Global Village Polyphony” (Stockhausen 1989). In parallel, Eno’s formative 1960s influences were John Cage and Cornelius Cardew. He took up multi-track tape recorder as his instrument, and through the 1970s had a string of extraordinary pop collaborations and credits from Roxy Music to Robert (King Crimson) Fripp, John Cale, Velvet Underground, and David Bowie. By the end of the 1970s Eno focused on his soundtrack and *Ambient* volumes, including *Music for Airports*, and the extremely popular (and later highly contested for its appropriation politics) 1981 project with David Byrne, *My Life in the Bush of Ghosts* (Pareles 1982, Toop 1995:122-23).

On these margins two additional Eno-pygmy connections come to mind. One is to Louis Sarno, an American who has spent more than ten years living with the BaBenzélé and has recently collaborated on a soundscape and music recording project, *Bayaka*, with acoustic ecologist Bernie Krause (Sarno 1995). He has also written a popular book, a romantic and lyrical travelogue, *Song from the Forest* which mentions a commission from Eno to collect music and sounds for a rainforest environment Eno was to produce for a New York art festival (Sarno 1993:80, also see Toop 1995:130-131). This “collecting” reveals Eno’s use of and attitude toward the use of Africa. As he expresses it in a recent interview:

Classical music is music without Africa . . . Do you know what I hate about computers? The problem with computers is that there is not enough Africa in them . . . Do you know what a nerd is? A nerd is a human being without enough Africa in him or her . . . You know why music was the center of our lives for such a long time? Because it was a way of allowing Africa in (Kelly 1995; for another side of Eno’s essentialisms, see his comments on cantometrics in Toop 1995:107-108).

Yet another Eno-pygmy connection is to renowned filmmaker Wim Wenders. Eno produced (with Daniel Lanois), the U2 song “Until the End of the World” that is featured in Wenders’ 1991 film of the same name; he also influenced the design direction of the soundtrack (on the Lanois, Hassell, and Eno connections see Toop 1995:146-8). Pygmies are featured in a major symbolic role in this film, which is an allegorical treatment of the history of vision, film, and dreaming. Wenders’ vehicle is an apocalyptic, around the world mixed genre where the mad scientist meets the chase and escape thriller. At the center of the tale is a camera that can record brain impulses, which once decoded can permit a blind person to see. Ultimately this technology creates the possibility for people to record and replay their own dreams. The last part of the film is set in the scientist’s lab in the Central Australian desert. Aboriginal Australians are deployed in numerous ways to suggest the links between past and future, between x-ray art and futurist mental telepathy. They are represented as uniquely able to see back into the Dreamtime, and ahead into the end of the world. Wenders uses the trope of Aboriginal empathy for and adoption of the visionary scientist and his

blind wife to tell a story about memory as forecasting in a world which has become addicted to dreams.

The pygmies fit into this grand scheme as the aural, childlike foil to the Aborigines, who are clearly the embodiment of ancient and futurist visual wisdom. To bring the pygmies into the narrative, composer Graeme Revell used digital samples of Aka children's songs in the film's soundtrack, beginning with the titles. These samples were taken from and credited to Simha Arom's *Centrafrique: Anthologie de la Musique des Pygmées Aka* (1978/1993). More significant is an important on-screen referential use of an Aka lullaby track to signify aural past echoes of simple, joyous, childlike, uncomplicated life (i.e., what Europeans presumably must once have been like). After hearing the pygmy lullaby in the car cassette the heroine goes into a deep trancelike slumber for five hundred kilometers of Euro-highway. "I haven't slept so long in weeks," says Claire as she awakes in Paris.

AND A HYBRID SISTERS KIND OF THING . . .

Jon Hassell isn't the only musician to name a song Ba-Benzélé. So did (with a different spelling) Zap Mama, an *a capella* group comprised of women of mixed African and European heritage. The US release of their 1993 (originally 1991) debut CD, *Zap Mama: Adventures in Afropea* was curated by former Talking Heads leader David Byrne, whose Luaka Bop label (in the Warner Brothers family) has taken an important entrepreneurial role in global pop. The recording commanded the number one position on *Billboard's* World Music Albums chart for four months that year.

In the CD's liner notes Zap Mama leader Marie Daulne says: "Thanks to my dual cultural background — Walloon and Bantu, Belgian and Zairean — I discovered (and would like others to discover by listening to this record) the richness and diversity of the musics that are the foundation of our African and European repertoire." Daulne goes on to acknowledge "the ethnomusicologists whose records inspired me," but saves her strongest note of admiration for "the Pygmies of Central Africa."

Through the body, the breath, the respiration, the vibration of the vocal chords, and without the support of elaborate instruments, the Pygmies keep on conveying — to those willing to approach and listen — the beauty and purity of one of the most ancient cultures. One of my dearest wishes is, through these recordings, to participate in bringing people closer through understanding and respect for each culture — with, of course, a special attention to the people threatened by the triumphant materialism of the modern world."

Daulne's pygmy connection was regularly taken up by the pop press, who used it for their own exoticizing spins, barely mentioning that she had studied at the Antwerp School of Jazz, or that other tracks on the CD draw on Spanish, Syrian, Cuban, Zairian and other idioms and influences.

Daulne traveled through Central Africa, absorbing vocal, rhythmic and storytelling traditions, particularly from the pygmies who use music to contact the spirits (Sinclair 1992).

Daulne, who was born in Zaïre to a Belgian father (who was later killed in a political revolt) and Zairian mother, returned to her

birthplace at one point and learned her singing style, in part, from the pygmies who were present at her birth (Newman 1993:20).

Daulne has studied the social and political context for songs and sounds from ancient cultures, such as the pygmies of Central Africa whose trilling, hypnotic chants inspired such Zap Mama songs as ‘Mupepe’ and ‘Babanzélé’ (Duffy 1993).

Although she has spent most of her life in Belgium, as a very young child she lived with the pygmies in the Zairian forest. The earthy chants, bird songs and musical animal cries that are recurrent elements in Zap Mama’s music suggest a stylized echo of pygmy music (Hall 1994).

The Zap Mama track titled “Babanzélé” is an eight voice adaptation of a complex polyphonic piece featuring whistles and voices, originally recorded on the same 1966 Arom and Taurelle LP as the solo *hindewhu*. What is striking about this Zap Mama performance is that it is a far more detailed, nuanced and complete vocal mimesis of BaBenzélé vocalization than anything previously recorded. Treating BaBenzélé music as music, as fully articulated practices and pieces, Zap Mama copies the repertory object and develops its techniques of ostinatos and variations to closely duplicate the multiple layering of voices, *hindewhu*, clapping, and percussion on the 1966 LP. An authenticity is guaranteed to mimesis here in light of Daulne’s invocation of her own physical, cultural, and historical hybridity. In other words, invoking hybridity as one’s own identity position, one then is licensed to claim the full spatiotemporal terrain of that identity as an artistic palette.

MAYBE EVEN A MAGIC FLUTE KIND OF THING . . .

Cameroonian novelist, poet, and composer Francis Bebey was born and educated in Douala, then went to Paris to study music and broadcasting. He has many times toured the world as a classical guitarist, and is also well-known as a prolific poet and novelist (e.g., 1971, 1978, 1981). He has worked for UNESCO in Paris since 1972. Francis Bebey is widely credited as the first Cameroonian musician to transcend specific local styles of music and to successfully mix elements of different African instrumental and vocal repertoires with European music. Although Cameroon is better known on the international pop scene since the early 1970s for the Makossa beat of saxophonist and bandleader Manu Dibango, Bebey was equally important as an early inspirational model for Cameroonian and other African musicians who wanted to blend musical sources and styles (Dibango 1994:15, 79).

Cameroon has forests populated by Baka, but Bebey is well aware of pygmy musics from the recorded sources of the 1960s. In his 1975 (French original 1969) general book, *African Music: A People’s Art* there is a picture labeled “A fine hunter and an excellent musician — a true Pygmy.” There follows a brief section on the music. Bebey writes:

(Pygmies) live by hunting, gathering wild fruits, and bartering with villages on the edge of the forest; all their daily occupations are accompanied by music. Men and women, young and old alike, contribute their share to the collective enjoyment by singing, clapping, stamping, and other rhythmic actions. All Pygmies are

musicians, otherwise they would be incapable of participating fully in the nomadic life of this race of hunters. Pygmy music is usually very sophisticated in rhythm and form, as well as in its ritual structure. Pygmies rarely sing in unison; the songs they perform to create a successful hunting expedition are polyphonic in form with a fairly simple rhythmic pattern provided by handclapping and sticks struck one against another. Although their songs are constructed within a very strict framework, the performers are left with great freedom to improvise. In this type of community, where everyone is a musician, the artist usually has no particular place in society to single him out from the rest (1975:18-19).

In a later section on instruments and voice Bebey writes of the *hindewhu*, referenced to Arom & Taurelle's 1966 BaBenzélé recording.

The whistle may also be used concurrently with the human voice; the musician sings a tune that is punctuated at regular intervals by the sound of the whistle. This is a common practice in Pygmy music (1975:66; also fn. 48 to p. 181).

Now the BaBenzélé *hindewhu* sound has emerged in Bebey's own concert repertory. His 1993 CD, a tribute to Dr. Albert Schweitzer, features '*ndewhoo* (his spelling) sounds, developing the vocal-instrumental interplay with overdubbed percussion. Like Zap Mama, Bebey takes a BaBenzélé technique and extends it. In his liner notes to *Lambaréné Schweitzer* he writes of the "*ndewhoo*, a magical flute usually played by the Ba-Binga and Ba-Benzélé Pygmies . . ." He says:

'Ndewhoo: the Pygmy flute, is considered magic because despite the fact that it emits only one single note, it can still be used to perform a whole melody. All the musician has to do is to alternate notes from head voice with the only note of the flute. This fascinating technique is an invention by the Pygmies who readily use it in their own musical performances.

Bebey apparently began to incorporate the *hindewhu* sound in the early 1980s, following his success using the *sanza*. He has performed the technique live in concerts from Elysée Palace in Paris to New York's Carnegie Hall. In addition to *Lambaréné Schweitzer*, two other recordings document his compositional history with *hindewhu* techniques: *Akwaaba* (1985) and *Nandolo/With Love* (1995). The back jacket notice of the later, his newest, mentions that Bebey has just finished a commission, "a piece for Pygmy flute and string quartet, 'Kasilane' for the Kronos Quartet . . ." Listening to these three recordings makes it clear that Bebey has mastered all the techniques of rapid blown/sung and falsetto/open voice alternations, using a bamboo panpipe imitation of the papaya stem whistle.

Yet there is still, as with Zap Mama (and Herbie Hancock), a lingering issue, which is the place of condescension, even subjugation, within a sphere overtly marked by inspiration and musically coded as homage. Which is to say that polemics of race and cultural theft do not critically feature in critical discourses surrounding Zap Mama and Frances Bebey's pygmy kind of thing the way they feature more immediately in relation to Gismonti or Hassell

and Eno's pygmoid kind of thing. Clearly the subject positions of Afropeans and Africans (and African-Americans) tends to discourage a particular kind of moral and political scrutiny here, instead foregrounding an aesthetic reading of schizophonic mimesis as musical ambassadorship. Nonetheless, the power differentials separating all cosmopolitans from their forest pygmy muses cannot be elided. Such differentials are no less striking here than anywhere in imagining how commodity circulation reproduces the place of givers and takers, sources and users. While avant-gardes know no bounds, some have differential recourse to roots. "Respect," as Aretha Franklin taught us, carries a complicated burden (Keil and Feld 1994:218-226, 304-311).

OR A FOLKIE AND GREEN YOU CAN HAVE IT BOTH WAYS KIND OF THING . . .

Martin Cradick's 1993 *Spirit of the Forest* combines digital sampling and studio overdubs with tracks of his live guitar and mandolin playing along with the percussion of Baka forest people in Southeast Cameroon. Some of the Baka sounds, in their original live form, appear on the companion CD *Heart of the Forest*. Thus, spoken for simultaneously is the authenticity of the original — the "Heart" — and the sincerity of the copy — the "Spirit." Here the documentary world music genre completely blurs with its world beat jam session remix. Cradick's liner notes to *Spirit of the Forest* describe his experiences of making music with the Baka, and speak directly to his intentions:

I have tried to recreate the spirit of these occasions rather than copy the music exactly and have included their performances, especially their percussion, where it helps in this aim. I realize that many people will want to hear their music without my influence on it so I have produced a companion album, *Heart of the Forest*, with a selection of their traditional music.

While there are numerous divergences between the two CDs the immediate impression of their close connection is overwhelming. Not only is the cover art for the two extraordinary similar, but their beginnings stake out an auditory kinship. "Yelli," track 1 of *Heart of the Forest*, consists of untexted yodels sounded deep in the forest. "Spirit of the Forest," track 1 of *Spirit of the Forest*, begins with a digital sample of this sonic material, which then gives way to a mandolin and guitar reworking of the yodeled melody line. This track is credited to Martin Cradick and performed by Martin Cradick (guitar, mandolin, digital samples), accompanied by Baka percussionists and vocalists. This technique, in a variety of forms and transformations, characterizes the relationship between the Baka "heart" and the "spirit" known as Baka Beyond, Cradick's band name. Following the success of these two recordings, Cradick continued the approach with new field recordings to create *The Meeting Pool*, a second CD in 1995.

Aside from the "have it both ways" authenticity of this form of production, there is another complicated connection between the two recordings. In the liner notes to the Baka Beyond collaboration, *Spirit of the Forest*, Cradick writes: "All performance and compositional royalties due to the Baka for this album will be collected for them to use to protect their forest and to develop in a sustainable way without losing their knowledge and culture." And in the

liner notes to the companion documentary recording, *Heart of the Forest*, Cradick also notes that the royalties will all go to the Baka. In both instances Cradick indicates clear concern for the current cultural and environmental survival issues faced by Baka and their forest home. In the *Spirit of the Forest* liner notes this concern borders on a deep nostalgia.

They greeted us with a warmth, hospitality and respect that seems so rare these days . . . Living with them in an island of sanity in an increasingly insane world was a joy and a privilege and I hope the music conveys these feelings.

But in the *Heart of the Forest* liner conclusion, Cradick's collaborator Jeremy Avis directly articulates how this "island of sanity" is perhaps but a fantasy, lightly floating above the realities of nation-states who marginalize their remote others in harmony with global capitalist expansion:

African governments crippled by debts owed to Western development banks are forced to 'mine' their natural resources, such as the Baka's rainforest homeland, to get badly needed foreign capital. This short term financial gain does not reach the Baka, and the long term effects on their culture of this loss of habitat will have destructive and far-reaching consequences. Proceeds from the sale of this album will go back to the rainforest and go a small way to reversing the flow of resources exploitatively removed from the South to the North. The rest is up to you.⁶

AND FINALLY AN INTERNATIONAL DISCO DANCE MEGA-HIT KIND OF THING . . .

As a final contrast, there is the international disco multi-million seller, *Deep Forest*. Released in 1992, in a bilingual edition produced by Dan Lacksman and "based on an original idea by Michel Sanchez," *Deep Forest* features digitally sampled and manipulated sounds mixed with synthesized contemporary percussion and melody tracks. Arranged and adapted by Eric Mouquet and Michel Sanchez using synthesizer keyboards and other MIDI programming devices for synchronization, the African materials come from several ethnographic recordings of musics from Ghana, Senegal, Cameroon, Central African Republic and Burundi. Some of the pygmy sources are credited to a recent CD, *Polyphony of the Deep Rain Forest*; others come from earlier recordings by Simha Arom.

As a statement of *Deep Forest*'s intention we might inspect the liner text:

Imprinted with the ancestral wisdom of the African chants, the music of *Deep Forest* immediately touches everyone's soul and instinct. The forest of all civilizations is a mysterious place where the yarn of tales and legends is woven with images of men, women, children, animals and fairies. Not only living creatures, but also trees steeped in magical powers. Universal rites and customs have been profoundly marked by the influence of the forest, a place of power and knowledge passed down from generation to generation by the oral traditions of primitive societies. The chants of *Deep Forest*, Baka chants of Cameroon, of Burundi, of Senegal and of pygmies, transmit a part of this important tradition gathering all peoples and joining all continents through the universal language of music. *Deep Forest* is

the respect of this tradition which humanity should cherish as a treasure which marries world harmony, a harmony often compromised today. That's why the musical creation of *Deep Forest* has received the support of UNESCO and of two musicologists, Hugo Zemp (sic) and Shima (sic) Aron (sic), who collected the original documents.

This text, consistent with *Deep Forest's* publicity, video, art packaging (childlike scrawls, forest symbols), and audio design are a treasure textbook of every essentializing, romanticizing, exoticising trope available. The pygmy other is particularly equated with spirituality, the natural world, solidarity with the earth, balance and timelessness. As the introductory song puts it (in deep tones): "Somewhere deep in the jungle are living some little men and women. They are your past; maybe they are your future." The musical correlates of this stance are clear. In "Hunting," for example, the main melody is a direct digital sample from the first track of *Polyphony of the Deep Rain Forest*. The opening loop which creates a continuous response is a repeated sample metrically fixing a three pitch yodel — up a minor 7th, down a minor 3rd to sound the 5th — to create the key figure and refrain for a dance groove.

In addition to extraordinary success in the international marketplace (at least 2.5 million copies sold worldwide in the three years following its release in April 1993) *Deep Forest's* lead song was also heard widely as the soundtrack to TV commercials where a nude mermaid splashed through lush mountain streams advertising Neutrogena skincare products. Material from the CD was also licensed for other TV commercials like Sony's Triniton TV screen, and by clients as diverse as The Body Shop and Porsche; "it is truly the Benetton of music-marketing concepts" (Ross 1993:11). The publicity has been massive, the press response overwhelmingly positive, and the Deep Forest production team has gone on to apply the same technique to Gypsy and Celtic musics (Sprague 1995, Goldman 1995). The resulting CD *Bohème* won the 1996 World Music Grammy award (Pareles 1996). In an interview about this new recording Deep Forest's Eric Mouquet displays the "anything that is possible is permissible" underpinnings of his technocratic attitude toward music.

They say 'ah, no. You have no right to do that, put synthesizers on our music.' I say 'Why? Why can't I do that? Give me a good reason.' And of course they have no good reason (Goldman 1995:39).

Like the *Heart of the Forest* and *Spirit of the Forest* CDs, *Deep Forest* prominently advertises its social altruism. The liner contains the following notice:

The producers and musicians on this recording are donating part of their profits to The Pygmy Fund. Join us in helping save the African Pygmies and preserve their unique rain forest songs and music by sending your tax-deductible donation directly to: The Pygmy Fund, PO Box 277, Malibu, CA 90265, Attn: Jean-Pierre Hallet. For \$5 or more you will receive, along with your receipt, a 'To Save the People' kit and an original 5 1/2 x 8" photograph of a pygmy child.

Jean-Pierre Hallet, who directs the Pygmy Fund, grew up near the Ituri forest and won a Presidential End Hunger award for his agricultural work with the Efé (Hallet 1973). Hallet's Pygmy Fund is specifically designed to help the Efé, a group whose music was not sampled on the *Deep Forest* CD. As it turns out, inspection of The Pygmy Fund's tax returns for the years since *Deep Forest* reveals little change in their contribution base. One can only surmise that the fund has received little money from *Deep Forest*. My own letters and phone calls to Passionate Entertainment (the *Deep Forest* production company) about this have gone unanswered for the last two years.

TELLING STORIES IN MUSIC . . .

Do these scattered moments and manifestations form a narrative? If so, is it as coherent, or more or less so than what I've hunted and gathered here? How are these narrative variations speaking to critical postmodern themes about disjunctions in a global sphere of popular commodity circulation? To these questions, and across the range of engagements — who enjoys and embraces, or who regrets and detests the music objects circulating in the pygmy pop genre — I'd propose four critical ostinatos underlying world beat's pygmy pop.

From Afro-nationalism to Euro avant-gardism, from electroacoustic modernism to digital postmodernism, from highbrow to low, there's a pygmy product to fit every viewpoint on authenticity and collaboration, every celebration of roots and hybridity.

Whether the groove is pop sweet-talk, jazz scat, funk or ballad, whether it is trans-forest acoustic or transworld ambient; whether it's the hybridity of Afropea, the concertizing of Euroafrique; whether it is a folkie mandolin play-along eco-jam, or ethno-techno sampling, there's a pygmy for any and all consumer positions and tastes.

Everyone — no matter now exoticizing, how patronizing, how romanticizing, how essentializing in their rhetoric or packaging — declares their fundamental respect, even deep affection for the original music and its makers.

Concern for the future of the rainforests and their inhabitants is now central to the genre. This heightening is paralleled by romantic and patronizing renditions of an old theme, the "pygmy as timeless primal other." A complex humanity is thus fixed as a tape loop in the machine of both postcolonial devastation and primitivist fantasy.

For anthropologists and ethnomusicologists the most profoundly ironic and complicated aspect of the situation is the contrast between the musical stories told by pygmy pop and those told by the documentary recordings upon which these copies draw and depend. The documentary records emphasize a vast repertoire of musical forms and performance styles, including complex and original polyphonic and polyrhythmic practices. Yet what of this diverse musical invention forms the basis for its global pop representation? In the most popular instances it is a single untexted vocal-

ization or falsetto yodel, often hunting cries rather than songs or musical pieces. This is the sonic cartoon of the diminutive person, the simple, intuitively vocal and essentially non-linguistic child. Why, in the face of such a varied and complex corpus of musical practices, does global pygmy pop reproduce the most caricatured image of its origin?

There is a further irony. Some critics and contemporary pygmy pop artists like Zap Mama and Frances Bebey thank ethnomusicologists for recording the sounds in the first place and for bringing them to the world's attention. Yet others position ethnomusicology as the discourse of musical regression, and its practitioners merely as purist romantics and apologists. For example, one *Village Voice* critic, Randall Grass, states his initial pessimism upon reading Marie Daulne's liner notes about the source of her inspiration. "Don't get me wrong — the Pygmies genuinely awesome vocal polyphony can be magical; it was the academic aesthetic of the recordings themselves [i.e., those by ethnomusicologists, SF] that undermined their beauty (1992:84). But upon listening he was won over by the group's performance: "Zap Mama uses Pygmy tradition as a base to create something personal and — dare we say it? — novel" (1982:884). Likewise, *Melody Maker* columnist Ben Turner praises the Deep Forest duo by positioning them opposite to academic voyeurs: ". . . *Deep Forest's* mystical sound is not however, that of two musicologists who have hidden in the forest and eavesdropped on the conversations of the Pygmies" (Turner 1994:37). Other writers attempt to position what's exciting about hybrid world beat in opposition to what's moldy about world music roots. *Creem's* Brooke Wentz writes:

What's the ethnic flavor of the month? Pygmies. Like this year's contemporaries — the Belgian/Zairian *a capella* group Zap Mama and the French techno duo Deep Forest — the Afro-Euro instrumental melange Baka Beyond incorporates the voices and water drums of Cameroon's Baka pygmies with western music. The result is a marvelous combination of crystalline rhythms — a modern listener's wet dream, and an ethnomusicologist's worst nightmare (Wentz 1994).

Whatever one's judgment on the purism of ethnomusicology or the fun of the record studio, pygmy pop's schizophonia involves a rapid escalation of amplification and diminution. The primary circulation of several thousand, small-scale, low-budget, and largely non-profit ethnomusicological records is now directly linked to a secondary circulation of several million dollars worth of contemporary record sales, copyrights, royalty and ownership claims, many of them held by the largest music entertainment conglomerates in the world. Hardly any of this money circulation returns to or benefits the originators of the cultural and intellectual property in question. It is this basic inequity, coupled with the reproduction of such negative caricature, that creates the current ethnomusicological reality: discourses on world music are inseparable from discourses on indigeneity and domination.

Fans and marketers of contemporary world beat want the world to listen and dance to musics they imagine to be contemporary, vital, and profoundly transcultural. They are selling celebrations of hybridity; for them pygmy pop rejoices the forest. But for critics, whether world music purists, pastiche

haters, nostalgia apologists, or advocates for indigeneity and intellectual property rights, this rejoicing is burdened. The worry is that Jacques Attali's *Noise*, however dramatic and freewheeling, might be more correct than not: "Mimesis eliminates all obstacles to murder, all scapegoats" (1985:130). Either way, readers of Colin Turnbull's ethnographies are now inevitably forced to consider a more nuanced, ironic, or cynical reading of his exegesis of the Mbuti saying *akami amu ndura*, "noise kills the forest."

AND WHEN DO THE PYGMIES GET TO SPEAK?

I am not in face to face dialogue with Central African forest people, hence indigenous voices and perspectives are absent here. But my inability to represent how they are speaking should not be equated with their silence. While such matters need to be acknowledged, I don't think they vitiate the critical thrust of this project, because my central concern is with a general mapping of representations rather than with their specifically local implications in indigenous communities. No ethnographer or researcher I know is focally addressing the issue of how pygmies respond to representations of them. But academics are working on related projects, and their perspectives will take these stories in other directions.

Michelle Kisliuk has studied Biaka expressive culture over the last ten years (Kisliuk 1991). She responded with concern to some of my characterizations, urging that they are too focused on the "music of the past," the music of earlier generations, music only mildly interesting to Biaka today. She feels that the emphasis in research must now move toward the current repertoire, which among other topics addresses missionization, deforestation, and commercial hunting. She thinks that worrying over the term "pygmy" detracts attention from the immediate needs and conditions of the people in question (Kisliuk 1994).

Alec Leonhardt is writing a dissertation at Princeton about pygmy representations in science and popular culture, based both on fieldwork with Baka in the NorthWest Congo Basin, and study of current cultural practices and discourses (1995, n.d.). His title, quoting a Baka contemporary, is telling: "our grandparents were pygmies." The distance and irony here indicates complex shifts in identity. This raises difficult questions about how to remunerate and honor cultural and intellectual property rights, particularly when those rights reside with people whose connections to their cultural past is tenuous, disrupted, or willfully erased.

Finally, Louis Sarno continues his life of living and recording among the BaBenzélé. And along with that he feels increasingly burdened to address enormous problems that he knows he cannot solve (1996). He rails against conservationists who prohibit pygmies from hunting on their own lands so that those lands can be studied instead by visiting ecologists. He sees the non-governmental organizations who would "protect" pygmies rather as complicit agents in their transnational disenfranchisement. He worries that requests for performances in Paris or New York will only satisfy cosmopolitans, and leave Bayaka with an exaggerated and unrealistic view of themselves and their place in the world. As his current collaborator Bernie Krause puts it, "If he blends into the background of the forest and culture and does nothing, he dies a little each day. If he becomes an activist on behalf

of the Bayaka . . . the local and regional pressures on the tribe will effect them in other untold ways” (Krause 1996).

These pressing matters have now moved into the representational arena of Central African ethnomusicology. This is signaled in the packaging for *Echoes of the Forest: Music of the Central African Pygmies*, a recent compilation of Mbuti recordings by Colin Turnbull, Efé recordings by Jean-Pierre Hallet, and Bayaka recordings by Louis Sarno (1995). At the close of sixty pages of photographs and notes is a statement from Batwanda pygmy Charles Owirajiye, from a speech at the 1992 World Conference of Indigenous Peoples in Brazil:

We are the first people. When the second people came and cut down the trees and plants it forced us to live in other areas, uprooted. What can happen to us, our ecosystems, when our land is being cut down beside us? We need leadership and representation (1995:61).

There’s yet another way to remember how the pygmies speak. In their *Ota Benga* study, Bradford and Blume mention pygmies attacking photographers and confronting visitors who prodded, poked and harassed them at the World’s Fair. They also mention accounts of parodic pygmy imitations of marching bands and American Indians (1992:117-221; 250-252). Turnbull’s analyses of opposition and conflict mention Mbuti imitations of surrounding Bantu villagers (e.g., 1965:229-245). And Sarno reflexively and hilariously describes how BaBenzélé imitated his way of reading a book by Lévi-Strauss (1993:52). But perhaps the best use of mimesis as contestation comes as the last (and untitled) band on the B side of Colin Turnbull’s 1961 Lyrichord LP *Music of the Rainforest Pygmies*. Turnbull went to an unfamiliar forest camp and coaxed people to sing for his tape recorder. He told them he wanted to hear the oldest song they knew. Complete with polyrhythmic stick beating, handclap accompaniment, and vocal harmony, they sang “Clementine.”

Acknowledgments

This paper is drawn from a case study of the representational history of Central African forest musics. The part of the story presented here began in a Fall 1994 rambling lecture at the University of Melbourne, and in brief verbal and audio presentations at the Society for Ethnomusicology and American Anthropological Association annual meetings; it then developed at Spring 1995 conferences on popular musics at the University of Texas at Austin and at New York University, and a Fall 1995 discussion at the University of Pennsylvania Ethnohistory Workshop. My thanks to presenters, discussants and audiences at those events, especially, in Melbourne, Chris Healy, Martha McIntyre, and Manolete Mora; after SEM and AAA, Charlie Keil, Aaron Fox, Michelle Kisliuk, and Alex Leonhardt; at the UT conference, Chris Waterman and David Coplan; at the NYU conference, Barry Dornfeld, Ingrid Monson, Tony Seeger, Andrew Ross and Bambi B. Schieffelin; and at the Penn workshop, Greg Urban and Deborah Wong. Thanks too to Jay Peck for research assistance, to Sherylle Mills for sharing background documents, and to Georgina Born and Dieter Christensen for the gentle persistence that finally nudged the paper out of its largely oral state.

NOTES

1. On some of the dimensions of African-American citation ethics and recycling across genres and styles see Baraka 1991, Berliner 1994, Gates 1988, Hebdige 1987, Jones 1963, Monson 1994, Rose 1994. Especially provocative in this regard is Paul Gilroy's recent work, *The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness* (1993). Gilroy takes up the politics of authenticity in Black music, approvingly citing Houston Baker's work (1987) on the trope of "family" in African-American consciousness (1993:71-110).
2. Speaking of Afro-nationalism, the most recent jazz recycling of the Hancock-*hindewhu* quote opens the song called "Matatape" on *Mental Images*, a 1994 CD by African-American trombonist Robin Eubanks. The track is dedicated to President Nelson Mandela and the A.N.C.
3. The popular Turnbull recordings from Zaïre are: (with Francis Chapman) *Music of the Ituri Forest*, 1957 and *The Pygmies of the Ituri Forest*, 1958, both Folkways LPs. These have been combined and reissued on CD, *Mbuti Pygmies of the Ituri Rainforest*, Smithsonian Folkways, 1992. A later Turnbull recording is *Music of the Rainforest Pygmies*, Lyricord, 1961, also reissued on CD, 1992. Additional Mbuti recordings by Turnbull have recently appeared on an anthology with Efé recordings by Jean-Pierre Hallet and Aka recordings by Louis Sarno, *Echoes of the Forest: Music of the Central African Pygmies*, Ellipsis Arts, 1994.
 The popular Arom recordings from the Central African Republic are: (in collaboration with Genviève Taurelle) *The Music of the Ba-Benzélé Pygmies*, Bärenreiter Musicaphon, UNESCO Anthology of African Music, 1966; *Aka Pygmy Music/Musique Des Pygmées Aka*, UNESCO Auvidis, 1973 (LP), 1994 (CD reissue); *Centrafrique: Anthologie de la Musique des Pygmées Aka*, Ocora, 1978 (LPs) 1993 (CD reissue); *Polyphonies Vocales des Pygmées Mbenzele*, République Centrafricaine, Inedit/Auvidis, 1992.
 Among additional popular French and US released CDs of pygmies from Congo Republic, Cameroon, Central African Republic, Gabon, and Zaïre, there are: *Congo: Cérémonie du Bobé*, Ocora, 1991; *Heart of the Forest: Music of the Baka Forest People of Southeast Cameroon*, Hannibal/ Rykodisc, 1993; *Gabon: Musique des Pygmées Bibayak*, Ocora, 1989, *Bayaka: The Extraordinary Music of the Babenzélé Pygmies and Sounds of their Forest Home*, Ellipsis Arts, 1995; *Pygmées du Haut-Zaïre*, Fonti Musicali, 1991. A recent popular discography is Henderson 1995.
4. Aspects of the Ota Benga story clearly inspired the 1992 "Couple in the Cage" performance art event by Guillermo Gomez-Peña and Coco Fusco. For this North American quincentenary work Gomez-Peña and Fusco toured the world in a cage posing as recently discovered and just-contacted Mexican Indians. The performance was framed and staged in ways that would lead a viewer to recognize the event as performance and specifically as a social critique of the history of freak circus displays and colonial museum representation. Nonetheless, many viewers took the performance as something quite literal. Museums where the event was staged received calls of protest. When Gomez-Peña and Fusco realized what was happening, they got a video crew to document their interactions with audiences, some of whom abused them verbally and physically. Their video *The Couple in the Cage*, 1992, shows and tells the bizarre story, and intercuts early circus and museum display footage. Coco Fusco writes about the project and its parentage in "The Other History of Intercultural Performance," in her *English is Broken Here*, 1995; also see Gomez-Peña's *Warrior for Gringostroika*, 1993.
5. For the anthropology of art two rather different evaluative discourses have historically applied to these traffics. One is a discourse about the degree of artfulness marking the contact; the other is a discourse about the degree of power differences opened up by the split image. For some it is the discourse on artfulness that most characterizes the embrace of primitivism and the fetishization of "authenticity" in modernist art history. For others it is the discourse on power differences and the fetishization of "hybridity" that most characterizes the naturalization of appropriation in the postmodern era. For more on these developments, see Clifford 1988, Price 1989, Torgovnick 1990, Errington 1994, and the essays in Marcus and Myers 1995.
6. Cradick might be the first of the pygmy pop artists to recognize the complexities of actually returning money (Means 1996). He says that since music is communal in Baka villages that the performance and composition royalties must be treated as communal property. This led to the creation of a fund which collects the royalties and allows Baka to democratically decide how to disburse them. He notes, "To simply give them cash would be

the easiest thing to do . . . but it would be the most irresponsible since they would not keep it for long. They have a poor understanding of figures and money, compared to some of their neighbors (particularly the liquor sellers), who would very quickly end up with all the money" (Means 1996:75).

REFERENCES CITED

- Adorno, Theodore
 1983 *Aesthetic Theory*. London: Routledge.
- Appadurai, Arjun
 1991 Global Ethnoscapes: Notes and Queries for a Transnational Anthropology, in Richard Fox, ed., *Recapturing Anthropology*. Santa Fé, NM: School of American Research Press, pp. 191-210.
- Arom, Simha
 1976 The Use of Playback Techniques in the Study of Oral Polyphonies. *Ethnomusicology* 20(3):483-519.
 1980 Central African Republic. *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*. 4:357-361.
 1991 *African Polyphony and Polyrhythm*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Attali, Jacques
 1985 *Noise: The Political Economy of Music*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Bahuchet, S.
 1985 *Les Pygmées Aka et la Forêt Centrafricaine*. Paris: SELAF.
- Bahuchet, S. and H. Guillaume
 1982 Aka-Farmer Relations in the NorthWest Congo Basin, in Eleanor Leacock and Richard B. Lee, eds., *Politics and History in Band Societies*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Baker, Houston
 1987 *Modernism and the Harlem Renaissance*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Baraka, Amiri
 1991 The Blues Aesthetic and the Black Aesthetic. *Black Music Research Journal* 11(2):101-109.
- Bebey, Frances
 1971 (1968) *Agatha Moudio's Son*. Nairobi: Heineman.
 1975 (1969) *African Music: A People's Art*. London: Harrap.
 1978 (1973) *The Ashanti Doll*. London: Heineman.
 1981 (1976) *King Albert*. Westport: L. Hill.
- Berliner, Paul
 1994 *Thinking in Jazz: The Infinite Art of Improvisation*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Bogdan, Robert
 1988 *Freak Show: Presenting Human Oddities for Fun and Profit*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Bradford, Phillips Verner and Harvey Blume
 1992 *Ota Benga: The Pygmy in the Zoo*. NY: Dell/Delta.
- Cavalli-Sforza, L.L., ed.
 1986 *African Pygmies*. New York: Academic Press.
- Chadwick, Douglas
 1995 Ndoki: Last Place on Earth. *National Geographic* 188(1):2-45.
- Clifford, James
 1988 *The Predicament of Culture*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Cooke, Peter
 1980 Pygmy music. *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians* 15:482-483.
- Coombe, Rosemary J.
 1996 Embodied Trademarks: Mimesis and Alterity on American Commercial Frontiers. *Cultural Anthropology* 11(2):202-224.
- Derrida, Jacques
 1976 (1967) *Of Grammatology*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Dibango, Manu
 1994 *Three Kilos of Coffee*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

- Duffy, Thom
1993 Zap Mama Rides World Wave: Afro-European Quintet Bridges Cultural Gaps. *Billboard*, August 7, p. 1, 77.
- Erlmann, Veit
1993 The Politics and Aesthetics of Transnational Musics. *The World of Music* 35(2):3-15.
- Erlmann, Veit and Deborah Pacini Hernandez, eds.
1993 The Politics and Aesthetics of 'World Music.' *The World of Music*. 35(2).
- Errington, Shelly
1994 What Became Authentic Primitive Art? *Cultural Anthropology* 9(2):201-226.
- Feld, Steven
1994 From Schizophrenia to Schismogenesis: On the Discourses and Practices of World Music and World Beat, in Charles Keil and Steven Feld, *Music Grooves*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, pp. 257-289.
- Fiedler, Leslie
1978 *Freaks: Myths and Images of the Secret Self*. New York: Simon and Shuster.
- Foster, Robert
1991 Making National Cultures in the Global Ecumene. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 20:235-260.
- Frith, Simon, ed.
1993 *Music and Copyright*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Fusco, Coco
1995 *English is Broken Here*. NY: New Press.
- Garofalo, Reebee
1993 Whose World, What Beat: The Transnational Music Industry, Identity, and Cultural Imperialism. *The World of Music* 35(2): 16-32.
- Gates, Henry Louis
1988 *The Signifying Monkey*. NY: Oxford University Press.
- Gebauer, Gunter and Christoph Wulf
1995 *Mimesis: Culture, Art, Society*. Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- Gilroy, Paul
1993 *The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Goldman, Erik
1995 In Depth With Deep Forest. *Rhythm Music* 4(8):36-39, 53.
- Gomez-Peña, Guillermo
1993 *Warrior for Gringostroika*. NY: Greywolf Press.
- Gould, Stephen Jay
1981 *Mismeasure of Man*. New York: Norton.
- Grass, Randall
1992 Zap Mamas. *Village Voice*, December 29, p. 84.
- Grinker, Roy
1992 *Houses in the Rainforest: Ethnicity and Inequality among Farmers and Foragers in Central Africa*. Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- Hall, Gould
1994 A Belgian-African Quartet Mixes Traditions In Many Ways. *The New York Times*, June 11, p. 16.
- Haller, John
1975 *Outcasts from Evolution: Scientific Attitudes of Racial Inferiority 1859-1900*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Hallet, Jean-Pierre, with Alexandra Pelle
1973 *Pygmy Kitabu*. New York: Random House.
- Hancock, Herbie
1985 phone conversation, April.
- Hebdige, Dick
1987 *Cut 'n' Mix*. NY: Methuen.
- Henderson, Richard
1995 Born of Dreams: The Music of the Pygmies. *The Beat* 14(5): 46-49.

- Hewlett, Barry
1991 *Intimate Fathers: The Nature and Context of Aka Pygmy Paternal Infant Care*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.
- Howe, Marvin
1972 Pygmies, Many Owned by Planters, Are Central Africa's Second-Class Citizens. *The New York Times*, July 8.
- Jones, Leroi
1963 *Blues People*. New York: William Morrow.
- Kearney, Michael
1995 The Local and the Global: Anthropology of Globalization and Transnationalism. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 24:547-565.
- Keil, Charles and Steven Feld
1994 *Music Grooves*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Kelly, Kevin
1995 Eno: Gossip is Philosophy. *Wired* 3(5):146-151, 204-209.
- Kisliuk, Michelle
1992 *Confronting the Quintessential: Singing, Dancing, and Everyday Life Among Biaka Pygmies (Central African Republic)*. Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Department of Performance Studies, New York University.
1994 correspondence, November 9.
- Klee, Joe H.
1970 Leon Thomas: Avant-Garde with Roots. *Down Beat* 37(25):18-19 (December 10).
- Krause, Bernie
1996 correspondence, March 7.
- Leonhardt, Alec
1995 correspondence, June 21, July 25.
i.p. "Our Grandparents Were Pygmies." Ph.D. dissertation in progress, Department of Anthropology, Princeton University.
- Lyons, Len
1983 *The Great Jazz Pianists, Speaking of their Lives and Music*. New York: William Morrow.
- Marcus, George and Fred Myers, eds.
1995 *The Traffic in Culture: Refiguring Art and Anthropology*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Mark, Joan
1995 *The King of the World in the Land of the Pygmies*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press.
- Mauss, Marcel
1976 (1929) *The Gift*. New York: Norton.
- Means, Andrew
1996 In the Field: Ethno-Phonography in the late 20th Century. *Jazziz* 13(5):72-77.
- Merriam, Alan P.
1980 Zaire. *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 20: 621-626.
- Monson, Ingrid
1994 Doubleness and Jazz Improvisation: Irony, Parody, and Ethnomusicology. *Critical Inquiry* 20(2):283-313.
- Newman, Melinda
1993 Artist Developments: Breaking Zap Mama. *Billboard*, March 20, p. 20.
- Pace, Eric
1994 Colin M. Turnbull, 69, Anthropologist and Author. *The New York Times*, August 1.
- Palmer, Robert
1980 Jon Hassell and the 'Fourth World.' *Rolling Stone*, September 4.
- Pareles, Jon
1982 Eno Uncaged. *Village Voice* May 4, p. 77-8.
1994 Madonna Makes Her Next Career Move: Innocence. *International Herald Tribune*, October 25.
1996 Pop View: A Small World After All. *The New York Times*, March 24.
- Pieterse, Jan Nederveen
1992 *White on Black: Images of Africa and Blacks in Western Popular Culture*. New Haven: Yale University Press.

- Price, Sally
1989 *Primitive Art in Civilized Places*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Rawlings, Tyson
1970 Africa is Where I Am: Interview with Leon Thomas. *Jazz and Pop* 9(11):15-18.
- Rose, Tricia
1994 *Black Noise*. Hanover. Wesleyan University Press.
- Ross, Andrew
1993 Ecoculture. *Art Forum* 32(4):11-13.
- Sarno, Louis
1993 *Song from the Forest: My Life Among the Ba-Benjellé Pygmies*. New York: Penguin.
1995 *Bayaka: The Extraordinary Music of the BaBenzélé Pygmies*. (book/ CD). Roslyn, NY: Ellipsis Arts.
1996 phone conversation, together with Bernie Krause. February 13.
- Schafer, R. Murray
1977 *The Tuning of the World*. New York: Knopf.
- Seeger, Anthony
1991 Singing Other People's Songs. *Cultural Survival Quarterly* 15(3): 36-39.
1992 Ethnomusicology and Music Law. *Ethnomusicology* 36(3): 345-359.
- Sher, Chuck
1991 *The World's Greatest Fakebook*. Petaluma, CA: Sher Music.
- Sinclair, David
1992 Global Music Pulse: Belgium. *Billboard*, June 20, p. 47.
- Sprague, David
1995 Deep Forest Mines Globe for Second Set. *Billboard*, March 18, p. 14.
- Stern, Chip
1978 Egberto Gismonti: Finding the Avant-Garde in the Jungles of Brazil with an Eight-String Jazz Guitar. *Guitar Player* 12 (November):45, 114, 116, 118, 120.
- Stewart, Susan
1993 *On Longing: Narratives of the Miniature, the Gigantic, the Souvenir, the Collection*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Stockhausen, Karlheinz
1989 *Towards a Cosmic Music*. London: Element Books.
- Taussig, Michael
1993 *Mimesis and Alterity: A Particular History of the Senses*. NY: Routledge.
- Thompson, Robert Farris and S. Bahuchet
1991 *Pygmées?* Paris: Editions Dapper.
- Toop, David
1995 *Ocean of Sound: Aether Talk, Ambient Sound, and Imaginary Worlds*. London: Serpent's Tail.
- Torgovnick, Marianna
1990 *Gone Primitive: Savage Intellectuals, Modern Lives*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Turnbull, Colin M.
1961 *The Forest People*. New York: Simon and Shuster.
1962 *The Lonely African*. New York: Simon and Shuster.
1965 *Wayward Servants: The Two Worlds of the African Pygmies*. New York: Natural History Press.
1972 *The Mountain People*. New York: Simon and Shuster.
1983 *The Mbuti Pygmies: Change and Adaptation*. New York: Holt Rinehart Winston.
- Turner, Ben
1994 Bushwhackers! *Melody Maker*, February 12, p. 37.
- Wallis, Roger and Krister Malm
1984 *Big Sounds from Small Peoples: The Music Industry in Small Countries*. New York: Pendragon.
- Watrous, Peter
1996 Jimmy Rowles, 77, Lyrical Jazz Accompanist. *The New York Times*, May 30.
- Wentz, Brooke
1994 Baka Beyond. *Creem*, January/February.

RECORDINGS CITED

- Aka Pygmy Music*, Auvidis D 8054, 1973/1994.
 Baka Beyond, *Spirit of the Forest*, Rykodisc/Hannibal HNCD 1377, 1993.
 Baka Beyond, *The Meeting Pool*, Rykodisc/Hannibal HNCD 1388, 1995.
Bayaka: The Extraordinary Music of the BaBenzélé Pygmies and Sounds of their Forest Home, Ellipsis Arts CD 3490, 1995.
 Frances Bebey, *Akwaaba*, Original Music OMCD 005, 1985.
 Frances Bebey, *Lambaréné Schweitzer*, Disques Ceddia (Amaya No. 2) CED 001, 1993.
 Frances Bebey, *Nandolo/With Love (Works 1963-1994)*, Original Music OMCD 027, 1995.
Cameroon: Baka Pygmy Music, Auvidis D8029, 1977/1990.
Centrafrique: Anthologie de la Musique des Pygmées Aka, Ocora C559012, 13, 1978/1993.
Congo: Cérémonie du Bobé, Ocora C 560010, 1991.
Deep Forest, 550 Music/Epic BK57840, 1992.
Echoes of the Forest: Music of the Central African Pygmies, Ellipsis Arts CD 4020, 1994.
 Brian Eno, *Music for Airports*, Editions EG, EGS 201, 1979.
 Brian Eno and David Byrne, *My Life in the Bush of Ghosts*, Sire 6093-2, 1981.
 Robin Eubanks, *Mental Images*, jMT 697 124 051-2, 1994.
 Bill Evans, *You Must Believe In Spring*, Warner Bros. 3504-2, 1977/1981.
Gabon: Musique des Pygmées Bibayak, Ocora C 559 053, 1989.
 Egberto Gismonti, *Sol Do Meio Dia*, ECM 1116, 1978.
 Herbie Hancock, *Takin' Off*, Blue Note BLP 4109, 1962.
 Herbie Hancock, *Headhunters*, Columbia/Sony CK 47478, 1973/1992.
 Jon Hassell, *Earthquake Island*, Tomato TOM 7019, 1979.
 Jon Hassell/Brian Eno, *Fourth World Vol. 1, Possible Musics*, Editions EG EEGCD 7, 1980.
 Jon Hassell, *Fourth World Vol. 2, Dream Theory in Malaya*, Editions EG EEGCD 13, 1981.
Heart of the Forest: The Music of the Baka Forest People of Southwest Cameroon, Rykodisc/Hannibal HNCD 1378, 1993.
 Madonna, *Bedtime Stories*, Maverick/Sire/Warner Bros. 9 45767-2, 1994.
 Branford Marsalis, *Renaissance*, Columbia/Sony CK40711, 1987.
Mbuti Pygmies of the Ituri Rainforest, Smithsonian Folkways SF CD 40401, 1992.
 John McLaughlin, *The Promise*, Verve 314 529 828-2, 1995.
Music of the Ba-Benzélé Pygmies, Bärenreiter Musicaphon BM 30 L 2303, 1966.
Music of the Ituri Forest, Folkways 4483, 1957.
Music of the Rainforest Pygmies, Lyrichord 7157, 1961/1992.
Polyphonies Vocales des Pygmées Mbenzélé, République Centrafricaine, Auvidis W 260 042, 1992.
Polyphony of the Deep Rain Forest: Music of the Ituri Pygmies, JVC VICG-5015-2, 1990.
Pygmées du Haut-Zaïre, Fonti Musicali, fmd 190, 1991.
The Pygmies of the Ituri Forest, Folkways 4457, 1958.
 Jimmy Rowles, *Stan Getz Presents Jimmy Rowles, The Peacocks*, Columbia/Sony CK52975, 1977/1994.
 Pharoah Sanders, *Karma*, Impulse/MCA MCAD-39122, 1969/1992.
Until the End of the World, (Motion Picture Soundtrack), Warner Bros. W2 26707, 1991.
 Zap Mama, *Adventures in Afropea 1*, Luaka Bop/Warner Bros. 9 45183-2, 1993.