

Critical Appraisal Worksheet for an Article about Diagnostic Tests

Appraiser: _____

Date: ___/___/___

Citation: _____

What is the clinical question that this study addresses? Put the question in PICO format.

Population: _____

Diagnostic Test: _____

Comparison Test: _____

Outcome: _____

Setting: _____

I. ARE THE RESULTS OF THIS TRIAL VALID? What is the risk of bias?

Did clinicians face diagnostic uncertainty? <i>Were subjects drawn from a group in which it is not known whether the condition of interest is present or absent?</i>	
Was there a blind comparison with an independent gold standard applied similarly to the treatment group and the control group? <i>Was an acceptable gold standard used? Were the diagnostic test and gold standard independent of one another? Were the diagnostic test and gold standard assessed without knowledge of the other results?</i>	
Did the results of the test being evaluated influence the decision to perform the gold standard? <i>Was a different gold standard applied to subjects in whom the study investigation was negative?</i>	

II. WHAT ARE THE RESULTS OF THE TRIAL?

<p>What range of likelihood ratios was associated with the range of possible test results?</p> <p><i>See diagnostic test measures worksheet. Calculate sensitivity, specificity, likelihood ratios for positive and negative test results.</i></p>	
--	--

III. CAN I APPLY THE RESULTS OF THIS TRIAL TO MY PATIENT(S)?

<p>Will the reproducibility of the test result and its interpretation be satisfactory in your clinical setting?</p> <p><i>Does the test yield the same result when reapplied to stable subjects? Do different observers agree about the test result?</i></p>	
<p>Are the results applicable to the patient in your practice?</p> <p><i>Does the test perform differently (different LRs) for different severities of disease? Does the test perform differently for populations with different mixes of competing conditions?</i></p>	
<p>Will the results change your management strategy?</p> <p><i>What are the test and treatment thresholds for the health condition to be detected? Are the test LRs high or low enough to shift post-test probability across a test or treatment threshold?</i></p>	
<p>Will patients be better off as a result of the test?</p> <p><i>Will patient care differ for different test results? Will the anticipated changes in care to more good than harm?</i></p>	

CLINICAL BOTTOM LINE