



TBT PROGRAMME

OVERCOMING TECHNICAL BARRIERS TO TRADE



CASE STUDY



TRAINING

Financed
by the EU



At the request
of the ACP Group



LM Landell
Mills



What is training?

Although the concept of training is probably clear to all, the reality is that training takes many forms and varies considerably in content, methodology and quality. There are many types of training, and different models were applied in various ACP PMU TBT projects. For example, the PMU made experts available, provided workshops, seminars, conferences, e-learning, briefings, briefing papers, discussion forums, etc. In fact, almost all of the PMU's projects had a training component.

Which PMU projects had a training element?

Almost all of the PMU's projects had a very substantial training component that was generally appreciated by participants. Training components are to be found in PMU projects dealing with certification and accreditation, standardisation and quality infrastructure. Training is in fact a crosscutting issue. It should therefore come as no surprise that some of the good practices relevant for training also appear in case studies that deal with certification and accreditation, standardisation and quality infrastructure. As an ACP representative that is interested in training may not read a case study on certification or another subject, this case study is designed as a standalone piece that draws from other case studies.





Why is training important to ACP members?

Training is important to all serious professionals and not just ACP members. Developed countries expend considerable resources on professional training, whether through university or graduate education, continuing education, or through professional or on-the-job training.

Training is particularly important in technical areas involving scientific or legal component, such as non-tariff barriers (NTBs). TBT measures are often very technical in nature and can pose enormous challenges to ACP countries. (As do SPS measures, though they are generally beyond the scope of this PMU's responsibility.) Since complex training issues arise with respect to certification and accreditation, standardisation and quality infrastructure, the ACP-EU TBT Programme has made it a priority to train government officials from ACP countries both in capital and posted abroad on TBT-related issues, as well as to train beneficiaries from Quality Infrastructure institutions regional organisations, SMEs, and other entities.

With the growth in non-tariff barriers to market access for both goods and services, and the increasingly technical nature and complexity of many NTBs, the importance of training for ACP members will continue to grow. ACP members should recognise the importance of TBT training activities, both as a tool that may help to maintain and increase their market share for exports, and as a means to ensure the safety and confidence of their domestic consumers with respect to product safety, worker safety, environmental safety, and other legitimate TBT objectives. ACP members should also recognise that not all TBT measures further legitimate objectives. Instead some have protectionist purposes. ACP representatives should be prepared to make use of training activities to determine which types of TBT measures are WTO consistent, and which violate the WTO TBT Agreement.

The good practices set forth below, based on successes achieved in ACP-EU TBT projects should help frame future ACP training programmes, as well as national and regional training programmes.



How were Good Practices related to training identified?

A number of projects managed by the ACP-EU TBT PMU that had a training component were reviewed. The review included an analysis of the TORs and Final Reports; as well as interviews with beneficiaries, stakeholders, PMU representatives, contractors and experts. As most of the PMU's projects had a training component, the comments offered are based on many different projects, including the following projects that were particularly relevant due to their diverse forms of training:

[TBT Support to the ACP Geneva Office \(26-14\)](#)

This project was designed to enhance the effectiveness of ACP delegates representing their countries on TBT-related issues at the WTO. From a training perspective, this project strengthened the ability of ACP Members to participate in the multilateral trading system, including drafting and conducting WTO negotiations, by improving their ability to understand, influence and comply with TBT requirements and standards including private standards affecting the trade of ACP countries.

[NIGER - Capacity building of Quality Infrastructure towards a better integration to global trade \(38-15\)](#)

Among this project's goals was strengthening the capacities of Quality Infrastructure institutions (standard development division, quality control, metrology services and laboratories).

[Strengthening the competitiveness of Ghana-based exporters through effective Export Quality Management Systems \(EQMS project: 40-15\)](#)

As part of this project, 15 trainers (consultants and service providers) active in the country and Quality Managers of selected companies were trained in the field of Export Quality Management System in selected sectors.



GHANA - SIERRA LEONE: Enhancing EU Market Access for Handicrafts from Ghana, Sierra Leone (67-15)

One of the goals of this project was to sensitise handicraft stakeholders (artisans, NBS, chamber of commerce, public institutions) to technical regulations applied on the EU market and to the treatment of technical regulations under the WTO Agreements.

CROSQ & AFRIMETS Development and roll-out of an E-Learning Programme on Metrology (72-15).

The purposes of this project were to develop a comprehensive e-learning course on legal metrology, make it available to ACP relevant counterparts and allow additional modules to be added in the future.

Development and implementation of technical regulations and methods of referencing standards in Barbados, Jamaica and Trinidad and Tobago (81-16)

As part of this project, members of staff from Bureaus of Standards and relevant agencies were trained on the establishment of procedures for the development and implementation of technical regulations and methods of referencing standards while focusing on specific sectors of interest.





What good practices were identified?

Pursuant to the PMU's "project description", good practices are organised based on project design, management, effectiveness, sustainability and results dissemination.

PROJECT DESIGN

The ACP Geneva project (26-14) demonstrates that often the best good practice with respect to training is a flexible approach on the part of the PMU that allows beneficiaries to view themselves as drivers with respect to training needs. While a needs assessment is overall an important aspect of project design, in instances when beneficiary needs will vary based on issues under discussion (in this case in the WTO TBT Committee), not only must training be based on issues as they arise, flexibility must exist to design and manage an effective training programme based on relevant issues, and beneficiary needs. The ACP Geneva project functioned in this manner.

In the ACP Geneva project the PMU also recognised that it is good practice to coordinate TBT training activities with a broader legal and economic perspective in mind. While the project revolved around the work of the WTO TBT Committee, some of the training sessions were also relevant to a better understanding of the legal and economic issues arising as a result of EPA negotiations, and due to regional integration

activities in forums such as SADC, CARIFORUM and ECOWAS.

PMU good practices are also evident from CROSQ & AFRIMETS - E-learning training course on Legal Metrology (72-15). The PMU's use of an e-training platform is a very suitable mean to widely disseminate training material and sensitise stakeholders located in different places. The approach adopted for this project allowed the PMU to address similar needs of different ACP countries and regions through a single project to the benefit of two beneficiaries, CROSQ and AFRIMETS. This approach avoided a duplication of efforts, allowed for an efficient use of resources and ensured permanent and free access to training material on metrology for stakeholders, beyond the Caribbean and Africa.

GHANA - SIERRA LEONE: Enhancing EU Market Access for Handicrafts from Ghana, Sierra Leone (67-15) also evidences PMU good practices in the design phase. Training sessions were organised to combine sessions on TBT matters with discussions about actions required at the national level to comply with technical regulations in two



specific sectors (the wooden décor and basketry sector). During a three-day workshop, various stakeholders (customs agents, freight forwarders and officials from the Ghana Standards Authority) were gathered together to analyse the entire export process and to develop solutions. This enabled clarification of the responsibilities of the different agencies, the administrative forms required, the content of the legislation and finally the importance of quality control to sell safely on the foreign market. By suggesting this hands-on approach during the design phase, the PMU helped to ensure that training was not purely informative but rather focused on real needs. This approach can be considered as a good practice.

Although not a project that received careful study, a PMU representative reported that a good project design practice in NIGERIA - Capacity Building in Strengthening Product Testing Laboratories and Training (46-15) was to plan practical collective trainings where the experts worked with all people involved in the organisation. This allowed all staff of the Standards Office of Nigeria to obtain a clear idea of relevant needs and actions to be taken. While not all projects may benefit from collective training, the PMU's experience in Nigeria was very positive, and certainly a good practice to consider in the future. A second good practice that emerged from the same project was a successful focus on trainings related to standards development in a manner that promoted entry into value chains for non-

traditional exports. This also allowed participants to consider internal agricultural sectors specific to small producers.

A careful selection of trainees is always very important to the success of a training programme. Good practices identified across the various projects have to do with selection criteria. The essential aspect being that trainees have the right profile to participate actively to training sessions and be able to replicate their knowledge later as part of their professional activity. The EQMS project (81-16) is a good example of how auditors and SMEs were carefully selected. Trained auditors successfully contributed to the coaching of SMEs who in turn have made significant progress toward certification.





MANAGEMENT

The Export Quality Management project (EQMS – 40-15) is rich in PMU good practices that should be of relevance for future TBT-related training projects. As with many other projects, the most important good practice, and the reason for the success of the project was the decision to work closely with the beneficiary (CLSCE) to identify and meet the auditors and SMEs training needs.

With the assistance of the beneficiary, the EQMS project developed two types of training programmes of particular importance in TBT projects, namely (i) a programme to train local trainers (training of trainers) which is a standard good practice in many ACP-EU TBT projects and those of other technical assistance providers; and (ii) a training programme designed to advance the certification of SMEs on EQMS. While the first component reinforces the national capacities in the area of certification, the second leads to the delivery of outputs.

Effective time management characterised both training activities, and in addition to beneficiary involvement, is another good practice. In the EQMS project, effective time management meant: (i) allocating more time to prepare SME's for certification, necessarily in several stages, than to train trainers (the latter usually being a much easier task); and (ii) efficiently handling cost reimbursement issues so that the trainers only needed to focus on their training activities.

The EQMS project demonstrated that structural constraints, in particular the lack of auditors capable of judging whether a specific quality standard has been met, could be addressed through training. The approach taken comprised two elements, namely, (i) to require prospective auditors to undergo training by experienced trainers on ISO9001 and export quality management standards as this would facilitate future recognition by the certification bodies; and (ii) to deliver ISO 9001 and EQMS training in two separate sessions: i.e., one for managers (change in attitude, implementation strategy, and innovation); and another for quality/marketing technicians.

The ACP Geneva project (26-14) also presents important good practices related to the management of training activities that future NTB-oriented PMUs might employ. First, the PMU selected as team leader, a very experienced trainer who was very well known in the WTO field. Second, given the ever-changing landscape of WTO and TBT Committee activities, training activities were demand driven – they responded to issues arising in negotiations and day-to-day TBT Committee work. Third, training activities were conducted hand-in-hand with technical experts from capital (when financing allowed) as well as with ACP country representatives posted in Geneva. This enabled the immediate transmission of knowledge gained to ACP capitals, and not just Geneva-based ACP personnel.



EFFECTIVENESS

The ACP Geneva project (26-14) is unlike most PMU projects as it was designed by the PMU to address issues as they arise in WTO negotiations and discussions, including the meetings of the TBT Committee in Special Session, and the regular work of the TBT Committee, respectively. As a result the good practices that characterise effectiveness are different. In the ACP Geneva project, effectiveness required a degree of creativity, spontaneity and quick turn-around with respect to training activities not found in most other PMU projects. It required that team members be prepared to rapidly develop training programmes, briefing papers and technical notes (each of which have a training function) to address TBT issues as they arise in various WTO forums. Effectiveness also required the ability of the team to liaise well with the Head of the ACP Geneva Office; ACP delegations posted in Geneva and from capital, and with other WTO delegations and WTO Secretariat member in order to better understand the evolution of discussions and concomitant training needs. The good practice of the PMU was to recognise this fact and to give the team the space required to fulfil their training responsibilities. In part this was done by recognising that the Head of the ACP Geneva Office was in the best position to assess day-to-day training needs, and help steer the project in the most effective direction.

Benchmarking effectiveness of the ACP

Geneva project is an easier task and well illustrates the effect of the good practices employed in this project. ACP participation in the work of the TBT Committee (regular and special session) was at its highest, as were ACP interventions.

The Barbados, Jamaica and Trinidad & Tobago project (81-16), which focused on good regulatory practices (GRP), was regional in orientation and as a result involved a considerable number of Caribbean ACP members. The project demonstrated that under the right circumstances a regional approach to training activities is good practice. The circumstances required are that the ACP members involved have similar training needs, that the members will benefit from an exchange of information, and that the training can be a vehicle for consolidating an approach to a problem. In this particular project, as a result of the training, the ACP countries involved moved in the direction of developing a common approach towards good regulatory practices so much so that CROSQ decided to develop and adopt regional guidelines on GRP in order to improve quality infrastructure policies.

Part of the success of the Barbados, Jamaica and Trinidad & Tobago project which are indeed good PMU practices are (i) careful analysis of training needs, and (ii) an intelligent determination of how best to fulfil these needs. For example, training was offered on legal drafting. Legal drafting is a common subject for technical assistance. The



good practice here was to have an expert draft a technical regulation jointly with a focal point from each country. The result was successful, and most country participants now have a government official who has a much higher skill level than before with respect to the drafting of technical regulations, and by implication standards. Additionally it is worth noting that having a limited, but relevant, scope for the training programme was very effective as all stakeholders could focus on a single goal and achieve expected results (training on GRP and drafting of technical regulations in the area of telecommunication, energy, transport).

The Niger project (38-15) utilised a multi-level training programme that was specifically designed to improve the capacity of stakeholders and to improve the effectiveness of Niger's quality infrastructure. The multilevel training programme proved to be good practice due to the fact that it was targeted at QI improvement, an area where Niger has important needs, and due to the fact that many issues of relevance for Niger were covered including: standards development (ISO/CEI guide 21-1, 21-2, 59), export promotion marketing and quality control, and training on ISO 17025 for staff of LANSPEX laboratories. This consolidated approach allowed progress to be made at different level, including an improved institutional framework, increased SME awareness in terms of quality control and food safety, trained national auditors capable

of advising local entities, and an accreditation process implemented for LANSPEX laboratories.

The project "Capacity Building for the Quality Infrastructure Institutions of Kenya (54-15)" is discussed in some detail in the case study on certification and accreditation. This project had a training component that was designed to strengthen the capacity of the Kenya Bureau of Standards (KEBS) and the Kenya Accreditation Service (KENAS), and to enhance their capacity to provide technical assistance to SMEs. Training-related good practices emerged from this project are briefly mentioned here. For example, for many training participants English is a second language. As a result, it is often beneficial to select foreign trainers whose mother tongue is English or who speak unaccented English. Likewise, due to work demands that can arise when training is held in the office, trainings are more effective when conducted in other venues to prevent participants leaving to attend to office matters.

Another good practice in terms of effectiveness was found in the CROSQ-AFRIMETS project (72-15) where the e-training material developed as part of the project offers users the opportunity to sit an online test and receive a certificate in the area covered by the course they took.



SUSTAINABILITY

Dialogue between stakeholders was a central element of the PMU's success in the Niger project (38-15). It was observed during the initial assessment that there was a lack of coordination between the national actors, as well as limited momentum in the reform process. In response, the project facilitated discussion through various workshops involving key stakeholders. This led to the adoption of a revised strategic work plan for the national quality policy that is designed to ensure sustainability.

Many projects surveyed relied on a good practice common to ACP-EU TBT Programme projects and the projects of most other TA providers – training of trainers. Training of trainers, by its nature is a good practice designed to ensure sustainability as trained trainers remain in country to continue training activities. For example, the Ghana EMQS project (40-15) trained 15 auditors, of which 8 came from the beneficiary organisation CLSCE, who then took part in coaching Ghanaian SMEs.

Of course, there are limits to this type of programme which the PMU discovered and which also constitute good practice. For example in Rwanda - Horticulture Trade Enhancement & Certification (HORTEC) (43-15) it was discerned that good practice requires that independent professionals be selected as trainers. Competitors, when selected to be trainers, were less likely to

impart useful knowledge to those in the same industry. Good practice also required that financial compensation be sufficient to assure that talented potential trainers are attracted to participate in training programmes, and that once trained they retain interest.

The selection of subjects for training is also intertwined with the notion of good practice. The PMU found in the Barbados, Jamaica and Trinidad and project (81-16) that training programmes designed to improve legal writing skills related to the drafting of regulations are not only of interest to trainees, they can have an immediate effect as they contribute to improving the quality of national regulations and regulatory frameworks. This conclusion was also reached by the Kampala-based International Law Institute, which for years has offered successful and well-attended courses on legal drafting to government officials from Africa.

The ACP Geneva project (26-14) illustrates another good training practice adopted by the PMU – the importance of imparting WTO practice experience to capital-based officials who, as a result, will be able to better support the activities of ACP members with representation in Geneva, and transmit their knowledge of WTO practice to other capital-based officials. Exposing capital-based officials to WTO TBT Committee meetings not only motivates capital-based officials, but also allows for interaction with other ACP officials that may increase prospects for developing a sustainable ACP dialogue and a



common ACP position on certain WTO, RTA/EPA-related issues. Sustainability would, of course be increased if a permanent source of funding were found to institutionalise this cross-fertilisation, that is until ACP countries are able to assume this financial responsibility themselves.

In the Caribbean region, metrology reference laboratories (Caribbean Reference Laboratories - CaRLs) were recently established to provide cost-effective traceability to the National Metrology Institutions within the region (with EU and PTB support). Through the CROSQ & AFRIMETS project (72-15), an e-learning module on metrology has been developed improving the access to knowledge in metrology for all stakeholders. Efforts to continue to improve the metrology knowledge will add to the long-term sustainability of this endeavour.

Sustainability also arises from effective dissemination of training programmes, through on-line and other means. These programmes are discussed in the following section.

RESULTS DISSEMINATION

When one speaks of results dissemination in training, knowledge dissemination is also implied. The PMU relied on good practices that were particularly effective with respect to dissemination of training materials. Although

some of the good practices have already been mentioned in other case studies, as each case study is meant to be a standalone document, and as it is unlikely that someone interested in one issue will read all four studies, some of more successful training-related good practices are amalgamated here.

The e-learning training course on legal metrology (72-15) developed by the PMU in conjunction with UNIDO, PTB, OIML, CROSQ and AFRIMETS project (72-15) is similar to a training programme developed in partnership with AFRAC (African Accreditation Cooperation Secretariat, 12-14). This course is contributing to the availability of e-learning material available to benefit QI stakeholders in the ACP group. As part of project 72-15, training material has been developed and will be made available as an upload on the OIML (Organisation Internationale de Métrologie Légale) website in such a way as to allow additional modules on industrial metrology to be added in the future.

Placing e-learning programmes online is an important good practice followed by the ACP-EU TBT Programme. For example, arising from project 39-15, the PMU has placed on its website a link to the first African Accreditation Cooperation (AFRAC) e-learning programme on accreditation. This course covers many areas of importance, such as: (i) Accreditation in International Trade; (ii) An Introduction to the principles of



ISO/IEC 17011, General requirements for accreditation bodies accrediting conformity assessment bodies; (iii) Establishing and efficiently managing a new Accreditation Body; (iv) Training of National Accreditation Focal Points (NAFPs); (v) A Toolkit for Conformity Assessment Bodies (CABs) in the process of preparing for Accreditation; and (vi) Peer Evaluator Training. It is accessible also from the following AFRAC website: <http://afracelearning.onlinecf.net/login/index.php>.

Many PMU projects have adopted the efficient and cost-saving good practice of online dissemination of results and knowledge exchange. The PMU's Niger project (38-15) also created a Google group to share information that may be relevant for training purposes; likewise, the TIE special committee associated with the PMU's CROSQ project (93-16) is making use of online meetings (an e-Group) for regional promotion. The Ghana and Sierra Leone Handicraft project (67-15) also relies on an online Network Platform to disseminate knowledge and information. E-groups are an financially prudent manner of constructing efficient networks where knowledge can be shared and project results disseminated.

Both AFRAC (39-15) and CROSQ-AFRIMETS (72-15) projects successfully relied on visual media for knowledge dissemination, including video shooting of interviews of key stakeholders from the beneficiary group as part of the e-learning material. This can be considered as an

effective good practice for knowledge dissemination that arose out of the PMU's work.

Finally, training of trainers, which has already been mentioned as a successful crosscutting technique for knowledge dissemination is associated with many PMU projects.

Turning to other more general resources, not associated with a particular project, the PMU has relied on several different means, available on its website, to publicise its training activities and results.

They include its Newsletter (http://www.acp-eu-tbt.org/newsletter.cfm?title_page=Newsletters); its library, which provides access to its publication entitled TBT Insight (http://www.acp-eu-tbt.org/page.cfm?title_page=E-library); and links to external resources, many of which are also disseminate TBT-related knowledge (http://www.acp-eu-tbt.org/links.cfm?title_page=Links). Finally, Capacity4Dev.eu, an EU website active in knowledge dissemination warrants mention as it may host learning tools from the ACP-EU TBT Programme: <https://capacity4dev.ec.europa.eu/>.

