Innovations in Assessment: ABP's Pilot Results and Lessons Learned

Linda A. Althouse, PhD
Trevor Fleck, MPA
Robert Furter, PhD
Adam Turner, MPH

September, 2017
Disclosure

Salaried Employees of ABP
Presentation Objectives

• Model and Pilot Design

• Pilot Survey and Performance Results

• Planned Enhancements and Next Steps
Part 1 Professional Standing
Ensures physician is licensed and in good standing.

Part 3 – Cognitive Expertise
Incorporates an objective assessment of the diplomate. Provides assurance that the diplomate is remaining current in the core subject matter.

Part 2 – Lifelong Learning
Requires participation in high quality, unbiased learning and self-assessment activities.

Part 4 – Performance in Practice
Focuses on ongoing assessment and improvement in the quality of care and professional practice.
Current MOC Part 3 Exam for General Peds

- Taken every 10 years
- ~200 multiple-choice questions
- Four-hour examination
- Taken at a secure, proctored testing center
- No immediate feedback
Why Change?

- Diplomate feedback
- Advances in technology
- Incorporation of adult learning theory
- Rapid changes in medicine
- Increased learning provides better public protection
So What is MOCA-Peds?

• Continuous assessment tool

• Series of questions at quarterly intervals

• Delivered over the web or mobile device

• Focuses on assessment and learning
MOCA-Peds Overview

- 2 multiple-choice questions per learning objective per year
- 5 minutes per question
- Flexibility to answer within quarter; one-at-a-time or in batches
- Immediate feedback (response, rationale, references)
- Confidence and relevance ratings
Use of books, online references, resources is allowed, but should not be needed.

Discussing, sharing of questions is NOT allowed.
2017 Pilot Participation

- Launched January 9, 2017
  - Mobile App – April 1
- 5,081 registered for the pilot
- High question completion rate
  - Q1 (98%)
  - Q2 (96%)
- Only 7 Opted Out
- 14 approved for special accommodations (extra time)
Volume and Method of Communication

- Mostly email communication
- Highest at the beginning and end of each quarter
- 1,171 Q1 Tickets
  - 221 Technical (18%)
- 479 Q2 Tickets
  - 86 Technical (17%)
- Amount of communication overall trending down

End of Q1
When Are Diplomates Taking Questions?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Monday</th>
<th>Tuesday</th>
<th>Wednesday</th>
<th>Thursday</th>
<th>Friday</th>
<th>Saturday</th>
<th>Sunday</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Traditional Work Hours (8 AM - 5 PM)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 AM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 AM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 AM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 AM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 AM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Evening Hours (6 PM - 9 PM)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Night Hours (10 PM - 7 AM)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 AM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 AM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 AM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 AM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 AM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 AM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 AM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 AM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Live Demonstration
MOCA-Peds’ Developmental Evaluation

Stakeholder Involvement in Pilot Design

User Groups
- 37 pediatricians meeting on a regular basis to inform decisions
- 9 new pediatricians for usability testing

Focus Groups
- Over 160 external pediatricians
- In-person and teleconference

Pilot Evaluation

Longitudinal Surveys

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic/Domain Areas</th>
<th>Regional Quarter 1</th>
<th>Quarter 2</th>
<th>Quarter 3</th>
<th>Quarter 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Information technology - Ease of use and participant issues</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questions of MOCA Peds</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study/reliability and response use by participants</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>User survey/answer feedback (e.g., rationale/references)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer Service</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ease of understanding homepage score/status</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anxiety/Seriousness</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General feasibility/acceptability</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Focus Groups
- Planned after quarter completions
2017 Surveys and Focus Groups

- Topic areas vary by quarter
- Using focus groups to ask the ‘how’ and ‘why’ questions
- 83% Q1 survey response rate (n=4,181)
- 77% Q2 survey response rate (n=3,773)
- ??% Q3 (preliminary) survey responses (n=1,215)
### Technical Issues – Quarter 2 Survey

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Did you experience any technical issue(s)?</th>
<th>Quarter 1</th>
<th>Quarter 2</th>
<th>Quarter 3 (Preliminary)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Count</td>
<td>Percent</td>
<td>Count</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>673</td>
<td>16.1%</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>3,508</td>
<td>83.9%</td>
<td>3,364</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>4,181</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>3,773</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source = MOCA-Peds Quarter 1-3 Surveys
**Type of Platform Used – Quarter 2 Survey**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>In Quarter 2, which platform did you use?</th>
<th>Count</th>
<th>Percent of Cases</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Computer</td>
<td>3,594</td>
<td>95.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smartphone</td>
<td>234</td>
<td>6.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tablet</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>3.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Selected</strong></td>
<td>3,947</td>
<td><strong>N/A</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source = MOCA-Peds Quarter 2 Survey; Sample Size: n = 3,773
Would Adding App Features Increase Likelihood to use Mobile App?

Source = MOCA-Peds Quarter 2 Survey; Sample Size: n = 3,773
Learning, Study, & Resource Usage
Q12. Reflecting on Quarter 1/2, how much time did you spend studying, in advance of taking the questions? (Please approximate TOTAL time studied for ALL 20 questions during the Quarter 1/2.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study Time Before Questions</th>
<th>Quarter 1 Percentages</th>
<th>Quarter 2 Percentages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I did not prepare in advance</td>
<td>54.7%</td>
<td>55.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&lt;1 hour</td>
<td>6.8%</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 to &lt;2 hours</td>
<td>7.3%</td>
<td>9.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 to &lt;5 hours</td>
<td>9.6%</td>
<td>11.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 to &lt;10 hours</td>
<td>7.6%</td>
<td>6.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 to 20 hours</td>
<td>7.1%</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;20 hours</td>
<td>6.9%</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source = MOCA-Peds Quarter 1 and 2 Survey; Sample Size: n = 3,461 across both surveys
### Use of Resources

Q9. Reflecting on Quarter 1/2, how often did you use resources while answering questions?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Quarter 1 Percentages</th>
<th>Quarter 2 Percentages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I did NOT use resources during this quarter</td>
<td>19.2%</td>
<td>17.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With 1 to 5 questions</td>
<td>42.6%</td>
<td>41.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With 6 to 10 questions</td>
<td>22.2%</td>
<td>22.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With more than 10 questions</td>
<td>16.0%</td>
<td>19.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source = MOCA-Peds Quarter 1 and 2 Survey; Sample Size: n = 4,181 and n = 3,773
What was the primary reason you used external resource(s) while answering questions?

- I wanted to check my response: 51.1%
- I wanted to find the most up-to-date information/guidelines on this topic: 21.9%
- I did not know the answer to a question and needed to look it up: 15.4%
- I wanted to enhance my existing knowledge of the topic: 9.9%
- Other, please specify: 1.6%

Source = MOCA-Peds Quarter 2 Survey; Sample Size: n = 3,117
### Did MOCA-Peds Lead to Learning?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MOCA-Peds questions</th>
<th>Agree/Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Disagree/Strongly Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>were useful learning tools</td>
<td>86.59%</td>
<td>9.19%</td>
<td>4.21%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The MOCA-Peds program helps me provide better care to my patients</th>
<th>Agree/Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Disagree/Strongly Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>59.11%</td>
<td>27.82%</td>
<td>13.06%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source = MOCA-Peds Quarter 2 Survey; Sample Size: n = 3,773
MOCA-Peds Acceptability Among Participants

I am overall satisfied with MOCA-Peds as a replacement for the previous Part 3 Assessment: 95.49%

I prefer to take a continuous assessment like MOCA-Peds over the current, secure testing center exam: 88.97%

Source = MOCA-Peds Quarter 3 Survey; Sample Size: n = 1,065
Survey Analysis of the 5-Minute Time Limit

Quarter 3 Preliminary Survey Data: How often did you feel the 5-minute time-limit was too short?

- N/A, 5 minutes was enough for all questions: 436 (36.3%)
- With 1 to 2 questions: 392 (32.7%)
- With 3 to 5 questions: 230 (19.2%)
- With 6 to 10 questions: 90 (7.5%)
- With 11 or more questions: 52 (4.3%)

In comparison to Quarter 2’s Survey
76.3% Agreed/Strongly Agreed to: “I had enough time to answer each question”

Source = MOCA-Peds Quarter 3 Survey; Sample Size: n = 1,200
Pilot Performance Results
Average time per question
1 minute, 55 seconds
~38 minutes total for 20 questions

Source: Quarter 2 data
Extra time accommodations not included
Key Design Feature

- Questions in pilot used in:
  - Prior year’s General Pediatrics initial certification exam
  - Prior year’s secure MOC Part 3 General Pediatrics exam (MOC-G)
Strong correlation exists between questions that appeared on the traditional, proctored examination and MOCA-Peds.

Slightly easier on MOCA-Peds.
Generalists vs. Subspecialists Performance

General Pediatricians performing slightly better:

78% vs 76%
Question Difficulty

- Question difficulty was consistent across Quarter 1 to Quarter 2.
- One indication that item content may not be leaking.
Lessons Learned and Planned Enhancements
A Tough Balancing Act

Still a high-stakes assessment with focus on assessment.
MOC Cycle Alignment and Life Circumstances

• Scoring process will drop the lowest 4 quarters of performance in a 5 year MOC cycle
  • Reduces burden
  • Eliminates the appeal process
• Accounts for –
  • Extenuating circumstances
  • Technical issues (eg, slow internet, dropped questions)
Five-year MOC Cycle (once live in 2019)

Year 1: 80 questions
Year 2: 80 questions
Year 3: 80 questions
Year 4: 80 questions
Year 5: Proctored exam (if needed)

Am I meeting the performance standard at the end of Year 4?

Yes
No

Because of the 4 lowest quarters rule, those performing well enough may be able to stop at end of Year 3

You do not have to participate in MOCA-Peds until your next MOC 5-year cycle
Part 3 Options (once MOCA-Peds adopted)

MOCA-Peds
- Default with enrollment
- No additional fees
- Earn Part 2 points

Proctored Exam
- Every 5 years at proctored site
- Additional fee to cover cost of seat fee and processing
- No Part 2 credit
General Phase-in Plan

In general…

Diplomates will enter MOCA-Peds at the start of the 5-year MOC cycle during which their next exam due date falls.
Maintaining Multiple Certificates

Regardless of the number of certifications held, diplomates will need to answer the same number of questions for a given discipline/area to maintain the certification for that area.
Incorporation of Guidelines/Articles

- Beginning in 2018
- Goal - Greater face validity - relevancy, currency
- Available at beginning of year with learning objectives
- Restricted to guidelines and just 2 in 2018
- Will expand to other types of articles in 2019
- Likely restructure model – fewer overall questions to accommodate articles
More Feedback - Confidence in Relation to Performance

- Correct: Confident
- Incorrect: Confident
- Correct: Not Confident
- Incorrect: Not Confident
Communications

- Can’t over-communicate...

“I do not recall being sent or directed to any learning objectives.”

“I did not know there was learning objective information given to help prepare for answering questions? Did I miss something?”

“I never received any learning objectives.”
Key Planning Thought

• No silver bullet
• Learning objectives, partners, articles, timing, batching, MOC cycle alignment, etc.
  • Cannot change one without impacting the other
• Everything is a tradeoff
• Need to decide what is most important for your organization
More Information

mocapeds@abpeds.org

(919) 929-0461

abp.org/mocapeds