



Photo by Brooke Anderson | @movementphotographer

# OAKLAND IS REIMAGINING PUBLIC SAFETY

The Defund Police Coalition Responds To Reimagining Public Safety Task Force Final Recommendations

## VERSION 2.0

Written by: Cat Brooks & James Burch

Additional Contributions by: Annie Banks,

Maureen Benson, Tracey Corder, Woods Ervin,

Linda Sánchez, Liz Suk, Pete Woiwode.

Sponsored by: The Defund Police Coalition

---

*We write this report for the loved ones we've lost to state violence, whether intra-communal or by law enforcement, and for those who live on with that trauma. We write this report with the knowledge and belief that if we are brave enough and bold enough to truly reimagine public safety through a more just, humane, and equitable lens, our communities will be safer, our children will be able to play outside, our elders will be content and at ease, and our communities will possess the tools they need to thrive.*



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>We Will Never Forget: Say Their Names</i>	4
<i>Executive Summary</i>	5
<i>How Did We Get Here: The History of Reimagining and Defund</i>	6
<i>This Political Moment: The Time for Extraction</i>	7
<i>Terminology Guide</i>	10
<i>Defund Police Coalition Values &amp; Principles</i>	11
<i>Where Does the Money Come From? Revenue Streams to Support a Safer Oakland</i>	13
<i>How Does OPD Spend Its Time? Not Fighting Violent Crime</i>	17
<i>Recommendation Analysis</i>	18
<i>Defund Coalition Top Recommendations</i>	52
<i>Avoid At All Costs: Recommendations That We Should Avoid</i>	54
<i>Conclusion</i>	55
<i>Appendix</i>	59
— <i>Glossary of Terms</i>	60
— <i>Surveys of Support</i>	62
— <i>Reports/Resources</i>	63
— <i>Articles</i>	64

## WE WILL NEVER FORGET: SAY THEIR NAMES

In many African traditions, saying the name of an ancestor (someone who has transitioned) brings them closer to you – opens up communication where you can ask for help and guidance. In American culture, where we have two-second attention spans, we say their names to remind us that they were, that they mattered, that **they** are why we do this work. So, we begin this report saying their names. **They are the why.** We say their names with a prayer: Never Again. Not Another One. Bring Healing and Peace to our Communities. Show us the Righteous Path to Liberation for us all.



This list is but a snapshot of loved ones stolen from us too soon, either by the hands of law enforcement or the hands of a community member. **All violence is state violence** as it is the state that creates the conditions that allow these tragedies to take place. The intentional manufacturing of poverty through the consistent robbing of resources, supports and services all communities need to thrive is a blatant disregard of BIPOC life. We declare that this ends today. We assert our humanity. We claim Life for our people.

*Richard Perkins - Marcellus Toney - Demouriah Hogg - Khatari Gant - Yvette Henderson - Khadafy Washington - LoEshe Lacy - Nia Wilson - Tamellia Cobbs - Dijuan Armstrong - Jessica St. Louis - Brandy Martell - Shaquoia Moody - Nandi Perry - Gary King - Oscar Grant - Reggina Jeffreies - Stephanie Franklin - Shaleem Tindle - Nathaniel Wilks - Mark Antontion Alexander (Lil Yase) - Mack "Jody" Woodfox - Yonas Alehegne - Marnee Causey - Andrew Moppin - Alan Blueford - Hasan Humphries - Sean Hector - Charles King Jr. - David Martinez Gomez - Unidentified - Unidentified - DeAndre Green - Sean Collins - Jalain Dickson - Franklin Winnemucca - Anika Crane - Alvin Bell - Lamont Johnson - Rasheen Ferguson Hadari Baker - Antonio Diaz - Henry Texada - Miles Armstead - Kendrick Riley - Jose Mejia-Lemus - Henry S. Brown - Dave Patrick Underwood - Francisco Rodriguez - Ricardo Calmo-Perez - Joseph Saxton - Quinton Williams III - Darius Brazell - Alfredo Gonzalez - Billy Attaway Jr. - Karongie Louis Bell - Preston Miller - Unidentified man - Nandi Perry - Rivelino Tepaz - Carlos Pablo-Matias - Aaron Pryor - Daniel Lucero - Lance Barr - Jorge Martinez - Juan Diaz-Ochoa - Alvin Hogan - Leemo Tagaleoo - Michael Scallions - Madalyn Sandoval - Jabree Russworm - Andre Robinson - Gerald Smith - Silas Greer - Antwain L. Ramsey Sr. - William Blakeman*

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

On Friday, February 12th, 2021, Oakland's [Reimagining Public Safety Task Force](#) issued their first round of draft recommendations that will forge a new path toward holistic and community driven public safety practices and policies in Oakland. Within 48 hours, The Defund Police Coalition released the first version of this report.

**Following a discussion and revision process, the Task Force's Advisory Boards released their second – and final – round of recommendations on March 1, 2021.**

These recommendations will now be deliberated by the 17-member Task Force composed of City Council, City Commissions, and Mayoral appointees on March 10th and March 17th. **Members of the public still have opportunities to weigh in, including at the final Task Force meetings and until the report is submitted to City Council on April 1st.**

The revised recommendations include 10 new recommendations, the merging of 47 pre-existing recommendations, 44 amended recommendations, and three new supplemental reports. The Defund Police Coalition has updated its remarks and recommendations based on these latest revisions. We have also noted whether a recommendation has been withdrawn, merged, amended or was new. We left all of our previous commentary as we feel that the analysis about these elements of policing remains useful to the public, elected officials, and media. This report breaks down all the recommendations we support, the ones we don't, and why. We also look at potential revenue streams to pay for these shifts in practice and new community safety programs, analyze OPD calls for service data in a brand new APTP report, and highlight work already happening at the grassroots level that needs more investment. Such community programs are already keeping us safe – which is no surprise because #WeKeepUsSafe and #WeTakeCareOfUs.



## HOW DID WE GET HERE: THE HISTORY OF REIMAGINING AND DEFUND

Though this political moment was born of great tragedy, struggle and sacrifice, there is power in the now to extract real wins for the people that will quantitatively shift the quality of our lives and the future of our children. The Oakland Reimagining Public Safety Task Force was created in direct response to significant local demand to redirect monies from the Oakland Police Department to programs, support services, and resources that take a holistic view of public safety and focus on addressing the root causes of so-called “crime” rather than relying on militarized policing and a violent and cyclical carceral state.

This demand to defund police and invest in community grew in response to the nationwide uprisings last summer when, across the globe, tens of thousands of people came together to demand an immediate and final end to state terror and violence. The people of Oakland, in the flats and in the hills, have demonstrated a commitment to investing in services that will actually protect communities as opposed to exacerbating harm. The Task Force recommendations are an important first step in achieving that goal.

---

**The people of Oakland, in the flats and in the hills, have demonstrated a commitment to investing in services that will actually protect communities as opposed to exacerbating harm.**

The Defund OPD campaign was launched by the Anti Police-Terror Project (APTP) five years ago. It has since evolved into a coalition comprised of 13 BIPOC-led grassroots organizations\* with decades-long roots in Oakland and tens of thousands of active members amongst them.

Task Force Advisory Board members dedicated thousands of collective hours to develop these recommendations. These volunteers offered their time, energy, passion, innovation, care, and commitment to push Oakland into the 21st century as it relates to public safety and how Oaklanders, specifically BIPOC Oaklanders, are seen and treated

by the entity whose motto it is to protect and serve while we simultaneously work to dismantle and replace that institution with something more just, equitable and humane.

## **THIS POLITICAL MOMENT: THE TIME FOR EXTRACTION**

The Defund Coalition is excited about this powerful, political moment. This updated report responds to each of what are now 102 recommendations and three supplemental reports issued in this latest round of Advisory Board Recommendations.

**After five years of organizing, the voices of Oaklanders are finally being heard.**

This moment matters not just for Oakland, but for the country as a whole. For well over a decade, Oakland has been America's vanguard for criminal "justice" reform and as we go, so does the nation. APTP and the Defund Police Coalition receive weekly calls and emails from organizers in cities across the country for consultation and guidance. Lives saved in Oakland means lives saved across the nation.

This conversation could not be happening at a more crucial time. In 2020, and continuing into 2021, Oakland, along with the rest of America, has seen massive spikes in violent crime. We are losing our loved ones at an alarming rate.



---

**Police are violence responders. Not violence interrupters. We need to invest in root cause preventive strategies. We need to get to the gun before the bullet flies, not stand by yet another mother as she puts her child in the ground. We need to REfund. REstore. And REImagine.**

---

While the Oakland Police Department placed the blame on our Black children, the responsibility lies squarely at the feet of the Libby Schaaf administration. For six years, she has neglected the Black community. While she “developed” Oakland, she displaced Black Oaklanders. Her policies have pushed Black people out of their homes, into the streets and the underground economy. We are sicker and poorer. More angry, tired, frustrated and afraid. THIS is what we mean when we say “all violence is state violence”. It is the state that creates the conditions under which these tragic realities play out.

Some people point to this painful period of time and say this is why we can’t defund police. **This is faulty logic.** Law enforcement has the money NOW. And our people continue to die NOW. Police are violence responders. Not violence interrupters. We need to invest in root cause preventive strategies. We need to get to the gun before the bullet flies, not watch yet another mother put her child in the ground. We need to REfund. REstore. And REimagine.



Photo by Brooke Anderson | @movementphotographer



---

**For well over a decade, Oakland has been America's vanguard for criminal justice reform and as we go, so does the nation. APTP and the Defund Coalition receive weekly calls and emails from organizers in cities across the country for consultation and guidance. Lives saved in Oakland means lives saved across the nation.**



Photo by Brooke Anderson | @movementphotographer

## TERMINOLOGY GUIDE

**Support/Strongly Support:** The Defund Police Coalition supports the recommendation and would like City Council to move toward implementation.

**Do Not Support/Strongly Do Not Support:** The Defund Police Coalition does not support the recommendation and encourages City Council to not move toward implementation.

**Conditions/Commentary:** The Defund Police Coalition supports the recommendation and would like City Council to move toward implementation if considerations and commentary can be addressed. Or the Defund Police Coalition does not support the recommendation and encourages City Council to not move toward implementation. Further commentary has been provided to increase both council's and the public's understanding of why the recommendation is potentially harmful to the Oakland community and the mission of the Task Force.

**Neutral:** Recommendation was not relevant to the Task Force's Process.

**Bold Text Red:** Priority Recommendation we strongly support.

**Bold Text Yellow:** Priority Recommendation we strongly oppose.

An Appendix and Glossary of Terms can be found at the end of this report.

<sup>1\*</sup> The **Defund Police Coalition** consists of the following groups: Anti Police-Terror Project, Arab Resource and Organizing Center, Asian Pacific Environmental Network, Bay Rising, Black Organizing Project, Causa Justa-Just Cause, Community Ready Corps, Communities United for Restorative Youth Justice, Critical Resistance, East Bay Alliance for A Sustainable Economy, Ella Baker Center, Oakland Rising, and the Urban Peace Movement.

## DEFUND POLICE COALITION VALUES & PRINCIPLES

**Imagination and Visioning:** We can create safer communities if we are willing to have an openness to imagine *and* the financial investment to match. Let us come with open hearts, eyes, and ears and with an orientation towards openness and possibility. Let us invest as aggressively in proven, community-based alternatives as we have in punitive and violent policing and incarceration.

---

**We can create safer communities if we are willing to have an openness to imagine and the financial investment to match. Let us come with open hearts, eyes, and ears and with an orientation towards openness and possibility. Let us invest as aggressively in proven, community-based alternatives as we have in punitive and violent policing and incarceration.**

**Reinvestment and Restoration:** Recommendations must center replenishing our communities with what was stolen with the advent of the “[war on drugs](#)” and remains missing as Oakland “develops”: safe housing; access to clean water, air, and adequate food; health care; education; jobs; and mental health support. The data show these are the things that lead to increased safety, decreased violence, healthy families, and whole communities.

**Racial Equity:** It is our moral duty to center the people and communities most impacted by the lack of housing, economic stability, support services, over-policing, intercommunal violence and the carceral state in all public dialogues, debates, listening sessions and recommendations for adoption by the City Council.

**Accountability:** This body must be rooted in qualitative and quantitative data that may challenge personal opinions but ultimately lead us closer to the goals and mission of the Task Force. These data should be mined from honest opinions and feedback from communities most impacted by policing and violence, research, polling, expert testimony, and more. Task Force members must hold each other accountable for principled engagement both within and outside of the confines of Task Force meetings and move as a collective unit not individuals with personal agendas.

**Expertise:** Oakland is rich with some of the nation’s leading experts: particularly Black women, men and TGNC (transgender and gender non-conforming) people and other disenfranchised people of color. These people and organizations should be tapped for solutions, support, and services outside of formal/traditional government services, programs and ideology.

**Data Driven and Fact Based:** While all members of the Task Force should support and believe in the mandate of the Task Force, we recognize some are still challenged – and even fearful – of moving Oakland into a new and more effective paradigm. Service on this Task Force must be rooted in a commitment to invest in research, evaluate OPD’s current programs and strategies, push back on false narratives, provide data-driven recommendations in service of the Task Force’s mandate, and collectively and fearlessly dream big in partnership with Oaklanders toward a new system of public safety rooted in justice, healing and humanity.

---

**It is our moral duty to center the people and communities most impacted by the lack of housing, economic stability, support services, over-policing, intercommunal violence and the carceral state in all public dialogues, debates, listening sessions and recommendations for adoption by the City Council.**



Photo by Brooke Anderson | @movementphotographer

## WHERE DOES THE MONEY COME FROM? REVENUE STREAMS TO SUPPORT A SAFER OAKLAND

The mandate of the Reimagining Public Safety Task Force is to redirect monies from the Oakland Police Department to social services, resources and public frameworks that create true community safety. We know that by funding vital community needs, including civilian responders, job training, community-based violence prevention, and other essential services, we can build a safer and healthier community.

We repeatedly hear from the City Administration that we just don't have the money. We reject this assertion, and we reject the politics of austerity

in which needed core workers are laid off, unemployment increases, and the city leaves trash on the streets and fails to help the unhoused.

---

**“The public’s will is to fund the services, not the police”**

— *George Galvis, Executive Director, Communities United for Restorative Youth Justice (CURYJ)*

There are funds available that the administration is trying to keep to themselves. They have given away funds without a public hearing and without Council approval, and where existing funds are insufficient, the job of our city leaders is to take action to generate the needed income streams to ensure Oakland, and Oaklanders, have what they need to thrive.

**1. OAKLAND POLICE DEPARTMENT BUDGET:** The Oakland Police Department consumes almost 50% of Oakland’s general fund every year and yet, year after year, Oakland remains near the [top of the list](#) for America’s most violent cities; ahead of Chicago and Washington D.C.

Millions of dollars have been wasted on extra deployments the City Administrator authorized, expending funds the City Council did not authorize on work that has nothing to do with public safety, including extensive, heavy-handed police response to peaceful demonstrations to the tune of \$2.2 million dollars for just one event.

At the same time, the police department failed to respond to calls for help for armed robbery, and refused to hire staff for gun tracing and to address illegal gun dealing, even after approval by Council.

Simultaneously, the Schaaf Administration pushed to totally eliminate funding for violence prevention programs for our youth, as well as job training.

It is time for Oakland to invest in preventative measures rather than punitive failures, in real violence prevention rather than in weaponry used against children. Using civilian personnel for tasks they are best suited for will save money and save lives. We need to support more violence prevention and less criminalization. It is time for Oakland to invest in preventative measures.

---

**The Oakland Police Department consumes almost 50% of Oakland's general fund every year and yet, year after year, Oakland remains near the top of the list for America's most violent cities; ahead of Chicago and Washington**

---

## **2. ASSET FORFEITURE:**

Civil Asset Forfeiture laws allow police to seize the property of the public without a trial or conviction. They simply have to have a suspicion the money is associated with the drug trade and they can take it. What's more, these monies do not go to the City but are more often used as a personal slush fund for police departments. In 2019, 186 asset forfeitures were completed in Alameda County. Out of those 186, 36 took place in Oakland resulting in the collection of money and property worth almost \$900,000.00.<sup>1</sup> Precedent exists: In 2014, the Oakland City Council adopted [a resolution](#) authorizing the City Administrator or his designee to appropriate the Federal Asset Forfeiture Fund balance in the amount of \$248,100. City Council should ask the City Administrator what these balances are and utilize any monies to support the Task Force recommendations.

**3. PROGRESSIVE BUSINESS TAX:** Currently big businesses in Oakland are paying the same amount as smaller businesses and mom-and-pop shops. Big business must pay its fair share and their dollars used to support community based solutions to safety. Council President Nikki Fortunato Bas proposed to amend Oakland's business tax system last year (2020), to make Oakland's business taxes more progressive and fair, but Mayor Libby Schaaf fought against it. Oakland could already have passed an action to make sure our community has the funding for vital needs. We must pass this at the next general election.

**4. PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIPS, FUNDRAISING:** City Council should aim its fundraising with intention and focus, to bring in additional support to the most needed efforts, and to ensure that raised funds are used appropriately and transparently. The City should enter into partnerships with known community entities and private foundations to secure funding for community-based solutions to safety.

---

<sup>1</sup> See California Attorney General, Asset Forfeiture: 2019 Annual Report. [https://oag.ca.gov/sites/all/files/agweb/pdfs/publications/asset\\_forf/2019-af/2019-af.pdf](https://oag.ca.gov/sites/all/files/agweb/pdfs/publications/asset_forf/2019-af/2019-af.pdf).

The Oakland government's fundraising efforts must be directed to vitally needed programs like youth violence prevention, jobs programs, civilian responses, and housing the unhoused, and be used in a transparent and effective way.

**5. TAX THE ULTRA-WEALTHY:** Pending legal confirmation that cities can enact an income tax, Oakland should impose a progressive tax on the ultra-wealthy. People with extraordinary incomes and assets should not pay the same amount of taxes as the working-class or working-poor. The additional dollars should be used to fund vital city services and alternative public safety programs that do not lead with law enforcement.

**6. C.A.R.E.S ACT FUNDING:** The city is expecting upwards of \$190 million dollars from the federal government (The C.A.R.E.S. Act). These monies should be prioritized for shoring up social safety nets for BIPOC low-income and working-class Oakland residents. Additionally, the city should actively seek out additional state and federal grant opportunities.

**7. REVISE MEASURE Z:** Measure Z, a ballot measure enacted by the people of Oakland, provides tax-generated funding for both law enforcement and violence prevention programs. It also sets an OPD "staffing floor" – a minimum number of officers required for the City of Oakland to use that funding. A new ballot measure revising Measure Z should be implemented as soon as is reasonably possible. This measure must (1) reallocate all police funding to violence prevention and public safety programs, and (2) eliminate the staffing floor. In the meantime, the City of Oakland could forgo the \$26M in Measure Z funds, offsetting those costs by cutting \$150M in police funding, funds that could be repurposed to the Measure Z programs with \$124M to spare.

**8. ELIMINATE RED TAPE BY FIXING PERMIT BACKLOG:** The current backlog in Oakland permitting and related work in Development Services is preventing people from building housing and opening businesses; causing hardship in the community, worsening the housing crisis, undermining our economic recovery and denying local people access to economic opportunity. We desperately need the jobs and revenue these projects would generate, yet they are being blocked by the Administration's action to cut the staff who do this work (to process permits, inspections).

We support Oakland Vice Mayor Kaplan's efforts here as she has identified the problem and brought forward a solution to Council to restore these positions and expedite the hiring. We need to continue to push the Administration to do this immediately.<sup>2</sup>

---

2 For more info, see: <https://oakland.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4774106&GUID=BCB40A62-ACE8-4352-A3CF-0B975D688551&Options=&Search=>

**9. CREATE INCOME GENERATING PROJECTS THROUGH THE USE OF CITY PROPERTY THAT IS CURRENTLY NOT BEING UTILIZED.**

**10. UTILIZE THE EXTRA MONIES THAT VICE MAYOR KAPLAN HAS IDENTIFIED VIA THE COLISEUM AUTHORITY TO SUPPORT VITAL PUBLIC NEEDS.<sup>3</sup>**

**11. ADDITIONAL REVENUE GENERATING MEASURES THAT SHOULD BE CONSIDERED FOR BALLOT MEASURES:**

**a. Transportation Network Company (TNC) Trip Tax:** This was introduced in 2020 by Vice Mayor Kaplan, but blocked by billionaire TNC corporations and Mayor Schaaf. There is precedent: Berkeley placed a measure on their ballot based on Vice Mayor Kaplan's design, and it passed in November 2020. San Francisco also passed a TNC trip tax. There is no excuse for wealthy app-based companies to get special tax loopholes. Oakland voters should be given an opportunity to vote for tax fairness, close loopholes, and provide revenue for vital City needs.<sup>4</sup>

**b. Extended Stay Hotel Tax:** Oakland currently has a hotel tax, but it only applies to short stays. With lower demand for short stays and greater demand for shelter-in-place and other reasons for extended stays, hotels should be handling extended stays on the same basis, and the same tax rate should apply. This requires a ballot measure to amend our hotel tax. Progressive Rental Property Tax: Currently, very large landlords in Oakland pay the same tax rate as small mom-and-pop landlords. This should be amended to a progressive rate structure.

---

<sup>3</sup> See, e.g., <https://oaklandside.org/2021/01/20/10-million-to-return-to-oaklands-budget-after-warriors-lose-lawsuit/>.

<sup>4</sup> See e.g., <https://oaklandside.org/2020/09/24/lyft-backing-campaign-to-unseat-oakland-councilmember-rebecca-kaplan/>



## HOW DOES OPD SPEND ITS TIME? NOT FIGHTING VIOLENT CRIME

The Oakland Police Department, the Oakland Police Officers Association (OPOA), and neo-liberal electeds would have you believe that police will lose time to fight violent crime if their budget is cut.

The Anti Police-Terror Project commissioned a study by [AH Datalytics](#) to analyze how the Oakland Police Department spends its time. Below is a list of key findings.

**Violence:** The violent crime category made up 4.2% of all calls using the National Incident Based Response System Definition.

**Medical:** Medical Calls for Service added up to 10% of total calls (44,231) at a median of just under 42 minutes of time spent per call. This category includes:

- *Medical* (5.7%)
- *Mental Health* (2.8%)
- *Suicide* (0.4%)
- *Welfare Check* (1.4%)

**Traffic:** 12.6% of all calls for service are related to traffic.

- 3.8% of those calls are related to accidents with a median call time of over an hour.
- 3.5% are related to enforcement with a median call time of just under 24 minutes.

**Unfounded/Hangups:** 11.4% of all calls are hang-ups or are determined to be unfounded at a median call time of 0:17:31

**Disturbances:** 10.8% of all calls (47,734) are for various types of “disturbances” that include, among other subcategories, a variety of noise complaints.

**Alarms:** 4.3% of all calls for service (19,150) are generated from alarms. Of those calls, at least 65% are coded as false or cancelled.

## RECOMMENDATION ANALYSIS

### OPD ORGANIZATION AND CULTURE

We appreciate the work of all the Advisory Board members and, as the co-creators of this process, we are clear that the purpose of the Task Force was not to strengthen, fix, reform, or rebrand the Oakland Police Department (OPD). Both Oakland and the nation have invested untold resources to “fix” policing. We have seen this with attempts at training on implicit and explicit bias, body camera mandates, and policy shifts regarding Use of Force requirements toward “less lethal” weapons; [weapons that permanently disabled and killed hundreds of Americans](#) during the 2020 summer uprisings. **You cannot fix something that is not broken.** Police and policing

---

**We appreciate the work of all the Advisory Board members and, as the co-creators of this process, we are clear that the purpose of the Task Force was not to strengthen, fix, reform, or rebrand the Oakland Police Department (OPD).**

in this country was [born out of the slave trade](#), the genocide of Indigenous bodies, and the suppression of workers. Their job then was to protect an economic system dependent on the slave labor of Black and Brown bodies and to uphold the tenets of white supremacy that are the foundation of this country. They continue to do their job.

**We remain concerned that, even with amendments, there are almost 30 recommendations in the OPD ORGANIZATION AND CULTURE SECTION.** As history and recent events continue to make painfully clear, a “culture shift” is not what is required. That said, there are several forward-thinking recommendations in this section that we have highlighted and strongly support.

The only rational way forward is to actively divest from policing and invest in the programs and services that are proven to support communities and increase safety. **We urge City Council to place less emphasis on the recommendations in this section** and prioritize focus on BUDGET AND DATA, and ALTERNATIVE PROGRAMS, RESPONSES AND INVESTMENTS.

---

**As history and recent events continue to make painfully clear, a “culture shift” is not what is required.**

---



Photo by Brooke Anderson | @movementphotographer

**Police and policing in this country was born out of the slave trade, the genocide of Indigenous bodies, and the suppression of workers. Their job then was to protect an economic system dependent on the slave labor of Black and Brown bodies and to uphold the tenets of white supremacy that are the foundation of this country. They continue to do their job.**

---

## OPD Organization and Culture Advisory Board

### **1: CREATE AN OAKLAND SPECIFIC CROWD CONTROL ORDINANCE: AMENDED. ADDITIONAL COMMENTARY BELOW.**

**Strongly Support:** We support this recommendation in combination with #83, removing OPD from “special events”. Police should not be at protests. Full stop. Far too much energy and effort is wasted determining when and why police can use chemical and other “less lethal” weapons to hurt, maim and/or possibly kill us. Policing protests only serves to aggravate and escalate those who have come to engage in civil disobedience and free speech. Law enforcement response is a waste of time and resources. For instance, the Libby Schaff administration spent **\$2.2 million on one night of overtime** policing for last year’s F\*ck Your Curfew Protest — a protest staffed by a movement security team ([Community Ready Corps](#)) who have been keeping the public safe and protests on track for almost 30 years. It was a waste of time and resources our city just doesn’t have. What’s more, when protests do escalate, it is almost always the result of law enforcement being present and antagonizing protesters. Removing police from these events will save time, money and prevent violent encounters between law enforcement and community members.

**Additional Commentary:** The amended version is significantly stronger than the original recommendation as it establishes Mutual Aid agreements with community groups and residents trained in non-violence and de-escalation and requires other (outside) agencies providing mutual aid abide by Oakland’s ordinance, and prohibits their use of any equipment or tactics not allowed by OPD’s policy.

### **2: CHANGE THE UNIFORMS FOR POLICE OFFICERS: MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENT AT THIS TIME.**

**Support with Commentary:** We support the concepts behind recommendations #2 and #3. [Research demonstrates](#) that the more militarized a police department is, the more violent they are likely to be. These types of reforms are not, however, aligned with the mission and mandate of RPSTF. The goal is not to make cops “a little safer”. The goal is to reimagine public safety by divesting from law enforcement and investing in housing, jobs, health care, and other services.

### **3: ELIMINATE ALL MILITARY TITLES AND RANKS AND CHANGE ALL JOB TITLES TO CIVILIAN PROFESSIONAL TITLES: MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENT AT THIS TIME.**

**Support:** See #2

---

## PROTESTERS INJURED BY OPD

OPD has routinely used excessive force against peaceful protests, including at several protests during the uprising after George Floyd's murder. On June 1, thousands of Oakland youth marched to demand cuts to the Oakland Police Department budget. At 7:57 pm (before the curfew that had imposed took effect – Oakland Police Department threw flashbang grenades and teargas into the gathered crowd and proceeded to make 100+ arrests into the night, rounding up protestors and non-protestors alike, including many of our unhoused neighbors and essential workers. This was a peaceful action and it was met with violence by the Oakland Police Department as they tear gassed our children.

Several protesters were severely injured during the June 1 protest or in the days leading up to it.

- Jennifer Li sustained injuries when [she alleges](#) OPD threw a flashbang grenade and stinger ball directly into her back as she was walking away from the June 1, 2020, protest. The flashbang exploded on her back, causing her to stumble forward. She also experienced ringing in her ear and suffered a perforation in her left ear drum.
- A 30-year old Oakland resident was in the crowd and reported that they were given no time to disperse before being bombarded with tear gas. [She states](#), "I was present with a walking buddy who is currently using a cane and cannot run. We both began to lose our vision as we tried to escape the gas at a walking pace. I began to lose my vision, and my lungs seized. There was nearly a full minute where I was not receiving oxygen.

I believe I began to pass out as I felt my body start to keel over and braced myself for losing consciousness by getting almost on all fours. I believe that another 20-30 seconds in that environment would have led to a loss of consciousness and possibly asphyxia."

- [Daniel Sanchez](#) was shot in the eye with a rubber bullet near the corner of Broadway Street and 14th Street, likely by a member of the OPD, during a protest on May 30, 2020.



#### **4: CREATE A LAW ENFORCEMENT MUTUAL AID PLAN FOR 21ST CENTURY PUBLIC SAFETY OPERATIONS: AMENDED. ADDITIONAL COMMENTARY PROVIDED.**

**Strongly Do Not Support:** Oaklanders are terrorized not just by the Oakland Police Department, but also by multiple other law enforcement agencies that patrol our streets. We demand an end to the harm caused by the California Highway Patrol (CHP), BART PD, and the Alameda County Sheriff's Department within the City of Oakland. We make this demand in the name of Brianna Colombo and Erik Salgado, who were shot by CHP on a residential street in East Oakland on June 6, 2020. They were unarmed. Erik Salgado was killed. Brianna, who was four months pregnant, lost her child. Further harm was done by law enforcement during the George Floyd protests, when outside agencies brought to Oakland under our state's mutual aid scheme used tear gas and other "less-lethal" forms of crowd control. When the Anti Police-Terror Project filed a lawsuit resulting in a preliminary injunction limiting the use of such weapons, mutual aid agencies threatened to refuse to come to Oakland if they could no longer use those weapons. We are safer when violent and reckless policing agencies like the [Alameda County Sheriff's Department](#) are not on Oakland's streets. This recommendation should give the people of Oakland as much power as possible to decide who has authority within our borders.

**Additional Commentary:** While the amendments to this recommendation bring it closer to alignment with our vision, Oaklanders have the right to determine who may or may not police within their borders, and under what conditions. If we are reimagining public safety, we must be envisioning a society where agencies like CHP cannot come onto our streets and murder Oaklanders with impunity.

#### **5: EVALUATE OFFICER CANDIDATES FOR IMPLICIT AND EXPLICIT BIASES. MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Support:** Investigative journalists have recently reinforced what many of us already knew: white supremacist groups and actors continue to populate law enforcement agencies across the country. The Proud Boys, the [Three Percenters](#) and the Oath Keepers have recently been exposed for their ties to both law enforcement, the military and right-wing hate groups. The very least Oakland can do is screen candidates for these biases (read: racist ideologies and tendencies). Racists are attracted to policing because they know their ideology has a home there. That does not require screening; it requires dismantling and transformation.

See #2 re: reforms

**6: ELIMINATE OR REDUCE THE USE OF OPD'S HELICOPTER: AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Strongly Support:** We fully support this recommendation. In addition to being an incessant annoyance for Oaklanders, the helicopter costs Oakland taxpayers \$500,000 annually with little-to-nothing to show in terms of safety outcomes.

**7: ACHIEVE COMPLIANCE WITH THE NSA. AMENDED. ADDITIONAL COMMENTARY PROVIDED.**

**Strongly Support:** The [Negotiated Settlement Agreement \(NSA\)](#) was born out of the Riders case wherein Oakland officers were exposed for harassing, extorting and assaulting Black Oakland residents in West Oakland. Targeting, profiling and abuse of Black Oaklanders by OPD continues today and is central to why BIPOC Oaklanders do not trust, nor want to engage, local law enforcement. The NSA was intended to fix the culture that propagates this behavior. It has failed – we believe in large part because the very culture of policing is rooted in racism and violence. That said, it is significantly more difficult to pursue certain transformations within OPD while the NSA is active. The city needs the NSA's terms to be satisfied to free Oakland from its requirements so we can move forward without restriction in our transformation efforts.

**Additional Commentary:** We disagree that Oakland's failure to satisfy the conditions of the NSA are due to a lack of training or bureaucracy - we believe it is due to a failure of the current administration to hold OPD accountable. We do not need more structure to support the NSA, we need an administration that demands that OPD either satisfy the NSA's conditions or face consequences for not meeting the goals and benchmarks.

**8. INSTITUTE NEW INCENTIVE STRUCTURES THAT ENCOURAGE OFFICERS TO REPORT MISCONDUCT AND MISTREATMENT BY THEIR PEERS. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Support with Commentary:** Officers who are bystanders to instances of excessive use of force are just as responsible as officers who commit these acts. Police officers shouldn't need incentives to report violence against community members, and there should be additional consequences for failing to report misconduct – we need a stronger version of what was proposed in AB 1022 (McCarty) at the state level last year which would have “required that officers report potential excessive force to a superior officer when present and observing another officer using force that the officer believes to be unnecessary, and to require that officers intercede when present and observing another officer using force that is clearly beyond that which is necessary...” as specified.

See #2 re: reforms

## **9. TRAIN ALL OFFICERS IN HOW TO DEAL WITH THE PRESS**

**Support:** The Oakland Police Department should respect the right of the media to do their job and the media should feel free to do their job without the fear of experiencing bodily harm or incarceration in the process. There is nothing reimaginative about this demand. **This should just be OPD policy without spending additional funds on training.**

See #2 re: reforms

## **10. INTRODUCE A PROCESS THAT LOOKS FOR PATTERNS OF BIGOTRY AND BIAS WHEN REVIEWING A CANDIDATE'S QUALIFICATIONS. MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Support – #10 and #11:** The institution of policing in America is rooted in racism and violence. Even individuals entering the police department with good intentions will be exposed to the racist and misogynistic culture that infects OPD and other departments across the country. Racists are attracted to policing because they know their ideology has a home there. That does not require screening; it requires dismantling and transformation.

See #2 re: reforms

## **11. AUDIT THE OFFICERS THAT REJECT DIVERSE CANDIDATES FOR BIAS. MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Support:** See #10.

## **12. TRAIN OFFICERS ON THE HISTORY OF BLACK AND BROWN COMMUNITIES IN OAKLAND. MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Do Not Support:** We have spent enough taxpayer dollars, effort and energy on police training; resulting in policies on paper and no real change in practice.



---

**“The job of this Task Force is not to reform OPD, but to reimagine public safety, develop radical (rational) reforms and, reallocate police resources to community programs.”**



Photo by Brooke Anderson | @movementphotographer

**13. TRAIN WITH THE GOAL OF CREATING EQUITY FOR ALL PARTICIPANTS. WITHDRAWN. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Do Not Support:** We have spent enough taxpayer dollars, effort and energy on police training, resulting in policies on paper and no real change in practice.

*The job of this Task Force is not to reform OPD, but to reimagine public safety, develop radical (rational) reforms and reallocate police resources to community programs.*

**14. 6-MONTHS OF COLLEGE COURSEWORK PRIOR TO WORKING IN THE FIELD. MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Do Not Support:** If we are spending monies on education, then these dollars should be spent on creating quality educational experiences for BIPOC community members in Oakland – specifically for Black children who have been left behind and are tracked into sex work or jails and prisons by our school system.

**15. TRAINING BY SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS ON ALLEVIATING HIGH IMPACT NOISE EVENTS. WITHDRAWN. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Support with Conditions:** We support the development of neighborhood-based responses to community high impact noise events like sideshows and fireworks season. Those who live in a particular neighborhood are the experts, and need to be supported to develop community-generated responses.

**16. USING APPROPRIATE ETHNIC GROUP ASSIGNMENT FOR ITS RESPECTIVE POPULATION. MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Support:** This is low-hanging fruit that will interrupt patterns of daily disrespect by law enforcement toward our BIPOC community members. This should be implemented across all racial groups and ethnicities in Oakland. *This should be implemented with no additional monies going to the Oakland Police Department.*

See #2 re: reforms

**17. PROMOTION PACKETS INCLUDING AN OFFICER'S ENTIRE DISCIPLINE HISTORY. MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Support:** All promotions should be vetted by the Police Commission. *This should be implemented with no additional monies going to the Oakland Police Department.*

See #2 re: reforms

**18. PROMOTION PACKETS – DISCIPLINE HISTORY. MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Support with Commentary:** Add text mandating law enforcement agencies adhere to SB 1421; requiring any information that can be made available to the public be made available to the public with ease, without fees or additional obstacles to transparency.

See #2 re: reforms

**19. PROMOTION PACKETS- EMPHASIS ON TRAINING. MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Do Not Support:** Training has had little to no impact on the culture or behavioral patterns of the Oakland Police Department. *The mission of this Task Force is not to reform OPD, but to reimagine public safety and reallocate police resources to community programs, resources and supports.*

---

**Being Black or Brown,  
in a mental health crisis  
and law enforcement is a  
deadly cocktail.**

**20. IMPLEMENTATION OF RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE BPOA. MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Neutral.**

**21. CHANGES TO HIRING. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THE TIME.**

**Neutral:** This mission of this Task Force is not to reform OPD, but to reimagine public safety and reallocate police resources to community programs.

**22. UPDATE OPD PROMOTION PROCESS. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Neutral:** The mission of this Task Force is not to reform OPD, but to reimagine public safety and reallocate police resources to community programs.

**23. COMMUNITY AUDIT OF CIVILIAN POLICE ACADEMY**

**Neutral:** We do not see how this recommendation facilitates the reimaging process or forges new pathways to public safety.

**24. REQUIREMENTS FOR DIVERSITY BASED TRAINING. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Do Not Support:** See earlier commentary on diversity and training.

## 25. VULNERABLE POPULATION COMMUNICATION

**Neutral:** As long as this system of policing exists, having police who speak the language of those they are policing is necessary. While we are crystal clear that having police that look like us and/or live in our communities is not, and will never be, an answer to police violence, we are also clear that many deaths have been caused by language barriers, and thus we feel that it is necessary for law enforcement to be able to speak the language of those they police.

**No funding should be tied to this police training.**

## 26. FOCUSED EFFORT TO INCREASE GENDER AND RACIAL DIVERSITY. MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.

**Do Not Support:** See above commentary on diversity and training.

## 27. REVISE THE OPD RISK ASSESSMENT SYSTEM. MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.

**Support with Commentary:** Decisions around police resource allocation should not be made based on historical data as historically the allocation of police resources has been biased and racist.

See #2 re: reforms

## 28. TRACK THE INCIDENCES OF MISCONDUCT. MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.

**Support:** Per state law SB 1421 (Skinner), applicable information must be made available to the public without delays, intimidation, impossible fees or other impediments to community in accessing reports, records and data.

## 29. ANALYZE MILITARY VETERAN OFFICERS

**Do Not Support:** This recommendation unfairly targets military veterans. People coming home from the horrors of war should be provided with the help, support, and services they need to become whole people and fully contributing members of society. The ills of policing are not about individual officers, but rather the institution of policing itself.



**30. REMOVE OFFICERS WITH INCIDENTS OF MISCONDUCT. MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Strongly Support with Commentary:** We recommended that the author of this recommendation seek feedback from the legal and policy advisory board for guidance on how to make this recommendation effective in light of current labor laws and the California Peace Officers Bill of Rights.

Many police departments across the state are populated by officers who have committed one or several acts of serious misconduct without punishment. APTP is cosponsoring [SB 2](#); legislation that would create a state department to decertify officers who commit acts of serious misconduct. #30 should include a recommendation that Oakland City Council pass a resolution in support of such legislation.

**31. TRANSFER MOST OF IAD TO CPRA. MERGED WITH RECOMMENDATION #84. ADDITIONAL COMMENTARY BELOW.**

**Strongly Support:** Civilianizing IAD will generate significant cost savings. Police should not, and history demonstrates they [clearly cannot investigate themselves](#). In their [Independent Police Oversight report](#), the Anti Police-Terror Project recommended allocating 5% of OPD's budget to this process.

**Joshua Pawlik's Story**

Joshua Pawlik was murdered by the Oakland Police Department (OPD) on March 11, 2018. Four officers shot him more than 20 times while he was sleeping in West Oakland. Joshua was homeless, struggling with mental health issues and just beginning to wake up when OPD murdered him. He was 32 years old.

Unsurprisingly, OPD's investigation into his murder was bogus. A federal court-appointed monitor rejected the findings of internal investigations, calling them "deficient" and then-Police Chief Anne Kirkpatrick's oversight "disappointing and myopic."

The Oakland City Council agreed to pay Pawlik's family \$1.4 million in April of 2020.

**32. UPDATE MANUAL OF RULES & DISCIPLINE MATRIX. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Support with Conditions:** No additional monies are provided to the Oakland Police Department to achieve this goal.

---

## The goal is less police contact, not more.

### **33. END QUALIFIED IMMUNITY TO KEEP OFFICERS MORE ACCOUNTABLE. WITHDRAWN. ADDITIONAL COMMENTARY BELOW.**

**Strongly Support with Conditions:** Ending [qualified immunity](#) is one of the single most important radical “rational” reforms we can enact to interrupt state violence. Qualified immunity allows police officers to

violate the civil rights of the people with absolute impunity. It makes it nearly impossible to hold law enforcement officers accountable for even the most serious and deliberate violations of our constitutional rights. No additional monies should be provided to the Oakland Police Department to achieve this recommendation.

Without ending qualified immunity, short of absolute abolition, we will never end state violence.

### **34. COORDINATE CITY OR COUNTY SERVICES TO RESPOND TO SPECIAL POPULATIONS. AMENDED. ADDITIONAL COMMENTARY BELOW.**

**Strongly Support with Commentary:** Responses to vulnerable, marginalized or distressed populations should not lead with law enforcement, nor should they be equal partners in this work. Law enforcement should be the last resort. *Plans and policies to work with these populations should reside outside the police department.* Programs like MACRO should be brought in-house under the supervision of the fire department, and community services like [MH First](#) should be seen as a partner with the city in this work. *The goal is less police contact, not more.*

**Additional Commentary:** #34 was revised to recommend coordination between departments to prevent members of vulnerable populations from being engaged by law enforcement. We now support it as it is housed within a non law enforcement department.

### **35. UPDATE POLICIES REGARDING SPECIAL POPULATIONS. WITHDRAWN.**

**Do Not Support with Commentary:** Police should not be responding to these calls. Full stop. Invest in community groups and city employees outside of law enforcement who are more prepared, more qualified and more connected to the communities in crises.

### **36\_97. RESTRUCTURE OAKLAND DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SAFETY: ESTABLISH A COMMUNITY SAFETY COORDINATING HUB CENTERED WITH A NEW PUBLIC SAFETY DEPARTMENT. AMENDED.**

**Strongly Support:** This recommendation reflects the heart of what this Task Force was created to do and the types of services that should be invested in. The only words of caution we have are (a) the creation of this department should be done in close partnership with the community who generated the Reimagining call, (b) further entangling OPD with other departments should be avoided at all costs and (c) OPD should not be a part of this process.

### **37. INSTITUTE CROSS FUNCTIONAL TEAM TO APPROACH CRISIS RESPONSE**

**Strongly Do Not Support:** Police should not be responding to these calls.

### **38. SUSPEND OR TRANSFER THE PARAMILITARY BEARCAT ARMoured VEHICLE. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Support:** The demilitarization of the Oakland Police Department is critical to ensuring the health and welfare of Oakland residents. This includes ending the use of weapons and excessive machinery (such as helicopters, bearcats, chemical munitions, and projectiles), that only serve to increase fear and harm within our communities. [Data demonstrate](#) that police departments that possess and utilize military-grade equipment have higher incidents of excessive use of force and see the communities they patrol more as enemy combatants rather than residents they are supposed to “protect and serve”.

### **39. FULLY STAFF/ TRAIN NEIGHBORHOOD SERVICES**

**Support with conditions:** Empowering and resourcing community members to find solutions to local issues and diffuse situations before they escalate is an excellent violence prevention strategy. However, Neighborhood Services should not be integrated with the Oakland Police Department.

### **40. INCREASE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT & COMMUNITY SENSITIVITY TRAINING**

**Do Not Support:** These strategies have been ineffective in protecting BIPOC communities from state violence. We need transformation, not training.

### **41. REORGANIZING OPD’S INTERNAL STRUCTURE**

**Do Not Support:** The Oakland Police Department should in all likelihood reorganize, however that is not the mandate of this Task Force nor the focus of this moment.

### **42. CEASE USAGE OF EQUIPMENT BANNED IN PROPOSED ORDINANCE. MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Strongly Support.**

### **43. DEMILITARIZE POLICE DEPARTMENT: AMENDED. ADDITIONAL COMMENTARY BELOW.**

**Strongly Support:** See above analysis and commentary on militarization. No additional monies should be provided to the Oakland Police Department.

**Additional Commentary:** We support the immediate end to stress-based training for trainees based on the military boot camp model.

**44. RENEGOTIATE OPOA'S MOU IN 2021 INSTEAD OF 2024. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY.**

**Strongly Support:** We strongly support the renegotiation of the OPOA Contract in 2021 instead of 2024. Our current MOU with the Oakland Police Officers Association was passed by a lame duck city council in late 2018 and provided OPD a 12.5% raise over five years. The agreement has caused irrevocable financial harm to the City of Oakland's economy, and we are in desperate need of contract renegotiations to fend off the current economic crisis.

## **Budget and Data Analysis Advisory Board**

**45. IMPLEMENT A YOUTH CENTERED PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING PROCESS: AMENDED. ADDITIONAL COMMENTARY BELOW.**

**Support:** Young people should have a seat at the table when it comes to designing city policies and practices that will impact their lives for years to come.

**Additional Commentary:** This is enveloped in a larger community-centered participatory budget process which moves decision-making to the city residents and not just those in positions of government.

**46. INVESTMENT IN EARLY LITERACY (3RD GRADE AND BELOW)**

**Strongly Support with Conditions:** For far too long, Oakland has allowed BIPOC students to languish in a school system that is not only not serving them, but is actively harming them and solidifying pathways to prison or into the underground world of sex trafficking for which Oakland is internationally known. This recommendation should be developed in partnership with Black students, parents and teachers and tie into the [current organizing](#) demanding reparations for Black students in OUSD.

**47. IMPLEMENTING A SECOND PHASE OF REIMAGINING PUBLIC SAFETY**

**Strongly Support.**

**48. HIRING ADDITIONAL FACILITATORS/PARTNER ORGANIZATIONS**

**Support.**



#### **49. STREAMLINING AND MAKING PUBLIC MULTIPLE FORMS OF DATA FROM OPD**

**Support:** The calls for service data with location must be provided regularly. A quality example of this can be found within the [Phoenix Police Department](#).

#### **50. REALLOCATE AND REINVEST FUNDS FROM THE OPD BUDGET INTO OTHER AREAS THAT INCREASE PUBLIC SAFETY**

**Strongly Support:** Reducing sworn officers and replacing sworn officers with non-sworn staff is central to the process of defunding OPD. Sworn officers make up more than 65% of OPD spending, and the cost of a sworn position is on average 1.8 times the cost of a non-sworn position.

#### **51. THE CITY PRIORITIZING THE RENEGOTIATION OF THE OPOA MOU**

**Strongly Support:** The current OPOA MOU is extremely detrimental to Oakland's financial well-being and needs to be amended immediately.

#### **52. BUILD ON THE TASK FORCE'S GUIDING PRINCIPLE #2**

**Strongly Support.**

#### **53. ADOPT "VERIFIED RESPONSE" STANDARD FOR DISPATCH OF PATROL OFFICERS TO BURGLARY ALARMS**

**Strongly Support:** The verified response standard is an attempt to address the fact that the majority of burglar alarms are "false alarms." As the recommendation points out, the city wastes over a million dollars a year responding to false alarms.

#### **54. PRIORITIZE OPD DATA COLLECTION & ANALYSIS STAFFING AND MECHANISMS. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Strongly Support:** SB 1421 (Nancy Skinner) made access to increased data from California law enforcement agencies state law. Like many law enforcement agencies across the state, the [Oakland Police Department has continued on as if they do not have to respond to community requests for records and data](#). There are documented incidents of families impacted by state violence having to wait upwards of years to receive records related to the murder of their loved ones. This is unacceptable. While increased data staffing should happen outside of OPD, this recommendation will improve accountability in Oakland. The Police Commission needs the power to hold the Department accountable for not meeting the standard of the law and adding to the distress of community members already taxed and traumatized as a result of OPD's misconduct.

#### **55. CREATE MORE OPD DATA TRANSPARENCY**

**Support:** See above.

## Alternate Responses, Programs, and Investments Advisory Board

### 56. CREATE A CITYWIDE BEHAVIORAL HEALTH UNIT

**Support:** It is imperative that this program remain entirely separate and apart from OPD. The recommendation mentions training – any training provided to OPD needs to center on diverting the highest percentage of service calls possible away from OPD and to the BHU and MACRO.

### 57. IMMEDIATELY MAKE LONG-TERM INVESTMENT IN MACRO. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.

**Strongly Support:** MACRO is not a program. It is a set of principles. This makes it that much more important that the facilitator of the actual program gets it right. We recommend that Oakland bring MACRO into the City and create unionized BIPOC living wage jobs – for example, this program could be housed within the Fire Department. We also must ensure that MACRO is working in partnership with programs like MH First, who do not utilize the 9-1-1 number, so we are serving the whole of the Oakland community. To create a program out of the principles, MACRO should contract with local Black and Brown experts currently engaged in the work.

#### Marcellus Toney

On September 28, 2017, Marcellus Toney was involved in a car accident on the 4100 block of Foothill Boulevard. OPD was called to the scene and within minutes, Marcellus Toney – an unarmed, 45-year old Black man – was Tased by an Oakland police officer. He later died. Footage of the events leading up to Marcellus’s killing show he was clearly in a state of mental health crisis when police confronted him.

His wife, La Mesha Toney, arrived at the hospital thinking he had been in a car accident. She left the hospital without ever seeing his body because she was

told there had been an interaction with the police, Marcellus died on the way to the hospital, and now his body was “evidence”. La Mesha was never contacted by OPD to tell her what happened. She had to call them after a friend told her she saw that a man had been Tased earlier in the day who looked like Marcellus. Despite repeated requests for police reports, autopsy reports and medical records, the family was denied any evidence or explanation about what happened to Marcellus.

Marcellus was a husband, a father and a friend.



**58. FUND/CREATE COMMUNITY HOTLINES AND TRANSFER 911 CALL CENTER OUT OF OPD. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Strongly Support:** We fully support this recommendation. It calls on the city to support [Mental Health First](#) (MH First) Oakland, a project of APTP, that launched in December 2019 in Sacramento and Oakland in August 2020. MH First is Oakland’s first and only model for non-police response to mental health crises, substance abuse and interpersonal violence. [Research shows that large swaths of the BIPOC community will not call 9-1-1 under any circumstances.](#) We need to provide a pathway to safety and care for those populations.

**59. MOVE MOST TRAFFIC ENFORCEMENT TO OAKDOT. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Strongly Support:** We support moving most traffic violations to OakDOT. Police traffic stops remain one of the leading entry points to violent police interactions for Black and Brown people, as these drivers are pulled over at disproportionate rates and suffer disproportionate harm, including incarceration and death, from police engagement. You do not need a badge and a gun to write a speeding ticket.

**60. CREATE A CIVILIAN COMMUNITY AMBASSADORS PROGRAM TO RESPOND TO NONVIOLENT, NON-MENTAL HEALTH INCIDENTS. AMENDED. NEW COMMENTARY BELOW.**

**Strongly Support:** We support the implementation of community ambassadors as first responders to non-emergency calls as identified in this recommendation.

Various “disturbances” and disorderly conduct calls for service comprise over 11% of officer time. Virtually all of those calls could be responded to first by community ambassadors who reside in the neighborhoods they are tasked with supporting.

**Additional Commentary:** Recommendation #95, assigning community ambassadors housed in DPW to specific areas of the city, is a great first step towards creating an expansive community ambassador program.

---

**The Task Force should prioritize recommendations that create the largest shifts in how public safety is defined and executed in Oakland—not in recommendations that reinforce the violent status quo.**

## Community Ready Corps Ambassador Program

### Community Ready

Corps (CRC) is a Black-created and Black-led grassroots organization dedicated to organizing and empowering the community to achieve self determination and equity. CRC has delivered community safety services and mutual aid for nearly 30 years. Their model is based on working



within the community and building strong relationships to enhance security. CRC has provided security at community events and protests in Oakland and San Francisco, Glide, East Oakland Youth Development Center, Malcolm X Jazz Festival, and in the Laurel Business Improvement District. CRC's Community Ambassadors are trained in de-escalation and are from the communities they serve, so they have done the work to earn the community's trust and have an established reputation for successfully working in communities of ethnic, cultural and religious diversity. Their approach to security centers community engagement and respect.

### **61. DISSOLVE OPD HOMELESS OUTREACH UNIT AND REINVEST IN MOBILE STREET OUTREACH. AMENDED. NO ADDITIONAL COMMENTARY.**

**Strongly Support:** These duties could go to MACRO or other crisis response groups like MH First. Rather than law enforcement accompanying city workers, let's utilize community ambassadors or community safety teams like Community Ready Corps to do this work.

### **62. REINVEST HOUSING AUTHORITY POLICE BUDGET THROUGH PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Strongly Support with Commentary:** As is laid out in this recommendation, the OHA Police Department, operating under the U.S. Dept of Housing and Urban Development, spends the majority of its time enforcing non-criminal infractions, lease violations, and parking and traffic violations. As a result, OHA residents are constantly policed in and around their own homes. This not only criminalizes them, but also places their housing in jeopardy. Oakland's City Council should demand the dissolution of the OHAPD and demand that all section 8 funding go to housing and supportive programming.

**61. DISSOLVE OPD HOMELESS OUTREACH UNIT AND REINVEST IN MOBILE STREET OUTREACH. AMENDED. NO ADDITIONAL COMMENTARY.**

**Strongly Support:** These duties could go to MACRO or other crisis response groups like MH First. Rather than law enforcement accompanying city workers, let's utilize community ambassadors or community safety teams like Community Ready Corps to do this work.

**62. REINVEST HOUSING AUTHORITY POLICE BUDGET THROUGH PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Strongly Support with Commentary:** As is laid out in this recommendation, the OHA Police Department, operating under the U.S. Dept of Housing and Urban Development, spends the majority of its time enforcing non-criminal infractions, lease violations, and parking and traffic violations. As a result, OHA residents are constantly policed in and around their own homes. This not only criminalizes them, but also places their housing in jeopardy. Oakland's City Council should demand the dissolution of the OHAPD and demand that all section 8 funding go to housing and supportive programming.

**63. GIVE NEIGHBORHOODS POWER TO REDUCE HOUSING PATROLS. AMENDED. NEW COMMENTARY BELOW.**

**Support:** This recommendation was amended to give neighborhoods the power to reduce the number of roving patrols in their neighborhood. Community members should not feel under siege or as if there is an occupying army in their community.

**64. REPEAL LAWS CRIMINALIZING HOMELESSNESS AND POVERTY. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Strongly Support.**

**65. PROVIDE A PUBLIC HEALTH RESPONSE TO ADDICTION/SUBSTANCE ABUSE. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Strongly Support.**

**66. STOP ENFORCEMENT OF LAWS THAT CRIMINALIZE SEX TRADE BETWEEN CONSENTING ADULTS**

**Strongly Support with Commentary:** Rather than simple non-enforcement of the laws as suggested in this recommendation, the laws should be repealed. It is draconian to arrest and incarcerate consenting adults for engaging in sexual activity. That said, Oakland is a destination on the "circuit" and thousands of underage girls and kidnapped women pass through our city borders annually to be bought and sold in the sex trafficking industry. A quick drive down E-1-4 reveals throngs of children being sold for sex. Because the majority of these girls are Black or BIPOC, the City of Oakland ignores the issue, even allowing OPD to profit/benefit from the trade. Oakland must contract with [local agencies](#) to develop policies and programming that both protect sex workers and interrupt sex trafficking. There must also be a significant focus on Black and Brown Trans women.

Across the Bay, organizations like [Transgender Gender-variant and Intersex Justice Project](#) and [St. James Infirmary](#) have received city dollars to provide programming to their communities. We need to be doing the same. Investment in organizations that work with that demographic should be fiscally supported and looked to for leadership. Those closest to the problem have the solution, and these groups need to be empowered to create policies that keep them whole, healthy and safe.

**67. BUILD A RESTORATIVE JUSTICE WEB OF SUPPORT. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Strongly Support.**

**68. PROVIDE MORE COMPREHENSIVE REENTRY SUPPORT**

**Strongly Support:** As the criminal legal system provides those leaving incarceration with very little in terms of support, the City of Oakland needs to go above and beyond with our services and accessibility.

**69. EXPAND RESTORATIVE JUSTICE DIVERSION FOR YOUTH AND YOUNG ADULTS. AMENDED. ADDITIONAL COMMENTARY BELOW.**

**Support with Commentary:** No young person should be put in a cage. We stand in solidarity with efforts across the Bay and the state to close all youth jails/prisons.

---

**No young person should be put in a cage.**

**Additional Commentary:** Restorative Justice practices must remain rooted in their Indigenous foundation and Transformative Justice must be included with all Restorative Justice processes. While the roots of Restorative Justice are located in Indigenous and traditional communities, where the collective process of healing and restoration is practiced and upheld, the systems of white supremacy have co-opted many of these community healing practices by inserting them in a criminal justice reform model. Now, rather than truly restoring both sides to the original harm by addressing the root causes of such poverty, patriarchy, and racism subjected on both the harm doer and the harmed, currently Restorative Justice practice is in many spaces rooted in reforming the harm doer, alleviating only the resentment of the harmed. Thus, for many, the system of Restorative Justice practice has become punitive and tied to the carceral system.

Transformative Justice on the other hand is true to the original intent of the Indigenous and traditional practices of addressing the harm done by looking at restoring the wholeness of the being for both the harm doer and the harmed. This includes accountability and an accounting of all the root causes that lead to the harm committed. The practice is one that is not prescriptive, as Restorative Justice practice has become currently. Instead, it is creative in finding ways to fulfill the acts of the apology, accounting, healing, and restoration of the relationship between the harm doer and the harmed as well as with the community.

Transformative Justice best occurs within communities that have pre-existing

relationships. In order to move forward with Transformative Justice, resources will need to be directed to community- based groups to anchor the training and work to hold Transformative Justice practices and processes.

We support this recommendation with the understanding that its authors are promoting what we call Transformative Justice, rather than the prescriptive model of Restorative Justice.

## **70. INVEST MORE IN PROGRAMS, SERVICES, AND SPACES FOR YOUNG PEOPLE**

**Support with commentary:** See RJ commentary above.

## **71. EXPAND AND FUND EXISTING HARM REDUCTION SERVICES. AMENDED. NO ADDITIONAL COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Strongly Support:** The City of Oakland's programming for people who use drugs are severely underfunded. We need to provide a more robust harm reduction infrastructure for the People of Oakland.

## **72. INCREASE FUNDING TO GENDER-BASED VIOLENCE RESPONSE SERVICES**

**Strongly Support with Commentary:** Oakland allocates a disproportionately small percentage of its budget to respond to gender-based violence. We thank this advisory board for demanding that we appropriately fund services.

Responses to Interpersonal violence must be couched in holistic and non punitive policies and practices for the entire family. The commitment to support the survivor is equally important as committing to support the person who perpetrated the harm. The goal should be to heal everybody. Support must be participant centered and participant determined. Not all survivors want to leave. Even if families do choose to separate, steps must be taken to ensure healing for all parties so the cycle of violence can be broken.

## **73. EXPAND FLEXIBLE FUNDING FOR SURVIVORS OF GENDER-BASED VIOLENCE**

**Strongly Support with Commentary:** Oakland allocates a disproportionately small percentage of its budget to respond to gender-based violence. We thank this advisory board for demanding that we increase flexible funding for survivors.

Responses to interpersonal violence must be couched in holistic and non-punitive policies and practices for the entire family. The commitment to support the survivor is equally important as committing to support the person who perpetrated the harm. The goal should be to heal everybody. Support must be participant-centered and participant-determined. Not all survivors want to leave. Even if families do choose to separate, steps must be taken to ensure healing for all parties so the cycle of violence can be broken.

#### **74. ADEQUATELY FUND GENDER-BASED VIOLENCE PREVENTION**

**Strongly Support with Commentary:** Oakland allocates a disproportionately small percentage of its budget to respond to gender-based violence. We thank this advisory board for demanding that we appropriately fund prevention efforts.

Responses to interpersonal violence must be couched in holistic and non-punitive policies and practices for the entire family. The commitment to support the survivor is equally important as committing to support the person who perpetrated the harm. The goal should be to heal everybody. Support must be participant-centered and participant-determined. Not all survivors want to leave. Even if families do choose to separate, steps must be taken to ensure healing for all parties so the cycle of violence can be broken.

#### **75. PERMIT/INVEST IN A COMMUNITY-LED SIDESHOW SPACE**

**Neutral.**

#### **76. CREATE AN ADVISORY COUNCIL OF UNHOUSED RESIDENTS TO GUIDE CITY POLICY**

**Support:** The City of Oakland's approach to tackling this problem needs to be guided and led by those most impacted.





## **77. CREATE IMMEDIATE HOUSING SOLUTIONS**

**Support with Commentary:** We strongly support this recommendation. Conversations about rent coverage for tenants must also include mortgage support for mom-and-pop landlords who have also been hard hit so they can continue to provide housing for Oaklanders.

## **78. REVITALIZE COMMERCIAL CORRIDORS**

**Support with Commentary:** BIPOC neighborhoods remain neglected in the City of Oakland. Streets do not get cleaned, roads do not get fixed, and dumping runs unmitigated. The city must invest resources to correct these issues with a focus on longtime BIPOC shop owners. Investing in these spaces not only supports local businesses, it has also been demonstrated to decrease acts of violence in the surrounding area.

When implementing this program, we must not repeat or implement George Kelling/Bill Bratton's Broken Windows Policy, which resulted in the [targeting, profiling, harassing, assaulting, and incarceration of BIPOC community members](#).

## **79. TRANSFORM UNUSED VACANT LOTS**

**Strongly Support with Commentary:** The City of Oakland should use public land for public good. Currently our greatest need is low-income and work-force housing. We support this recommendation because it not only provides a temporary purpose for vacant lots as housing initiatives move forward, it also has been demonstrated to reduce acts of violence in the surrounding area.

## **80. CREATE A WORKFORCE EQUITY FUND**

**Support:** This recommendation needs to more clearly identify Black and other BIPOC community members of Oakland as the primary beneficiaries of the fund.

## **81. MAKE ALL OAKLAND COMMUNITY COLLEGES FREE FOR LOCAL RESIDENTS**

**Strongly Support.**

## **82. LAUNCH A BASIC INCOME PROGRAM TO ADDRESS INCOME INSTABILITY**

**Support.**

## **83. INCREASE ACCESS TO AFFORDABLE AND NUTRITIOUS FOOD**

**Support.**

## Legal and Policy Barriers and Opportunities Advisory Board

### **84. ELIMINATE DUPLICATION OF INVESTIGATIONS BY IAD AND CPRA. MERGED W/OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS: LEGAL AND POLICY BARRIERS AND OPPORTUNITIES. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

There currently exist two methods of investigation—Internal Affairs Division (IAD) in OPD and CPRA the civilian oversight body—in an effort to have "checks and balances" for investigations into officer misconduct, specifically allegations for which a full investigation is mandated under Oakland City Charter Section 604/Measure LL. By removing IAD, the city would effectively be removing the entity that polices itself when investigating officer use of force and other higher levels of misconduct. Those funds can adequately fund a civilian investigation arm (AOTP's [Proposal for Effective Police Oversight](#) indicates this civilian investigative arm should be funded at no less than 5% of overall police budget) and remove the blue line of impunity from these investigations.

### **85. TRANSFER FORENSICS CRIME LAB OUT OF OPD**

**Support.** There is no need for sworn officers to engage in these functions. Civilianizing these roles saves money and reduces the size of our police department.

### **86. TRANSFER SPECIAL EVENT DUTIES OUT OF OPD**

**Strongly Support.** Police should not be at protests, see #1.

### **87. INITIATE A PART-TIME SWORN OFFICER PILOT PROGRAM. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Strongly Do Not Support:** The goal of this Task Force is to Reimagine Public Safety. This recommendation reinforces the status quo. Identifying jobs, tasks and duties that do not require law enforcement presence or response will free up a significant officer time to respond to incidents that do require law enforcement.

### **88. CREATE A NEW POLICE BUDGET AUDITOR POSITION. MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENT AT THIS TIME.**

**Do Not Support:** We do not need additional overhead related to our police department — we need a transparent system of data provision from OPD. Breakdowns of costs, calls for service data with location, traffic stop data, we want it all. We spend over \$330 million per year on policing — it is reckless and irresponsible that we lack an intimate understanding of what we are doing with that money. The answer is not a new position, it is access and transparency.

**89. CAP OPD OVERTIME. AMENDED. ADDITIONAL COMMENTARY BELOW.**

**Strongly Support with Commentary:** In addition to almost 50% of Oakland's general fund, the Oakland Police Department then siphons off millions more in unauthorized overtime. Last year, OPD went \$32 million over budget, \$19 million of that in unauthorized overtime. Despite several audits and repeated demands from Oaklanders and City Council to reign in unauthorized police spending, OPD and the Schaaf Administration have refused to address the overspending. This year, the Administration's failure to regulate OPD spending forced the city to make dramatic budget cuts across the board.

**Additional Commentary:** We agree OPD should not be allowed to offset its excessive overtime from "salary savings" of vacant positions. OPD needs to include any overtime into their existing budget and not request for additional funds from the general fund from City Council to cover overtime costs.

**90. COMMIT \$8 MILLION SET-ASIDE FUNDS TO TASK FORCE RECOMMENDATIONS**

**Support.**

**91. ENGAGE COMMUNITY TO AMEND MEASURE Z**

**Support:** Measure Z includes a minimum OPD staffing requirement that needs to be removed from the rewrite. The police staffing floors and police spending provision in Measure Z are not good public policy – they are handouts to the OPOA in exchange for the small amounts of money in the measure that flow to violence prevention advocates.

**92. MANDATE THAT OPD OFFICERS POSSESS COLLEGE DEGREE/ARE OVER 25**

**Do Not Support:** This is a recommendation that does not reimagine public safety and only serves to reinforce the status quo.

**93. MANDATE A DIVERSE OPD HIRING PANEL**

**Do Not Support:** This is a recommendation that does not reimagine public safety and only serves to reinforce the status quo.

**94. MANDATE COMMUNITY RECOMMENDATION FOR OPD RECRUITS**

**Do Not Support.** This is a recommendation that does not reimagine public safety, is easy to work around, and only serves to reinforce the status quo.

**95. ESTABLISH PUBLIC WORKS STREET TEAM/CUSTODIAL STEWARDS. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Strongly Support:** We support a community ambassador model as was established by the Asian Prisoner Support Committee, who provided reentry opportunities for people leaving prison. Groups like Community Ready Corps have been engaged in community safety programs in Oakland for decades, and serve as thought leaders in the space.

As is discussed in this recommendation, the community ambassador program would include cleanup in certain neighborhoods, engagement and relationship building with all Oaklanders in those neighborhoods, connection to city and county services for those in need, de-escalation, and engagement and relationship with store owners in those neighborhoods. These ambassadors need to be provided city wages and benefits, and access to training to ensure that they are able to communicate with and provide service to all.

**96. ESTABLISH OVERARCHING BUREAU OF COMMUNITY SAFETY.  
AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Do Not Support:** We don't support this recommendation because public safety programs affiliated with the police are often reduced to little more than efforts to burnish the Police Department's reputation. Community safety programs must be independent from police departments for them to be effective.

**97. ESTABLISH A DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SAFETY**

**Strongly Support:** We support this recommendation because we need to de-center the Oakland Police Department when it comes to public safety. That will help us focus on the investments and programs that should truly combine to create a Department of Public Safety as we minimize the role of OPD.

We have great concern that this department not become a larger bureaucracy controlled by the police or encourage additional entanglement between law enforcement and other city departments. As mentioned in recommendation #36, the goal of this department should be to separate out as many functions as possible from law enforcement involvement. As such, we strongly disagree with OPD involvement in the structuring of this department or in the training of new city staff.

**98. ESTABLISH NCPD COMMUNITY SAFETY STEWARDSHIP PROGRAM.  
AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Support.**

**99. IMPLEMENT RACIAL PROFILING ORDINANCE TO DETER FALSE CALLS  
FOR SERVICE**

**Neutral With Commentary:** While we support the spirit of this recommendation, we do not support the use of hate crimes legislation to widen the net of policing and criminalization. Calls such as these can be coded by non-law enforcement departments and addressed using public media/narrative interventions.

**100. REACH ANNUAL ALIGNMENT ON NSA TASKS. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Neutral With Commentary:** The NSA must be resolved as it limits the city's ability to flexibly adjust its system of policing while under the NSA's provisions. This proposal is worrisome as it appears to add unnecessary layers of bureaucracy. What is missing in the effort to resolve the NSA is not a lack of structure, but rather any accountability within the Oakland Police Department. We also agree with the alignment of performance indicators on the Chief across the mayor, city administrator and police commission to mainstream work and encourage efficient practices.

**101. REEXAMINE ROLE OF PUBLIC SAFETY BOARDS**

**Support:** All city efforts to provide community governance over policing and matters of public safety should be reexamined as a whole, especially in light of any changes to IAD that are made as a result of the reimagination process.

**102. EXPAND COUNTY-PROVIDED MENTAL HEALTH SERVICES**

**Support.**

**103\_88. INCREASE POLICE COMMISSION STAFF. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Support:** We believe if the police commission had more staff, they would be able to do a more comprehensive job at holding OPD accountable. We do not agree that an additional budget auditor position is necessary as we have a city auditor whose office needs to be fully staffed to serve this function. Additionally, we strongly recommend an end to Mayoral appointments to the Commission. Oaklanders have said this in city council meetings, surveys and polls. The Commission should be independent from the Mayor and her office.

See #2 re: reforms

**104. IMPROVE THE POLICE COMMISSION SELECTION PANEL PROCESS**

**Do Not Support.** If we are going to improve the police commission selection process, let's start by removing the Mayor's pick and giving that pick to the People. The Police Commission can not be under the administration's influence as the administration is in control of the police department. Any changes to the police commission must shift it towards true independence.

**105. IMPOSE DISCIPLINE ON OPD MANAGERS/SUPERVISORS FOR DISCRIMINATORY POLICING**

**Support:** We support holding police accountable, but this recommendation is not what reimagining public safety is about. We cannot tinker our way to a system of policing that is effective. If we could, we would be there by now, as trillions of dollars have been spent in that direction. Our system of policing is not broken, it is working as designed.

See #2 re: reforms

**106. IMPROVE OUTCOMES IN THE NEXT OPOA MOU. AMENDED.  
ADDITIONAL COMMENTARY BELOW.**

**Support.** This should be combined with the other MOU recommendations and prioritize renegotiation of the MOU this year. The last MOU was negotiated in 2018 without community input by a lame duck council more than six months before the existing MOU expired. This cannot ever happen again – our city literally cannot afford it. Community input is needed.

**Additional Commentary:** What's more, elected officials whose job it is to serve the people should not take contributions from an entity that oppresses the people. It creates a pathway for undue influence of law enforcement on city council members.

**107. INCREASE FUNDING TO THE NEIGHBORHOOD OPPORTUNITY AND ACCOUNTABILITY BOARD (NOAB). MERGED WITH OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS. NO FURTHER COMMENT AT THIS TIME.**

**Neutral.**

**108. CREATE SCHOOL ATTENDANCE STIPEND**

**Support.**

**109. CREATE SCHOOL-SITE BASED VIOLENCE PREVENTION AND CRISIS INTERVENTION TEAMS**

**Strongly Support with Commentary:** This recommendation must be weighted with the fact that the City of Oakland and the Oakland Unified School District are two different governmental agencies with two different budgets. It rightly calls for the city to invest in our young people by investing in the school district that educates the future of our city.

**110. PROVIDE ENHANCED PUBLIC AND MENTAL HEALTH ACCESS TO UNDERSERVED COMMUNITIES. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Support.**

**111. CREATE A CIVILIAN DEPARTMENT OF CANNABIS. AMENDED. NO FURTHER COMMENTARY AT THIS TIME.**

**Support.**

**112. INVEST IN EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT OF CANNABIS INDUSTRY**

**Support.**

### **113. LOWER THE CANNABIS BUSINESS TAX**

#### **Support.**

As designed by the so-called War On Drugs, Black and Brown communities were targeted, surveilled and incarcerated for low-level drug offenses; many for marijuana. We are in a position to acknowledge and repair some of that harm through ensuring industry access to directly impacted communities. This point is highlighted in Recommendation 111:

“The City should invest as much in ensuring the sustainability of the cannabis industry for the benefit of the equity businesses as it did in enforcing the drug war. The equity businesses are benefited by the existence of a thriving ecosystem of a vibrant and diverse industry, of both equity and general businesses.”

Creating a civilian Department of Cannabis, investing in the equitable development of the cannabis industry, and lowering the cannabis business tax are concrete steps towards sustaining and growing the industry that is rooted in community involvement, not criminalization.

### **114. ESTABLISH A COMMUNITY REPARATIONS COMMISSION**

**Support with Commentary:** The City should adopt [The Black New Deal](#).

Convened by the Anti Police-Terror Project and Community Ready Corps, the Black New Deal was created by over 40 Black organizations and individuals and maps out a pathway to creating thriving Black communities.

### **YOUTH ADVISORY BOARD RECOMMENDATIONS**

We support the Youth Advisory Board and agree with their recommendations regarding alternatives to public safety and investments in programs that address the root causes of violence.

### **137. ACCOUNTABILITY #1 (QUALIFIED IMMUNITY) NEW**

**Strongly Support with Conditions:** Ending [qualified immunity](#) is one of the single most important radical “rational” reforms we can enact to interrupt state violence. Qualified immunity allows police officers to violate the civil rights of the people with absolute impunity. It makes it nearly impossible to hold law enforcement officers accountable for even the most serious and deliberate violations of our constitutional rights.

Without ending qualified immunity, short of absolute abolition, we will never end state violence.

That being said, this recommendation fails to achieve its goal – the processes recommended for dismantling qualified immunity are entirely impractical if not impossible.

### **138. ACCOUNTABILITY #2 (TRAIN OFFICERS ON MOR) NEW**

**Do Not Support:** The job of this Task Force is not to reform OPD, but to reimagine public safety, develop radical reforms and reallocate police resources to community programs.

### **139. ACCOUNTABILITY #3 (CHANGE THE BURDEN OF PROOF) NEW**

**Neutral:** It is unclear by what mechanism the author hopes that the burden of proof should be shifted – an undertaking of this magnitude requires a clear plan.

### **140. ACCOUNTABILITY #4 (REVIEW MISCONDUCT FOR LATERAL TRANSFERS) NEW**

**Support:** The public has the right to know what harms officers who are policing Oakland have committed. APTP is currently cosponsoring SB 2 (Bradford), a bill that would create a statewide accountability scheme to decertify officers who commit acts of serious misconduct. We are one of less than five states that lack such a policy.

See #2 re reforms

### **141. ACCOUNTABILITY #5 (REMOVE BIAS WHEN SUSTAINING CASES AND DETERMINING DISCIPLINARY ACTION) NEW**

**Do Not Support:** We do not support investing in additional technology to help OPD police itself. The suggestion to use AI for disciplinary consistency is reform-oriented, not re-imaginative. We support civilianizing internal affairs and making the police commission truly independent.

### **142. ACCOUNTABILITY #6 (SLAS FOR COMPLETING MISCONDUCT INVESTIGATIONS) NEW**

**Neutral:** We do not support investing in additional technology to help OPD police itself. The suggestion to use AI for disciplinary consistency is reform-oriented, not re-imaginative. Further, the timeline suggested here with consequences for not completing misconduct investigations will not address the root cause of the issue and may in fact compound it.

We support civilianizing internal affairs and making the police commission truly independent.

### **143. AMEND CITY CHARTER ON POLICE DISCIPLINE NEW**

**Support with commentary:** We believe in empowering a truly independent police commission to impose discipline on sworn officers. That said, we have concerns about providing this level of power to a mayoral-run police commission and problematic selection panel.



#### **144. INVEST IN COMMUNITY WORKERS AND VIOLENCE INTERRUPTERS**

##### **Strongly Support.**

Law enforcement does not prevent violence. Far too many incidents of so-called “crime” go unreported and thus survivors go without help. As is evidenced by OPD’s inability to stem the tide of violence in Oakland’s streets, the time is now to invest in tested programs and strategies that interrupt violence before it happens. People are much more likely to talk to the brothers or sisters on the block that they know than the police. People from communities know when something is about to go down and can communicate with trusted peacekeepers in their communities. Let’s get to the gun before the bullet is fired.

#### **145. ELIMINATE COUNTY COURT AND JAIL FEES AND PROVIDE STIPEND FOR RE-ENTRY**

##### **Strongly Support.**

Court and jail fees serve as nothing more than figurative handcuffs to people stuck in the court and jail systems. Poor people make up the majority of people arrested only to be released and then rearrested because they cannot afford to pay the outlandish fines. Our court and jail systems need to stop balancing their budgets on the backs of Black people.

#### **146. ENHANCE THE GUN BUY-BACK PROGRAM IN OAKLAND**

##### **Neutral.**

#### **147. ADDRESS FOOD INSECURITY**

##### **Strongly Support.**

If someone cannot make a living in the above ground economy, they will make a living in the underground one. Access to healthy, consistent food along with housing, clothing, education and healthcare are not only basic human rights, they are the surest way to building safe and healthy communities.

## Supplemental Reports

### REPORT 1: CALLS FOR SERVICE ANALYSIS

We greatly appreciate the time and energy Advisory Board volunteers spent analyzing calls for service data. We believe that they have come to many important conclusions about where we can cut service, and have some great insights into the many areas where we are wasting funds on OPD. That being said, with regards to their analysis of time spent, we respectfully disagree with their methodology.

APTP commissioned [AH Datalytics](#), a team of crime data analysts with extensive experience analyzing calls for service whose work was recently featured in the [New York Times](#), to analyze the calls for service data provided by OPD. They concluded that OPD's failure to properly close service calls means that there are many calls with close times that do not reflect when those calls were actually closed. This failure is clearly shown by the fact that 1.2% of all calls for service comprise 57.5% of hours spent. A specific example of this failure is a collision report for a traffic accident that, according to records, took 32 straight hours of officer time. As a result of these inconsistencies, AH Datalytics chose to analyze calls for service by percentage of calls and median call time.

The Budget and Data Advisory Board team that analyzed calls for service chose to use the time closed category, attempting to deal with the "time closed" problem by cutting off all calls at 24 hours.

While we appreciate the Budget and Data Advisory Board team's efforts and approach to dealing with such poor data, we agree with the AH Datalytics team that the time closed category should not be relied upon. Thus, we are unable to support several of the conclusions drawn by their report that rely on these data.

### REPORT 2: CITY BUDGET ANALYSIS – THREE KEY TAKEAWAYS:

1. **Cops Haven't Reduced Crime:** In the City of Oakland, data from 2007-2019 does not demonstrate a correlation between budget increases and reduced crime nor between the number of sworn officers and reduced crime. During that time, OPD's budget has increased more than 70%.
2. **Invest in the Youth:** The analysis proposes increasing youth-related services by a total of \$70.8M (78.6%) when investments in all departments are combined.

3. **Invest in Public Works:** “The Youth Advisory Board, the Alternatives Advisory Board, and the Legal and Policy Barriers Advisory Board have all recommended that the Dept. of Public Works expand parks and programming for youth, increase safety and sanitation for people living in vehicles, remediate blighted buildings, assist in cleaning trash from the **streets, and ready vacant lots for use as community gardens and other events, such as pop-ups and markets.**”

### **REPORT 3: ROLE OF LOCAL, STATE, AND FEDERAL PARTNERS – THREE KEY TAKEAWAYS:**

1. Oakland must take advantage of new and existing state and federal funding sources that require matching dollars from the City:
  - For example: “\$1 reallocated from police can result in \$2 of mental health funding for Medi-Cal recipients through the Federal Medical Assistance Percentage.”
2. Incoming Measure W Funds: Alameda County’s Measure W provides sales tax revenue to support those in the county who are unhoused. The measure could generate up to \$150 million per year, and Oakland should receive half of that revenue because half of the county’s unhoused residents live in Oakland.
3. The County Has Our Mental Health Funds: According to the Legislative Analyst’s Office, the State of California directs about 80% of total funding for public community mental health services to county behavioral health agencies.

## **COALITION ADDITIONAL RECOMMENDATION SUGGESTIONS**

**OPD Culture:** None

### **Alternatives:**

Invest in trauma responders who arrive at every violent incident and provide trauma support services for the family and community. This body should be completely separate from law enforcement agencies.

Invest in increasing accessibility for disabled persons throughout Oakland to have a seat at the table in these conversations, highlighting how state violence impacts their lives and the City must invest in programming that provides services for people with disabilities.

### **Budget & Data:**

Research the possibility of utilizing OPD’s Asset Forfeiture fund to pay for alternative programs, additional community resources, and supports as identified by these recommendations.

# DEFUND COALITION TOP RECOMMENDATIONS

## OPD ORGANIZATION AND CULTURE

- Create an Oakland Specific Crowd Control Ordinance (#1)
- Demilitarize Police Department (#43)
- Renegotiate OPOA's MOU in 2021 instead of 2024 (#44)

## BUDGET DATA & ANALYSIS

- Implementing a Second Phase of Reimagining Public Safety (#47)
- Reallocate and Reinvest Funds from the OPD Budget into Other Areas that Increase Public Safety (#50) (\*This is now called: "Make Cuts to Officer Compensation, Overtime, Number of Sworn Staff, and Sworn\_non-Sworn Staff Balance to Cut OPD Budget")
- Build on the Task Force's Guiding Principle #2 (#52)

## ALTERNATE RESPONSES PROGRAMS AND INVESTMENTS

- Immediately make long-term investment in MACRO (#57)
- Fund/create community hotlines and transfer 911 call center out of OPD. (#58)
- Move most traffic enforcement to OakDOT (#59)
- Expand existing Community Ambassador Program Frameworks. Create a civilian Community Ambassadors program to respond to nonviolent, non-mental health incidents (#60)
- Dissolve OPD Homeless Outreach Unit and reinvest in mobile street outreach. (#61)
- Reinvest Housing Authority Police budget through Participatory Budgeting. (#62)
- Repeal Laws Criminalizing Homelessness and Poverty (#64)
- Provide a public health response to addiction/substance abuse. (#65)
- Stop enforcement of laws that criminalize sex trade between consenting adults (#66)

## DEFUND COALITION TOP RECOMMENDATIONS

- Establish a Restorative Justice Web of Support (#67)
- Provide more comprehensive reentry support (#68)
- Expand restorative justice diversion for youth and young adults. Amended. Additional commentary below. (#69)
- Expand and fund existing harm reduction services (#71)
- Invest in Gender-Based Violence Prevention
- Increase funding to gender-based violence response services (#72)
- Expand flexible funding for survivors of gender-based violence (#73)
- Adequately fund gender-based violence prevention (#74)
- Revitalize commercial corridors (#78)
- Transform unused vacant lots (#79)
- Make all Oakland Community Colleges free for local residents (#81)

### LEGAL & POLICY BARRIERS

- Cap OPD overtime (#89)
- Commit \$8 million set-aside funds to Task Force recommendations (#90)
- Engage community to amend Measure Z (#91)
- Establish Public Works Street Team/Custodial Stewards (#95)
- Reimagine Community Safety Hub in Oakland under Dept of Community Safety (#s 36 and 97)
- Create school-site based violence prevention and crisis intervention teams (#109)
- Create a Civilian Dept of Cannabis, Invest in Equitable Development of the Cannabis Industry, and Lower the Cannabis Business Tax (#s 111-113)
- Accountability #1 (Qualified Immunity) (#137)
- Accountability #4 (Review misconduct for lateral transfers) (#140)
- Invest in Community Workers and Violence Interrupters (#144)
- Eliminate County Court and Jail Fees and Provide Stipend for Re-entry
- Address Food Insecurity (#147)

## **AVOID AT ALL COSTS: RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WE SHOULD AVOID**

1. Create a Law Enforcement Mutual Aid Plan for 21st Century Public Safety Operations (Amended) (#4)
2. Give Neighborhoods power to determine level of housing patrols (#63) (amended)
3. Initiate a part-time sworn officer pilot program (Amended) (#87)

## CONCLUSION

For over 400 years, America has utilized violence and intimidation to maintain power, uplift white supremacy, and maintain the status quo of an economic system rooted in race-based dominance, anti-Blackness, colonialism, and imperialism. Law enforcement agencies are the frontline soldiers that protect these systems. The average American notices not, and simply goes about their day, enjoying the “benefits” of living in what they believe to be the land of the free, home of the brave. But not all of us are free. We fear our children’s arrival to adulthood will never come in a society that locks us out of the opportunity to build a beautiful life. Our communities are occupied by an armed force, and our borders are violently policed. We are not protected. We are not served. We are hunted, we are caged, and we are blamed for our suffering. We are punished for our resistance.

We no longer have chattel slavery, we have Black and Brown bodies languishing in American prisons by the tens of thousands. We no longer have slave catchers, we have police that infest and subjugate our communities, oversee our benign daily activities, and utilize intimidation, repression and incarceration to keep us in line. We no longer have lynchings; instead they shoot us, unarmed, for the consumption of the world on social networking platforms that make algorithms out of our suffering. **We are not all free, and if some of us are not free, none of us are free.**

---

**If anywhere and anyone can reimagine public safety. If any place can model 21st century morality in how we keep ourselves safe while loving everyone in our midst. It is us.**

Still, we assert and fight for our humanity. Lovers of freedom and liberation stand on the shoulders of our ancestors knowing our righteous rage, love for our people, strategy and sacrifice will bring about our liberation. Organizers, those who put their life and limb on the line for the people, continue to work with the people, serve the people, build power, leverage that power and make qualitative changes in our lives.

Organizing is hard. Struggle is difficult. There are many disappointments. We organize despite systems, organizations and individuals who profit from our suffering and have no desire to release or share the benefits; our health and welfare bought and sold on Wall Street markets many don’t even know exist. We organize despite those who resist our simple demand to be free. Especially those who look like us. Change comes slow. **But it does come.** Wins happen. Seismic shifts in the cultural and social fabric of our society take place. We do win.

This is one of those moments. A winning moment. Now has the potential to be a seismic shift in who we are, how we behave, how our humanity shows up in the world. How we recognize and honor the humanity in us all.

Change takes courage and resistance is expected. But this is Oakland. Home of the Panthers. Sanctuary for freedom fighters. A place of endless inspiration for the creators. If anywhere and anyone can reimagine public safety. If any place can model 21st century morality in how we keep ourselves safe while loving everyone in our midst. It is us.

This is a moment of extraction. After years of organizing, there are historic wins for our people wrapped in the words of these recommendations. There lies the possibility to get to the gun before the bullet flies, to heal the generational trauma that perpetuates intercommunal violence and harm, to release our people from cages and into communities with resources to heal them, to provide pathways to educational and economic opportunities that will allow people to live with dignity, to destigmatize mental health crisis exacerbated by the tenets of white supremacy we all struggle to live under, and so much more.

This is not the cure-all. But it is a giant step in the right direction. We will stumble as we learn, and we will make mistakes, but dismantling systems of oppression as we build new liberatory models and systems gets us just that much closer to the world we dream of and fight for. A world where we all have access to the tools, resources and supports that allow us to move from surviving to thriving. **Yes. These transformative recommendations have that much power. This moment is that crucial. We must not squander it.**

---

**If locking up people kept us safe, we would be the safest country on the planet because we do that more than any other country in the world and more than several countries combined.**

---



Even if the word Defund makes you cringe. Even if you can't imagine a world where every social ill is not responded to with a badge and a gun. Even if you can't fathom violence being met with peace. Even if you are lucky enough that the brutality of state terror has never touched your life, shattered your world, or dominated your psyche. You, too, must admit that this system is not working. For any of us. We invest trillions and trillions of dollars in policing, jails and prisons, and yet so-called "crime" continues. If locking up people kept us safe, we would be the safest country on the planet because we do that more than any other country in the world and more than several countries combined.

We have a fleeting opportunity to do it differently. To do it right. To move with the knowledge and truth that hurt people hurt people and healthy people hold people.

Oaklanders have made a demand. They want healthy communities and people. They want clean streets and air. They want economic and educational opportunities. They want to be the vanguard of 21st century public safety. The city must listen. And if they don't listen, we the people must continue to organize, build, push, strategize, and unify until they have no choice but to enact the will of the people. They work for us. This is our moment. This is our time.



Photo by Brooke Anderson | @movementphotographer

**OPD's budget must be cut by 50% with those dollars redirected to neighborhoods, communities, programs and practices that are real roads to community safety.** The Task Force must remain true to the mission and mandate of its body. The polls, surveys, community meetings, and town halls make it clear that Oaklanders do not want reforms that require further resources for policing – including recommendations for reforms that would inadvertently require an increase in police funding.

The Task Force must prioritize recommendations that resource our community, not law enforcement. They must lead with humanity and healing. We will accept nothing less.

We Love you Oakland ...

---

**The Task Force must  
prioritize recommendations  
that resource our  
community, not law  
enforcement. They must  
lead with humanity and  
healing. We will accept  
nothing less.**

---

# APPENDIX



## GLOSSARY OF TERMS

**Abolition** is a political vision with the goal of eliminating imprisonment, policing, and surveillance and creating lasting alternatives to punishment and imprisonment.

**Restorative Justice** is a system of criminal justice which focuses on the rehabilitation of offenders through reconciliation with victims and the community at large.

**Transformative Justice** is a way of practicing alternative justice that acknowledges individual experiences and identities and works to actively resist the state's criminal injustice system. Transformative Justice recognizes that oppression is at the root of all forms of harm, abuse and assault. As a practice, it therefore aims to address and confront those oppressions on all levels and treats this concept as an integral part to accountability and healing.

**State Terror** For Black and Brown communities within the United States of America, the use of force and violence is seldom, if ever, deemed "unlawful," as attested to by the lack of accountability and punishment for police officers when they kill. This use of force and violence, which is in furtherance of the political and social objective of containment of Black and Brown peoples, is in actuality, state-sanctioned violence (government): violence that is on behalf of, serves the interest of, and/or is conducted by the state.

**Police Violence** While no universal definition of terrorism exists, the Federal Bureau of Investigation defines terrorism as the unlawful use of force and violence against persons or property to intimidate or coerce a government, the civilian population, or any segment thereof, in furtherance of political or social objectives. Police terrorism is not only the actual acts of killing by police but also the fear and anxiety it causes amongst our community.

**Defund OPD** is a grassroots campaign committed to reducing the Oakland Police Budget by 50% and reinvesting that money into alternative non-police programs that can better protect and strengthen our communities. We believe defunding the police is the first step towards abolition.

**Refund** in this context is used to explain the reinvestment of resources into communities that have been actively divested from and overly policed.

**Self Determination** is the process by which a people, specifically those who have been actively oppressed, are able to exert their free choice without external compulsion.

## **GLOSSARY OF TERMS**

**The Black New Deal** is an overarching platform, created by a coalition of Black-led organizations in Oakland, CA, led by The Anti Police-Terror Project and Community Ready Corps, that includes policy solutions across the broader arenas that determine Black people's lives: investment, housing, education, healthcare, jobs and criminal justice.

## **SURVEYS OF SUPPORT**

### **Multiple Agencies and Organizations Engaged Oaklanders About Defund/Refund: Oaklanders Support**

**RAHEEM Survey** - Raheem is an independent service for reporting police conduct in the United States.

**Chamber of Commerce Survey** - The mission of the Chamber is to secure the economic future of our community, and to enhance the quality of life in the city of Oakland.

**Urban Peace Movement Survey** - Urban Peace Movement (UPM) builds youth leadership in Oakland to transform the culture and social conditions that lead to community violence & mass incarceration in communities of color.

**APT Survey** - The Anti Police-Terror Project is a Black-led, multi-racial, intergenerational coalition that seeks to build a replicable and sustainable model to eradicate police terror in communities of color.

## REPORTS/RESOURCES

**The Black New Deal** - Black Oakland Demands in Light of COVID-19 and Rates of Black Death, Anti Police-Terror Project (AFTP)

**The Black New Deal** - The California Black New Deal Platform, The Alliance of Californians for Community Empowerment (ACCE)

**MH First Oakland** - MH First Oakland, a project of Anti Police-Terror Project, is a cutting-edge new model for non-police response to mental health crisis.

**City of Phoenix Police Open Data Project** - The city of Phoenix Open Data portal provides access to the city's [Mapping Portal](#) and tabular data in one convenient digital location.

**Oakland Negotiated Settlement Agreement** - The City of Oakland's Negotiated Settlement Agreement (NSA) dates from January 22, 2003, when the City of Oakland and the Oakland Police Department entered into an agreement resolving allegations of police misconduct raised by private plaintiffs in the civil lawsuit, Delphine Allen, et al., v. City of Oakland, et al.

**MACRO Feasibility Report** - Report on feasibility and implementation of a pilot of Mobile Assistance Community Responders of Oakland (MACRO)

## ARTICLES

[Police Attacks on Protesters with “less than lethal” weapons result in life threatening injuries](#)

–Jordan Smith, *The Intercept*

[Ending The War On Drugs: By the Numbers](#)

–Betsy Pearl, *Center On American Progress*

[Poisoning Our Police: How the Militarization Mindset Threatens Constitutional Rights and Public Safety](#)

–Wayne McEarlwrath & Sarah Tuberville, *POGO*

[Erik Salgado and Brianna Colombo were apparently unarmed when CHP officers shot them in East Oakland on Saturday](#)

–Darwin Bond Graham, *Berkeleyside*

[Solano Deputies, Vacaville Councilmember Promote Anti-Government Militia](#)

–Scott Morris, *Open Vallejo*

[Curated Collection of Links on Policing and Mental Health Crisis](#)

–The Marshall Project

[Oakland Police Failed to Adequately Probe Fatal Shooting of Homeless Man, Court Monitor Says](#)

–Megan Cassidy, *San Francisco Chronicle*

[Black People Don't Call 9-1-1](#)

–Ida Harris, *Essence*

[Qualified Immunity: Explained](#)

–Amir H. Ali & Emily Clark, *The Appeal*

[Journalists Fight Foot-Dragging by Oakland Police on Records Request](#)

–Maria Dinzeo, *Courthouse News Service*

[Mental Health and Racial Justice: Why Advocates Want to Get the Police Out of Crisis Responses](#)

–Alice Woelfle, *KQED*



## The Defund Police Coalition



