Innovations in Brazil’s Private Sector

HSR Conference, Liverpool, England

Maureen Lewis PhD, CEO
October 11, 2018
Brazil’s private sector is large and innovating – public sector, not so much

This presentation covers:

• Challenges of SUS - public sector system
• Overview of the private sector
• Data on the size, coverage of the insurance sector
• Selected data on private providers
• Major innovators in the private sector
Challenges in both public and private healthcare

• The two are linked but largely function separately
• The public sector serves low income households, as does the public sector, reflecting constraints in public healthcare
• Innovation in public healthcare limited and changes few since the launch of SUS in 1988
• Private healthcare has faced a sharp cost spiral, a recession and a retrenchment of enrollees – the response includes both stasis but also innovation to broaden the market, raise efficiency and control costs
Organization of SUS Today

without networks, coordination of care or accepted standards of quality
SUS – Public Sector Weaknesses

- Federal, state and municipal responsibilities fragmented
- Lack of autonomy at the local level
- Rigidity in rules
- Quality culture and quality priority missing
- Low productivity
- No oversight of performance
- Data systems separate by function
- Lack of patient focus in service delivery

Drives Private Spending and Private Insurance

Source: Consocial 2017; Personal interviews 2018
Overview of Private Sector

- 56.6% of health care spending is private
- 26% of the population has private health insurance
- Only 12 health insurers with over 100,000 enrollees
- Providers run the gamut from basic and informal to high quality quaternary care
- Both for-profit and non-profit
- Providers unregulated
- Fewer than 8% of providers accredited by national or global accreditation bodies
- Insurance and providers target all income segments with different products for different income groups

Source: ANS
Brazil’s private health insurance market is one of the largest globally

- Almost 50 million people covered by private health insurance – 26% of the population
- Over 23 million people have dental insurance
- US$110 billion market
- Over 54,000 insurance suppliers
- 757 managed care organizations
- Insurers regulated by ANS (Agência Nacional de Saúde Suplementar)

Number of Health and Dental Insurance Enrollees per year

Source: ANS 2018
Extent of Health Insurance Coverage by State, 2018

Source: ANS 2018, IBGE 2018
Characteristics of Private Health Insurers

- **Type of Health Insurance**
  - Corporate In-house Services
  - Physician Cooperative
  - Philanthropic Providers
  - HMO
  - Contract-out Services

- **Growth in Annual Premiums for Private Health Insurance (in 2017 US$)**

Source: ANS 2018

Exchange Rate: US$ 1 = BR 3.198; Source: ANS 2018
Private Health Insurance Service Coverage and Cost Distribution

Private Health Insurance by Type of Service Coverage, Dec 2017

- Ambulatory and Hospital: Corporate health plan - 572, Association health plan - 510, Individual or family health plan - 473
- Hospital Only: Corporate health plan - 66, Association health plan - 38, Individual or family health plan - 65
- Ambulatory Only: Corporate health plan - 95, Association health plan - 170, Individual or family health plan - 157

Distribution of Medical Care Spending by Private Health Insurers, Dec 2017

- Outpatient Visits: 18.5%
- Diagnostic Tests: 25.5%
- Therapies: 5.7%
- Inpatient: 39.8%
- Other: 5.4%

Sources: ANS 2018
Total Revenues of Private Health Insurers by Year, 2001-2017 (2017 US$)

Exchange Rate: US$ 1 = BR 3.198; Source: ANS 2018
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Health insurer</th>
<th>Type of org.</th>
<th>% total market share 6/2018</th>
<th># of beneficiaries 6/2018</th>
<th>% change in beneficiaries, 2014 to 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AMIL Health Insurance International</td>
<td>HMO</td>
<td>7.5%</td>
<td>3,537,284</td>
<td>-2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bradesco Health</td>
<td>Indemnity Insurance</td>
<td>7.1%</td>
<td>3,349,249</td>
<td>-13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hapvida Health Insurance</td>
<td>HMO</td>
<td>4.8%</td>
<td>2,274,990</td>
<td>+32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notre Dame Intermédica Health Insurance</td>
<td>HMO</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
<td>2,034,151</td>
<td>+50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sul America Health Insurance</td>
<td>Indemnity Insurance</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
<td>1,773,914</td>
<td>+5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National UNIMED Center</td>
<td>Physician Cooperative</td>
<td>3.1%</td>
<td>1,449,608</td>
<td>-7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIMED - Belo Horizonte Cooperative</td>
<td>Physician Cooperative</td>
<td>2.6%</td>
<td>1,237,972</td>
<td>-2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ANS 2018
# Summary of Innovative Practices of Private Providers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Provider</th>
<th>Target low-income pop.</th>
<th>Integrated care model</th>
<th>Quality measurement</th>
<th>IT for management</th>
<th>IT performance monitoring</th>
<th>Efficient for patients</th>
<th>Insurance Payment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Amil/UHG</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>HMO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bradesco Health</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>FFS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sul America</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>FFS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIMED Minas Gerais/ NE</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>HMO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HAPVIDA</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>HMO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevent Senior</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>HMO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N. D. Intermédica</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>HMO/PPO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Consulta</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>Provider - FFS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANAPHE Hospitals</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>Provider - Insurance/FFS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© Aceso Global. All rights reserved.
Prevent Senior – Greater São Paulo

- Patient centered organization with defined objectives, processes and support to physicians
- Risk stratification of patients and designated care givers
- Integrated, comprehensive IT and data system encompassing EHRs, and hospitals, clinic and physician performance
- Strong management across the system
- Services based on team structure and coordinated patient care
- Protocols and continuous education for physicians
- Just-in-time clinical back up to reduce wait times for patients

Value of Prevent Senior:
Model of care emphasizing integrated care and prevention, clear incentives and strong management based on data analytics

Sources: Fagundes Parrillo 2018; HBS 2016
UNIMED – Belo Horizonte

• Physician-run cooperative and insurance company with >1.2 million beneficiaries and network of 350 providers
• Pioneered pay-for-performance (P4P) programs in their network in 2005
• First health insurer in Brazil to apply DRGs for management in 2007
• GUIA initiative (Management and Service Delivery Indicators) has used data for management since 2015
• UNIMED Pleno, insurance product launched in 2013, links patient to PCP responsible for patient coordination and tracking

Value of UNIMED-BH: Continuous experimentation with incentives to improve quality and efficiency across levels of care

Sources: Borem et al. 2010; Morato de Castilho 2016
Hapvida – Northeast, Amazonas, Pára

• Managed care chain targeting (lower) middle class in the poorest states in the NE, Amazonas and Pará, offering medical and dental plans
• Exclusive network of hospitals, clinics, and emergency
• Fully EHRs – and electronically obtained from external network providers
• Patients can schedule follow-up appointments online
• Focus on quality - dedicated team to review surgical standards using electronic analytics platform

Value of Hapvida: Rapidly growing HMO in poorer states with EHR/IT and data driven management
Dr. Consulta – São Paulo, Rio de Janeiro, Belo Horizonte

• Chain of “one-stop shop” outpatient clinics with on-site lab, diagnostics, and specialty care
• Target low-income earners
• Located in poor neighborhoods and high-end neighborhoods to be near employers of the poor
• Providers paid on a fee-for-service basis
• Patients pay out-of-pocket at flat-rate fees
• Digital patient records, and online patient portal app for patients for results and feedback
• Harnessing technology (e.g. cloud, AI) to manage costs and supply chain, and moving toward utilizing machine learning algorithms and predictive analytics

Value of Dr. Consulta: Fast-growing low-cost, high-volume delivery model focused on accessibility and affordability for patients
DRG Brazil

- Developed DRGs for Brazilian private sector based on US/CMS DRGs and their algorithms
- Major tool for quality assurance, management data, and only source of Brazilian data on hospital adverse events
- Implemented DRG for managed care company (UNIMED) as a tool for quality, management, data control and cost containment
- Adapters have raised performance, reduced costs and improved outcomes in service delivery
- Working with Belo Horizonte municipal Health Secretary on adapting to public hospitals

Value of DRG Brazil:
Only reliable national source of data on performance, costs and adverse events; highly effective management tool

Source: Grilli 2018
Analysis of 2017 DRG data reveals opportunities for substantive efficiency gains in private health care

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reduce Length of Stay</th>
<th>Reduce Avoidable Admissions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Private:</strong> 28% of cases above median ALOS</td>
<td><strong>In private sector, 5% of total inpatient days due to avoidable readmissions</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Public:</strong> 80% of cases above median ALOS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Increase Hospital Safety</th>
<th>Reduce Avoidable Hospitalization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Adverse events in private hospitals cost R$10.9-15.6 billion</strong></td>
<td><strong>26% of hospitalizations in private sector avoidable</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Adverse events increase patient ALOS by 6.9 days</strong></td>
<td><strong>Account for 23% of total inpatient days</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Combined, could reduce waste in health system by 42.3%

Source: Couto 2018
Conclusions

• The private sector is driving innovation in the Brazilian health sector

• Multiple models for delivery and finance that target different delivery challenges

• Payers target all income groups; plans and benefits vary

• Regulation of payers important for consumers and the industry

• Providers unregulated and not accredited --undermining quality and performance

• Data on providers scarce

• Payer regulation would benefit from restructuring to promote efficiency and quality, and reduce number of insurers

Source: ANS
Thank you.

mlewis@acesoglobal.org