Do Electrostatic Interactions with Positively Charged Active Site Groups Tighten the Transition State for Enzymatic Phosphoryl Transfer?

Ivana Nikolic-Hughes, Douglas C. Rees, and Daniel Herschlag

Abstract: The effect of electrostatic interactions on the transition-state character for enzymatic phosphoryl transfer has been a subject of much debate. In this work, we investigate the transition state for alkaline phosphatase (AP) using linear free-energy relationships (LFERs). We determined $k_{\text{ap}}/k_{\text{en}}$ for a series of aryl sulfate ester monoanions to obtain the Brønsted coefficient, $P_{\text{Br}}$, and compared the value to that obtained previously for a series of aryl phosphorothioate ester dianion substrates. Despite the difference in substrate charge, the observed Brønsted coefficients for AP-catalyzed aryl sulfate and aryl phosphorothioate hydrolysis ($-0.76 \pm 0.14$ and $-0.77 \pm 0.10$, respectively) are strikingly similar, with steric effects being responsible for the uncertainties in these values. Aryl sulfates and aryl phosphates react via similar loose transition states in solution. These observations suggest an apparent equivalency of the transition states for phosphoryl and sulfate hydrolysis reactions at the AP active site and, thus, negligible effects of active site electrostatic interactions on charge distribution in the transition state.

Introduction

Catalysis is defined as preferential stabilization of a reaction’s transition state, relative to its ground state. Thus, detailed knowledge of the transition-state character for both nonenzymatic and enzymatic reactions is essential to decipher enzymatic catalysis. The least amount of energy is required for an enzyme that stabilizes a transition state closely related to that found in solution, and many enzymatic transition states have indeed been found to be similar to their nonenzymatic counterparts.

Physical organic studies over the past several decades have characterized the nonenzymatic transition state for phosphoryl transfer from phosphate monoesters as loose, with a large amount of bond breaking to the leaving group and only a small amount of bond formation to the nucleophile, presumably resulting in a reduction of negative charge on the nonbridging oxygen atoms of the phosphoryl group, relative to the ground state (eq 1). As enzymes tend to surround the phosphoryl group with hydrogen bond donors and positively charged groups, it has been proposed numerous times that electrostatic interactions between these positive charges and the phosphoryl group would introduce an energetic incentive to increase the amount of charge on the nonbridging oxygen atoms in the transition state, thereby tightening the transition state, such that there is less bond breaking to the leaving group and more bond formation to the nucleophile (Scheme 1).

Recently, Escherichia coli alkaline phosphatase (AP) has been shown to have activity toward sulfate monoesters in addition to the cognate phosphate monoester substrates. The AP active site contains two Zn$^{2+}$ metal ions and an arginine residue that interact directly with the transition state (Scheme 2). Because

---

the phosphate monoesters are dianionic, whereas sulfate monoesters are monoanionic (eqs 1 and 2), we considered whether the overall charge difference between these substrates would result in them being “handled” differently within the highly charged AP active site (Scheme 2). Although the P=O and S=O bonds are very similar in length,7 AP catalyzes the phosphate ester reaction with a catalytic proficiency that is at least 10^10-fold greater than the catalytic proficiency for the sulfate ester reaction, corresponding to 13 kcal/mol of additional transition-state stabilization for the phosphate compared to the sulfate.5,8 Additionally, physical organic studies of nonenzymatic sulfate monoester monoanion hydrolysis suggest a transition state that is loose, akin to that for the phosphate monoester reactions (eqs 1 and 2).9,10 These and additional observations (O’Brien, P. J.; Nikolic-Hughes, I.; Herschlag, D, unpublished results) support the notion that charge is of utmost importance to AP catalysis.

Given the proposals for creation of a tighter transition state within the highly charged active site of phosphoryl transfer enzymes, including AP, and the apparent importance of electrostatics in AP catalysis, we were interested in comparing the transition states for AP-catalyzed phosphoryl and sulfuryl transfer. Three classes of models were considered and are depicted in Scheme 3. (1) The strong electrostatic interactions of the AP active site with phosphate monoester dianions result in a tighter transition state, whereas sulfate ester monoanions undergo a smaller change (if any) because their lower charge results in less intimate, more distant electrostatic interactions (Scheme 3A). (2) The lower charge density of the sulfate ester monoanions leads to an imbalance of charge, especially on the nonbridging oxygen that interacts with both active site Zn^{2+} ions. This charge imbalance creates a large driving force for increasing the charge on this nonbridging oxygen atom in the sulfate ester transition state, whereas the corresponding nonbridging oxygen of the phosphate ester transition state is more highly charged so that there is less of a driving force from interaction with the two Zn^{2+} ions for a charge increase on this atom. (Scheme 3B depicts an increase in charge for the sulfuryl transfer transition state for all of the nonbridging oxygen atoms relative to the unperturbed transition state (Scheme 3A,C); an increase in charge in the sulfuryl transfer reaction would most simply be accompanied by increasing the bond order to the incoming and outgoing groups, as is also depicted in Scheme 3B.) (3) Bonding in both the phosphoryl and sulfuryl transfer transition states is unchanged relative to solution because the “force” exerted by the active site is insufficient to substantially reorganize the covalent and partially covalent bonds in the transition state (Scheme 3C).

Additionally, there is literature precedent to suggest that if the active site environment indeed affected the transition-state nature, the response of the phosphate ester would be different from that of the sulfate ester. The effect of dimethyl sulfoxide (DMSO) addition on nonenzymatic rate constants has been found to be drastically different for a phosphate ester compared to a sulfate ester (10^6 vs 50-fold rate enhancement in 95% DMSO, respectively).11 This solvent effect presumably arises from a loss of stabilizing ground-state electrostatic interactions between substrate and water when the transition state is reached, as charge is dispersed in the transition state.11c Therefore, removing electrostatic interactions (via DMSO addition) is energetically more unfavorable for phosphate than for sulfate.


Scheme 1. Observed and Hypothetical Transition States for Phosphoryl Transfer

![Scheme 1](image)

Scheme 2. AP Active Site with a Bound Transition-State Model

![Scheme 2](image)
This suggests that loss of electrostatic interactions with positively charged active site groups in the transition state would be more unfavorable for phosphate than sulfate, and thus a greater force to optimize those interactions, if indeed such a force existed, would be exerted upon a phosphate, as described in model 1 (Scheme 3A).

Results and Discussion

To determine the effect of electrostatic interactions in the highly charged active site of AP (Scheme 3 and Introduction) we compared linear free-energy relationships (LFERs) for phosphoryl and sulfuryl transfer in solution and in the AP active site. A series of aryl leaving groups was used to determine the LFER coefficient $\beta_{lg}$, which represents the dependence of the logarithm of the reaction rate constant on the leaving group $pK_a$. Phosphorothioates were used in the comparison because the AP-catalyzed hydrolysis of aryl phosphates is limited by binding rather than the chemical step,\(^{12}\) whereas thio-substitution renders the chemical step rate-limiting.\(^{13,14}\)

Figure 1 shows a comparison of the leaving group dependence for the aryl sulfate and aryl phosphorothioate nonenzymatic hydrolysis, from literature data and aryl sulfate data obtained in this work (Table 1).\(^{10,13}\) These correlations give the same slope, within error, for aryl sulfates and aryl phosphorothioates, with $\beta_{lg}$ values of $-1.2$. The results are consistent with the previous conclusions that these reactions proceed through similar, loose transition states in aqueous solution.\(^{9}\)

We next determined a Brønsted correlation for AP-catalyzed hydrolysis of aryl sulfates, using a broader series of synthesized aryl sulfate esters, and compared this LFER to that previously

---

Figure 1. Leaving group dependence for nonenzymatic hydrolysis of aryl sulfates (■) and aryl phosphorothioates (○). In the current work, aryl sulfate esters were synthesized as described previously, and their reactions (■) were conducted at 90 °C, as described in the Methods section. Aryl sulfate hydrolysis data by Fendler and Fendler (●) were obtained at 100 °C, and aryl phosphorothioate data by Holfelder and Herschlag (○) were obtained at 37 °C. The phenol leaving groups and their pKa values for the ■ series are: 3,4-dinitro (5.42), 4-nitro (7.14), 4-chloro, 3-nitro (7.78), and 4-cyano (7.95); for the ● series: 2,5-dinitro (5.22), 4-nitro (7.14), and 3-nitro (8.35); for the ○ series: 3,4-dinitro (5.42), 4-nitro (7.14), and 3-nitro (8.35). The solid lines represent the least-squares fit to the individual data series with slopes (βlg) of −1.23 ± 0.04 (■), −1.15 ± 0.01 (●), and −1.15 ± 0.07 (○). All fits gave R² > 0.99.

Table 1. Rate Constants for Nonenzymatic Aryl Sulfate Hydrolysis at 90 °C, pH 10 (see Methods section)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>aryl substituent</th>
<th>phenol pKa</th>
<th>[substrate] (mM)</th>
<th>kcat/KM (M⁻¹ s⁻¹)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3,4-dinitro</td>
<td>5.42</td>
<td>5–50</td>
<td>1.4 × 10⁻⁴</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-nitro</td>
<td>7.14</td>
<td>1–10</td>
<td>1.0 × 10⁻⁶</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-chloro, 3-nitro</td>
<td>7.78</td>
<td>12.5–100</td>
<td>1.9 × 10⁻⁷</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-cyano</td>
<td>7.95</td>
<td>2.5–25</td>
<td>1.0 × 10⁻⁷</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Rate Constants for AP-Catalyzed Aryl Sulfate Hydrolysis at 60 °C, pH 10 (see Methods section)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>aryl substituent</th>
<th>phenol pKa</th>
<th>[substrate] (mM)</th>
<th>kcat/KM (M⁻¹ s⁻¹)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4-nitro</td>
<td>7.14</td>
<td>0.5–40</td>
<td>1.4 × 10⁻⁴</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-chloro, 3-nitro</td>
<td>7.78</td>
<td>2.5–20</td>
<td>6.3 × 10⁻⁵</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-cyano</td>
<td>7.95</td>
<td>5–40</td>
<td>7.6 × 10⁻⁵</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-nitro</td>
<td>8.35</td>
<td>10–55</td>
<td>2.4 × 10⁻⁵</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3,4-dichloro</td>
<td>8.55</td>
<td>10–110</td>
<td>5.4 × 10⁻⁵</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-chloro</td>
<td>9.02</td>
<td>8–90</td>
<td>1.1 × 10⁻²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-bromo</td>
<td>9.11</td>
<td>8–45</td>
<td>3.2 × 10⁻²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-fluoro</td>
<td>9.29</td>
<td>10–110</td>
<td>4.1 × 10⁻³</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-bromo</td>
<td>9.37</td>
<td>10–110</td>
<td>4.9 × 10⁻³</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-chloro</td>
<td>9.38</td>
<td>8–90</td>
<td>3.8 × 10⁻³</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-fluoro</td>
<td>9.95</td>
<td>10–110</td>
<td>1.1 × 10⁻³</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>parent</td>
<td>9.95</td>
<td>12.5–90</td>
<td>2.0 × 10⁻³</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-methoxy</td>
<td>10.21</td>
<td>10–110</td>
<td>4.9 × 10⁻⁴</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

obtained for aryl phosphorothioates (Table 2 and Figure 2). As noted in the Introduction, AP is much more efficient at catalyzing the cognate phosphoryl transfer reaction. Nevertheless, similar values of βlg of −0.76 ± 0.14 and −0.77 ± 0.10 were obtained for the sulfate and phosphorothioate esters, respectively (Figure 2). Much of the scatter present in the individual LFERs in Figure 2 is eliminated by plotting the logarithm of the rate constant for each aryl sulfate as a function of the logarithm of the rate constant for the aryl phosphorothioate with the same leaving group (Figure 3). A single line with a slope of 1.00 ± 0.08 gives a good fit to the data, suggesting that idiosyncratic binding effects from the aryl substituents are the main source of scatter and deviations in the enzymatic LFER plots of Figure 2, as was previously proposed. This strong correlation indicates that the βlg values for AP-catalyzed phosphate and sulfate hydrolysis are virtually identical and thus suggests that the transition states for these enzymatic reactions are similar.

The apparent likeness of the transition states for phosphate and sulfate AP-catalyzed hydrolysis is most simply accounted for by model 3 above (Scheme 3C), according to which the electrostatic interactions in the AP active site have a negligible effect on charge distribution of the axial bonds in the transition state for AP-catalyzed reactions. Furthermore, our data cannot be accounted for by either model 1 or model 2 (Scheme 3A,B). However, we cannot rule out a coincidental scenario in which models 1 and 2 hold simultaneously, with forces exerted on both phosphate and sulfate esters to tighten their transition states to precisely the same extent. The observed values of βlg are consistent with those expected based on the solution hydrolysis values of −1.2 after correction for the stronger nucleophile

present and binding interactions of both bridging and nonbridging oxygens with the active site \( Zn^{2+} \) ions, as described previously. On the basis of the above observations and considerations, we conclude that model 3 is most likely.

There are several possible explanations for the absence of an effect of electrostatic interactions on transition-state nature. These are described below.

The classical view of reactions proceeding via loose, metaphosphate-like transition states is that charge donation from the nonbridging oxygen atoms helps expel the leaving group (Scheme 4A). From this standpoint, electrostatic interactions with the nonbridging oxygen atoms would inhibit this charge donation. However, the charge distribution is not known, and computational work has suggested that metaphosphate may be better described by a resonance form with one or two positive charges on the phosphorus atom so that charge donation from the nonbridging phosphoryl oxygen atoms may not occur in the transition state (Scheme 4B,C). It is also possible that the negative charge is not evenly distributed among the nonbridging phosphoryl oxygen atoms, but rather rearranges to accommodate differential positive potentials within active sites.

Although addition of covalent bonds to the phosphoryl oxygen atoms to give phosphate di- and triesters tightens the transition state, ionic interactions with metal ions or side chains are expected to be weaker and give less of a perturbation to the covalent electronic structure of the transition state. This viewpoint is supported by previous observations in model systems. \( Mg^{2+} \) or \( Ca^{2+} \) bound to phosphoanhydrides such as ATP, phosphate monoesters, or phosphorylated pyridines in aqueous reactions does not tighten the transition state. Similarly, the transition states for hydrolysis of phosphates by \( E. coli \) alkaline phosphatase (AP) and \( Yersinia \) protein tyrosine phosphatase are unchanged upon removal of positively charged active site arginine residues, as judged by LFERs and isotope effects, respectively. These observations suggest that electrostatic interactions with positively charged groups do not have large effects on the nature of transition state for phosphoryl transfer, consistent with model 3 and the results herein (Scheme 3C). This conclusion is also consistent with previous substituent effect studies in model systems that implied that the transition state is rather difficult to change because the energy surface near the transition state is steep.

It is also possible that other electrostatic interactions limit charge flow to the nonbridging oxygen atoms (Scheme 5; dots depict the strength of electrotatic interactions). As noted above, the interaction of the nonbridging oxygen atoms with the \( Zn^{2+} \) ions and positively charged Arg side chain (Scheme 2) presumably provides a driving force for accumulation of additional charge on these oxygen atoms. However, as the incoming and outgoing oxygen atoms also interact with the active site \( Zn^{2+} \) ions (Scheme 2), loss of charge on these atoms would weaken their electrostatic interactions. Thus, a balance of interactions, along with any barrier for electron rearrangement from the otherwise most stable transition state (see Introduction), may render formation of the unperturbed transition state most

---

**References**

favorable in the AP active site. Also, the absence of a change
in transition-state structure upon removal of the active site Arg
residue, as determined by $\beta_{\text{lg}}$, provides no indication of an
electronic rearrangement of the transition state induced by
Arg;14,15a as Arg only interacts with the nonbridging oxygen
atoms, its effect would not be subject to the balance of
interactions.

In conclusion, it appears that the interactions in the AP active
site stabilize the transition state found in the solution reaction,
so that AP uses the minimal amount of energy to achieve
considerable rate enhancements.$^{5,8,15b}$ The challenge we now
face is to understand how these active site interactions cause
the observed stabilization of more than 25 kcal/mol for the
phosphoryl transfer reaction, and what active site features are
responsible for the enormous discrimination exhibited against
the sulfate ester transition state.$^{5,8,15b}$

Methods

Nonenzymatic Sulfate Ester Hydrolysis Reactions. Standard
reaction conditions were 0.1 M NaCHES, pH 10.0, 0.5 M NaCl,
90 °C. The reaction was followed in the pH-independent region, to
ensure that $S=O$ bond cleavage was monitored (see ref 9c). The
appearance of the phenolate product was monitored noncontinuously
using a Uvikon XL spectrophotometer at the following wavelengths:
4-nitro (410 nm), 4-chloro, 3-nitro (403 nm), 4-cyano (300 nm), 3-nitro (400 nm), 3,4-dichloro (314 nm), 3-chloro (292 nm), 3-bromo (293 nm),
3-fluoro (283 nm), 4-bromo (292 nm), 4-chloro (298 nm), 4-fluoro (293 nm),
4-nitro (400 nm), and 4-methoxy (300 nm). For hydrolysis of 3,4-dichloro-, 3-chloro-, 3-fluoro-, 4-bromo-, and 4-chloro-phenyl sulfate, aliquots
were taken from reactions and diluted 10-fold for absorbance readings,
whereas for all the other reactions absorbance measurements were
obtained without dilution. Rate constants were obtained from initial
rates ($\pm 5\%$ reaction). Product formation was linear in all cases, and
AP was shown to retain $>80\%$ of the activity during the course of the
slowest reactions (1 week). Reactions were shown to be first-order
in substrate and enzyme by varying substrate concentration over a range
of 6–80-fold (Table 2) and enzyme concentration from 1 to 5
$\mu$M. The apparent second-order rate constants, $k_{cat}/K_M$, obtained are reported
per active site in Table 2.

Enzymatic Sulfate Ester Hydrolysis Reactions. Standard re-
aaction conditions were 0.1 M NaCHES, pH 10.0, 0.5 M NaCl, 10 mM
MgCl$_2$, and 1 mM ZnSO$_4$ at 60 °C. The appearance of the phenolate
product was monitored noncontinuously using a Uvikon XL spectrophotometer at the following wavelengths: 4-nitro (410 nm), 4-chloro,
3-nitro (403 nm), 4-cyano (300 nm), 3-nitro (400 nm), 3,4-dichloro (314 nm), 3-chloro (292 nm), 3-bromo (293 nm), 3-fluoro (283 nm),
4-bromo (292 nm), 4-chloro (298 nm), 4-fluoro (293 nm), parent (292
nm), and 4-methoxy (300 nm). For hydrolysis of 3,4-dichloro-, 3-chloro-, 3-fluoro-, 4-bromo-, and 4-chloro-phenyl sulfate, aliquots
were taken from reactions and diluted 10-fold for absorbance readings,
whereas for all the other reactions absorbance measurements were
obtained without dilution. Rate constants were obtained from initial
rates ($\pm 5\%$ reaction). Product formation was linear in all cases, and
AP was shown to retain $>80\%$ of the activity during the course of the
slowest reactions (1 week). Reactions were shown to be first-order
in substrate and enzyme by varying substrate concentration over a range
of 6–80-fold (Table 2) and enzyme concentration from 1 to 5
$\mu$M. The apparent second-order rate constants, $k_{cat}/K_M$, obtained are reported
per active site in Table 2.

Acknowledgment. We are grateful to P. Dervan for generous
ly sharing laboratory space and equipment for the aryl sulfate
syntheses, A. Heckel and P. Arora for synthetic advice, J.
Zalatan for helpful discussions, P. O’Brien and members of the
Herschlag and Rees labs for comments on the manuscript. This
work was funded by grants from the NIH to D.H. (GM64798)
JA0480421