ECLC
Early Childhood Leadership Commission

August 27, 2020
9:30am - 12:00pm
Webinar Only
https://attendee.gotowebinar.com/register/3807444249121509392
Old Business
Business Meeting

• Welcome New Members: Adeeb Khan, Happy Haynes & Rebecca Kantor

• Review Meeting Objectives:
  o Approve Meeting Minutes from June 25, 2020 Meetings
  o Hear updates from State Agencies
  o Discuss COVID-19 Research + Opportunities to Share the Information
  o Learn about Implementation Planning for the Future of Preschool
  o Consider Endorsement of Ballot Measure
  o Approve Subcommittee Co-chairs
  o Hear from the Early Childhood Community during Public Comment

• Approval of June 25, 2020 Meeting Minutes
Follow Up from Previous ECLC Meeting Action Items
Kristina Heyl
Equity, Diversity and Inclusion - Next Steps

• Discussion Questions for Subcommittees:
  • Who is missing from the table? Are there communities that we should be reaching out to be part of our Subcommittees?
  • What are the Subcommittees doing to ensure equitable outcomes for all Colorado children and families?
  • What are some actionable steps for the Subcommittees to increase our focus on equity, diversity and inclusion?
Family and Parent Engagement Plan

• Stipends for Parent Representatives

• Connect to Other Parent and Family Engagement Groups
  • Family Voice Council

• Thoughtful and Intentional Coordination on ECLC Efforts
COVID-19 Early Childhood Sector Research
Meg Franko & Suzanne Delap, Early Milestones
Colorado
COVID-19 EC RESEARCH PARTNERSHIP EMERGING FINDINGS

Note: all data is preliminary and subject to adjustments as analyses continue

AUGUST 26, 2020
SURVEY RESPONSES (as of 8-16-20; 9:00am)

Closed

Open through August

Closed

Providers: 1,225

Families: 8,000+

Workforce: ≈6,000
PROGRAM SUPPLY/CAPACITY
KEY SUPPLY/CAPACITY HIGHLIGHTS

- 10% of providers have closed
  - Some are reopening, but many are not or are not yet certain

- Enrollment has dropped by:
  - 39% for children under 5
  - 30% for school-age children

- Some regions of the state have been hit harder than others

- Public funding helped programs sustain unexpected downturns

- Programs need grants or forgivable loans to re-open or stay open

- Operational changes are having negative impact on business viability
WHO CURRENTLY IS OPEN/CLOSED?

**OPEN/CLOSED STATUS – BIRTH-12 YEARS**

- **OPEN**: 41%
- **OPEN WITH REDUCED ENROLLMENT**: 33%
- **CLOSED BECAUSE OF PANDEMIC**: 10%
- **CLOSED FOR SUMMER**: 17%

**RE-OPENING PLANS (AMONG THOSE CLOSED BECAUSE OF THE PANDEMIC n=93)**

- Re-opening with restrictions: 19%
- Re-opening within 3 months: 20%
- May not re-open: 6%
- Closed permanently: 55%

WHO IS MORE LIKELY TO BE CLOSED?

Those who do NOT participate in federal, state, or local early childhood funding programs*

*Child Care Assistance Program, Colorado Preschool Program, Denver Preschool Program, Head Start/Early Head Start, Summit Preschool Program*
% Closed by Region

Northwest (n=88) 13%
Metro (n=618) 11%
Southwest (n<41) 10%
Southeast (n<20) 10%
Pikes Peak (n=142) 8%
West Central (n<58) 7%
Northeast (n<33) 7%
North Central (n=166) 6%

% Closed by Program Type

Center (n=530) 11%
Family ChildCare Home (n=357) 10%
District-operated Preschool (n=82) 7%
HOW HAS ENROLLMENT CHANGED SINCE THE START OF THE PANDEMIC?

**BIRTH-AGE 4**

39%

**SCHOOL AGE**

30%

Reduction by Age and Region

- Metro: Birth-4 -36%, School Age -33%
- Pikes Peak: Birth-4 -33%, School Age -21%
- North Central: Birth-4 -14%, School Age -14%
- Northeast: Birth-4 -22%, School Age -22%
- Southeast: Birth-4 -46%, School Age -44%
- Northwest: Birth-4 -30%, School Age -30%
- West Central: Birth-4 -30%, School Age -22%
- Southwest: Birth-4 -16%, School Age -16%
FUNDING SOURCES APPLIED FOR/RECEIVED

- Applied
- Received

QUOTES

- “Not mixing groups will continue to make viability difficult.”
- “[We] need more CCCAP absences paid during this time – counties are going back to previous limits.”
Most Common Changes

- Increased cleaning of toys
- Increased cleaning of space
- Increased hand washing
- Health screenings at check-in
- Staff use of masks, gloves, other PPE
- Limitation of family access to classrooms
- Limitation of group sizes to 10 or fewer
- Six-foot distancing between adults
- Curb-side drop-off and/or pick-up
- Limitation/elimination of mixed group activities
- Limitation of each staff person to one group of children

Perceived Negative Impacts of Operational Changes On...

- Cost of care/business viability: 74%
- Child attendance: 69%
- Enrollment: 68%
- Staff morale: 52%
- Peer-to-peer interactions: 44%
- Child social-emotional well-being: 44%
- Teacher-child interactions: 38%
- Staff retention: 37%
- Quality of care/instruction: 30%
Note: All workforce data is PRELIMINARY
KEY WORKFORCE HIGHLIGHTS

• Nearly 25% of the workforce was furloughed or laid off
  • Furloughs/lay-offs varied by region and credential level

• 10% of out-of-work workforce doesn’t plan to go back

• 50% of the workforce saw their hours decrease and 46% saw their household income decline

• 16% are having difficulty paying bills
  • Rates are much higher depending on race/ethnicity

• Early educators need significantly more technology and instructional support
HOW HAS THE PANDEMIC IMPACTED TEACHER EMPLOYMENT?

FURLOUGHED OR LAID OFF
(Reported by Workforce)

23%

% Furloughed or Laid Off by Region

Southeast: 29%
Northwest: 27%
North Central: 27%
Metro: 23%
Pikes Peak: 22%
Southwest: 21%
West Central: 20%
Northeast: 5%
DID EARLY CHILDHOOD TEACHER CREDENTIALS PROTECT AGAINST FURLOUGHS AND LAYOFFS?

**Percent Furloughed/Laid Off With and Without Credentials**

- Colorado Early Childhood Professional Credential:
  - With: 22%
  - Without: 25%

- Elementary Teaching License:
  - With: 16%
  - Without: 24%

**Percent Furloughed/Laid Off by Credential Level**

- Credential Level 1: 29%
- Credential Level 2: 23%
- Credential Level 3: 20%
- Credential Level 4: 19%
- Credential Level 5: 14%
- Credential Level 6: 20%
**WHY ARE SOME WORKFORCE NOT RETURNING?**

Not currently working or planning to return to work in next 3 months

*(n=249)*

10%

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason(s) for not returning to work</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Health and safety concerns</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taken another job outside EC sector</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program is still closed</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No childcare for own children</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retiring</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
WORKFORCE FINANCIAL WELL-BEING

Status of Financial Factors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Decreased</th>
<th>Stayed the same</th>
<th>Increased</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hours</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wage</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household income</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefits</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10% Receiving grocery assistance

5% Receiving rent or mortgage relief
### WORKFORCE FINANCIAL WELL-BEING

#### DIFFICULTY PAYING BILLS BY RACE/ETHNICITY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race/Ethnicity</th>
<th>Not difficult</th>
<th>Somewhat difficult</th>
<th>Difficult/Very Difficult</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous, Native American</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black, African, African-American</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic, any race</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle eastern, arabic</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unspecified/prefer not to answer</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian, Pacific Islander,Asian-American</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White, non-Hispanic</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Finding it “difficult” or “very” difficult to pay bills: **16%**
WHAT TECHNOLOGY AND INSTRUCTIONAL SUPPORTS DO TEACHERS/CAREGIVERS NEED FOR REMOTE LEARNING?

- Remote learning equipment: Teachers 35%, Families 42%
- Access to online learning and how to use it: Teachers 51%, Families 50%
- Access to internet service: Teachers 45%, Families 39%
- Other: Teachers 16%, Families 3%

% REQUESTING SUPPORT
- Support keeping families engaged and communicating: 63%
- Learning materials that can be delivered to families: 60%
- Curricula or lesson plans for online and at-home early education: 54%
- Guidance for how to conduct online instruction for young children: 51%
- Guidance for supporting children with special learning, language, or...: 44%
- Other: 3%
WHAT INSTRUCTIONAL SUPPORTS DO TEACHERS/CAREGIVERS NEED FOR **SOCIALLY-DISTANCED LEARNING**?

**% REQUESTING SUPPORT**

- Additional learning materials to support individualized or small groups: 59%
- Training in use of instructional strategies that promote social distancing: 51%
- Curricula that promote social distancing: 46%

**% REQUESTING SUPPORT BY PROVIDER TYPE**

- **Center**
  - Curricula that promote social distancing: 44%
  - Training in use of instructional strategies that promote social distancing: 26%
  - Additional learning materials to support individualized or small group activities: 57%

- **Preschool Program**
  - Curricula that promote social distancing: 59%
  - Training in use of instructional strategies that promote social distancing: 48%
  - Additional learning materials to support individualized or small group activities: 52%

- **Family Child Care Home**
  - Curricula that promote social distancing: 72%
  - Training in use of instructional strategies that promote social distancing: 25%
  - Additional learning materials to support individualized or small group activities: 67%

**Note:** This data is based on an unspecified survey or study.
Note: All family data is PRELIMINARY
KEY FAMILY HIGHLIGHTS

• **66%** of families had to alter child care arrangements due to the pandemic
  • Rates were highest for school age children

• **30%** of families do not currently have needed child care

• **57%** of families have not finalized child care plans for the fall
  • Security of plans vary by the age of child and race/ethnicity

• **Most** parents are caring for children themselves or have children in non-preferred arrangements

• A **majority** of families want small groups under 10 children and daily attendance

• **50%** of parents have seen their incomes decrease
  • Rates differ by race/ethnicity
### FAMILY SAMPLE: WHO IS RESPONDING?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demographic</th>
<th>Sample Percent (as of 8/21)</th>
<th>Census Comparison (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Race</strong> (check all that apply) (N = 7,460)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>79.3%</td>
<td>87.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black or African-American</td>
<td>7.2%</td>
<td>5.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
<td>4.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native Hawaiian or other Pacific Islander</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Indian or Alaska Native</td>
<td>3.0%</td>
<td>2.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some other race or races</td>
<td>2.8%</td>
<td>4.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don't know</td>
<td>1.1%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prefer not to answer</td>
<td>7.7%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Latino, Hispanic, or Spanish Ethnicity</strong> (N = 7,525)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>18.7%</td>
<td>21.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>76.0%</td>
<td>78.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prefer not to answer</td>
<td>5.2%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Child Age</strong> (N = 7,874)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Families with at least one child 5 and under</td>
<td>71.10%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Families with at least one child 6 and over</td>
<td>57.90%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Annual Household Income</strong> (N = 7,456)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than $25,000 per year</td>
<td>17.6%</td>
<td>15.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$25,000-$45,000</td>
<td>19.6%</td>
<td>20.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$45,001 to $60,000</td>
<td>12.8%</td>
<td>17.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$60,000 to $100,000</td>
<td>23.3%</td>
<td>13.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than $100,000 per year</td>
<td>26.9%</td>
<td>32.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DO FAMILIES HAVE NEEDED CHILD CARE?

CHILD CARE CHANGED DUE TO PANDEMIC

66%

% with Changed Child Care by Age

- Under 5: 61%
- School Age: 70%
DO FAMILIES HAVE NEEDED CHILD CARE?

CURRENT UNMET NEED – ALL AGES

30%

SCHOOL YEAR UNMET NEED – ALL AGES

57%

UNMET CHILD CARE DEMAND BY AGE GROUP

- **Under 5**
  - Current: 22%
  - 2020-21 School Year: 52%

- **School-age**
  - Current: 38%
  - 2020-21 School Year: 64%
HAVE FAMILIES FINALIZED CHILD CARE PLANS FOR THE FALL?

FAMILIES WITH CHILD CARE PLANS FOR FALL

43%

Families Who Have Finalized Plans for Child Care for 2020-21 School Year (all ages)
CURRENT vs PREFERRED CHILD CARE – UNDER AGE 5

INTERPRETATION

- Parents with children under 5 are generally providing care themselves or are using child care centers.
- For the 20-21 school year, many parents would prefer to shift their children to licensed family child care homes or preschool settings.
A majority of parents are currently caring for school-age children themselves or are having family, friends, or neighbors care for them.

For the 20-21 school year, more than a third of parents would prefer to shift their children to a before- or after-school program.
While the pandemic lasts, please indicate your preference for how to have your child/children participate in childcare, camp, or school:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>More like this</th>
<th>In Between</th>
<th>More like this</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Children are in small groups (10 or less)</strong></td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>All social distancing and public health guidelines are strictly followed</strong></td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Children are in care/school on alternate/rotating schedules</strong></td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Children are in typical group sizes (more than 10 based on age)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Flexibility on following social distancing and public health guidelines</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Children are in care/school daily</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*n = 7,570-7,607*
Percent of families whose income has DECREASED since the beginning of the pandemic: 50%
ACTION ITEMS

• Sustainability funding for providers who have lost enrollment and/or are at risk of permanent closure
  • Target to regions that have been hardest hit

• Income stabilization for the early educators and families, targeted to hardest hit populations

• More specific guidance on how to implement social distancing guidelines in early childhood settings

• Tech and instructional support for remote and socially-distanced learning

• Work with districts to develop clear plans for different scenarios that caregivers and families can plan around

• Support for small group, consistent, and structured care and learning in all settings
Department Updates
Department Updates

• Colorado Department of Higher Education (Angie Paccione)

• Colorado Department of Education (Melissa Colsman)

• Colorado Department of Human Services (Anne-Marie Braga)
  ○ Office of Early Childhood (Mary Anne Snyder)

• Colorado Department of Health Care Policy & Financing (Tom Massey)

• Colorado Department of Public Health & Environment (Tracy Miller)
CO Department of Public Health & Environment

Early Childhood Updates

Presented to the Early Childhood Leadership Commission
August 27, 2020

Tracy Miller, MSPH, RD
Chief, Nutrition Services Branch
Prevention Services Division
Colorado Department of Public Health and Environment
Today’s CDPHE Updates

- Immunizations progress
- Maternal mortality report
- Maternal & Child Health new priorities and strategies
- WIC remote services
- Child & Adult Care Food Program innovation
- Farm to early care and education funding application
Immunizations

• 2020 school year: Whether virtual or in-person, Colorado school and child care immunization entry requirements are unchanged

• 2019-2020 school & child care immunization data are available here:
  http://covaxrates.org
  ❖ 95% of children in 1,747 child care facilities are compliant

For more information contact Heather Roth, heather.roth@state.co.us

For more information contact Shivani Bhatia:
shivani.bhatia@state.co.us
preventmaternalmortality@state.co.us

Find the report here:
https://www.colorado.gov/cdphe/maternal-mortality

- Maternal mortality in Colorado is increasing, similar to the nation
- Suicide, drug overdose, injury, & homicide are leading causes
- ¾ of deaths were determined to be preventable
- Some people and populations are more likely to experience maternal death
- Report includes 13 recommendations to prevent maternal deaths & support maternal health and equity
Maternal & Child Health (MCH)

Priorities and FY 2021 strategies

(Draft: Final version in development, to be posted in October)

For more information contact Rachel Hutson, rachel.hutson@state.co.us
Seven MCH priorities

❖ Positive Child & Youth Development
❖ Reduce Racial Inequities
❖ Economic Mobility
❖ Social Emotional Wellbeing
❖ Access to Supports
❖ Prosocial Connection
❖ Built Environment
WIC is open!

WIC continues to serve families remotely

- Preparing for expiration of remote service waivers & waiting for possible extension

- Main focuses:
  - Retention: Fewer families are leaving WIC by choice compared to last year
  - Converting referrals to enrollments

For more information, contact Heidi Hoffman, heidi.hoffman@state.co.us
Child and Adult Care Food Program (CACFP)

- Implemented joint claims & application system with CO Dept. of Education, Office of School Nutrition: less administrative burden for participants

- Preschool Development Grant efforts with CDHS & others:
  - Expand access to quality nutrition
  - Support child care business sustainability
  - Outreach to non-participating providers

For more info contact Naomi Steenson, naomi.steensson@state.co.us
Farm to ECE grant funding application:

- Develop farm to ECE roadmap with community and stakeholder engagement
- Develop strategic plan including policy and programmatic focuses

For more information contact Jennifer Dellaport
jennifer.dellaport@state.co.us
Questions?

Tracy Miller
Nutrition Services Branch Chief
Prevention Services Division
CDPHE
tracymarie.miller@state.co.us
Public Comment & Commissioner Updates
Public Comment

• Each speaker may take up to five (5) minutes to make his or her comments. This time constraint may be modified by the ECLC Co-chairs.

• Any opinions, advice, statements, services, offers, or other information or content expressed or made available by stakeholders or members of the public during public comment does not constitute or imply its endorsement, recommendation, or favoring by the ECLC.
Colorado Early Care and Education Workforce Data Dashboard

Colorado knows that a **qualified and committed early care and education (ECE) workforce is essential** for the success of policies and programs designed to improve the lives of children birth to five. This data dashboard was designed to provide the most up-to-date information on Colorado’s ECE professionals who were employed throughout 2019.

- **23,702** working ECE professionals
- **48%** earned a college degree
- **21%** were new to the ECE field
- **28%** changed jobs in 2019

Click here for the full ECE professional 2019 Snapshot Report.
Updates from the Governor’s Office
Scott Groginsky, Special Advisor for Early Childhood
Future of Preschool Policy Planning Overview
Bill Jaeger, Colorado Children’s Campaign and Jennifer Stedron, Early Milestones Colorado
Discussion and Consider Endorsement of Cigarette Tobacco and Nicotine Products Tax Ballot Measure
Approval of Subcommittee Co-Chairs
Kristina Heyl
• Program Quality and Alignment: Anna Jo Haynes and Anji Gallanos

• Communication Subcommittee: Tom Massey and Katie Facchinello

• Data Subcommittee: Susan Steele

• Early Childhood Workforce Development: Heather Craiglow, Rebecca Kantor, Pamela Harris, and Jennifer O’Brien

• Approve Home Visiting Initiative Working Group Charge
Co-Chair Final Thoughts and Adjourn
ECLC 2020 Meeting Schedule:

• October 22, 2020
• December 17, 2020
Next Meeting:

Next Meeting: October 22, 2020
From 9:30 am - 12:30 pm
Health Care Policy & Financing, 303 East 17th Avenue, Denver, 11th Floor Conference Room
OR via webinar