# Sadržaj | Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Uvodnik</th>
<th>Editorial</th>
<th>03</th>
<th>Priroda i društvo</th>
<th>Nature and Society</th>
<th>Krunoslav Ivanšin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Priroda i društvo | Nature and Society** | 04 | Zvjezdanovi gradovi, američki zapravo | Star-like Cities, American actually | Aleksander Fleker |

10 | Od edifikacije do kvalifikacije krajolika | From the edification to the qualification of landscape |
| Izuzetno Chinchilla |

18 | Modeliranje količina 1 | Modelling the quantities 1 | Veljko Olić, Tonči Žarić |

22 | Modeliranje količina 2 | Modelling the quantities 2 | Veljko Olić, Tonči Žarić |

24 | Recycle! | (ecosistema urbano) |

28 | Renaturalize! | (ecosistema urbano) |

30 | Izleti u prirodu i društvo | Excursions in nature and society |
| Nathalie de Vries u razgovoru sa Sanjom Jerković | Nathalie de Vries in conversation with Sanja Jerković |

**Granični slučaj | Borderline** | 36 | Territorij: projektiranje neuskladenog | Territory: Non-Aligned Designs |
| Autor tekst | Text by: Vyjayanthi Rao |
| Uvodni tekst | Introduction and Croatian translation by: Aleksandra Wegner |
| Uredila | Edited by: Lovorka Prcić |

44 | Prakse prostornog planiranja i provedbe planova u Hrvatskoj | Physical Planning and Plan Implementation Practice in Croatia |
| Maja Magrcica |

| Ratimir Zimmermann |

52 | Arheološko-prirodoslovni park na Palagruži | Archaeological and Nature Park on the island of Palagruža |
| Ante Manešić, Ivana Frenke |

53 | Palagruža – otok medu zvijezdama – Diomedov otok | Palagruža – the Island among the Stars – Diomedes’ Island |
| Branko Krištan |

** Razotkrivanje | Rediscovery** | 56 | Nikola Dobrović, 1957 |
| Dječji odjel zavoda za žilinsku terapiju, Igalo, Crna Gora | Children’s Department of the Physical Therapy Institute, Igalo, Montenegro |
| Veljko Rudulović |

**BOOK BOOM** | 62 | PROJEKT ZAGREB: TRANZICIJA KAO STANJE|STRATEGIJA|PRAKSA | PROJECT ZAGREB: TRANSITION AS CONDITION|STRATEGY|PRACTICE |
| Eve Blau, Ivan Rupnik |

64 | Sešta Randić, Idis Turato: IN-BETWEEN |
| Peter Milković |

**Teorija | Theory** | 65 | Definiranje urbanističkog projekta: deset suvremenih pristupa |
| Joan Busquets |
| Pripremila, provele i uređila: Karin Ćerjan |

**Vijesti | Notices** | 66 | Društvo arhitekata Splita (DAS) |
| Društvo arhitekata Dubrovnik (DAD) |
| Novi predsjednik i izvršni odbor DAZ-a |
| Performing the Space |
| Bert Loeltsche in Zagreb |

| 67 | Društvo arhitekata Zadra |
| Drugi kongres hrvatskih arhitekata |
| Tisuću pikela za Vlado |
| Richard Rogers – dobitnik Pritzkrove nagrade za 2007. godinu |
| London: Zagreb ne čelju IMPACTS-a |
Territorij: projektiranje neuskladenog

Alekandra Wagner (rođena u Zagrebu, odrasla u Sarajevu, živi u New Yorku) je psihosocijalna učenica i klinička praksa. Predaje sociologiju na sveučilištu The New School.

Dr. Vyjayanthi Rao je New York-baserad psychoanalytiker; hon teaches sociologi at The New School, New York City.

Uvod

Kao urbanist i etnograf, dr. Vyjayanthi Rao bavi se istraživanjem odnosa između estetike, etike i globalizacije, te između pevijest i memorije u kontekstu razvoja. Njene autorske stručne publikacije iz područja urbanih intervencija obuhvaćaju teme kao što su: spekulacija vrijednošću zemljista izgradnjom na područjima bivših alamanove; destrukcija i reklasifikacija gradskog tkiva u svrhe prodaje; izražavanje građanske inicijativa na bezi novih medijskih tehnologija. Rao podučava antropologiju i međunarodne odnose na The New School u New Yorku, kroz kolegij: Grenice etike - subjektivitet, ljudska prava i politika u suvremenom etnografiji; Antropologija i mejlerto; Modifikacije i dizajn, a trenutno dovršava rukopis knjige "Na ruševinama grada: spekulacija, urbanizacija i globalizacija."

Njegov rad na prostornoj transformaciji grada, kretanju kapitala, nekretnina i na ponovnom uстроju urbane povišine kao reakciji na intervencije kapitala i urbanih istraživanja, pokazuje kako i zašto, u Indiji kao i drugdje, današnji "gradovi ne razgradnju." Kako bi se ova privredna kontradikcija odstavila razumijevanje, neophodno je da se istraživački napori osnovku tradicionalnih profesionalnih i političkih pretpostavki u tome što su oni koji imaju pravo planirati, i za kakvou budućnost. U tom smislu, nove teritorije u Indiji, valja čitati kao neukrivke, ali isak gomilaka značajnih različitih oblika spekulativne moći. I teritoriji ne samo da oblikuju lokalni fizički krajolik, proizvod međunarodnog kapitala, nego predstavljaju senzibilitet i etičke odnose između ljudi i njihove okoline. Rao tvrdi da je i sama teorija svojevrsna etička ulaganje, koje shvaća da je budućnost u vodi i sad, a ne neki plan koji tek treba nastati. Stavio, njen rad sugerira da su političke lokacije s kojima se budućnost promišlja ulazna mnogostrucne - stoga su za budućnost jednoznačno od struke odvijeni "visionari", kao i radničari preko čijih se ideje talke vizije najčešće ostvaruju.

Introduction

Vyjayanthi Rao, Ph.D., is an urbanist and ethnographer working on the relationships between aesthetics, ethics and globalization, and between history and memory in the context of development. She has written and published on urban interventions including real-value speculation through slum redevelopment, the destruction and reconfiguration of urban fabric by terror attacks and citizens' research initiatives using new media technologies. She is currently completing a book manuscript titled On The Ruins of the City: Speculation, Urbanization and Globalization. Rao teaches anthropology and international affairs at The New School in New York. Her courses include: Limits of Ethics - Subjectivity; Human Rights and Politics in Contemporary Ethnography; Anthropology and Scale and Mobile Media Design Studio.

Rao's work on the spatial transformation of cities, circulation of real-estate capital and on the realignments of urban surface in response to interventions of capital and urban research, aims to show how and why today, in India and elsewhere, "cities grow in their unbuidling." She argues that an understanding of this seeming contradiction demands that the attention of urban research be turned away from the traditional professional and political presuppositions about who does the work of planning and for what kind of future. In this sense, terrains emerging in Mumbai must be read as unruly, yet systemic, juxtapositions of varied forms of speculative power. They not only form a local physical landscape, infused by international capital, but also represent the potentialities and ethical relationships between people and their environment. She argues for the work of theory - itself an ethical investment - which recognizes that a future is here and now, not a plan to be drawn, but a condition already charged. More importantly, Rao's work suggests that psychic locations of the future are manifold and produced equally by the official and the non-official imaginaries and by the toiling subjectivities which make such visions possible.
Vizije budućnosti

U prošlom broju ĆIP-a Anthony Vidler s pravom je zaključio da "paradigma organičke cjeline više nije relevantno sredstvo za mjerjenje i interpretiranje. Suviše je toga u svakom slučaju, usprkos tome, planirati grad i dalje trebati kao tijelo - koherentno orkestriranje funkcionalnih i funkcionirajućih dijelova. Planovci i vizije danas su osnutke u kojima se postojanom urbanom prostoru vrijednost uvećava ponovnim primijetanjem teritorijalnih i odnosenih procesa, upravljanjem finansijskim i javnim procesima, planiranje sa sve češće okreće eksperimentima u matematičkom braniranju - zamjenjujući mjesto odjela moča i stvarnosti. Pokretajući takav braniranje, teško sam stvarne, funkcionalne i ideološke potrebe, važno u jednakoj mjeri i naravno, identitet, te mašte i težnje. Njega se često što je globalna konzultantska tvrtka McKinsey & Co. 2003 godine dobio na radnoj zabavi pod nazivom Vizija Mumbaia. Taj je izvještaj trebao definirati korake koje valja poduzeti kako bi se Mumbaia pretvorila u "grad svjetske klase."Vizija Mumbaia predložila je niz planerskih procedura koje bi, primjerice, trebale riješiti ozbiljnu stambenu krizu u gradu napućenom samoumivima i divljom gradnjom, kao i niz preporuka za adekvatni razvoj infrastrukture. Rješenja i priljede su u tomu su izvješću međusobno vješta povezani - tako se aktualna gradska kriza pretvorila u ugovor za gradisne poduzeća, financiere i političare, kako bi ovi, iz postojeće gradske stvarnosti, dalje mogli ubiti vrijednosti kojima teži. Ove su se mogućnosti dalje oblikovale vladinim najava njenom planu da Mumbaia pretvoriti u novi Shanghaj, analitiku modela 'grada svjetske klase.' Uzme li se u obzir degradaciju Mumbaia kao modernoć metropole, jasno je da je takva atraktivna vizija bila potrebna. Za izvršnje je da je Singapur - nakon glavnih konkurentskih modela povijesnog arhitekta i neodvisnim zamjenjivanjem Shanghaja, uključujući čak i indijskog premijera, D. Mamohana Sinha, baš svi nude javnu obećanje da će Mumbaia postati novi Shanghaj; za izvršnje te akademijeske formule nije propuštena niti jedna prilika.

No veza sa akademijom ovlju je i mnogo dubljeg, a mnogo povijesnija. Jer Mumbaia - nekadašnji Bombay - odnosi se za ovo svoj raj, degradaciji, to, izgledno, jošt uvijek i jest. Izvještaj Sjeverne univerziteta je to da bi reforma zakona o korištenju zemljišta i uklanjanje ograničenja izgradnje i gustoće, za ukupnu državnu ekonomiju bili jednako učinkoviti kao i pravna reforma tržišne liberalizacije iz ranih 90-tih. Ovakve hipoteze pokuša uzgajati o izuzetnoj važnosti Mumbaia u odnosu na ostatak države. Ispak je iz ovog jezgra nacionalna politika za proizvodnju pokrenulih slika, kao i skrtaša za izvoz tih slika, na koje se lako lako učinilo da bi se moglo dozvoliti da Mumbaia propadne, ili da se drugi gradovi razviju na njegov račun; suviše spekulativnog investiranja, simboličkog kapitala, i psihički energije. Urbanisa reforma Mumbaia stoga predstavlja jedinstvenu mogućnost profita, ali i jedinstvenu mogućnost pozitivnih promjena u životu grada. Upravo je to kontekst unutar kojeg želim primijetiti nove konfiguracije prostora, vremena, tehnologije i društvenih odnosa.

Vrijeme, ili 'arhitektura i arheologija'

Ne smucenom teritoriju Mumbaia blisko se dotiču posve različiti pajzaji, od kojih svaki odražava određenom 'epizodi' urbana planiranja. 'Epizode' o kojima govorim rezultat su recentnih promjena postojanja pravilima gradskog poduzetništva, učestalost kojih eksponencijalno raste od sredine 90-tih. Sagledamo iz današnje perspektive, ove 'epizode' solovo čine projektiranje za propust, čim se jednom konkretiziraju, u krizoliku u povijesnoj, kao stambeni blokovi, koncipirani za 'rehabilitaciju' stanovnika samoume, javnost uživa njihove negativne kvalitete i započine protest protiv daljnjih izgradnje. Brojne su tužbe radi 'zaštitu javnog interesa' uspješno zauzimale neke od sličnih vlažnih projekata. Uzmoemo li u obzir kulturu popularne demokracije u Indiji, propust takvih planova je, na prvi način, očekivana. Što onda svrha i funkcija ovakve 'epizode'? Možda nam na ove projekte valja gledati kao na nastojanje da se registrira budućnost - ali budućnost kao efekt nelepštine - u svijesti gradskih stanovnika.

Visions of the Future

As Anthony Vidler remarks in his interview in the last issue of ĆIP, "the paradigm of organicism, of an organic whole, is no longer possible as means to measure and interpret the city," Yet, master-planning continues to treat the city as body, a coherent orchestration of functional and functioning parts. Plans and vision-statements are commonplace strategies for harvesting value from existing city-space by re-imagining the terrain. Increasingly, planning itself is moving from the concrete operations of arranging infrastructure, determining financing and navigating the public processes to...
the land-use policies and lifting restrictions on building and densification would have as much impact on the national economy as a whole as did the economic liberalization reforms of the early 1990s. Such hyperbolic claims reveal a great deal about the concrete space and glamour of Mumbai in relation to the rest of the nation. It is, after all, the nation’s factory for manufacturing cinematic images and its export warehouse from where these images travel far and wide across the globe. Much is riding on not allowing Mumbai to collapse and letting other cities grow at its expense. The urban reform of Mumbai therefore represents an unprecedented opportunity for profiteering as it does for positive urban change. Too much...
im impulsima. Takvo projektiranje postoećem krajoboru daje osjećaj privatnosti i prozračnosti, čineći ga time anekronim i unaprijed spremnim za uništavanje – čak i onda kada je upravo ono 'novo' u svojoj suštini anekrono.

Takvi transformacijski projekti puka su projekcija uporne logike modernizacije. Ta logika funkcioniра na način da urbani prostor markira ili kao 'ne-modern' (tj. pred-modern), ili kao 'još-ne-modern' (tj. u neskladi s normativnim standardima modernog građenja). U Mumbaju, baš kao i drugdje, 'ne-moderni' dijelovi urbanog tkiva dio su graditeljske baštine. Treba ih sačuvati kao simbole prošlosti – smiju egzistirati tek kao ana-

schemes as functioning to find and register the future, albeit as an uncanny effect in the consciousness of the urban resident.

The most dramatic results of these experiments in urban planning are reflected in landscapes characterized by the juxtaposition of built forms assigned to different temporalities. Abandoned textile mills and 19th century tenement housing blocks are thrown into relief against the luxury high-rise condominium towers and shopping complexes. Shacks housing garbage collectors and rag-pickers lean against mountains of trash inside the city's massive garbage dumping grounds. Low-tech and hazardous activities – like ship-breaking – as well as high-tech jobs housed in new Technoparks are secret-

chronizmi. Stari i postojeće tako 'mutira' u nešto novo, nalagajući zadržavajući svoj identitet. S druge strane, 'još-ne-moderni' aspekt urbanog tkiva smatraju se trajnim smetnjama modernom estetskom sanbilizaciju, čak i kad efikasno ispunjavaju niz funkcija koje moderna Država nije uspjela zadovoljiti.

Središnja funkcija takvog 'još-ne-modernog' izgrađenog okoliša – divljih naselja – čini se da je udomljanje velikog broja nadničara, a usmjerenje njihovih aktivnosti na efikasan i produktivan način. Drugim riječima, uloga takvog okoliša jest da ljudsku djelatnost - spontanu i reeksibilnu interakciju među ljudima, te interakciju između ljudi i tehnologije - pretvori u infrastrukturnu na kojoj se bazira funkcionalizirano grada. Termin 'nadničar' u svojem radu koristi Sandeep Pendse, mumbajski pisac koji ovaj izraz smatra mnogo prikladnijim od uobičajenih markističkih formula poput 'proletarjata' ili 'radničke klase'. Po njemu, upravo je specifično iskustvo prostora i vremena ono što čini urbanu egzistenciju nadničara. Za razumijevanje njihovih društvenih uvjeta to je iskustvo relevantnije od bilo kakve političke idealizacije. Izgrađeni okoliš reflektira po-

3 | Poljski zahod | Toilet Block
Ručno skepkan zahod u slamu Mumbaja, na rubu mačere. | Self-built toilet block in Mumbai slum, at the edge of a swamp.
Fotografija | Photo by: Rajesh Vora

4 | Luditi krajolik | Ludic landscape
Fotografija | Photo by: Bart Orr

5 | Prenemjena zgrade | Building Conversion
Fotografija | Photo by: Sandra Calvo

ed away from prying eyes and human rights monitors. These kinds of developments become part of urban 'nature'. If urban nature is understood in terms of the naturalized environments that are produced by infrastructural systems in conjunction with human interactions. In any urban environment, 'nature' is the product of an inevitable relationship between human needs, technology and the naturalization or invisibility of the instrumental nature of the infrastructural apparatus. However, throughout Mumbai, this general process of the production of urban nature is highly visible, both in the low-tech solutions that people devise to provide themselves with simple infrastructural facilities such as toilets, and in the high-tech developments that reclaim urban space by recycling obsolete infrastructural facilities like garbage dumps into office and residential complexes or even natural park facilities. These acts of recycling bring together the long durée, ecological temporality, with the short-term temporalities of destruction and construction that characterize the urban built fabric.

Produced by the recent manipulations of development rules, these mixed-up terrains convey and heighten a sense of familiarity, albeit in their reference to the decaying and the rolling built forms subjected to transformation. Yet, this familiarity also evokes an uncanny sensation of being in a present that is ruptured from within. What exactly ruptures the present? I would argue that it is the presence of the future, distilled and represented in contained pockets, which pervades the space of the present. This distillation of the
Glavni slučaj

6 | 'Rehabilitacijski' blockovi | Rehab Towers
Stambeni blokovi za rehabilitaciju stanovnika stanova u sjevernim predgradima.
Rehabilitation housing built for slum-dwellers in northern suburbs.
Fotografija | Photo by: Slatya
Pernaraju

7 | Ljudski krajolik | Ludic landscape
Izgrada neobodera u dijelu grada s ličnim stvarinama, puno Mumba.
High-rise construction in the frozen-rent district of south Mumbai.
Fotografija | Photo by: Bart
Orr

8 | Rezač brodova | Ship-Breaker
Radnik u rezačtvima brodova (Davudhara), Luka Mumbali, Mumbai. | Worker in the ship-breaking yard (Davudhara), Mumbai Port Trust, Mumbai.
Fotografija | Photo by: Vyjayanthi Rao

ova i razvijenih tehnologija. Jediniji načini koji ovi ljudi mogu ući u takvo polje, jest da se prema njemu postave poput vode, poput novca kojim građevinski poduzetnici otkupuju vrijednu zemlju na kojoj nadnjičari žive. Proces preinamjera siromašnih u kapital usko je povezan s načinima na koje zemljište povećava vrijednost uz pomoć instrumenta kojim su urbana pravila. U nedavnjoj transformaciji Mumbaja, popularističke mjere koje se u cilju siromašnih osiguraju tražene i sigurno stajanje provedene su za činjenicu da je svaka osoba konvertirana u prostornu mjeru. Dakle, ako je stanovnik stana mogao dokazati svoje dugo obilježavanje na tom prostoru - svoju 'pravo na grad' - građevinski bi ga poduzetnik potom uradili u svoju prostornu računac. Po toj se konzervaciji stanovnik izjednačio s opredijeljenom brojkom kvadratnih metara, a poduzetnik je na račun njegove preoljanja stekao pravo na adekvatni postotak 'ljudske kvadrature'; tu slobodnu valutu poduzetnik je kasnije mogao iskoristiti za kupnju zemljišta u nekom drugom dijelu grada. Geografija razvoja neposredno je povezana s ovakvim spekulacijama. Proces kojim se prostorni kapital generira iz ljudi obavijen je velom tajnom, okrutnim glasinama i zaslićen tak-tikama čvrste ruke i "neformalnog suvereniteta" poduzetnika i majetne, kojima se omogućuje dalje uvećanje profita iz spekulacije. Takav "misterij" neophodan je kako bi se odrazila pretjerana, upravo perversna, vrijednost zemljišta - prava suprotnost spekulativnom procesu na kojem su zasnovani racionalni instrumenti planiranja, npr. urban grid.

Mumbai, as elsewhere, the 'not modern' parts of the built fabric are consigned to the heritage industry, assigned for preservation as tokens of the past - allowed to exist as anachronisms. This implies the 'mutation' of the old and evident into something different, while appearing to retain its identity. On the other hand, the 'hot-yet-modern' aspects of the built fabric are perceived as constant disturbances to the aesthetic sensibility of the modern, even while they efficiently fulfill a variety of functions that the modern State fails to fulfill.

The chief function of this kind of built environment designated as "not-yet-modern" - the settlements outside regulation - seems to be housing a large number of 'tillers' and directing their activities efficiently and productively. Its function, in other words, appears to be that of turning the activities of people, their provisional and flexible interactions with each other and with the technological apparatus into the very infrastructure upon which the functioning of the city rests. The term 'tiller' is used by a Mumbai-based writer Sandeep Pendse, who argues that it would be more appropriate to use this term than to apply the conventional Marxist political label of the proletarian or the working class. According to Pendse, a very specific experience of space and time constitutes the social existence of the tillers in the city; this very experience is more relevant to understanding their social condition than any idealized notion of politics. The built environment also reflects the manner in which the tillers are positioned and deployed in the city's functioning. Their dense relationship with the technological apparatus which constitutes the city's infrastructure, is an indication of their position as
Ne stale ni neuspjeli takvih mjera - koncipiranih istodobno kao populističke strategije i kao sredstva spekulacije - bitno utječu na projektiranje, urbanizam i politiku Mumbaia. Neuspjeha, 'ljudski' krajolici na kojima su vidljive konkretno posljedice ovih planerskih 'epizoda', simboli su poraza i parvezije kojima političari i spekulanti nastojale progratirati svoje sumnjeve idije, ali se završili najviše javnoj javnosti. Ti krajolici čine tko 'napulje temporalnosti' u kojoj se superponiraju slojevi potpuno različitih geografskih, zadržavajući prilom medusobnu neusklađenost. Može se baš u tom smislu 'ljudski' krajolici mogu smatrati svrhevitim i instrumentalističkim. Oni nisu tek posljedice 'lošeg'

planiranja ili političkih pogrešaka, to su djelomični, spekulaativni krajolici koji omogućuju uvid u budućnost koja vrše obradu, umetnuta u sadašnjost. Oni površinu grada pretvaraju u arheološka nalazište - prostor koji objedinjuje različite temporalnosti, koje onda mogu biti iskapano i korišteno prema potrebama.

Gustoča ili 'projektiranje urbanog iskustva'


esim them in a temporal limbo vis-à-vis the developing city. Their species are suspended and marked for erasure even while they are denied access to a regulated housing market. The only way in which they might enter this field is by positioning themselves as currency, as the coin by which developers can gain access to the valuable land that they occupy. The process of converting the poor into capital is intimately connected to the ways in which land is converted into value through instruments like development rights. In the recent transformation of Mumbai, populist measures to provide permanent and secure housing to the poor have been implemented by converting each person into a spatial measurement. Thus, if a slum-dweller can demonstrate legitimate right to the city by showing proof of long-term residence, then he or she is treated by the developer as a spatial calculation - that is, valued in terms of square feet, even as he or she is treated as being entitled to a number of square feet. In turn, the developer who resells him or her is entitled to a proportion of that number as a free currency that he can exchange for land elsewhere in the city.

The geography of development is intimately tied to this kind of schemes. The process of generating spatial capital from persons is endowed with a sense of mystery, surrounded by rumour and backed up by the strong-arm tactics and the "informal sovereignty" of developers and underworld types. It allows the maximization of profits from speculations. The 'mystery' is essential to maintaining extremely inflated, indeed perverted, land values - the very opposite of the speculative process opened up by rational planning instruments, such as the urban grid.
Density, or 'Design of Urban Experience'

In the post-industrial West, refurbishment and preservation through reuse of industrial buildings leads externally to the temporal arrest of an aesthetic form, while updating its function or program. Thus the preserved building ruptures the linear apprehension of time and makes the past available through the uncanny apprehension of form. In Mumbai the functional densities of the industrial city were long surpassed during the decades in which Mumbai’s population grew exponentially. Mumbai drew people magnetically by its image as the only space of opportunity in a slow-moving nation. To return to a functional density now would mean having to banish large parts of the existing population from the city. The solution seems to be to repurpose these people – turning the chief function of their existence into one of maintaining, servicing and refurbishing the city’s obsolete industrial infrastructure.

Such activities actually make places like Mumbai competitive in the global economy, they put the obsolete people-infrastructure in the service of the more hazardous global industries. Many of the urban planning ‘episodes’, whose effects can be read from their correlated ‘yield’ of structures on the landscape, are part of an exercise of maintaining and manipulating density, repositioning residents and resources in order to create the most productive city. Indeed, one might view them as processes of producing urban nature. Using an agricultural metaphor: we might say that if the planning episodes are ‘seeds’ then these structures are their yield.

Yet, the overall picture that such speculation yields is curiously out of alignment, mis-shapen and out of sync. It is a landscape made up of destroyed ruïnes and partially of hill-built or even un-built ruïnes that deform the existing patterns of urban design. Here I use ‘ruïnes’ in two senses: first, in the more common sense of the trace left by willful destruction or by accident in the passage of historical time; and, second, in the sense given it by Walter Benjamin, as the “historical nature” particular to the present. In this sense, perhaps, marked by the continual abandonment of forms and products, including, in this case, spatial products or entire built environments willfully built for obsolescence. How does one inhabit this landscape of ruïnes? What forms of historicity or subjective historical consciousness are adequate to navigating this landscape of partial territories that are nevertheless held together by a ‘vision’ of the city as an organic whole? These questions can only be answered by rethinking the place and notion of density in relation to the production of territory.

Subjectivity, or ‘Phenomenology of Non-Alignment’

The processes I describe with respect to Mumbai are, in my view, variations on a more general process of contemporary urbanism. Various accounts have emerged to capture the collapse of the organicist metaphor of the city in the imagination of planners and of the public – new accounts of “urban metabolism,” of “splintering urbanism,” and so on. Each of them strives to capture a theoretical anxiety with what I describe as the non-alignment of territories within the imagination of the public and the corresponding problem of the transcendent city, the idea that the space of the city cannot be descriptively captured and lies beyond the limits of all possible experience or knowledge. This anxiety is particularly acute in the
je. Ova je tjelesna osobito snažna kad je riječ o mašti planera, koji nastoje održati fikciju ili barem sliku grada kao koherentne funkcionalne cjeline. U takvom kontekstu, suvremeno izgradnje grada - bila riječ o New Yorku, Mumbaju, Lagosu ili Dubaju - mora se susići s funkcionalnom fragmentacijom i neuključenosti teritorija, uz istodobno održavanje fikcije koherentnosti i cjelovitosti.

No to je tek jedno od mjesta na kojem se neuključenost i fragmentacija teritorija mogu suzresti i osjetiti. Razumijevanje suvremenog urbanog izgradnje moglo bi se usmjeren na proizvodu proizvođačke usklađenosti između mjesta kakvog zabilježili planeri i marketinški stručnjaci, te dispersivnog, fragmentarnog, subjektivnog izgradnje urbanog prostora. Uobičajena urbana ontologija 'izbavljanja' - priča koja nam kaže na što je to način došao tu gdje je - pretpostavlja da su akcije stanovništva eksplicitno političke i instrumen
talne, uvijek usmjeren prema jasno koncipiranim reformama i rezultatima.

Tako shvaćanje ignorira mogućnosti etičkog ulaganja u urbani teritorij. Ova su etička ulaganja zasnovana na subjek
tivnom izgradnju gospeko kao principu uređenju kojim se ljudske interakcije usklađuju s osjetijskim i tehnološkim krajolicima arhitekture i javnih radova. Prepoznavanje i poštivanje takvih etičkih ulaganja značio bi da bi smo spremni učiniti činjenicu da mnogi 'jedno egzistiraju', da mnogi 'izlaze na kraj' ili preživljaju - bez ikakvih mogućnosti 'izbavljanja'. Novi obli
ci etičkog ulaganja podrzujemaju i nov odnos prema teritoriju budućnosti. Na teritoriju kakav je Mumbaj, budućnost je prostor radikalne nestabilnosti, već i stoga što je jasno da je potpuno rasprostranjeno na razini društvenih odnosa nemoguće. Tko će to, i kako, nositi s tim nestabilnošću? Ovo nam promišljanje tek predstoji.

Budemo li poetični pažnju ovakvim etičkim ulaganjima, lako
cemo prepoznati i bolje razumjeti one interakcije koje vode pravallom usklađivanju teritorija. Time bi urbana analiza i sama mogla postati jednom vrstem etičkog ulaganja. Obraćanje pažnje na procese koji oblikuju teritorij, na vrstu ljudske etike koje proizvode izgradnju, usklađuje je nas od normativnih interpratacija i od nametanja osjetljivih kategorizacija u specifičnim situacijama. Tek bi se na ovaj način analiza i njezini objekti mogli naći u odnosu etičkog dijalog. Za razumijevanje novog subjek
tiviteta nužno je promjeniti analitičke taktike i strategije. Ta bi nam promjena mogla pomoći u razumijevanju grada koji nastaje, koji je pred nama - što bi svakako bilo koristan na inzistirati na razumijevanju grada koji više i tako ne postoji.

face of the planner's imagination, which strives to maintain the fic
tion (or at least an image) of the city as a coherent body with func
tional parts. In this context, the contemporary experience of the city - whether of New York, Mumbai, Lagos or Dubai - must come to
terms with the functional fragmentation and non-alignment of terri
tories, while maintaining a fiction of coherence and wholeness.

But this is only one site at which the non-alignment and frag
tementation of territories produced by contemporary processes, in
ccluding those of speculation, is felt — and the only one that I have been able to discuss here at any length. In the broader sense, con
temporary urban experience might well be focused on the problem of producing some kind of provisional alignment between the im
gery of place distributed by planners and marketers and that of the dis
cerate and fragmentary subjective experience of urban space. A common, redemptive urban ontology, or an account of how things
got to be the way they are, assumes that the actions and demands of residents are explicitly political and instrumental and that they are directed toward yielding specific reforms and results.

Typically, such accounts ignore the possibilities of ethical invest
mens in the urban terrain that are produced by the subjective expe
diences of density as the principle of arrangement by which human interactions are brought into sync with the aesthetic and technolo
gized environments of architecture and public works. To recognize such ethical investments would be to recognize the fact of 'merely existing' and getting by, or surviving in states of relation, with
t the possibility of redemption. In my reading, these ethical invest
mements arise from new forms of subjective historical consciousness, in particular in relation to the future of a horizon.

In terrains like Mumbai, the future exhibits radical instability premi
ed on the inability to achieve full reproduction at the level of social relations. What modes of subjectivation are being developed to deal
with such instability? This becomes a crucial question to investigate.

Paying closer attention to such ethical investments will allow us to recognize and therefore to better understand the kinds of inter
actions that give rise to provisional alignments of terrains. Urban analysis, too, then becomes a form of ethical investment, because our attention to the process of how terrains get to be as they are, to the kind of human ethic that produces urban nature, leads us away from normative readings and the imposition of subjective patterns. This ethical dialogue thus arises between analy
sis and its objects. Changing the tactics and strategies of analysis might lead to our apprehending these new modes of subjectivation — it might, indeed, lead to our apprehending the emergent and im
cient city rather than to our aspiring for an alignment with a city that has already been left behind.

Bilješke

2. Među primerima ovake vrste mogu naći veliki Informaci
j-tehnički park 'MindSpace' u Mumbaju, sjevernom gradu Mumbaja, i park prirode Mahim, u kojem se pruža pasaj između priroda i industrije.
7. "Examples of these kinds of reclamations include a massive Infosys Park, 'MindSpace', at the northern fringes of the city, in the suburb of Malad and the Mahim Nature Park, a sanctuary for migratory birds, carved out by reclaiming natural mangrove swamps from a rapidly encroac
ing garbage dump.

Endnotes

2. Examples of these kinds of reclamations include a massive Infosys Park, 'MindSpace', at the northern fringes of the city, in the suburb of Malad and the Mahim Nature Park, a sanctuary for migratory birds, carved out by reclaiming natural mangrove swamps from a rapidly encroaching garbage dump.
5. I have been exploring the process of slum rehabilitation through the rubric of 'people as currency' in my work. A version of this argument is presented in my essay, "Post-Industrial Transitions: The Speculative Futures of Citizenship In Contemporary Mumbai," published in the Mumbai Reader (Rahul Mehrotra and Pankaj Joshi, Eds.) by the Urban Design Research Institute, Mumbai, accompanied their exhbition at the Venice Architecture Biennale, 2006.