WHAT IS GOOD TEACHING AND HOW CAN LICENSURE HELP MOVE US TOWARD MORE HIGH-QUALITY INSTRUCTION?

Deborah Loewenberg Ball
@deborah_ball

2017 Southern Regional Education Board Teacher Preparation Commission Meeting
November 16, 2017 • St. Pete Beach, Florida
I know I found all of them because first I drew all of the colors but then I ignored the won.
OUR NATION, AND OUR FUTURE

How can we educate so that people stop hating and killing one another?

Adapted from Maisha Winn, inspired by Ihab Hassan
Teaching is powerful.

We don’t leverage it well.
THE URGENCY, BY THE NUMBERS

1/3
18%, 48%
40%
11%
1.5 million
26%
9%
72,000,000
3x
31 million
17%

November 16, 2017
ENTRY-LEVEL TEACHING AS A PROBLEM OF JUSTICE AND THE FUTURE OF OUR NATION

1. More U.S. schoolchildren have a teacher with fewer than five years of experience than a teacher with any other number of years of experience.

2. Enormous difference between who U.S. teachers are and who the children are.

3. Most beginning teachers say they are underprepared for teaching, and on average they are less effective.

4. Distribution of beginning teaching is concentrated disproportionately in low-income and high-minority schools.
MY ASK OF YOU TODAY

To use your leverage as states to raise the quality of beginning teaching in our country by 2022
TWO BIG QUESTIONS YOU SHOULD ASK ME

1. What does teaching skillfully require?
2. What would we have to do to ensure that (beginning) teaching in our states was of the necessary quality?
1. WHAT DOES TEACHING SKILLFULLY REQUIRE?
TEACHING SKILLFULLY DEPENDS ON THREE CORE AREAS OF KNOWLEDGE AND SKILL

1. Knowing the content in ways that make it possible to help others learn it
2. Using fundamental high-leverage teaching practices with judgment and care
3. Understanding and *acting on* the profound ethical, political, social, and moral responsibility of teaching
Knowing Mathematics

\[
\frac{3}{1} \div \frac{1}{4} = \frac{1}{2}
\]
KNOWING MATH FOR TEACHING
WRITE A STORY OR DRAW A REPRESENTATION

\[
\frac{3}{1} \div \frac{1}{2} = \frac{4}{2} = 2
\]
I have two pizzas. My friend eats one quarter of one of the pizzas. I have one and three quarters pizzas left. Then I split it evenly between two of my other friends. Each person gets three and a half pieces of pizza.

1. What is wrong with this?
2. Write a story problem that correctly represents the division.
A CLOSE LOOK AT THE WORK OF TEACHING: ANIYAH AND TONI
What number does the orange arrow point to?

Explain how you figured it out.
TONI
What number does the orange arrow point to? \( \frac{1}{3} \)

Explain how you know: Because it's in 3 parts

MARIANA
What number does the orange arrow point to? \( \frac{1}{2} \)

Explain how you know: How I know it's zero is that there was 2 line between 0 and 1.

ASHTON
What number does the orange arrow point to? __________

Explain how you know: ___

MAKAYLA
What number does the orange arrow point to? \( \frac{1}{3} \)

Explain how you know: Can't from zero is one then make it equal and then it's equals then can't from the 1, I saw the one then 3 \( \frac{1}{3} \) maybe not. It has 3 parts. 1 2 3 and 3 equals 1.

Write a complete sentence with one goal for yourself for our math class today. Give an example of what it looks like to do this really well.
ANIYAH

What number does the orange arrow point to?

Explain how you know: Because this arrow is $\frac{1}{7}

PARKER

What number does the orange arrow point to? \[ \frac{1}{5} \]

Explain how you know: Because if you count by ones you get zero over five.

DANTE

What number does the orange arrow point to? \[ \frac{1}{2} \]

Explain how you know: Because if you look at it and count.
WHAT DO ANIYAH AND TONI KNOW AND WHAT CAN EACH DO?
VIDEO: ANIYAH AND TONI

This video and additional supporting materials are available here.
WHAT DO MANY “HEAR” IN ANIYAH AND TONI?

ANIYAH
- She has the wrong answer: 1/7

TONI
- She is playing with her hair and trying to get attention
- She is trying to embarrass Aniyah
WHAT DO ANIYAH AND TONI KNOW AND WHAT CAN EACH DO?

ANIYAH

- Uses the definition for a fraction to explain
  - She identifies the “whole”
  - She makes sure the intervals are equal
  - She counts intervals and not tick marks
  - She knows how to write “one-seventh”
- Produces a mathematically well-structured explanation
- Presents her ideas clearly

TONI

- Listens closely to a classmate’s presentation
- Uses the definition for a fraction to ask
  - How Aniyah decided on 7 parts
- Asks a pointed mathematical question
WHERE IS THE WORK OF TEACHING?

INVISIBLE WORK

- Purposefully and efficiently reads students’ work while circulating
- Selects a student to present who will push the conceptual understanding forward, and for whom this positioning will be significant
- Disrupts racist and gendered patterns by:
  - Believing that Black girls are smart; knowing Aniyah and Toni and their smartness
  - Trusting the children to think, be engaged, try to learn
  - Making choices about how to read children and what not to make an issue of

VISIBLE WORK

- Supports Aniyah to present skillfully at the board, using representations; encourages Toni to ask her on-point question
- Disrupts marginalizing patterns that focus on “error” and focuses instead on concepts and reasoning
- Expects other children to listen and to ask questions and creates structures that support children to listen to others’ ideas
- Models and names “good questions” as an important mathematical practice
- Strategically names and highlights particular children displaying specific forms of competence
WHERE IS THE WORK OF TEACHING?

INVISIBLE WORK

- Purposefully and efficiently reading students’ work while circulating
- Supporting Aniyah to present skillfully at the board, using representations; encourages Toni to ask on-point questions
- Disrupting marginalizing patterns that focus on “error” and focuses instead on concepts and reasoning
- Expecting other children to listen and to ask questions and creating structures that support children to listen to others’ ideas
- Modeling and naming “good questions” as an important mathematical practice
- Strategically naming and highlighting particular children displaying specific forms of competence
- Disrupting racist and gendered patterns by:
  - Believing that Black girls are smart; knowing Aniyah and Toni and their smartness
  - Trusting the children to think, be engaged, and try to learn
  - Making choices about how to read children and what not to make an issue of

MODELING AND EXPLAINING CONTENT

- Establishing norms and routines for classroom discourse and work
- Leading group discussions
- Eliciting and interpreting students’ thinking
- Building respectful relationships with and among students
- Specifying and reinforcing productive student behavior

WHERE IS THE WORK OF TEACHING?

INVISIBLE WORK

- Establishing norms and routines for classroom discourse and work
- Eliciting and interpreting students’ thinking
- Building respectful relationships with and among students
- Leading group discussions
- Modeling and explaining content
2. WHAT WOULD WE HAVE TO DO TO ENSURE THAT (BEGINNING) TEACHING IN OUR STATES WAS OF THE NECESSARY QUALITY?
PREDOMINANT APPROACHES TO “QUALITY TEACHING”

- Increase “selectivity” by focusing only on conventional markers of quality
- Residency and induction programs
- Teacher evaluation (concerns for ineffective teaching)
- Small, local innovations

WHAT IS NOTABLY MISSING?

- A broad strategy for recruiting, preparing, and supporting responsible beginning teachers
A FOUR-PART STRATEGY FOR STATES

1. Strengthen licensure to focus on beginning teachers’ readiness to teach responsibly
2. Expect and create incentives for teacher preparation programs to focus on practice
3. Directly influence recruitment and admissions to diversify and raise the quality of the teaching force
4. Support beginning teachers, not just evaluate them
A FOUR-PART STRATEGY FOR STATES

1. Strengthen licensure to focus on beginning teachers’ readiness to teach responsibly

2. Expect and create incentives for teacher preparation programs to focus on practice

3. Directly influence recruitment and admissions to diversify and raise the quality of the teaching force

4. Support beginning teachers, not just evaluate them
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE IN THE U.S.: K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

- **Teachers**: 82% White, 18% Of Color
- **Students**: 52% White, 48% Of Color
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE: K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

United States

Teachers:
- Of Color: 18%
- White: 82%

Students:
- Of Color: 48%
- White: 52%

Alabama

Teachers:
- Of Color: 21%
- White: 79%

Students:
- Of Color: 42%
- White: 58%
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE:
K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

United States

Teachers
- Of Color: 18%
- White: 82%

Students
- Of Color: 48%
- White: 52%

Arkansas

Teachers
- Of Color: 18%
- White: 82%

Students
- Of Color: 35%
- White: 65%

30 November 16, 2017
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE:
K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

United States

Teachers

Students

Delaware

Teachers

Students

Of Color

White

Of Color

White

31 November 16, 2017
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE: K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

United States

- Teachers: 82% White, 18% Of Color
- Students: 52% White, 48% Of Color

Florida

- Teachers: 69% White, 31% Of Color
- Students: 43% White, 57% Of Color

November 16, 2017
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE: K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

United States

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teachers</th>
<th>Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>82%</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Of Color</th>
<th>White</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18%</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Georgia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teachers</th>
<th>Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>76%</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Of Color</th>
<th>White</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>24%</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

33 November 16, 2017
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE: K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

United States

Teachers: 82% White, 18% Of Color
Students: 48% White, 52% Of Color

Kentucky

Teachers: 94% White, 6% Of Color
Students: 82% White, 18% Of Color

November 16, 2017
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE: K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

United States

Teachers: 82% White, 18% Of Color
Students: 52% White, 48% Of Color

Louisiana

Teachers: 74% White, 26% Of Color
Students: 49% White, 51% Of Color
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE: K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

United States

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Teachers</th>
<th>Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Of Color</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Maryland

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Teachers</th>
<th>Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Of Color</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE:
K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

United States

Teachers

Students

Mississippi

Teachers

Students

Of Color

White

United States

Teachers

Students

Mississippi

Teachers

Students

Of Color

White

37 November 16, 2017
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE: K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

United States

- Teachers: 82% White, 18% Of Color
- Students: 52% White, 48% Of Color

North Carolina

- Teachers: 84% White, 16% Of Color
- Students: 53% White, 47% Of Color

38 November 16, 2017
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE: K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

United States

Teachers: 82% White, 18% Of Color
Students: 52% White, 48% Of Color

Oklahoma

Teachers: 82% White, 18% Of Color
Students: 55% White, 45% Of Color

39 November 16, 2017
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE: K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

United States

- Teachers: 82% White, 18% Of Color
- Students: 52% White, 48% Of Color

South Carolina

- Teachers: 81% White, 19% Of Color
- Students: 53% White, 47% Of Color

November 16, 2017
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE:
K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

United States

Teachers
- Of Color: 18%
- White: 82%

Students
- Of Color: 52%
- White: 48%

Tennessee

Teachers
- Of Color: 9%
- White: 91%

Students
- Of Color: 33%
- White: 67%

[Diagram showing the proportion of teachers and students who are of color and white in the United States and Tennessee.]
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE: K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

United States

- Teachers: Of Color 18%, White 82%
- Students: Of Color 48%, White 52%

Texas

- Teachers: Of Color 35%, White 65%
- Students: Of Color 69%, White 31%
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE:
K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

United States

- Teachers: 82% White, 18% Of Color
- Students: 52% White, 48% Of Color

Virginia

- Teachers: 85% White, 15% Of Color
- Students: 54% White, 46% Of Color
DEMOGRAPHIC DIVIDE: K–12 TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

**United States**

- **Teachers**: 82% White, 18% Of Color
- **Students**: 52% White, 48% Of Color

**West Virginia**

- **Teachers**: 98% White, 2% Of Color
- **Students**: 92% White, 8% Of Color
WHY IS THIS GAP SUCH A CRITICAL PROBLEM?

- The profession responsible for developing the primary human capital of our society should reflect our population.
- Importance of children interacting with adults in school with whom they can identify.
- Expanding the diversity of adults with whom children interact with in school.
- The knowledge base of the profession requires the expertise and experience of people who are diverse with respect to race, socioeconomic status, ethnicity, language, gender.
REFINE ENTRY STANDARDS BASED ON PROFESSIONAL CONSIDERATIONS, AND ON PROFESSIONAL PRACTICE

CONSIDER THE RESOURCES CRUCIAL FOR LEARNING TO TEACH

- Focus on the resources, experiences, and skills that are most likely to be crucial in success in learning to teach

SPECIFY THE THRESHOLD FOR ENTRY TO THE CLASSROOM

- Focus on the essential skills, knowledge, and qualities for responsible first-year practice
A FOUR-PART STRATEGY FOR STATES

1. Strengthen licensure to focus on beginning teachers’ readiness to teach responsibly
2. Expect and create incentives for teacher preparation programs to focus on practice
3. Directly influence recruitment and admissions to diversify and raise the quality of the teaching force
4. Support beginning teachers, not just evaluate them
HIGH-LEVERAGE PRACTICES

- Leading a group discussion
- Explaining and modeling content, practices, and strategies
- Eliciting and interpreting individual students’ thinking
- Diagnosing particular common patterns of student thinking and development in a subject-matter domain
- Implementing norms and routines for classroom discourse and work
- Coordinating and adjusting instruction during a lesson
- Specifying and reinforcing productive student behavior
- Implementing organizational routines
- Setting up and managing small group work
- Building respectful relationships with students
- Talking about a student with parents or other caregivers
- Learning about students’ cultural, religious, family, intellectual, and personal experiences and resources for use in instruction
- Setting long- and short-term learning goals for students
- Designing single lessons and sequences of lessons
- Checking student understanding during and at the conclusion of lessons
- Selecting and designing formal assessments of student learning
- Interpreting the results of student work, including routine assignments, quizzes, tests, projects, and standardized assessments
- Providing oral and written feedback to students
- Analyzing instruction for the purpose of improving it
SELECT AND USE TOOLS THAT ASSESS BEGINNING TEACHERS’ PRACTICE

1. Content knowledge for teaching (not conventional academic markers)
2. Fair evidence of skill with high-leverage practices
3. Professional judgment and demonstrated commitment to equity
WHAT DO WE WANT A LICENSING EXAMINATION TO DO?

- Ensure that the candidate will perform “safely” and competently with clients
- Assure ourselves that the candidate can perform at (not just know about) the standard of entry-level practice, across the key elements of regular practice
- We can assure clients that the individual meets the professional entry-level standard of care
AN EXAMPLE FROM THE
NATIONAL OBSERVATIONAL TEACHING EXAMINATION
LEADING GROUP DISCUSSION
HLP: LEADING GROUP DISCUSSION

In a group discussion, the teacher and all of the students work on specific content together, using one another’s ideas as resources. The purposes of a discussion are to build collective knowledge and capability in relation to specific instructional goals and to allow students to practice listening, speaking, and interpreting. The teacher and a wide range of students contribute orally, listen actively, and respond to and learn from others’ contributions.
ASSESSMENT: LEADING A GROUP DISCUSSION

Grade level: First grade
Content area: Reading and language arts
Task: The candidate will facilitate a small group discussion aimed at helping students develop their ability to make and support inferences.

- Elicit thinking from all students by asking targeted questions about the main character in the book. What is she like as a person?
- Coordinate students’ ideas and steer the discussion toward the learning goal.
- Represent the content accurately, either verbally or visually, as you would do with typical first graders.
- Conclude the discussion by summarizing the key ideas covered during the discussion.

Materials: Kite Flight
Performance time: 15 minutes
The sun was shining. A breeze was blowing. It was a perfect spring day to spend in the park. Bindi pumped her legs as hard as she could. She knew that her friends were waiting!

"Why is Jack all alone?" she thought as she got her first look into the park. Bindi’s other friends waved to her to come over, but she stopped her bike and climbed off.

"What’s wrong?" Bindi asked. Jack was out of breath. "I keep running and running, but I can’t get it to fly," he said. "How about if I try?" asked Bindi.

Bindi ran as hard as she could, but that didn’t work either. "I’m just going to go home. Thanks, anyway," said Jack. "Hold on, Jack," she said. "Let’s try it together."
They both held onto the string and started to run. Jack stopped running first. “I don’t know why this won’t work,” he said. “It’s a brand new kite.”

At that moment, Bindi saw a strange sight. “I think I have an idea!” she said. “Maybe we’re just not fast enough.”

“Grab your bike!” said Bindi. Jack started riding. He pedaled faster. The kite took off!

Bindi was happy she helped Jack. She got on her bike, too. What a great day she would have with her friends!
This video of a sample performance is available [here](#).
WHAT IS BEING ASSESSED?

Specific instructional practices:
- Elicit participation from all students
- Establish and maintain norms for respectful discourse
- Orient students to one another
- Steer the discussion toward the learning goal(s)
- Represent the content with rigor and integrity
- Wrap up the discussion productively

Content knowledge for teaching
- Analyzing characters in a text
- Making inferences from text
- Justifying interpretations of text

Attending to equity
- Encouraging each student to do high-quality work
- Distributing turns for contributing to class
VIDEO: WHAT DO TEACHERS SAY ABOUT NOTE?

This video is available [here](#).
AFFORDANCES AND LIMITATIONS OF ON-DEMAND PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT

AFFORDANCES

- Requires candidates to demonstrate their skill in real time with a set of high-leverage practices that are crucial to effective beginning teaching.
- Results reflect “average” performance—not examples chosen for their exemplary nature.
- Fair and equitable

LIMITATIONS

- Not carried out in live settings
- Controls for some specific focal aspects of teaching
- May not assess for context where going to teach
A FOUR-PART STRATEGY FOR STATES

1. Strengthen licensure to focus on beginning teachers’ readiness to teach responsibly
2. Expect and create incentives for teacher preparation programs to focus on practice
3. Directly influence recruitment and admissions to diversify and raise the quality of the teaching force
4. Support beginning teachers, not just evaluate them
MY ASK OF YOU TODAY

To use your leverage as states to raise the quality of beginning teaching in our country by 2022
THANK YOU!

dball@umich.edu

Slides will be available on my website https://deborahloewenbergball.com/
(“Google” Deborah Ball)
Data on slides 28–44:

Image on slide 48:
“Haircut” by Flickr user JasonUnbound
Licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 2.0 Generic License
https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/2.0/

Image on slide 48:
“AOC Pipefitters” by Architect of the Capitol
Used without restriction as a work of the U.S. Government
https://www.usa.gov/government-works
CREDITS

Image on slide 48:
“Best Shoes for Nurses” by Flickr user Esther Max
Licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 2.0 Generic License
https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/2.0/

Image on slide 48:
“almost forbidden territory....” by Flickr user Esthr
Licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 2.0 Generic License
https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/2.0/

Image on slide 48:
“Marielle Carving Francinaldo's Ear” by Flickr user ReSurge International
Licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs 2.0 Generic License
https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/2.0/