JUST DREAMS AND IMPERATIVES:
The Power of Teaching in the Struggle for Public Education

Deborah Loewenberg Ball
@deborah_ball #AERA18 #AERAPres

Presidential Address • 2018 American Educational Research Association Annual Meeting
Sunday, April 15, 2018 • New York
THANK YOU: PROGRAM CHAIRS

Carla O’Connor
University of Michigan School of Education
Professor
Arthur F. Thurnau Professor

Suzanne Wilson
University of Connecticut Neag School of Education
Neag Endowed Professor of Teacher Education
Department Head, Curriculum and Instruction
THANK YOU: COLLEAGUES & STUDENTS

Colleagues
- Chandra Alston
- Hyman Bass
- Alyssa Brandon
- Maisie Gholson
- Imani Goffney
- Mark Hoover
- Carla O’Connor
- Kara Suzuki
- Kathryn Taylor
- Kyana Taylor
- Camille Wilson
- Suzanne Wilson

Students
- Karen Ahn
- Annie Blais
- Rosalie DeFino
- Kolby Gadd
- Rebecca Gadd
- Susanna Farmer
- Lauren Hickman
- Lindsey Mann
- Blake Noel
- Darrius Robinson
- Sabrina Salazar
- William Waychunas
- Charles Wilkes
- Amber Willis
THE POWER OF TEACHING IN THE STRUGGLE FOR PUBLIC EDUCATION
VIDEO: IS THERE A TEACHER WHO HAD A SIGNIFICANT IMPACT ON YOU?
TEACHING EFFECTS

COMPOUND EFFECTS

- Teacher sequence can affect student achievement by up to 50 percentile points after only three years.
- Low achieving students have the most to gain from an effective teacher.
- The top quintile of teachers facilitate appropriate to excellent gains for students of all achievement levels.

Sanders & Rivers (1996)

VARIATION IN TEACHER QUALITY

- The most important in-school factor affecting student learning is the teacher.
- There is wide variation in effectiveness among teachers.

Wright, Horn, & Sanders (1997)

LONG-TERM IMPACT

- Children who do not read proficiently by the end of third grade are four times more likely to drop out.
- Workers with a bachelor’s degree or more earned almost twice as much as workers with only a high school diploma.

Fiester (2013)

DISCIPLINE

- Latinx, Black, and Native/Indigenous students are punished more often and more harshly than other groups.
- Black girls are disproportionately subjected to exclusionary discipline practices.
- Students with disabilities are punished more often and more harshly than other groups.
- Discipline disparities for Black students, boys, and students with disabilities are observed as early as pre-K.

Gregory, Skiba, & Noguera (2010)
Skiba, Horner, Chung, Rausch, May, & Tobin (2011)
Blake, Butler, Lewis, & Daresbourg (2011)
Morris (2016)
Noltemeyer & McLoughlin (2010)

8
“Education as the practice of freedom … denies that man is abstract, isolated, independent, and unattached to the world.”

(Freire, p. 81)
Cohen, Raudenbush, & Ball (2003)
Teaching is constrained by policies, curriculum, testing regimes. . .

Lipsky (1980), Shulman (1983)
Teaching is constrained by policies, curriculum, testing regimes. . .

Lipsky (1980), Shulman (1983)

Teaching is highly idiosyncratic and individual.
THE PARADOX OF CONSTRAINT AND DISCRETION IN TEACHING

CONSTRAINTS CAN:

- Support efforts to disrupt inequity.
- Restrict teachers’ professional freedom through standardization.
- Reproduce racism and other forms of oppression.
- Impede efforts to make schools responsive, contextual, culturally relevant.

DISCRETION CAN:

- Make possible teachers’ efforts to teach in contextually sensitive and culturally responsive ways.
- Enable teachers to connect school to the world.
- Enable racism and other forms of oppression to flow into schools and schools.

(e.g., Aguirre, Celédon-Pattichis, Civil, Dewey, Gutiérrez, Ladson-Bilings, Paris, Walker, Winn)
Teacher: Who would like to try to explain what you think the answer is? And show us your reasoning by coming up to the board?

Other children: Playing with hair

Teacher: When someone's presenting at the board, what should you be doing?

Other children: Laying on arms

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?

Teacher: You're trying to mark what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.

Aniyah: You want me to write it?
TEACHING IS DENSE WITH “DISCRETIONARY SPACES”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speaker</th>
<th>Talk</th>
<th>Discretionary space</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>“Okay, Anya?”</td>
<td>1. Deciding when to open/show group discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Playing with hair</td>
<td>2. Deciding what to do in large discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Laying on arms</td>
<td>3. Framing the expectation for presenters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“When someone’s presenting at the board, what should you be doing?”</td>
<td>4. Framing what it means to ‘come to the board’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students &amp; others</td>
<td>“Looking at them.”</td>
<td>5. Listening to a student to principle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>“Looking at that person.”</td>
<td>6. Deciding whether to comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“Uh huh.”</td>
<td>7. Deciding whether to comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anya</td>
<td>You wanna me write it?</td>
<td>8. Setting norms for what to do when a student is presenting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>“You’re trying to make what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.”</td>
<td>9. Clarifying task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>“Listen closely and see what you think about her reasoning and her answer.” (Anya writes 17 by the orange line.)</td>
<td>10. Setting task for the other students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anya</td>
<td>“I just one-seventh because there’s.”</td>
<td>11. Responding to students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tony</td>
<td>“I see one one-seventh.”</td>
<td>12. Responding to students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Talks to Ted). Yeah. (continues to chop) Because there’s seven equal parts, the one, two, three, four, five, six, and then seven. (Uses her fingers to count the parts on the number line.)</td>
<td>13. Responding to students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>“Before you agree or disagree, I want you to ask questions if you think you don’t understand what someone did. No agreeing and disagreeing. You. All you can do right now is ask Anya questions. What does a question for?”</td>
<td>14. Setting task for responding to student explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>“Okay. Tony, what’s your question for her?”</td>
<td>15. Listening to a student to principle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tony</td>
<td>You did not.</td>
<td>16. Responding to student raising hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Why did you pick one-seventh? (Physically points to another student who says something to Tony.)</td>
<td>17. Responding to student raising hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>“Ok, Tony. In my turn.”</td>
<td>18. Responding to student raising hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tony</td>
<td>You did not.</td>
<td>19. Responding to student raising hand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>“Let’s listen to her answer now. That was a very good question.”</td>
<td>20. Responding to student</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/
© 2018 Deborah Loewenstern Tall • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48106 • dball@umich.edu
WHAT REGULARLY FILLS THE DISCRETIONARY SPACES IN TEACHING?
WHAT REGULARLY FILLS THE DISCRETIONARY SPACES IN TEACHING?

1. Teachers’ experiences in a society filled with racism and oppression.

Lortie (1975), Banks, Grant and Koskela, Moll
WHAT REGULARLY FILLS THE DISCRETIONARY SPACES IN TEACHING?

1. Teachers’ experiences in a society filled with racism and oppression.
2. Normalized practices in schools that institutionalize dominant values and habits.

Lortie (1975), Banks, Grant and Koskela, Moll
Anyon (1981), Heath, Martin, Tuck
WHAT REGULARLY FILLS THE DISCRETIONARY SPACES IN TEACHING?

1. Teachers’ experiences in a society filled with racism and oppression.
2. Normalized practices in schools that institutionalize dominant values and habits.

Professional education and teaching experience often teach these.

Professional education does not effectively intervene on these.

Lortie (1975), Banks, Grant and Koskela, Moll
Anyon (1981), Heath, Martin, Tuck
“Ever since the birth of our nation, white America has had a schizophrenic personality on the question of race. She has been torn between selves—a self in which she proudly professed the great principles of democracy and a self in which she sadly practiced the antithesis of democracy. This tragic duality has produced a strange indecisiveness and ambivalence toward the Negro, causing America to take a step back simultaneously with every step forward on the question of justice.”

Where Do We Go From Here (1967)
JUST DREAMS
How do macro-structures play out in the micro-moments of Black and Brown children’s experiences in classrooms?

Gholson & Wilkes, 2016
What number does the orange arrow point to? Explain how you figured it out.
LAKEYA

What number does the orange arrow point to? \( \frac{1}{2} \)

Explain how you know: because there were equal parts and you are pointing to the second one so it is \( \frac{1}{2} \).

JAMARI

What number does the orange arrow point to? \( \frac{2}{3} \)

Explain how you know: first I thought it was \( \frac{5}{6} \) because the zero messes me up.

LARRY

What number does the orange arrow point to? \( \frac{4}{5} \)

Explain how you know: by \( \frac{1}{5} \) and keep going by \( \frac{1}{4} \) till you got a whole.

Write a complete sentence with one goal for yourself for our math class today. Give an example of what it looks like to do this really well.

Learn more about the number line.
ANIYAH AND TONI
This video and additional supporting materials are available online [here](https://example.com).
**DISCRETIONARY SPACES IN JUST THESE FEW SECONDS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speaker</th>
<th>Talk</th>
<th>Discretionary space</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Who would like to try explaining what you think the answer is? Just show us your reasoning by coming up to the board. Who would like to come up to the board and try to tell And you know, it might not be right. That's okay because we're learning something now. I'd like someone to come up and not be the teacher and explain how you are thinking about it. Who'd like to try this morning?</td>
<td>1. Negotiating when to open up the floor 2. Giving space to launch discussion 3. Framing the expectation for preserving space 4. Framing of what it 'opening the floor' entails</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toni</td>
<td>Okay, Aniya?</td>
<td>5. Selecting a student to present</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other children</td>
<td>Playing with her</td>
<td>6. Deciding whether to comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Laying on arms</td>
<td>7. Deciding whether to comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>When someone's presenting at the board, what should you do now?</td>
<td>8. Setting norms for what to do when a student is presenting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student</td>
<td>Looking at them.</td>
<td>9. Responding to student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Looking at that person.</td>
<td>10. Tapping up an individual student member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Uh huh.</td>
<td>11. Clarifying task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aniya</td>
<td>You want me to write it?</td>
<td>12. Setting task for the other students and teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aniya</td>
<td>Teacher is trying to hash what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.</td>
<td>13. Responding to student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Listen closely and see what you think about her reasoning. If not sure, just write it down.</td>
<td>14. Setting task for responding to student explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aniya</td>
<td>Did she say one-twelfth? Because there's</td>
<td>15. Responding to student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toni</td>
<td>(Turns to Toni) Yeah, (continues to clack) Because there's seven equal parts, like one, two, three, four, five, six, and then seven. Listen to her clack to count the parts as she counts on the board.</td>
<td>16. Setting task for responding to student explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Before you agree or disagree, I want you to ask questions if there's something you don't understand about what she did. No agreeing and disagreeing just until you can ask right now is it clear? and questions. There's a question for her?</td>
<td>17. Setting task for responding to student explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aniya</td>
<td>Okay, Toni, what's your question for her?</td>
<td>18. Tapping up an individual student member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toni</td>
<td>You did it.</td>
<td>19. Responding to student speaking across norm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Why did (thought of another student who asks something to her across the room)</td>
<td>20. Setting task for responding to student explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Go ahead, it's your turn.</td>
<td>21. Setting task for responding to student explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toni</td>
<td>Why did you pick one-twelfth?</td>
<td>22. Setting task for responding to student explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>You did it.</td>
<td>23. Setting task for responding to student explanation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Let's listen to her answer now. That was a very good question.</td>
<td>24. Setting task for responding to student explanation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DISCRETIONARY SPACES IN JUST THESE FEW SECONDS

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

© 2018 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu
DISCRETIONARY SPACES IN JUST THESE FEW SECONDS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speaker</th>
<th>Talk</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Who would like to try and explain what you think the answer is? Do you have an idea of your reasoning by coming up to the board and writing down what you think the answer is? Who'd like to come up to the board and try to tell And you know, it might not be right. That's okay because we're learning something new. I'd like someone to come up and sort of be the teacher and explain how you are thinking about it. Who'd like to try that this morning?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Okay, Angie.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toni</td>
<td>Playing with her.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other children</td>
<td>Laying on arms.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>When someone's presenting at the board, what should you do when someone's presenting?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student in class</td>
<td>Looking at them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Looking at that person.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Uh huh.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angie</td>
<td>You want me to write it?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>You're trying to teach what you think this number is and explain how you figured it out.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Listen closely and see what you think about her reasoning and her answer. (Angie writes it)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angie</td>
<td>You have to do this because there's</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toni</td>
<td>Did she say one-seventh?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angie</td>
<td>(D’une to Toni) Yeah, (continues to class) because there's one equal part, two, three, four, five, six, and then seven. Use her fingers to count the parts on the board.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Before you agree or disagree, I want you to ask questions if there's something you don't understand about what she did. No agreeing and disagreeing, just. All you can do right now is ask Angie questions. Who has a question for her?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Okay, Toni, what's your question for her?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toni</td>
<td>You did not.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Why did one another student who says something to her across the room?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Why did you pick one-seventh?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Go ahead, it's your turn.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toni</td>
<td>You did not.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Teacher | Let's listen to her answer now. That was a very good question.
VIDEO: RE-VIEW AND RE-LISTEN TO THESE DISCRETIONARY SPACES

This video and additional supporting materials are available online here.
Toni is asking a question of Aniyah.
Toni is laughing and playing with her hair.
Toni and Aniyah are Black girls, who are positioned with different statuses in the classroom, have different physical embodiments, and perform their meanings and understandings of their Black-girlness in different ways.

What to do next?
WHAT TO DO NEXT IN DISCRETIONARY SPACE #19?

1. “Toni, when you’re ready to participate appropriately by not playing with your hair and laughing, and have a question to ask, I will come back to you.”

2. “You need to be a better listener, Toni. Aniyah already explained why she picked one-seventh. Who else has a real question for Aniyah?”

3. “What do others think?”
POSSIBLE NEXT MOVES

1. “Toni, when you’re ready to participate appropriately by not playing with your hair and laughing, and have a question to ask, I will come back to you.”

2. “You need to be a better listener, Toni. Aniyah already explained why she picked one-seventh. Who else has a real question for Aniyah?”

3. “What do others think?”

POSSIBLE RESULTS

1. Toni is publicly excluded from the discussion.

2. Toni is judged to not be listening, her question is judged as not good, and she is excluded from the discussion.

3. Toni is excluded and her mathematical point is sidelined.
WHAT DO THESE THREE DIFFERENT TEACHING MOVES DO TO TONI?

- Her contributions to the class are not positioned as appropriate or valuable.
- Her participation and mathematical attentiveness are made invisible.
- She is seen as being a distraction, mocking Aniyah, and as playing with her hair.
- These combine to eclipse her humanity.
LOOKING AT THE MICRO THROUGH THE MACRO: BLACK GIRLS’ RATES OF SUSPENSION

Epstein, Blake, & González (2017)
BLACK GIRLS MORE LIKELY TO BE DISCIPLINED FOR SUBJECTIVE INFRACTIONS

2X
For minor violations (dress code violations, inappropriate cell phone use, loitering)

2.5X
For disobedience

3X
For disruptive behavior

3X
For bullying/harassment

Epstein, Blake, & González (2017)
WHAT WOULD IT TAKE TO DISRUPT THE PATTERNS THROUGH WHICH A BLACK GIRL IS MARGINALIZED?

- Seeing Toni’s question as key to the class’s work
- Taking as axiomatic the brilliance of Black children, and thus Toni and Aniyah

WHAT WOULD IT TAKE TO DISRUPT THE PATTERNS THROUGH WHICH A BLACK GIRL IS MARGINALIZED?

- Seeing Toni’s question as key to the class’s work
- Taking as axiomatic the brilliance of Black children, and thus Toni and Aniyah

TONI AND HER CONTRIBUTIONS

- Listens closely to a classmate’s presentation
- Uses norm of not beginning with agreeing/disagreeing
- Uses the definition for a fraction to ask how Aniyah decided on 7 parts
- Asks a mathematical question that is crucial for the collective work
WHAT WOULD IT TAKE TO DISRUPT THE PATTERNS THROUGH WHICH A BLACK GIRL IS MARGINALIZED?

- Seeing Toni’s question as key to the class’s work
- Taking as axiomatic the brilliance of Black children, and thus Toni and Aniyah
- . . . AND having something different to DO

(Gholson & Martin, 2014; Martin, 2012, 2015; Leonard & Martin, 2013)
VIDEO: TONI’S QUESTION

This video and additional supporting materials are available online here.
COUNTERING THE PATTERN

Acknowledge publicly the importance of Toni’s question.

POSSIBLE RESULT

Toni is trusted, seen, and recognized for her contribution to the mathematical work:

- The mathematical precision of her question
- Asking Aniyah a question instead of disagreeing.
ANIYAH

- Identified the “whole” as 0 to 1 on the number line

TONI

- Modeled at the board a complete explanation of how to understand and identify a fraction on the line

THE OTHER CHILDREN

- Developed a depth of understanding of fractions as numbers on the line and how to explain them
- Saw Black girls’ brilliance
We are now faced with the fact that tomorrow is today. We are confronted with the fierce urgency of now. In this unfolding conundrum of life and history there is such a thing as being too late.

Now let us begin. Now let us rededicate ourselves to the long and bitter—but beautiful—struggle for a new world.

April 4, 1967
JUST IMPERATIVES
THE PROJECT OF FORMING A PROFESSION TO WORK WITH DISCRETION FOR JUSTICE

1. Making the teaching profession diverse
2. Building professional education for the just and skillful exercise of discretion
MAKING THE TEACHING PROFESSION DIVERSE

1. The profession responsible for developing the human beings of our society should reflect our population
2. Black and Brown children must encounter and work with adults in school with whom they can identify
3. White children also must encounter and work with Black and Brown teachers
4. The knowledge base of the profession requires the expertise and experience of people who are diverse with respect to race, socioeconomic status, ethnicity, language, gender
BUILDING PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION FOR THE JUST AND SKILLFUL EXERCISE OF DISCRETION

1. Educating the whole self
2. Helping to see, hear, name, and critique normalized practice
3. Developing professional orientations founded on ethics and care related to the project of disrupting racism and oppression
4. Developing a repertoire of practices and ways of practicing that counter normalized practice
VIDEO: BRANDON
“Each of us, from his or her own specialty and vantage point, has a distinctive part to play. We have the power, here in our own space of appearance. And our power will be significant if we speak with one another in our own authentic voices and disclose reality as we do so, if we act so as to establish what holds us together anew. We have the power because we are together in speech and action and because possibility spreads before us and because there are boundaries to break through.”

THANK YOU!

dball@umich.edu

Slides will be available on my website
https://deborahloewenbergball.com/
(“Google” Deborah Ball)
CREDITS

Image on slide 7:
No known restrictions

Image on slides 10 and 60:
No known restrictions

Image on slides 10, 27, and 51:
Public domain, no known restrictions
CREDITS

Image on slides 10 and 11:
Licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 3.0 Unported license https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/3.0/deed.en

Image on slide 11:
“Paulo Freire: Pedagogy of the Oppressed” by Flickr user AJC1
Licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 2.0 Generic License https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/2.0/

Graphic on slide 12:

CREDITS

Image on slide 29:
“microscope-research-laboratory-3101403” by Pixabay user AdrianoKF
Licensed under a Creative Commons Public Domain Dedication
https://creativecommons.org/publicdomain/zero/1.0/deed.en

Data on slides 42 and 43:

Image on slides 57 and 58:
“Teacher of the Year - Cristina Torres” by Flickr user K.W. Barrett
Licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 2.0 Generic License
https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/2.0/