(HOW) CAN MATHEMATICS TEACHING AND
TEACHER EDUCATION CONTRIBUTE TO
DISRUPTING RACISM AND OPPRESSION?

Deborah Loewenberg Ball

Michigan Association of Mathematics Teacher Educators
Conversations among Colleagues 2020 Virtual Conference
March 21, 2020
SHARING WORDS FROM NA’ILAH NASIR AND MEGAN BANG AT THE SPENCER FOUNDATION

Our hearts are breaking as we witness the fall-out from the effects of the pandemic on our communities. We are holding so much in our hearts and minds.
We are holding the worry of those who are sick and the sorrow of those who have already lost a loved one to this virus both here and abroad.

We are holding undergraduate students who have had to move abruptly from their living spaces, and who may be housing or food insecure.

We are holding graduate students whose dissertation studies may be irreparably altered, and who are anxious about what this means for their job-seeking process and their futures.

We are holding faculty members and staff at universities across the country who are learning to teach and serve students online, while caring for young children and/or elderly parents and needing to attend to their own health and well-being.

From Na’ilah Nasir and Megan Bang, Spencer Foundation
- We are holding parents and caregivers at home with their kids, managing the tension between supporting their children’s learning and just wanting to make sure they feel safe and loved in an unprecedented time.
- We are holding all of the teachers and school administrators and education leaders who are trying to figure out how to support children and families, and how to do so equitably.
- We are holding the junior faculty whose work and careers have been disrupted, in ways that may have reverberating effects for years to come.
- We are holding the scholars and students with disabilities who have been told for years that virtual participation was too cumbersome or not possible, and who are watching the world participate in work and school virtually over a very short span of time.

From Na’ilah Nasir and Megan Bang, Spencer Foundation
AND—

- We are holding the gravity of the reality that in this moment of collective trauma and crisis, the negative effects are experienced much more drastically by those who are already vulnerable in our society—those in poverty, immigrants, the undocumented, people of color, those with disabilities, those in foster care or without safe and loving family structures. This crisis is exposing the extreme fissures in our society and the deep and abiding obligation we have to put things right.

From Na’ilah Nasir and Megan Bang, Spencer Foundation
BUT ALSO—

More drastic change to education systems has occurred in the last week than it has in arguably the last 50 years. What possibilities does this open up for the future of learning, for the reorganization of our institutions, for the centrality of families and family life?

From Na’ilah Nasir and Megan Bang, Spencer Foundation
BUT ALSO—

More drastic change to education systems has occurred in the last week than it has in arguably the last 50 years. What possibilities does this open up for the future of learning, for the reorganization of our institutions, for the centrality of families and family life?

What if we recognized this moment as also a possibility to reconfigure life towards the world we want? What kinds of new questions would we ask, what kinds of reimagining might we do together?

From Na’ilah Nasir and Megan Bang, Spencer Foundation
WHAT IS OUR OPPORTUNITY IN MATHEMATICS TEACHING AND TEACHER EDUCATION?
LOOKING BACK TO 2000: WHAT PROGRESS HAVE WE MADE?

- Articulated mathematical practices as fundamentally intertwined with mathematical content
- Organized as a community to catalyze change (John Staley’s inspiring talk this morning)
- Developed many structures and practices to support mathematics teachers (many sessions across the day)
- Common progress on understanding the “mathematical knowing” demands of mathematics teaching

What are some other big areas of progress?
LOOKING AHEAD TO 2030: WHERE DO WE NEED TO MAKE PROGRESS?

We need to confront the perpetuation of marginalization and oppression in mathematics classrooms.
EXAMPLE #1: BLACK GIRLS’ RATES OF SUSPENSION

Epstein, Blake, & González (2017)
EXAMPLE #2: DISPROPORTIONALITY IN ASSIGNMENT TO “ABILITY STATUS”

- Black students: 16.7% of student population; 9.8% of those selected to gifted programs
- Latinx students 22.3% of student population; 15.4% of those selected to gifted programs
- 6.2% of all students are assigned to gifted programs; 10% of Asian students, 7.5% of White; 3.6% of Latinx; 3% of Black
- Black students are 2x as likely to be classified as having learning or emotional problems (special ed)
- Exclusion from class reduces opportunity to learn
- Exclusion from rigorous content; long-term effects of labeling
- Lack of access to accelerated and enrichment programs

1. Teacher’s race affects gifted program selections, Joan Brasher, Research News @ Vanderbilt, January 18, 2016
Many taken-for-granted practices in mathematics classrooms reflect and reproduce patterns of marginalization and oppression.

What are some of these common practices?
"A third of my class was bored and ready to move on, a third was close to understanding but not quite there, and another third was so far behind that continuing to try might have seemed like a fool’s errand."
But even our efforts to make change are still high-risk for reproducing patterns of racism and marginalization.
WHAT ARE SOME OF THESE POPULAR EFFORTS THAT COULD STILL REPRODUCE RACISM AND OPPRESSION?

ADVOCATED “REFORM” PRACTICES

- Small group work
- Situating word problems in contexts
- Revoicing students’ ideas
- Group discussions
- Going to the board to show one’s ideas
- Constructing mathematical arguments
- Discourse norms

POTENTIAL RISKS

- Can foreground status and power dynamics (Langer-Osuna)
- Can reinforce racial and gendered narratives (Nasir, Shah)
- Can reduce or remove students’ own voices
- Can reinforce narrow views of what it means to be good at math
- Can reinforce competitive individual orientations
- Can reinforce competitive individual orientations
- Can reinforce white dominant values and norms

March 21, 2020
Let’s look at one of these:
Going to the board to show one’s ideas.
GOING TO THE BOARD TO SHOW ONE’S IDEAS

Why do we do this?

March 21, 2020
GOING TO THE BOARD TO SHOW ONE’S IDEAS

COMMON PURPOSES

- To show that there are different ways to solve math problems and sometimes also different solutions
- To provide opportunities for children to practice talking and explaining their ideas

Why do we do this?
What number does the orange arrow point to?
Explain how you figured it out.
ANIYAH AND TONI

ANIYAH

TONI

March 21, 2020
VIDEO: ANIYAH AND TONI

This video and additional supporting materials are available online [here](#).
WHAT ARE LIKELY COMMON RESPONSES TO ANIYAH?

- “Nice job, Aniyah. Can someone help Aniyah out and show what the whole is on the number line?”

- “Thumbs up if you agree with Aniyah; thumbs down if you disagree.”
WHAT ARE LIKELY COMMON RESPONSES TO ANIYAH?

- “Nice job, Aniyah. Can someone help Aniyah out and show what the whole is on the number line?”

- “Thumbs up if you agree with Aniyah; thumbs down if you disagree.”

WHAT IS THE IMPACT?

- Aniyah is positioned as not smart.
- Aniyah’s mathematical points are sidelined.
- The mathematical work of the class is not supported.
- The class sees a Black girl positioned as a “struggling” learner.
WHAT ARE LIKELY COMMON RESPONSES TO TONI?

- “Toni, when you’re ready to participate appropriately by not playing with your hair and laughing, and have a question to ask, I will come back to you.”
- “You need to be a better listener, Toni. Aniyah already explained why she picked one-seventh. Who else has a real question for Aniyah?”
- “We show others respect in this classroom, Toni.”
WHAT ARE LIKELY COMMON RESPONSES TO TONI?

- “Toni, when you’re ready to participate appropriately by not playing with your hair and laughing, and have a question to ask, I will come back to you.”
- “You need to be a better listener, Toni. Aniyah already explained why she picked one-seventh. Who else has a real question for Aniyah?”
- “We show others respect in this classroom, Toni.”

WHAT IS THE IMPACT?

- Toni is positioned as not paying attention and off-task.
- Toni’s mathematical contributions are excluded.
- The mathematical work of the class is slowed.
- The class sees a Black girl positioned as a “troublemaker” and not contributing.
WHAT DOES IT MEAN TO SAY—

...that our efforts to make change might still be high-risk for reproducing patterns of racism and marginalization?
Many taken-for-granted teaching practices insidiously reproduce patterns of racism, sexism, and ableism.

- Many of these we have inherited or absorbed from our deep immersion in schools as children and as educators.
- We often have not had opportunities to stand back and consider their effects.
- Some of these we have deliberately learned as part of “mathematics reform” or professional development.
Why does this happen?
This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0
International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/
© 2020 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speaker</th>
<th>Talk</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Why would like try to explain what you think the answer is? And think on your reasoning by coming up to this board. The idea is that we come up in the board and try to talk. And you know, it might not be right. That's okay because we're learning something new. I'll like someone to come up and sort of be the teacher and explain how you are coming up to this idea. Who'd like to try the first thinking?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ideon</td>
<td>Okay, Aiden?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student A</td>
<td>Playing with hair</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other students</td>
<td>Looking at other students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>When someone is presenting an idea, what should you be doing?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student B</td>
<td>Talking to the student and asking them to present.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student C</td>
<td>Student B is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student D</td>
<td>Student D is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student E</td>
<td>Student E is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student F</td>
<td>Student F is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student G</td>
<td>Student G is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student H</td>
<td>Student H is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student I</td>
<td>Student I is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student J</td>
<td>Student J is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student K</td>
<td>Student K is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student L</td>
<td>Student L is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student M</td>
<td>Student M is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student N</td>
<td>Student N is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student O</td>
<td>Student O is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student P</td>
<td>Student P is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Q</td>
<td>Student Q is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student R</td>
<td>Student R is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student S</td>
<td>Student S is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student T</td>
<td>Student T is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student U</td>
<td>Student U is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student V</td>
<td>Student V is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student W</td>
<td>Student W is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student X</td>
<td>Student X is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Y</td>
<td>Student Y is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Z</td>
<td>Student Z is making it clear what purpose they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Diagram:**
- **students** connected by lines to **environments**.
- **teachers** connected by lines to **students**.
- **stuff** connected by lines to **environments**.

**Notice:**
- 20 in 1:28

---

**Footer:**
- March 21, 2020
- This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/
- © 2020 Deborah Loewenberg Ball • School of Education • University of Michigan • Ann Arbor, MI 48109 • dball@umich.edu
Who would like to try to explain what you think the answer is? And show us your reasoning by coming up to the board?

Laying on arms

20 in 1:28

You did not!
TEACHING IS DENSE WITH “DISCRETIONARY SPACES”
WHAT REGULARLY FILLS THE DISCRETIONARY SPACES IN TEACHING?

1. Teachers’ experiences in a society filled with racism and oppression.
2. Normalized practices in schools that institutionalize dominant values and habits.

Lortie (1975), Banks, Grant and Koskela, Moll
Anyon (1981), Heath, Martin, Tuck
Ball (2018)
WHAT REGULARLY FILLS THE DISCRETIONARY SPACES IN TEACHING?

1. Teachers’ experiences in a society filled with racism and oppression.
2. Normalized practices in schools that institutionalize dominant values and habits.

Professional education does not effectively intervene on these.

Lortie (1975), Banks, Grant and Koskela, Moll Anyon (1981), Heath, Martin, Tuck Ball (2018)
WHAT WOULD IT TAKE TO DISRUPT THE PATTERNS THROUGH WHICH BLACK GIRLS ARE MARGINALIZED?


March 21, 2020
WHAT WOULD IT TAKE TO DISRUPT THE PATTERNS THROUGH WHICH BLACK GIRLS ARE MARGINALIZED?

- Seeing Aniyah’s explanation and Toni’s question as key to the class’s work

WHAT WOULD IT TAKE TO DISRUPT THE PATTERNS THROUGH WHICH BLACK GIRLS ARE MARGINALIZED?

- Seeing Aniyah’s explanation and Toni’s question as key to the class’s work

WHAT WOULD IT TAKE TO DISRUPT THE PATTERNS THROUGH WHICH BLACK GIRLS ARE MARGINALIZED?

- Seeing Aniyah’s explanation and Toni’s question as key to the class’s work

- Taking as axiomatic the brilliance of Black children, and thus Toni and Aniyah

WHAT WOULD IT TAKE TO DISRUPT THE PATTERNS THROUGH WHICH BLACK GIRLS ARE MARGINALIZED?

- Seeing Aniyah’s explanation and Toni’s question as key to the class’s work

- Taking as axiomatic the brilliance of Black children, and thus Toni and Aniyah


Knowing and using mathematics in teaching (MKT)

Interpreting Toni as asking a mathematical question that she means

March 21, 2020
WHAT WOULD IT TAKE TO DISRUPT THE PATTERNS THROUGH WHICH BLACK GIRLS ARE MARGINALIZED?

- Seeing Aniyah’s explanation and Toni’s question as key to the class’s work
- Taking as axiomatic the brilliance of Black children, and thus Toni and Aniyah
- . . . And having something different to do

(Knowing and using mathematics in teaching (MKT))

(Interpreting Toni as asking a mathematical question that she means)


March 21, 2020
VIDEO: ANIYAH AND TONI

This video and additional supporting materials are available online here.
USING DISCRETION TO DELIBERATELY DISRUPT THE PATTERNS THROUGH WHICH BLACK GIRLS ARE MARGINALIZED

COUNTERING THE PATTERN

- Acknowledge publicly the importance of Toni’s question.

WHAT IS THE IMPACT?

- Toni is trusted, seen, and recognized for her contribution to the mathematical work:
  - The mathematical precision of her question
  - Asking Aniyah a question instead of disagreeing.
ANIYAH
- Identified the “whole” as 0 to 1 on the number line

TONI
- Modeled at the board a complete explanation of how to understand and identify a fraction on the line

THE OTHER CHILDREN
- Developed a depth of understanding of fractions as numbers on the line and how to explain them
- Saw Black girls’ brilliance
TEACHING IS POWERFUL

Teaching either reinforces/reproduces or it can avert and disrupt patterns.
TEACHING IS POWERFUL

Teaching either reinforces/reproduces or it can avert and disrupt patterns.

1. AWARENESS OF PATTERNS
   - Becoming critically conscious of common patterns of thinking about “ability”
   - Understanding one’s own identity and how that shapes one’s assumptions and interpretations
   - Understanding that these patterns are historical and embedded in our institutions and systems

2. AVERTING/DISRUPTING PATTERNS
   - Consciously NOT following or reproducing the patterns
   - Developing specific new habits and practices that counter the patterns
   - Strengthening your own mathematical knowledge for teaching
WHAT IS THE IMPERATIVE AND THE CHALLENGE FOR MATHEMATICS TEACHER EDUCATION AND PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT?
CONTINUITY AND DISCONTINUITY IN MAKING CHANGE

BUILD ON PROGRESS

- Intertwine mathematical practices with mathematical content
- Organize as a community to catalyze change (John Staley)
- Use and develop new structures and practices to support mathematics teachers
- Continue to emphasize the necessity of knowing and using mathematics in teaching

BUT CONFRONT AND DISRUPT THE PERSISTENCE OF RACISM AND OPPRESSION

- Become critically conscious of patterns even in “reform” practices
- Understand how our own identities shape our assumptions and interpretations
- Understand that these patterns are historical and embedded in our institutions and systems

March 21, 2020
CENTERING THE INTERCONNECTEDNESS OF PRACTICE

- Developing mathematics and practice
- Advancing justice through curriculum, explicit attention to relationships, identities, and place
- Noticing and using discretionary spaces
  - Learning to connect macro and micro, systems and individuals
  - Changing habits, learning moves that counter patterns, developing repertoires of alternatives (Noel, 2018)
GOING TO THE BOARD TO SHOW ONE’S IDEAS

Why do we do this?
GOING TO THE BOARD TO SHOW ONE’S IDEAS

COMMON PURPOSES

- To show that there are different ways to solve math problems and sometimes also different solutions
- To provide opportunities for children to practice talking and explaining their ideas

Why do we do this?

March 21, 2020
GOING TO THE BOARD TO SHOW ONE’S IDEAS

COMMON PURPOSES

- To show that there are different ways to solve math problems and sometimes also different solutions
- To provide opportunities for children to practice talking and explaining their ideas

CRITICAL PURPOSES

- To represent mathematics as collective work by building mathematical ideas and solutions together
- To disrupt patterns of who and what is seen as competent

Why do we do this?
BROADENING OUR REPERTOIRES OF PRACTICE FOR STUDENTS TO SHOW THEIR IDEAS AT THE BOARD

- Considering whom to ask to show their work and the sequencing of who goes to the board
  - Positioning students
  - The trajectory of the math
- Developing a broad array of moves to distribute turns (e.g., purposeful selection, pairs)
- Broadening the array of contributions that can be shown at the board (e.g., an approach that didn’t work, a method that a student is trying)
- Extending the questions we ask to prompt students to come to the board (e.g., Who has an idea that they are still developing? Who has something that didn’t work? What would not be a solution to this problem?)
- Developing individual and affirming relationships with each student
- Building a classroom culture that values and supports collective work and that welcomes each person’s contributions
GOING TO THE BOARD TO SHARE ONE’S IDEAS

Is a crucial practice for—

▪ Supporting the development of positive identities

▪ Developing students’ ownership of ideas

▪ Engaging in collective mathematical work in school
GOING TO THE BOARD TO SHARE ONE’S IDEAS

Is a crucial practice for—

- Supporting the development of positive identities
- Developing students’ ownership of ideas
- Engaging in collective mathematical work in school

But must be enacted with care:

- To anticipate, avert, and disrupt normalized patterns that reproduce racism and oppression
GOING TO THE BOARD TO SHARE ONE’S IDEAS

Is a crucial practice for—

- Supporting the development of positive identities
- Developing students’ ownership of ideas
- Engaging in collective mathematical work in school

But must be enacted with care:

- To anticipate, avert, and disrupt normalized patterns that reproduce racism and oppression

... But no matter what we do, these risks are always there and we must constantly be aware of the discretion we have to attend to them.

March 21, 2020
Let’s recognize this moment as also a possibility to reconfigure life towards the math classrooms we need.

Let’s ask new questions, let go of the taken for granted, and reimagine together.

Thank you to Na’ilah Nasir and Megan Bang of the Spencer Foundation, for their inspiration to see our current situation in a new light.
“We are going to have to take upon ourselves a disciplined and continuing effort, with no real hope that, in our lifetime, we are going to be able to take a vacation from the struggle for justice.”

Rev. James Reeb

Reaching for the possibilities and the power is our collective work.
THANK YOU!

dball@umich.edu

Slides will be available on my website

https://deborahloewenbergball.com/

(“Google” Deborah Ball)
CREDITS

Data on slide 11:

Image on slide 14:
Image from “New function - homework assignments with automatic checking,” by push to learn

Image on slide 14:
Photo from “Using reward charts successfully”
CREDITS

Image on slide 14:
Photo from “8 Common Core Math Standards, Explained [+ Examples],” by Maria Kampen
Retrieved from https://www.prodigygame.com/blog/common-core-math-standards/

Image on slide 14:
Image from “Classroom Behavior Management Student Notice – Editable”

Images on slide 14:
Images from “Making It Work for Everyone: Seven ways to create a classroom that meets the needs of all your students,” by Zachary Herrmann
Retrieved from https://www.gse.harvard.edu/uk/blog/making-it-work-everyone

"A third of my class was bored and ready to move on, a third was close to understanding but not quite there, and another third was so far behind that continuing to try might have seemed like a fool's errand."
CREDITS

Image on slide 61:
Photo of James Reeb.