



Richard Holdaway <turnagra@gmail.com>

Fwd: Enquiry: Breach of embargo on thesis referenced in Rawlence et al 2016

1 message

Claude Hillaire-Marcel <hillaire-marcel.claude@uqam.ca>

22 August 2016 at 01:51

To: turnagra@gmail.com

Cc: "Lovegrove, Daniel (ELS-OXF)" <D.Lovegrove@elsevier.com>, "Barrett, Debbie (ELS-EXE)"

<d.barrett@elsevier.com>, Claude Hillaire-Marcel <chm@uqam.ca>

Dear Dr. Holdaway,

An administrative inquiry about the above case has been launched. Based on your message below, I am not sure any legal approach might be formally considered, but some ethical aspects do deserve some attention from the Journal, as far as I can judge.

With my best regards,

Claude Hillaire-Marcel
Editor in chief, QSR

>>

>>> From: <turnagra@gmail.com>

>>> Date: 20 August 2016 20:53:05 BST

>>> Subject: Enquiry: Breach of embargo on thesis referenced in Rawlence et al 2016

>>>

>>> The following enquiry was sent via the Elsevier Journal website:

>>>

>>> -- Sender --

>>> First Name: Richard

>>> Last Name: Holdaway

>>> Email: turnagra@gmail.com

>>>

>>> -- Message --

>>> I would like to bring to your attention the citation of Olivia Johnston's thesis (Johnston, O.R. 2014) in Rawlence et al's paper on moa diet published recently in QSR, despite the thesis being embargoed in the University of Canterbury library until 31 August 2016.

>>>

>>> The submission date for the MS is 10 April 2016: the thesis was embargoed in the University of Canterbury library until 31 July 2016. Neither I nor my colleague David Hawke, who were co-supervisors on this thesis were aware that it had been made available to a competing laboratory until we saw the reference list in the published paper.

>>>

>>> The thesis contains data which are confidential to our research group and which are fundamental to MSS that we are preparing for submission to major journals.

>>>

>>> How our competitors learned of the existence of the thesis we do not know, but the release of those data to a rival group is, as you will be aware, a most serious breach of scientific ethics. The fact that the paper contains a reference to the thesis in an MS prepared 5 months before the embargo ended suggests that the authors concerned also have little regard for norms of behaviour in such matters.

>>>

>>> Their paper is based to a significant extent on published information derived from our work, and now they have crucial additional information from the thesis which could well compromise our ability to publish our own research results in the manner we were intending.

>>>

>>> I understand completely that it is beyond a journal's ability to check the reference list for such matters but in submitting the MS for publication in your journal, the authors are surely obliged to certify that all of the data

presented (and we are not saying that) and its supporting material (which is what is involved here) have been obtained legally and ethically.

>>>

>>> Thank you for your attention.

>>>

>>> Dr Richard N Holdaway

>>>

>>> Palaecol Research Ltd

>>> and

>>> Adjunct Professor, School of Biological Sciences, University of Canterbury, Christchurch, New Zealand

>>>

>>>

>>> --

>>> This email was sent to you by Richard Holdaway (turnagra@gmail.com) via the Elsevier Journal Editor contact form at <http://www.journals.elsevier.com:80/quaternary-science-reviews/editorial-board/n-glasser>

>>> Elsevier B.V., Radarweg 29, 1043 NX Amsterdam, The Netherlands. Reg. No. 33156677.

>>>

>>> Elsevier is not responsible for the content of this email, and anything written in this email does not necessarily reflect the views or opinions of Elsevier. Please note that neither the email address nor name of the sender have been verified.

>>

>>

>> -----

>> Un o'r 4 prifysgol uchaf yn y DU a'r gorau yng Nghymru am fodlonrwydd myfyrwyr

>> (Arolwg Cenedlaethol y Myfyrwyr 2016)

>> www.aber.ac.uk

>>

>> Top 4 UK university and best in Wales for student satisfaction

>> (National Student Survey 2016)

>> www.aber.ac.uk

>

 **smime.p7s**
2K