Center for Biological Diversity \* Coalition to Protect America's National Parks \* Sierra Club \*
Environmental Action Committee of West Marin (EAC) \* Marin Audubon Society \*
Resource Renewal Institute \* National Parks Conservation Association \* Save Our Seashore \*

Action for Animals \* Alameda Creek Alliance \* All-Creatures.org \* Animal Legal Defense Fund \* Animals Are Sentient Beings, Inc. \* Biodiversity First! \* Californians for Western Wilderness \* Center for Farmworker Families \* Climate Action Now! \* Coalition on the Environment and Jewish Life \* Committee for the Preservation of the Tule Elk \* Conservation Congress \* Conservation Council for Hawaii \* Conserve Southwest Utah \* Dorothy King Young Chapter of the California Native Plant Society \* Earth Island Institute \* EarthAction \* Eastern Coyote/Coywolf Research \* Ecologistics, Inc. \* Ecology Party of Florida \* Endangered Habitats League \* Endangered Species Coalition \* Environmental Protection Information Center \* Eyak Preservation Council \* ForELK \* Friends of the Black-tail Prairie Dog \* Friends of the Earth U.S. \* Fund for Wild Nature \* Gallinas Watershed Council \* Global Movement Network \* Golden Gate Audubon Society \* Golden West Women Flyfishers \* Granite Chief Wilderness Protection League \* Harvard Law School Animal Law and Policy Clinic \* Hilton Pond Center for Piedmont Natural History \* Howling For Wolves \* In Defense of Animals \* Interfaith Council for the Protection of Animals and Nature \* International Marine Mammal Project of Earth Island Institute \* Kickapoo Peace Circle \* Klamath Forest Alliance \* Madrone Audubon Society \* Marin Chapter, California Native Plant Society \* MLK Coalition of Greater Los Angeles \* Movement Rights \* National Wolfwatcher Coalition \* Northcoast Environmental Center \* Northeast Oregon Ecosystems \* Northwest Animal Rights Network \* Northwest Arkansas Audubon Society \* NY4WHALES \* Ocean Voyages Institute \* Oceanic Preservation Society \* Old Growth Forest Network \* OVEC-Ohio Valley Environmental Coalition \* Patagonia \* Paula Lane Action Network (PLAN) \* Pelican Media \* Petaluma Wetlands Alliance \* Planning and Conservation League \* Point Reyes Safaris \* Predator Defense \* Project Coyote Public Interest Coalition \* Public Lands Conservancy \* Public Trust Alliance \* Rainforest Action Network\* Regional Parks Association \* RESTORE: The North Woods \* Sandra Lee Photography \* Santa Cruz Climate Action Network \* Save Our Sky Blue Waters \* SAVE THE FROGS! \* Shark Stewards \* Social Compassion in Legislation \* Spottswoode Winery, Inc. \* Supporters for Del Norte Roosevelt Elk \* Tending the Ancient Shoreline Hill \* The Fire Restoration Group \* The Rewilding Institute \* The Wildlife Trust \* Topanga Peace Alliance \* Turtle Island Restoration Network \* Watershed Alliance of Marin \* Wellkind \* Western Watersheds Project \* Wholly H2O \* Wild Zone Conservation League \* WildCare \* Wilderness Watch \* WildernessPress Photography \* **Yellowbilled Tours** 

January 7, 2021

RE: Coastal Consistency Determination by the California Coastal Commission for the Proposed Point Reyes National Seashore General Management Plan Amendment CD-0006-20

Dear California Coastal Commissioners,

The National Park Service (NPS) is asking the Coastal Commission to fast-track concurrence with a Consistency Determination for the Proposed Point Reyes National Seashore General Management Plan

Amendment (GMPA), despite inadequate information regarding coastal zone impacts and the fact that the proposed plan and expanded agricultural activities are not consistent to the maximum extent practicable with the California Coast Management Program (CCMP).

The undersigned **100** conservation groups, environmental justice organizations, and local businesses hold diverse positions on the future role of agriculture in the Seashore, ranging from supporting to opposing the continuation of agriculture leases in the Seashore. Yet we are united in our request that the Coastal Commission Object to the Point Reyes plan at its January **14**, **2021** Commission meeting. It is substantively and politically prudent for the Commission to allow time for the Commission staff and the Biden administration's NPS to work together – free of the current political pressure – to finalize this plan.

As we outline below, this process and plan have been co-opted by the Trump administration in its waning days. There is no reason why the Coastal Commission should fast-track approval of a plan and forgo the careful consideration that Californians and Point Reyes National Seashore deserve.

- Your staff requested that the NPS extend the review deadline through the March 2021 Commission meeting, calling the extension "warranted and necessary." In response to this request, the NPS set a deadline of January 20, 2021, signaling that the Trump administration is intent on fast-tracking the controversial and complex plan before the new administration assumes office, even if it comes at the expense of not allowing California (through its Coastal Commission) to protect its coastal resources.
- In a multi-party Settlement Agreement in 2017, the NPS, environmental groups, Seashore ranchers, and Marin County agreed that the NPS could have until July 2021 to complete the GMPA. Your staff's request to have until March 2021 in order to fully review the plan falls squarely within this agreed upon timeframe, yet the Trump administration now wishes to prevent the Commission from conducting a careful review process.
- Your staff has reported a high level of public interest in the GMPA (e.g. Commission staff recently stating it has received more than 20,000 public comments during its review of the GMPA opposing the NPS plan for ranching at Point Reyes National Seashore and Golden Gate National Recreation Area and its spillover impacts to wildlife and other public resources in the coastal zone).
- Your staff has determined that there are significant spillover effects from proposed ranching activities in the plan related to water quality and the protection of marine resources. Your staff believes that the current GMPA is inconsistent with Coastal Act policies related to marine resources (Section 30230) and water quality (Section 30231), particularly for the Point Reyes portion of the GMPA planning area. Your staff also raised concerns that there are limited, insufficient water quality data available for Point Reyes National Seashore, where water quality standards have historically not been met in creeks and wetlands that drain into Drakes Estero, Abbotts Lagoon, and the Pacific Ocean. The efficacy of proposed best management practices and water quality protection measures for coastal resources in the GMPA are, at best, uncertain.

Any water quality assessment plan including a timeline for compliance targets and enforcement measures for Point Reyes should be finalized before any decision on concurrence.

Your staff's concern that more time was needed to adequately review this GMPA is confirmed in the NPS Consistency Determination and the Commission staff report – both which are missing credible analyses of additional impacts to the environment and public access that will result from the GMPA, many of them with spillover effects on the coastal zone, including impacts to water quality, water quantity, and migratory birds. For example, the Staff Report states the NPS informed Commission staff that "we expect adjustments to the timing of harvest mowing to be limited." This refers to harvest of silage, which overlaps with bird nesting season, and the NPS is stating that it won't end the unnecessary killing of birds due to this practice. Related, the NPS highlights its lack of commitment to ensure protection of coastal resources, stating (emphasis ours) that "Approaches to minimize harvest impacts on wildlife should be considered when using this Practice Standard (e.g., harvest timing, cutting procedures, and cover patterns)." (GMPA Appendix F pg 25), yet "considerations" does not equal protection.

This is just one of the many examples of the fine details within the GMPA that require additional time for careful analysis and point to why the Commission should object and let the Staff have more time to address by working with a NPS that isn't being politically pressured.

• GMPA also lacks specificity on proposed mitigation measures; the NPS refers to this missing information as "programmatic details" which will be described at some future date and "may be subject to future review by the Commission, after site-specific actions are developed."

The National Seashore is a keystone for California's interconnected coastal resources. This Federal administration's refusal to accept the Commission's proposed timeline is an attempt to usurp the state's ability to request additional information. It denies the Commission the time necessary to adequately analyze and evaluate how the maintenance of ranching operations and further agricultural development in these national parks will affect coastal resources for decades to come.

The Commission needs more time and information to confidently decide whether the NPS' plan is adequate and consistent with protecting the California coast. Please <u>object</u> to the Point Reyes plan at the January 14 Commission meeting.

Sincerely,

Center for Biological Diversity
Randi Spivak, Public Lands Program Director
Washington, DC

Resource Renewal Institute Chance Cutrano, Director of Programs Mill Valley, CA Environmental Action Committee of West Marin (EAC) Morgan Patton, Executive Director Point Reyes Station, CA

Marin Audubon Society Barbara Salzman, President Mill Valley, CA National Parks Conservation Association Neal Desai, Senior Director, Pacific Region

Sacramento, CA

Save Our Seashore

Gordon Bennett, President

Inverness, CA

Action for Animals Eric Mills, Coordinator

Seattle, WA

Alameda Creek Alliance Jeff Miller, Director

Fremont, CA

All-Creatures.org Veda Stram Athens, NY

Animal Legal Defense Fund

Cristina Stella, Managing Attorney

Cotati, CA

Animals Are Sentient Beings, Inc. Sarah B. Stewart, President

Watertown, MA

Biodiversity First! Linda Seeley, Secretary

Shandon, CA

Californians for Western Wilderness Michael Painter, Coordinator

San Francisco, CA

California Native Plant Society, Marin Chapter

Carolyn K Longstreth, Board Member

Mill Valley, CA

Center for Farmworker Families Dr. Ann López, Executive Director

Felton, CA

Climate Action Now! Markos Major, Director San Francisco, CA

Coalition on the Environment and Jewish Life Rabbi Daniel Swartz, Executive Director

Scranton, PA

Coalition to Protect America's National Parks

Philip A. Francis, Jr., Chair

Washington, DC

Committee for the Preservation of the Tule Elk

Bruce E. Keegan San Francisco, CA

Conservation Congress Denise Boggs, Director Rohnert Park, CA

Conservation Council for Hawaii Moana Bjur, Executive Director

Honolulu, HI

Conserve Southwest Utah Tom Butine, Board President

St. George, UT

Dorothy King Young Chapter of the California

**Native Plant Society** 

Renee Pasquinelli, Conservation Co-chair

Gualala, CA

EarthAction

Lois Barber, Executive Director

Amherst, MA

Earth Island Institute

David Phillips, Executive Director

Berkeley, CA

Eastern Coyote/Coywolf Research

Jonathan Way, Founder

Barnstable, MA

Ecologistics, Inc.

Stacey Hunt, CEO

San Luis Obispo, CA

**Ecology Party of Florida** 

Cara L. Campbell, Chair

Ft. Lauderdale, FL

Endangered Habitats League

Dan Silver, Executive Director

Los Angeles, CA

**Endangered Species Coalition** 

Tara Thornton, Deputy Director

Washington, DC

**Environmental Protection Information Center** 

Thomas Wheeler, Executive Director

Arcata, CA

**Eyak Preservation Council** 

Carol Hoover, Executive Director

Cordova, AK

The Fire Restoration Group

Craig Thomas, Director

Garden Valley, CA

**ForELK** 

Diana Oppenhiem, Founder

San Francisco, CA

Friends of the Black-tail Prairie Dog David Orr, Founder and President

Austin, TX

Friends of the Earth U.S.

Ariel Moger, Legislative and Political

Coordinator

Washington, DC

Fund for Wild Nature

Marnie Gaede, President

Sebastopol, CA

Gallinas Watershed Council

Judy Schriebman, Secretary

San Rafael, CA

Global Movement Network

Diana Oppenheim, Founder

San Francisco, CA

Golden Gate Audubon Society

Laura Cremin, Vice President

Berkeley, CA

Golden West Women Flyfishers

Cindy Charles, Conservation Chair

San Francisco, CA

Granite Chief Wilderness Protection League

Daniel Heagerty, Director

Mill Valley, CA

Harvard Law School Animal Law and Policy

Clinic

Katherine A. Meyer, Director

Cambridge, MA

Hilton Pond Center for Piedmont Natural

History

Dr. Bill Hilton Jr., Executive Director

York, SC

**Howling For Wolves** 

Maureen Hackett, Founder and President

Hopkins, MN

In Defense of Animals

Lisa Levinson, Wild Animals Campaign Director

San Rafael, CA

Interfaith Council for the Protection of Animals

and Nature

Lewis Regenstein, President

Atlanta GA

International Marine Mammal Project

Mark J. Palmer, Associate Director

Berkeley, CA

Kickapoo Peace Circle

Marcia Halligan

Viroqua, WI

Klamath Forest Alliance

Kimberly Baker, Executive Director

Arcata, CA

Madrone Audubon Society

Susan Kirks, President

Sonoma, CA

MLK Coalition of Greater Los Angeles

Julie Levine

Los Angeles, CA

**Movement Rights** 

Pennie Opal Plant, Co-founder

San Francisco, CA

National Wolfwatcher Coalition

Nancy Warren Executive Director

Duluth, MN

Northcoast Environmental Center

Larry Glass, Executive Director

Arcata, CA

Northeast Oregon Ecosystems

Wally Sykes

Joseph, OR

Northwest Animal Rights Network

Rachel Bjork, Board President

Seattle, WA

Northwest Arkansas Audubon Society

Carol Joan Patterson

Fort Smith, AR

**NY4WHALES** 

William Rossiter, Vice President

New York, NY

Oceanic Preservation Society

Courtney Vail, Director of Strategic Campaigns

Greenbrae, CA

Ocean Voyages Institute

Mary T Crowley, President and Founder

Sausalito, CA

Ohio Valley Environmental Coalition (OVEC)

Vivan Stockman, Executive Director

Huntington, WV

Old Growth Forest Network

Joan Maloof, Executive Director

Easton, MD

Patagonia

Hilary Dessouky, General Counsel

Ventura, CA

Paula Lane Action Network (PLAN) Susan Kirks, Chair, Board of Directors Petaluma, CA

Pelican Media
Judy Irving, Executive Director
San Francisco, CA

Petaluma Wetlands Alliance John Schribbs, President Petaluma, CA

Planning and Conservation League Jonas Minton, Senior Water Policy Advisor Sacramento, CA

Point Reyes Safaris Daniel Dietrich, Owner Inverness, CA

Predator Defense Brooks Fahy, Executive Director Eugene, OR

Project Coyote
Camila Fox, Executive Director
Mill Valley, CA

Public Interest Coalition Marilyn Jasper, Chair Loomis, CA

Public Lands Conservancy
Don Neubacher, Board Member
Point Reyes, CA

Public Trust Alliance Michael Warburton, Executive Director Mill Valley, CA Rainforest Action Network Ginger Cassady, Executive Director San Francisco, CA

Regional Parks Association Amelia Wilson, President Berkeley, CA

RESTORE: The North Woods Michael Kellett, Executive Director Concord, MA

The Rewilding Institute
John Davis, Executive Director
Albuquerque, NM

Sandra Lee Photography Sandy Zelasko, Owner Valley Center, CA

Santa Cruz Climate Action Network Pauline Seales, Organizer Santa Cruz, CA

Save Our Sky Blue Waters Lori Andresen, President Duluth, MN

SAVE THE FROGS! Kerry Kriger, Ph.D. Laguna Beach, CA

Shark Stewards David McGuire, Director Sausalito, CA

Sierra Club Olga Bolotina, SF Bay Chapter Chair Berkeley, CA Social Compassion in Legislation Nickolaus Sackett, Director of Legislative Affairs Laguna Beach, California

Spottswoode Winery, Inc.
Beth Novak Milliken & Lindy Novak
St. Helena, CA

Supporters for Del Norte Roosevelt Elk Phoebe Lenhart Crescent City, CA

Tending the Ancient Shoreline Hill Margot Cunningham, Head Richmond, CA

Topanga Peace Alliance Julie Levine Topanga, CA

Turtle Island Restoration Network Todd Steiner, Executive Director Forest Knolls, CA

Watershed Alliance of Marin Laura Chariton, President Mill Valley, CA

Wellkind Catriona Glazebrook, Executive Director Burlingame, CA

Western Watersheds Project Erik Molvar, Executive Director Laramie, WY

Wholly H2O Elizabeth Dougherty, Executive Director Oakland, CA WildCare Alison Hermance, Director of Communications San Rafael, CA

Wild Horse Education Laura Leigh, President Reno, NV

WildernessPress Photography Andrw Carothers-Liske, Owner Emeryville, CA

Wilderness Watch George Nickas, Executive Director Missoula, MT

The Wildlife Trust Edward S. Loosli, President Walnut Creek, CA

Wild Zone Conservation League Patrick Lee Hord, Director El Cajon, CA

Yellowbilled Tours
Richard Cimino, Owner
Larkspur, CA