

KeepLAMoving

INITIATIVE HLA ADDITIONAL BACKGROUND¹

1. The Environmental Impact Report (EIR) for Los Angeles Mobility Plan 2035 (which HLA is intended to accelerate without public input):

The EIR concludes, “*Emergency vehicles may also be significantly impacted due to the project’s location in a congested area of Los Angeles.* Since the proposed project could contribute to increased delay for drivers...and include design elements that impede emergency access, the proposed project would have a *potentially significant impact...related to inadequate emergency vehicle access.*” As we have seen in all too many cases, this warning was prophetic.

Additionally, Mobility Plan 2035 imposes “*unavoidable significant adverse impacts*” on traffic. Over 1/3 of intersections in L.A. would gridlock during rush hour, twice the current number.

Finally, “*Increased congestion on major arterials could result in cut-through traffic in neighborhoods [and] result in a cumulatively considerable contribution to neighborhood intrusion impacts.*”

2. Even “minor” traffic calming measures – which HLA would accelerate – can have outsize negative impacts

At the intersection of Hollywood and Highland, LADOT installed a “scramble” crosswalk. In this configuration all traffic lights are red and pedestrians can cross in any direction, including diagonally. In the two years following its installation severe injuries at this intersection increased by 14%.

3. So much for environmental benefits

Traffic calming and road diets create congestion. This is beyond dispute: Cars idling in traffic and constantly stopping and going are operating at minimal efficiency. They also produce far more particulate matter (PM) in the form of brake

¹ In addition to this document, more data and resources can be accessed at <https://www.keepLAMoving.com/resources>

dust, tire wear, road wear, road dust, and overall wear and tear on cars' moving parts, of which there are thousands.

A 2020 study by the U.C. Riverside Department of Mechanical Engineering concluded that, “non-exhaust sources, including brake and tire wear PM, have become larger contributors to traffic-related emissions.” Similarly, a study of a road diet in the city of Grand Rapids, Michigan, found that overall emissions increased 19.8% during commute times after the road diet. That's a problem, because more Complete Streets mean more congestion and more motorists riding their brakes.

Consider the irony: Even as tailpipe emissions become cleaner and cleaner (and in the context of EVs, nonexistent) Complete Streets, traffic calming, and road diets are causing spikes in non-tailpipe pollution (which, unlike tailpipe emissions, are not regulated). Adding to the irony, EVs tend to be heavier than conventional vehicles, increasing non-tailpipe PM pollution even more.

ANALYSIS OF SELECTED CALIFORNIA ROAD DIETS

- indicates year road diet was installed
- indicates record numbers of accidents
- reflects traffic volume decreases during COVID pandemic 2020-2022

Los Angeles – Mar Vista – Venice Blvd. road diet

Road diet (6 to 4 conversion with parking protected bike lanes) installed May 2017 on Venice Blvd. between Beethoven St. and Inglewood Ave. (0.8 mile)

Year	Total accidents	Fatal	Injury (severe)	Injury (minor/complaint)	Bicycle	Ped
2011	20	0	3 (v)	21	5	3
2012	26	0	1 (p)	34	6	3
2013	21	0	2 (v)	29	5	2
2014	16	0	1 (b)	18	6	0
2015	22	0	0	29	7	3
2016	29	1 (scooter)	1 (p) 1 (v)	32	5	1
2017*	27	0	1 (p) 1 (v)	30	6	4
2018	30	0	3 (v) 2 (b)	39	8	4
2019	18	1 (b)	0	19	6	3
2020**	10	0	0	13	3	1
2021**	5	0	1 (p)	4	1	2
2022**	5	2 (p)	3 (p)			4

* Road diet implemented May 2017 as a “pilot;” became permanent November 2018; 60% of 2017 accidents were post road diet

** Traffic dropped dramatically during COVID; additional analysis required, incorporating ADT data

- ***First bicycle fatality (2019) and pedestrian fatality (2022) in 10+ years both occurred post-road diet***
- ***Record number of severe accidents, injuries, and severe injuries recorded 2018; record number of severe pedestrian injuries recorded 2022***
- ***Overall accidents increased 13.5% from 59 in the two years pre-road diet to 67 in the two years post-road diet.***

- **Severe injury accidents increased 100%** from 3 in the two years pre-road diet to 6 in the two years post-road diet.
- **Pedestrian-involved accidents increased 275%** from 4 in the two years pre-road diet to 11 in the two years post-road diet.
- **Bicycle-involved accidents increased 100%** from 5 in the two years pre-road diet to 10 in the two years post-road diet.

Impacts on emergency response. Westbound the road diet begins in front of LAFD Station 62. Response times have increased by 50 seconds. Note that a 2017 rule change artificially decreased response reporting times, meaning the increase is actually even bigger. *Firsthand accounts from crews at Stations 62 and 63 indicate a correlation between increased response times and the road diet.*

Year	Travel time
2013	4m 17s
2014	4m 30s
2015	4m 44s
2016	4m 29s
2017†	4m 41s
2018‡	4m 38s
2019	5m 03s
2020	5m 04s
2021☐	5m 15s
2022☐	5m 31s

Source: FireStatLA

† Road diet installed May 2017

‡ 2018 data unreliable

☐ Note response times continued to increase despite COVID traffic drops

VERDICT: Road diet has had neutral to negative impacts on traffic safety; far fewer overall accidents but consistent or increased severe and fatal crashes, as well as severely degraded emergency response times.

Los Angeles – Sunland-Tujunga – Foothill Blvd. road diet

Road diet installed April 2017; modified December 2017

Year	Total accidents	Bike involved	Ped involved	Severe injury	Fatal
2011	8	--	--	--	--
2012	5	--	2 (1a/f)	--	--
2013	7	--	--	2(v)*	--
2014	13	--	1 (a/f)	--	1(v)
2015	6	1 (a/f)	1	1(p)	--
2016	8	1	1	--	1(b)
2017**	11	1 (a/f)	2	2 (p) (1a/f)	--
2018	6	1	1	--	--
2019†	11	--	--	1(v); 1(m)	1(v)
2020††	5	--	--	--	--
2021††	4	1	1	2(v)	1(v)
2022††	1	--	--	--	--

* Both solo accidents; one wrong-way driver at 2:45am, one drunk driver hit an object

** Road diet installed April 2017

† First year in which there were both severe and fatal accidents

†† Traffic dropped dramatically during COVID; additional analysis required, incorporating ADT data

- *Fatal crashes remained constant*
- *Emergency evacuations severely degraded, as reported by multiple outlets at the time*
- *Overall accidents declined 24%, from 34 (2013-2016) to 26 (2018-2021)*
- *Severe injuries declined 60%, from 5 (2013-2017) to 3 (2018-2021) – however, KTLA reported two people were seriously injured in an accident on Foothill just last week*

Verdict: Overall neutral to slightly positive impact on traffic safety. Overall accidents declined, but severe and fatal crashes remained at historic levels. For example, there were only four accidents in 2021, a decade-long low. However, of those four, two resulted in severe injuries and one was fatal.

Extreme negative impact on evacuations (La Tuna and Creek Fires). The city modified the bollards in 2018 after the La Tuna Fires, claiming the re-redesign is safer. However, it simultaneously road dieted the only other major evacuation route, La Tuna Canyon Road. This is of particular concern when CALTRANS closes the 210 Freeway, which has happened during the last three fire events, leaving only Foothill and La Tuna.

Santa Monica – road diet at California Incline intersection

Road diet installed in mid-2020; completed September 2020

Year	Total accidents	Bike involved	Ped involved	Severe injury	Fatal
2011	0	0	0	0	0
2012	1	0	0	0	0
2013	0	0	0	0	0
2014	2	0	0	0	0
2015×	1	0	0	1*	0
2016×	0	0	0	0	0
2017	1	1**	0	0	0
2018	0	0	0	0	0
2019	2	0	0	0	0
2020†	--	--	--	--	--
2021††	5	2	0	0	0
2022††	3	3	0	0	0

× California Incline was closed 5/15 – 7/16 for rehabilitation

* Motorcycle rider collided with a car; driver of the car was severely injured

** Cyclist at fault

† Data unavailable

†† Traffic dropped dramatically during COVID; additional analysis required incorporating ADT data

- **Overall accidents increased 400%**, from 2 (2018-2019) to 8 (2021-2022) – and that was during the pandemic, when traffic volumes were dramatically reduced; normalizing the data results in more accidents.
- Video and drone footage shows a majority of bicycle riders do not use the dedicated lanes, either swerving into traffic or using the crosswalks, particularly southbound riders.
- All road users often appear confused.
- Drone footage shows emergency vehicles having difficulty navigating the intersection even with minimal traffic
- **June 2023 a pedestrian was struck by a car and severely injured in the intersection; a woman suffered a compound fracture to her femur, and her dog was killed; details unavailable.**

Verdict: Overall negative impact on traffic safety

Santa Monica – Broadway road diet

Road diet installed in mid-2020; completed September 2020

Year	Total accidents	Bike involved	Ped involved	Severe injury	Fatal
2011	8	3	1	1*	0
2012	3	0	0	0	0
2013	5	1	1	0	0
2014	2	1	1	1	0
2015	3	1	0	0	0
2016	7	1	1	0	0
2017	9	2	1	0	0
2018	2	1	1	0	0
2019	8	1	3	1*	0
2020	--	--	--	--	--
2021†	3	0	0	0	0
2022†	9	2	4	0	1(p)††

* Drunk driver involved

** Traffic dropped dramatically during COVID; additional analysis required incorporating ADT data

† Tied 11-year high for overall accidents

†† First fatality since at least 2011 according to SWITRS; first since 1990 according to City data

Verdict: Overall mixed to negative impact on traffic safety. Overall accidents and pedestrian accidents reached at least 10 year highs. Severe injuries eliminated (for two years) but first fatality in decades. Anecdotal reports and observations suggest an increase in near misses.

Negative impact on emergency response. Observations and informal conversations with SFPD indicate significant impacts on emergency response.

Long Beach – E. Broadway road diet

Road diet (lane narrowed, parking protected bike lanes) installed on Broadway Ave. between Alamitos and San Fernando (1.7 miles) in April 2019

Year	Total accidents	Fatal	Injury (severe)	Injury (minor/complaint)	Bicycle	Ped
2011	12	0	1 (s) 1 (v)	16	4*	1
2012	12	0	0	19	2**	3**
2013	15	0	0	19	4†	4†
2014	12	0	1 (p)±	16	1	3
2015	13	1 (p)±	2 (p) 1 (v)	11	1††	4
2016	19	0	0	20	6	2
2017	30	0	2 (p) 2 (v)	39	4	9
2018	29	0	3 (v)	34	5‡	5
2019	27	0	1 (p)	33	5‡‡	4‡‡
2020 [#]	26	0	1 (p)	29	5	7
2021 [#]	33	0	0	45	5	5
2022	35	1(v)	1(p)	33	3	7

* Two bicycle accidents were scooters; one was a solo rider crashing into a fixed object

** Both cyclists at fault; 1 pedestrian at fault

† Two cyclists at fault; 1 drunk pedestrian

± Hit by drunk drivers

†† Hit a fixed object

‡ One accident involved a scooter; included w bicycle accidents

‡‡ One accident involved a cyclist hitting a pedestrian

[#] Traffic dropped dramatically during COVID; additional analysis required incorporating ADT data

- **Overall accidents increased 10%**, from 78 (2016-2018) to 86 (2019-2021)
- **However, 2017-2019 were outlier years**, with accidents nearly doubling pre-road diet, and continuing to increase after the road diet, reaching a record in 2021

VERDICT: Requires further analysis. Initially the road diet seems to have had mixed to negative impacts on traffic safety. Severe injuries declined, but overall accidents increased and severe injuries and fatalities remained close to historic patterns.

LBFD interviews reveal significant complications in emergency response.

Oakland/Piedmont – Grand Ave. road diet

Road diet (4 to 3 conversion) installed June 2016 on Grand Ave. between Oakland Ave. and Elwood Ave. (0.8 mile)

Year	Total accidents	Fatal	Injury (severe)	Injury (minor/complaint)	Bicycle	Ped
2011	3	1 (p)*	0	0	0	1
2012	1	0	0	1	0	1
2013	0	0	0	0	0	0
2014	4	0	0	7	0	1
2015	2	0	0	2	1	1
2016	1	0	0	1	0	0
2017	1	0	0	2	0	0
2018	3	0	0	0	0	1
2019	4**	0	1 (p)	3	0	1
2020††	1	0	0	1	1	0
2021††	1	0	0	1	1†	0

* Pedestrian was at fault (jaywalking)

** Matches an 11 year high

† First time in 11 years bicycle-involved accidents two years in a row

†† Traffic dropped dramatically during COVID; additional analysis required incorporating ADT data

- **Overall accidents increased slightly**, from 10 (2011-2016) to 11 (2016-2021)
- **Overall bicycle accidents doubled** from 1 (2011-2016) to 2 (2016-2021)
- **Overall pedestrian accidents halved** from 4 (2011-2016) to 2 (2016-2021)
- **Overall minor injury accidents decreased slightly** from 10 (2011-2016) to 8 (2016-2021)

VERDICT: Road diet has had neutral to negative impacts on traffic safety

Oakland – Adeline St. road diet

Road diet (4 to 3 conversion) installed August 2016 on Adeline St. between 47th and 61st (0.7 mile)

Year	Total accidents	Fatal	Injury (severe)	Injury (minor/complaint)	Bicycle	Ped
2011	1	0	0	1	1	0
2012	3	0	0	3	2	1
2013	2	0	0	3	0	0
2014	2	0	0	3	0	0
2015	3	0	0	4	0	0
2016	3	0	0	3	1	0
2017	3	0	0	4	0	0
2018	3	0	0	2	2	0
2019	4	0	0	6	1	0
2020*	2	0	0	2	1	1
2021*	0	0	0	0	0	0

*Traffic dropped dramatically during COVID; additional analysis required incorporating ADT data

- **Overall accidents increased slightly**, from 11 (2011-2016) to 12 (2016-2021)
- **Overall bicycle accidents increased 66%** from 3 (2011-2016) to 5 (2016-2021)
- **Overall pedestrian accidents were unchanged** from 1 (2011-2016) to 1 (2016-2021)
- **Overall minor injury accidents increased slightly** from 15 (2011-2016) to 16 (2016-2021)

VERDICT: Road diet has had ineffectual to slightly negative impacts on for traffic safety; slight increase in overall accidents and bicycle accidents

San Jose – Lincoln Ave. road diet

Road diet (4 to 3 conversion) installed April 2015 on Lincoln Ave. between Minnesota Ave. and Coe Ave. (0.7 mile)

Year	Total accidents	Fatal	Injury (severe)	Injury (minor/complaint)	Bicycle	Ped
2011	10	0	1 (b)	11	5	1
2012	4	0	1 (p)	2	2	1
2013	7	0	0	8	2	4**
2014	3	0	0	3	0	1
2015*	6	0	0	9	2†	1
2016	8	0	0	9	6	1
2017	7	0	0	8	2	1
2018	8	0	0	10	2	1
2019	6	0	0	8	0	1
2020	6	0	0	8	0	2
2021	7	0	0	15	0	1

* Road diet installed April 2015; note all accidents that year were post-road diet

** In two accidents neither party was at fault

† In one accident the cyclist was at fault

†† Traffic dropped dramatically during COVID; additional analysis required incorporating ADT data

- **Overall accidents increased 20%**, from 24 (2011-2014) to 29 (2015-2018)
- **Overall bicycle accidents increased 33%** from 9 (2011-2014) to 12 (2015-2018)
- **Overall pedestrian accidents decreased 43%** from 7 (2011-2014) to 4 (2015-2018)
- **Severe injury accidents decreased 100%** from 2 (2011-2014) to 0 (2015-2018)

Note: Traffic volume declined through the Lincoln corridor by between 500 and 2,000 vehicles a day, meaning increases in accidents are more pronounced while reductions in pedestrian and severe accidents are less significant.

VERDICT: Road diet has had mixed to slightly positive impacts on traffic safety; overall accidents and injuries were either consistent or slightly increased post road diet, including pedestrian and bicycle involved accidents. However, severe injury crashes were eliminated (though there had not been a severe injury on the stretch since 2012).

San Jose – San Fernando St. road diet

Road diet (4 to 3 conversion) installed April 2015 on San Fernando St. between 11th St. and Almaden Blvd. (1 mile) in February 2014

Year	Total accidents	Fatal	Injury (severe)	Injury (minor/complaint)	Bicycle	Ped
2011	19	0	0	22	3	4
2012	12	0	1 (b)	15	4	3
2013	12	0	1 (p)	15	1	1
2014*	15	0	0	20	4	6
2015	12	1 (p)	0	12	3	3
2016	10	0	0	14	0	2
2017	15	0	0	15	1	3
2018	29	0	0	25	6†	7
2019	15	0	0	16	2	8
2020†	6	0	0	6	1	2
2021†	17	0	2 (p)	17	4	2
2022	5	0	0	5	2	2

* Road diet installed February 2014

** In one accident the cyclist hit a parked car

† Traffic dropped dramatically during COVID; additional analysis required incorporating ADT data

- **Overall accidents initially decreased 14%**, from 43 (2011-2013) to 37 (2014-2016); **then increased by 30% from baseline** to 56 (2017-2019)
- **Overall bicycle accidents decreased 12%** from 8 (2011-2013) to 7 (2014-2016); **then increased by 25% from baseline** to 10 (2017-2019)
- **Overall pedestrian accidents increased 38%** from 8 (2011-2013) to 11 (2014-2016); **then increased again from baseline by 125%** to 18 (2017-2019); **total increase of 225%** (2011-2019)
- **First fatal accident (2015, pedestrian)**
- **Severe injury accidents initially decreased 100%** from 2 (2011-2014) to 0 (2015-2018); however **there were 2 in 2021**.

VERDICT: Road diet has had overall positive impacts on traffic safety, though seems to have been particularly affected by drop in traffic volumes during COVID