Contents

List of Contributors  xi
Acknowledgments  xxiii

1 Prospects for Common Ground: Introduction  1
William N. Eskridge, Jr. and Robin Fretwell Wilson

PART I THE SEARCH FOR COMMON GROUND: FRAMING THE DIALOGUE

2 Choosing among Non-Negotiated Surrender, Negotiated Protection of Liberty and Equality, or Learning and Earning Empathy  11
Alan Brownstein

3 Liberty and Justice for All  24
Douglas Laycock

4 Belief and Belonging: Reconciling Legal Protections for Religious Liberty and LGBT Youth  38
Shannon Price Minter

5 Religious Freedom, Civil Rights, and Sexuality: A Christian Ethics Perspective  56
Dennis P. Hollinger

PART II GUIDING PRINCIPLES FOR MEDIATING CONFLICTS

6 Religious Accommodation, and Its Limits, in a Pluralist Society  69
Douglas NeJaime and Reva B. Siegel
Contents

7 “The Devil Is in the Details”: On the Central Importance of Distinguishing the Truly Public from the Truly Private in Reconciling Equality and Religious Liberty 82
Ronald J. Krotoszynski, Jr.

8 Mutual Tolerance and Sensible Exemptions 102
Kent Greenawalt

9 The Joys of Mutual Contempt 111
Andrew Koppelman

10 From Conflict to Coexistence: The Catholic Response to the LGBT Community 119
Sister Jeannine Gramick

11 Implied-Consent Religious Institutionalism: Applications and Limits 135
Michael A. Helfand

PART III THE DEMANDS OF FAITH: PERSPECTIVES FROM SELECT FAITH TRADITIONS

12 Christian Identity and Religious Liberty 153
Leith Anderson

13 The “Demands” of Faith 163
Archbishop William E. Lori

14 Toward Collaboration: A Perspective from The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints 179
Elder Von G. Keetch

15 Conscience Claims in Islamic Law: A Case Study 183
Intisar A. Rabb

16 Should an Amish Baker Sell a Cake for a Same-Sex Wedding? A Letter on Toleration of LGBT Rights from Anabaptists to Evangelicals 200
Jason R. Moyer

PART IV TESTING THE CIVIL RIGHTS ANALOGY

17 The Rhetoric of Bigotry and Conscience in Battles over “Religious Liberty v. LGBT Rights” 213
Linda C. McClain
Contents

18 Against “Civil Rights” Simplism: How Not to Accommodate Competing Legal Commitments
Steven D. Smith 233

19 Heterosexuals Only: Signs of the Times?
Louise Melling 245

20 Conscience v. Access and the Morality of Human Rights, with Particular Reference to Same-Sex Marriage
Michael J. Perry 256

21 On the Uses of Anti-Christian Identity Politics
Marc O. DeGirolami 267

PART V STRINGS ATTACHED? GOVERNMENT SUPPORT OF RELIGION AND RELIGIOUS INSTITUTIONS

22 Marriage Equality, Traditionalist Churches, and Tax Exemptions
William N. Eskridge, Jr. 281

Holly Hollman 295

24 Freedom to Serve: Religious Organizational Freedom, LGBT Rights, and the Common Good
Thomas C. Berg 307

PART VI EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS IN THE AGE OF SAME-SEX MARRIAGE

25 Two Paths: Finding a Way Forward at Covenantal Universities
Shirley V. Hoogstra, Shapri D. LoMaglio, and Brad Crofford 329

26 God and Man and Religious Exemptions in the Modern University
B. Jessie Hill 344

PART VII THE CHALLENGES OF PUBLIC ACCOMMODATIONS

27 Challenges to True Fairness for All: How SOGI Laws Are Unlike Civil Liberties and Other Nondiscrimination Laws and How to Craft Better Policy and Get Nondiscrimination Laws Right
Ryan T. Anderson 361

28 Dressmakers, Bakers, and the Equality of Rights
Michael W. McConnell 378
It’s Not About the Cake: Against “Altaring” the Public Marketplace
Jennifer C. Pizer

Bathrooms and Bakers: How Sharing the Public Square Is the Key to a Truce in the Culture Wars
Robin Fretwell Wilson

PART VIII REFLECTIONS FROM ADVOCATES, LEGISLATORS, AND POLICYMAKERS

Sound Nondiscrimination Models and the Need to Protect LGBTQ People in Federal Law
Sarah Warbelow

Cultivating Common Ground: Lessons from Utah for Living with Our Differences
Senator J. Stuart Adams

Shared Spaces and Brave Gambles
Governor Michael O. Leavitt

PART IX AFTERWORD

Masterpiece Cakeshop: Impact on the Search for Common Ground
Rabbi David N. Saperstein

Appendix of Laws
Robin Fretwell Wilson

Subject Index
Laws Index
Cases Index