A NATIONAL LEADER IN CRIMINALIZING SINCE 1981

This is the first in a series of articles covering the criminalization of homelessness in San Francisco drawing from findings of the Coalition’s recently released report Punishing the Poorest, which can be downloaded online at http://www.coohsf.org.

San Francisco is widely considered a liberal city in its provision of care and services to those experiencing homelessness. It has spent about $1.5 billion on homeless services in the last decade, and has six times more supportive housing units per capita than cities like New York, LA, and San Jose. In the last ten years, it has built 2,699 units of long-term, supportive housing and housed 11,362 formerly homeless people. With it’s armies of volunteers, network of soup kitchens, and host of service programs that have been replicated elsewhere—such as Project Homeless Connect, the Homeless Outreach Team, and Collaborative Courts—San Francisco has become considered a national leader responding to homelessness with a caring hand in the eyes of some experts and the general public alike.

However, San Francisco has also long been, and remains, a national leader in responding to homelessness with a punitive fist. Over the past 35 years, San Francisco has passed more municipal ordinances banning life-sustaining activities than any other city in California. This set of laws makes it illegal for homeless San Franciscans to sleep or sit on sidewalks, toslumber in parks or in their personal vehicles, and to use any form of shelter from the cold, sun, or rain other than one’s clothing. All of this, despite the fact that there is only one shelter bed for every six homeless people in the city. While the enforcement of these laws has varied over time, the criminalization of homelessness has been constant. Since 2011, citations for sleeping, sitting, and begging have more than tripled. Over this same period San Francisco has seen waves of “quality-of-life” policy campaigns and experienced the explosion of mass incarceration.

How does San Francisco rank in this index of anti-homeless laws? San Francisco has more anti-homeless laws than any other city in California, and perhaps in the nation. With 25 laws prohibit- ing sitting, sleeping, standing, and begging, San Francisco has nine times more anti-homeless laws than the average California city. While, this does not necessarily mean that San Francisco enforces these laws more aggres- sively than any municipalities, it clearly indicates the degree to which legisl- ators invest political capital into anti-homeless campaigns, the amount of time and energy devoted by citizens’ groups to support such mea- sures, and the associ- ated media coverage, that follows such campaigns, which not only tend to fuel the fires of hateful anti- homeless sentiments, but distract resources, energy, and atten- tion away from real solutions to creating “safe and clean” public spaces, and more importantly ending homelessness.

Furthermore, as our report uncovers, it is precisely these laws that incite police and courts to label, ticket, and arrest the “poor’ who are forced to live in public as criminals—a job that many in the police and court system think is inappropriate and a waste of resources.

IT’S HARD TO GET SLEEP IN THIS TOWN. I MEAN YOU CAN DO TWO DAYS WITHOUT EATING ALL RIGHT, BUT GOING WITHOUT SLEEP IS MUCH MORE WORSE.” —43-YEAR-OLD, AFRICAN AMERICAN WOMAN WITH A DISABILITY, LIVING UNDER THE BAY BRIDGE

With a punitive fist. Over the responding to homelessness has also long been, and re- spective Courts—San Francisco has network of once been a concerted ef- fort across a mayoral term to “decriminalize” home- lessness, rollback enforce- ment, or approach “quality of life” laws from a civil rights or human rights perspective.

Three lessons from San Francisco’s history of punishing the poorest

1. Restrictions on public spaces and life-sustaining activities homeless people have little choice but to perform in public have constantly increased over the past 35 years.

2. New policies and practices of criminalization are almost always packaged with new provisions or reforms of assistance for homeless people.

3. Over the past thirty-five years there has never once been a concerted ef- fort across a mayoral term to “decriminalize” home- lessness, rollback enforcement, or approach “quality of life” laws from a civil rights or human rights perspective.

Within a broader term, as the record here clearly indicates. In sum, over the past thirty-five years the Federal and State of California Government has moved out of the business of services and housing pro- vision for its poorest resi- dents, and into the business of incarcerat- ing and po- licing them. Rather than mitigating these effects, the city government of San Francisco has exacerbated this rising tide of state-spon- sored poverty by promoting eco- nomic and housing policies that have lubricated it rapid rise of rents, construction of luxury housing, reduction of afford- able housing, and evictions of thousands of poor residents. To manage the social fallout from these decisions, San Francisco has consistently increased its spending on homelessness and services. Yet this meager growth in a new welfare arm has proven wholly inadequate to address the homelessness that the City, state, and Federal governments’ broader housing, health and economic policies create. So the City has also fol- lowed, and at various times led, the national trend of criminal- izing homelessness. Sometimes out of moral panic, other times for political gain and policy making, sometimes NIMBY senti- ments among local neighbor- hood groups, and almost always backed by Business Improve- ment Districts and merchant and business associations.

Under the current mayoral administration of Edwin Lee, we see the exact same approach as his predecessors: park closures, a large vehicle ban, an expen- sive upsurge in citing destitute people for sleeping, camping and sitting in public spaces, and proposals for a costly new jail and hundreds of more police of- ficers—all of this in just the last four years. As our study reveals, these policies do not only violate the civil and human rights of homeless people, they also undercut the investments made in San Francisco’s social service system and contradict the City’s purported goal of reducing homelessness. In doing so they injure and insult our city’s most vulnerable citizens.

As you read this historical policy record of the crim- inalization of homeless- ness ask yourself: If these so-called “quality of life” laws are 30 percent effective at re- ducing homelessness, don’t you think San Francisco would see some tangible results after 35 years?

While this report uncovers, it is precisely these laws that incite police and courts to label, ticket, and arrest the “poor” who are forced to live in public as criminals—a job that many in the police and court system think is inappropriate and a waste of resources. In doing so they injure and insult our city’s most vulnerable citizens.
35 YEARS OF POLICY FAILURE

This extract from the Coalition on Homelessness report *Punishing the Poorest: How the Criminalization of Homelessness Perpetuates Poverty in San Francisco* details the numerous anti-homeless measures adopted under the various mayoral administrations of the past three and a half decades. The authors write, “As you read this historical policy record of the criminalization of homelessness ask yourself: If these so-called ‘Quality of Life’ laws are so effective at reducing homelessness, don’t you think San Francisco would see some tangible results after 35 years?”

**FEINSTEIN ADMINISTRATION**

1980 City replaces old sit/lie law with sidewalk obstruction ordinance.

1981 Ordinance passes banning sleeping in parks between 8 p.m. and 8 a.m.

1984 Ordinance passes banning habitation in vehicles.

**AGNOS ADMINISTRATION**

1988 Sweeps in Golden Gate Park, Civic Center, and Cole Valley.

1989 Mayor Agnos orders Police Chief Frank Jordan to sweep Civic Center Plaza of the 60-100 people living there.

**JORDAN ADMINISTRATION**

1992 Between 1988-1995 Food Not Bombs is arrested over 1,000 times for sharing food.

After the passage of Prop I (put on the ballot by Mayor Jordan), the City outsells aggressive panhandling.

Alvord Lake (part of Golden Gate Park) was closed during the evenings.

1993 The Matrix Program begins. Between August and December 5, 602 citations are issued to homeless people for "quality of life" offenses. More citations for sleeping and camping in the parks, drinking in public, obstructing the sidewalk and sleeping in the doorways were issued in the first month of Matrix than in the five previous years combined.

The Transbay Bus Terminal, home to more than 100 homeless people, locks its doors to them. A program serving many of the Terminal’s severely mentally ill residents is shut down.

Visually every city park is closed at night by the Recreation and Parks Commission.

1994 "No parking from 2:00am to 6:00am" signs are put up by the Port Authority on a street in China Basin where most of the city’s mobile residents reside.

Mayor Jordan declared to the media that armed criminals posing as homeless people are using their shopping carts to transport weapons. He ordered the SFPD to arrest people in possession of shopping carts. The people of San Francisco openly express their outrage at this proposal and no one gets arrested.

Sit/Lie Ordinance Fails to Pass as Proposition 19.564 "quality of life" citations issued.

1995 In August, Mayor Jordan plans Matrix II, "Take back our Parks." a multi-departmental intensive sweep of Golden Gate Park, and uses it as a media moment in his mayoral campaign. Homeless people lose property and are displaced.

14,476 "quality of life" citations issued.

1996 50 homeless people are evicted from a lot in the Bayview referred to as “Land of the Lost.” The City settles out of court.

Mayor Brown declares Matrix is over.

SFPD forms “Operation Park.” > 6 police officers on each shift are assigned to roost and cite homeless people in the parks of their districts.

17,534 "quality of life" citations issued. More citations issued after ending the highly unpopular "Matrix Program."

1997 Massive sweeps of Golden Gate Park begin. Mayor Brown asks to borrow the Oakland Police Departments night vision-equipped helicopter to locate homeless people illegally sleeping in the park, but is denied. Homeless people lose property and are displaced. A special crew of Recreation and Park employees is formed specifically to maintain order and identify and destroy encampments across the city.

Caltrans creates a special unit that sweeps homeless people and their property from under bridges and highways.

15,671 "quality of life citations" issued.

1998 "No Loitering or Sleeping" signs are placed in public parks around the city.

Civic Center Plaza is remodeled. The fountain is removed, two children’s playgrounds are added, and the park is cleared of homeless people. A police officer was assigned to monitor the park. In a 2015 chronicle article, Brown admits the primary motivation was to rid the area of homeless people.

Board of Supervisors makes it illegal to drink in parks where poor people congregate.

Board of Supervisors passes ordinance making it possible for police to cite people for camping or sleeping in UN and Hallidie Plazas.

18,590 "quality of life" citations issued.

1999 SFPD officers take photos of homeless people claiming they were "creating a scrapbook." They distribute copies to local merchants ordering them not to sell alcohol to anyone in the pictures because they are "habitual drunks." City sues lawsuit out of court.

Anti-panhandling legislation, called "Pedestrian Safety Act" fails to pass.

Mayor Brown orders homeless people to be charged with felonies if found in possession of a shopping cart. After a week of bad press, he never orders it.

23,871 "quality of life" citations issued.

2000 City attorney begins prosecuting homeless people in traffic court for "quality of life" offenses. Program costs $250,000 and fails in its stated purpose to connect homeless people with services they supposedly refuse.

Ordinance banning camping in parks passes.

17,916 "quality of life" citations issued.

2001 Ordinance banning loitering near public toilets passes.

Benches are moved from UN Plaza in a midnight attack, costing city $24,000 in overtime.

Large encampment under César Chávez Circle overpass is swept by DPW. Property belonging to homeless residents was videotaped being thrown into garbage truck. After the story aired on local news, Mayor Brown claims homeless advocates staged the incident and that the homeless person interviewed by news crews was an actor.

35 homeless people were displaced and many lost property. A fence is erected by Caltrans.

DA starts prosecuting California Penal Code 647(j), a misdemeanor that makes it illegal to lodge on public or private property. Homeless people begin to spend more time in jail.

The City spends $50.8 million to incarcerate homeless people in 2001.

9,314 “quality of life citations” issued.

2002 A large encampment is swept from Berry Street. 100 homeless people are displaced and a fence is erected by DPW. Property costs $13,644 on this sweep, not including costs for extensive police presence on the day of the sweep.

DPW starts “Operation Scrubdown” targeting downtown streets and alleys. Workers move encampments, and then hose them down with nasty chemicals making it impossible to return to that spot. DPW estimates that the operation cost the city $11,000 every day.

Board of Supervisors passes new law prohibiting urinating and defecating in public, but no new public bathrooms are opened.
NEWsom ADMINISTRATION

2004 Anti-panhandling ordinance championed by Newsom, and passed as a ballot initiative comes into effect. Newsom claims criminalization will push violators into substance abuse or mental health treatment. Instead, the treatment remains grossly underfunded, and the result is fines and arrest.

SF Coalition discovers that it costs San Francisco more than $10,000 to prosecute a single CPC 647(j) case (that’s “illegal lodging” to the uninitiated), which was being charged as a misdemeanor at the time.

SFPD launches “Operation Outreach” and begins assigning special units of officers to addressing 911 calls regarding homelessness. Camping citations triple from 456 in 2003 to 1,114 in 2004.

2005 District Attorney grants amnesty to thousand homeless people with “nuisance” citations.

Despite promises that no one would be arrested for the anti-panhandling Prop M passed in 2003, the police begin arresting some for simply begging.

2006 San Francisco is named the 11th meanest city in the nation to its homeless according to a National Law Center on Homelessness and Poverty and the National Coalition for the Homeless, based on an index of anti-homeless laws and the severity of penalties among other indicators.

City creates “focused enforcement” program to target quality of life infractions including sleeping in public, while city loses 300 shelter beds over the past 18 months.

2007 Eight days after Chronicle runs story on homelessness in Golden Gate Park, Police raid camps at the park at 4:30am. After, seven workers are hired to work full-time to remove encampments.

Newsom proposes new park code to expand the definition of camping and successfully advocated for funding early on, planning challenges resulted in a wait of several more years before the shelter was finally able to open its doors. As you read this, Jazzie’s Place is fully operational, expanding the City’s shelter system by 24 beds. A homeless person does not need to identify as queer or transgender to access Jazzie’s Place, but shelter-seekers may select a preference for this shelter.

Jazzie Collins—the shelter’s namesake—was a poor and queer person’s advocate and activist in San Francisco. In the early 2000s, she became involved in community organizing with development issues at the Plaza Hotel. Over the years, she became deeply involved in organizing the annual Tent March, joined the board of the Tenderloin Housing Clinic, became a strong leader with the Senior Action Network (now Senior and Disability Action), and was a member of the LGBT Aging Policy Taskforce. Jazzie was involved in the initial planning of the shelter, but passed away in 2009.

2008 Panhandler shot dead by officers who were trying to give him a citation for begging, when the man pulled a knife out as he was trying to escape.

2009 San Francisco is named the 7th meanest city in the nation to its homeless, according to a National Law Center on Homelessness and Poverty and the National Coalition for the Homeless. A move up from #11 three years earlier.

San Francisco launches the Community Justice Center, which focuses on low-level crimes in the Tenderloin. Although the court’s diversion of these cases from jail-time may be seen as a step towards de-criminalization—lowering punishments and reducing jail costs—some scholars and critics also see this as a further legitimation of dealing with sleeping and drug use through a punitive court system, rather than simply expanding social services. In its first year, the most common crime tried is misdemeanor theft, and more than 1,000 people were found guilty of crimes under the new laws. The center is closed indefinitely.

2010 In a replay of the 1993 Transbay terminal sweep, the State closes the terminal where roughly 140 San Franciscans lived, a large portion among the most disabled people in the city. Newsom was quick to boast about the solution, and be the village for the people like Jazzie, and that’s what this is part of.” Sadasaha Shimmers, a transgender activist who came to San Francisco after being rejected from her home in Portland, Oregon at the age of ten, and then queer-bashed in a shelter there, also spoke at the shelter’s opening. “When you grow up homeless and queer, life skills are the last things you learn. You don’t realize that it takes a lot to get an apartment. You don’t realize that everything you have—every fork, spoon, and toilet paper has to be bought by you. And you have no idea what a fixed income is because you’ve never had an income of your own. So what happens when you turn 18? Where do you go, what do you do, and how do you manage things when they’re given to you? This shelter is teaching life skills. This shelter is teaching people of queer backgrounds who may never have been shown how to create a life, how to transition from youth as a queer person to adulthood as a queer individual. This shelter is teaching people how to grow and move forward.”

“When we see broken people, it’s easier not to look at them because we have to look at ourselves and realize that we have helped create this problem. Today, a group of you has said that there should be a difference and we should start it right here in San Francisco. They said, ‘My money in my bank account is not important as long as there are people who have no housing.’ This baby has been birthed to shelter people, but it is just a beginning. The next step is to create affordable housing for each and every person, regardless of minority, regardless of gender, and regardless of sexual orientation.”

JAZZIE’S PLACE

This baby has been birthed to shelter people. But it is just a beginning. The next step is to create affordable housing for each and every person, regardless of minority, gender, and sexual orientation.

“Sadasaha Shimmers, a transgender activist who came to San Francisco after being rejected from her home in Portland, Oregon at the age of ten, and then queer-bashed in a shelter there, also spoke at the shelter’s opening. “When you grow up homeless and queer, life skills are the last things you learn. You don’t realize that it takes a lot to get an apartment. You don’t realize that everything you have—every fork, spoon, and toilet paper has to be bought by you. And you have no idea what a fixed income is because you’ve never had an income of your own. So what happens when you turn 18? Where do you go, what do you do, and how do you manage things when they’re given to you? This shelter is teaching life skills. This shelter is teaching people of queer backgrounds who may never have been shown how to create a life, how to transition from youth as a queer person to adulthood as a queer individual. This shelter is teaching people how to grow and move forward.”

“When we see broken people, it’s easier not to look at them because we have to look at ourselves and realize that we have helped create this problem. Today, a group of you has said that there should be a difference and we should start it right here in San Francisco. They said, ‘My money in my bank account is not important as long as there are people who have no housing.’ This baby has been birthed to shelter people, but it is just a beginning. The next step is to create affordable housing for each and every person, regardless of minority, regardless of gender, and regardless of sexual orientation.”

Everyone who knew and loved her knows that Jazzie—always an advocate of affordable housing, housing protections, and poor people’s rights—would no doubt agree. ■

LEEE ADMINISTRATION

2011 137 homeless people found in San Francisco’s jail in the Point in Time Count, the first time the count included counting those in jail. This amounted to roughly 25% of the entire jail population and represented 5% of the homeless people counted that night.

SF Recreation and Parks hire 10 new rangers leading to a six-fold increase in citations for sleeping in camping over the next three years.

2012 Oversized vehicle ban ordinance passes through the board of supervisors.

MTA begins plastering signs throughout the entire city, which continues to this day, reprinting the legal spaces homeless people may park their vehicles.

Benches removed from Harvey Milk Plaza by the Castro/Upper Market Community Benefit District.

2013 Supervisors pass a park closure ordinance, making it illegal for those with out shelters to sleep from 12 am–5 pm.

2014 BART begins displacing, citing, and arresting homeless people resting inside stations. ■

Heights moguls ultimately outspent opponents by roughly $400,000.