WWF Wildlife Cyber Spotter Program
Round 4
Fall/Winter 2018-19
Agenda

1. Introductions & background
2. Logistics
3. Data entry
4. Elephant product detection
5. Pangolin product detection
6. Live animals
7. Suspicious seller clues
8. Next steps
Your Cyber Spotter Program Coordinators!

Gia
giavanna.grein@wwfus.org

Lu
lu.gao@wwfus.org
Because of the demand for illegal wildlife products, some of the planet's most endangered, iconic species are rapidly decreasing.

20,000 African elephants are killed each year to meet the demand for ivory.

3 rhinos are poached in South Africa every day for their horns.

1,000,000 pangolins have been trafficked for scales and skin in the past decade.
What does the internet have to do with it?

- **4 billion +** users actively use the internet around the world
- **3 billion** users engage with each other via social media regularly
- **1.8 billion** users shop online regularly

It's now easier than ever to exchange information, money and goods.

In the time that it takes to brush your teeth, you can find, click and buy an illegal wildlife product online.
The Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online

24 Partners:

Alibaba, Baidu, Baixing, eBay, Etsy, Facebook, Google, Huaxia Collection, Instagram, Kuaishou, letgo, Mall for Africa, Microsoft, OfferUp, Pinterest, Qyer, Rakuten, Ruby Lane, Shengshi Collection, Tencent, Wen Wan Tian Xia, Zhongyikupai, Zhuanzhuan, 58 Group

Convened by:
The Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online

- Industry Collaboration
- Policy Harmonization
- Law Enforcement
- Machine Learning Enhancement
- Mobilizing Citizen Spotters
- In-Depth Company Training

80% by 2020
The Coalition to End Wildlife Trafficking Online

80% by 2020

Industry Collaboration
Policy Harmonization
Law Enforcement
Machine Learning Enhancement
Mobilizing Citizen Spotters
In-Depth Company Training
First things first! Some logistics...
Volunteer agreement form in a nutshell

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Requirement</th>
<th>Duration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Must have completed webinar training before starting data collection</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At least 1 hour per week reviewing assigned platform</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participate in program from 12/10/2018 – 1/25/2019</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No direct contact with platform company staff</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No contact with sellers, and no purchase of suspicious products!</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidentiality: No speaking to media / posting to social media about your work with WWF Cyber Spotters, unless approved by WWF staff</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No compensation for time and expenses</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Always be incognito

- Only conduct searches through Incognito Windows on your DESKTOP COMPUTER

- Prevents browser from storing data about your browsing session, including cookies and history
Data entry: Google Drive
Data entry process for each suspicious ad

- **Platform**: OfferUp or letgo?
- **Date found**: When did you find the ad?
- **Date posted**: When did the seller post the ad?
- **Keyword searched**: what did you search to find the ad?
- **Product type**: Elephant, pangolin, big cat, sea turtle, live big cat, or live primate?
- **URL**: Link of the post
- **User name**: Seller name
- **Title of the post**: What did the seller name their ad?
- **Location**: Where did the seller post the ad from?
- **Post category**: What category on letgo/OfferUp did the seller post the ad under?
- **PDF File Name**: What is the name of the PDF that you've saved and uploaded this ad as?
- **Agreement and agreeance notes**: For the reviewer – please ignore!
Data entry process for each suspicious ad

- **Platform**: OfferUp or letgo?
- **Date found**: When did you find the ad?
- **Date posted**: When did the seller post the ad?
- **Keyword searched**: what did you search to find the ad?
- **Product type**: Elephant, pangolin, big cat, sea turtle, live big cat, or live primate?
- **URL**: Link of the post
- **User name**: Seller name
- **Title of the post**: What did the seller name their ad?
- **Location**: Where did the seller post the ad from?
- **Post category**: What category on letgo/OfferUp did the seller post the ad under?
- **PDF File Name**: What is the name of the PDF that you've saved and uploaded this ad as?
- **Agreeance and agreeance notes**: For the reviewer – please ignore!

Save PDF file of the ad in your PDF captures folder
PDF naming process for each suspicious ad

Name file as: Platform.Your Initials.00X

For example: ‘LG.AD.001’, ‘LG.AD.002’, ‘OU.AD.001’, ‘OU.AD.002’

OfferUp = ‘OU’
Letgo = ‘LG’

File names in your PDF capture folder must match the file name given to the ad in your data entry sheet.
• Provides suggestions on what wildlife keywords to search for
• Categorized by language
• One tab per animal group
## Cyber Spotter Schedule

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Amy D.</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlie M.</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christina S.</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David G.</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emily K.</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Giana T.</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeff S.</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jennifer L.</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joachim I.</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jordan W.</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kellie W.</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laura M.</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lauren M.</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lyssa M.</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Jo B.</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matt B.</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Max K.</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicole B.</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicole T.</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nita L.</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patricia C.</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter F.</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rachel M.</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sally A.</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shane G.</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 2</td>
<td>OfferUp</td>
<td>letgo / Region 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Elephant Product Detection
Distinctive feature of real elephant ivory: **Schreger lines**
Schreger Lines Viewed Vertically
Common Elephant Ivory Products

Puzzle Balls
Common Elephant Ivory Products
Jewelry (carved, beaded and bangles)
Common Elephant Ivory Products
Tusks (carved and raw)
Common Elephant Ivory Products
Tobacco and weapon accessories
Common Elephant Ivory Products

Figurines
Product Spotlight: Netsuke

Netsuke are small, Japanese ivory carvings commonly traded as antiques. They usually depict human or animal scenes. The best way to identify elephant ivory in netsuke carvings is to view an image of the bottom of the figure, which often clearly reveals Schreger Lines.
Elephant vs. Mammoth Ivory

Please flag mammoth ivory!
Elephant Ivory vs. Hippo
Elephant Ivory vs. Whale Teeth (Scrimshaw)
Elephant Ivory vs. Tagua Nut
Elephant Ivory vs. Walrus Ivory
Elephant Ivory vs. Helmeted Hornbill

“Red ivory”
Elephant Ivory vs. Bone
Elephant Ivory vs. Plastics
Non-Ivory Elephant Products

- Foot stools
- Elephant skin wallets
- Elephant skin boots
- Subcutaneous layer beaded bracelet
- Elephant hair bracelet
Example Elephant Ivory Search Words

- Bone
- Carved Bone
- Carved Chinese Bone
- Carved Chinese Faux
- Carved Faux
- Carved Ivory
- Carved Ivory Colour
- Carved Natural
- Chinese Deep Carved
- IVY
- Indian Carved
- Ivorine
- Ivory Coloured
- Marine Tooth
- Natural Grained
- Natural Material
- Natural Substance
- Netsuke
- Not Bone or Resin
- Not Man Made
- Faux Ivory
- Cow Bone
- Ox Bone
- Bovine Bone
- Faux Bone
- Patination
- Graining
- Schreger Lines
- Striations
- Weight or scales

“Passes hot pin test”
What’s a Hot Pin Test?
A needle or pin is heated and pressed against the product to determine if the product is real or synthetic.

**Real elephant ivory / tortoise shell products**
- Hot pin leaves a black spot on the product
- Hot pin test produces a smell “like burning hair”
- Product passes hot pin test

**Plastic products**
- Hot pin melts product
- Hot pin test produces a smell “like burning plastic”
- Product does NOT pass hot pin test

- Sellers who reference this test are familiar with how to identify real vs. fake products
- If a seller references that a elephant / sea turtle product as “passing” a hot pin / needle test, the product is real
- **Always flag ads** that mention “hot pin test” as suspicious!

*Elephant ivory and tortoise shell that has “passed” hot pin test*
Pangolin Product Detection
What is a Pangolin?

- Often called ‘scaly anteaters’
- The only mammal covered in large, protective, overlapping scales.
- Distinct long body, thin nose, muscular tail, and short legs
- The most trafficked mammal in the world

Search words & keywords: Scaly anteater, exotic anteater

Flag all pangolin and pangolin products you find!
Identifying Pangolin Product: Scales

Distinctly diamond shaped, and overlapping on a pangolin’s body, like an artichoke or pinecone.
Example Pangolin Products for Consumption

- **Whole scales**
- **Dried scales**
- **Crushed scales for pills and medicine**
- **Pangolin wine and tonics**

**Other products**: meat and whole pangolin for consumption
Example Pangolin Products: Skin and Leather

Pangolin skin wallets

Taxidermy pangolin
Because pangolin is highly sought after, pangolin products tend to be more expensive compared to other wildlife or synthetic products of the same kind.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Products</th>
<th>Price</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pangolin leather</td>
<td>$2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pangolin leather</td>
<td>$525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Python leather</td>
<td>$220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ostrich leather</td>
<td>$200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cow leather</td>
<td>$75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Leather made from pangolin skin will have a more uniform, smooth pattern than that of other exotic leathers.
Panda Trivia!

What’s the name of the panda that inspired WWF’s logo?
Chi Chi was transferred from the Beijing Zoo to London Zoo in 1958 and became a star attraction. Three years later, Sir Peter Scott created WWF's logo in her honor.

**Answer: Chi Chi**

Send the response “Chi Chi” to Lu, lu.gao@wwfus.org, so we can track your attendance to this webinar!
Live Animals
Live animal spotlight: tiger cubs

Tigers are the most common big cat species found in captivity. Today, there are more tigers that live in captivity than in the wild.

Tiger cubs taken from the wild are sold into the exotic pet trade. Social media is increasing the demand to own and to be close to tigers.
Live animal spotlight: slow loris

Slow lorises are small primates native S.E. Asia.

More recently, after videos of slow lorises emerged on the internet, the demand for slow lorises as pets has skyrocketed.

Although they are “cute,” slow lorises do not fare well in a captive setting, as they are solitary, nocturnal and stress-sensitive animals.
Suspicious Seller Clues
Shipping Restrictions

- Require an in-person meeting
- May not ship to certain states, across state lines or internationally
- May be based in a different country from the location of the product
- May promise they can ship worldwide within a few days.
Price

- If the price of the product is very high compared to other similar products, it is worth flagging the post!
Language & Key Words

- Use quotation marks around words and product-specific keywords
- Provide contact information to take conversations and transactions off-line
- Using keywords, search words and hashtags identified in our spreadsheet
Image Clues

- Including a scale in the images (left)
- Stock photos and using same photos (for live animals)
- Health of the animal (for live animals)
Hot Pin Tests

• For elephant ivory and tortoise turtle shell products, if a seller notes that the product will pass a hot pin test, be sure to flag
Next steps

1. **Day 1** of Spotting is Monday December 10th!
2. Reach out to Lu if you have any questions as you start
3. Weekly reminders will be sent out. Check your spreadsheets weekly to see feedback on your flags!
4. Happy Spotting!