East Meets West: Choral Composers of the Eastern Mediterranean School

by Joshua R. Jacobson

I am of the West by birth and education, but I stem from the East and live in the East. I regard this as a great blessing indeed and it makes me feel grateful. The problem of synthesis of East and West occupies musicians all over the world. If we—thanks to our living in a country that forms a bridge between East and West—can provide a modest contribution to such a synthesis in music, we shall be very happy.

Paul Ben-Haim

With these words, Israeli composer Paul Ben-Haim (1897–1984) explained the credo of the "Eastern Mediterranean" school. Ben-Haim, né Frankenberger, left his native Germany in 1933 to seek a safe haven in the land of his ancestors. There he succeeded in establishing a new national style marked by the assimilation of Middle Eastern folk elements into the framework of Western musical tradition.

Jewish Nationalism

The roots of modern Jewish nationalism lie in Russia at the close of the nineteenth century. Many Jews, having left the confines of the ghetto, were seeking ways in which to express their ethnic identity. Thousands of Russian Jews emigrated to Palestine with the goal of rebuilding the ancient Jewish homeland. In their determination to leave behind the oppressive ways of diaspora life, these pioneer settlers sought to create a new existence for themselves. They traded their given European names for those of the Hebrew Bible. They ceased speaking Russian, German, and Yiddish, and created a new language out of the ancient Hebrew tongue. They left behind their former occupations to work the land as farmers, shedding their European garb and adopting the Arab form of dress. They rejected monarchies and capitalistic systems in favor of idealistic communal societies. All their efforts were directed toward reestablishing the Jewish people as a distinct and self-sufficient nation.

In the 1930s the political upheavals in Europe changed the reasons for immigration. Many Jewish refugees saw in Palestine not merely an experiment in nationalism but virtually their only chance for survival. These new immigrants were not interested in an idealistic return to the land; they merely wanted to carry on with their lives as they had before the Nazis came to power. To that end, these men and women from Central Europe settled in the cities of Tel Aviv and Haifa, building commercially and culturally thriving metropolitan areas.

Political nationalism stimulated a cultural awareness as well. Each stage of this modern Jewish revival evoked a particular musical expression. As in the political arena, the first musical efforts were centered around Russian-Jewish roots. But, when the political focus of Jewish nationalism shifted to Palestine, its music also began to assume a new character. Composers in the new land, by and large, rejected the folk songs of the diaspora that had been the inspiration of the Russian-Jewish nationalists.

A strange urge was born to toss overboard the tradition of the ghetto forefathers, to be rid of their heritage of the long exile. All the ancient cultural values, like the Yiddish language, literature, and especially its melodies, were forcefully abandoned as being of no account.

During the first decades of the Zionist settlement, very little art music was created. In a society totally occupied with the task of building a country, there was no leisure time for formal

---

Joshua R. Jacobson is Professor of Music and Director of Choral Activities at Northeastern University, Boston, Massachusetts. He is also founder and director of the Zamir Chorale of Boston.
concerts. Furthermore, pioneer ideals demanded folk music for communal singing; concert-going in the European sense was considered a step backwards. Although sporadic attempts at serious music-making appeared in the growing towns of Tel Aviv, Haifa, and Jerusalem during the second and third decades of this century, it was not until the arrival of the more sophisticated urban immigrants from Central Europe in the 1930s that a solid base for Western musical culture was established in Palestine.

The formation of competent professional performing ensembles created an opportunity for serious composition in the Jewish settlement. Many composers tried to turn their backs (at least in part) on musical developments in Europe and on the European-Jewish melos. Instead, they sought their inspiration in the melodies of the Middle East, ancient and modern. They eschewed the avant-garde and endeavored to make their compositions readily accessible to singers and audience. By the early 1940s, a new, self-conscious, nationalistic style had emerged, which was soon dubbed the “Eastern Mediterranean” school. The term was coined in the 1940s by Israeli music critics, who were alluding to “The Case of Wagner,” an essay written by Friederich Nietzsche in 1888. The essay compared the music of Bizet’s Carmen with the operas of Wagner, on whom Nietzsche was turning his back. Musicians in Israel eagerly adopted his description of Bizet’s opera as their own musical credo.

What it has above all else is that which belongs to subtropical zones—that dryness of atmosphere, that limpidita of the air. Here in every respect the climate is altered. Here another kind of sensuality, another kind of sensitiveness, and another kind of cheerfulness, make their appeal. This music [Carmen] is gay, but not in a French or German way. Its gaiety is African. . . . I envy Bizet for having had the courage of this sensitiveness, which hitherto in the cultured music of Europe has found no means of expression—of this southern, tawny, sunburnt sensitiveness. . . . What a joy the golden afternoon of its happiness is to us! . . . Il faut méditerraniser la musique, and I have reasons for this principle. The return to nature, health, good spirits, youth, virtue.3

Choral societies grew quickly in Israel, and composers were attracted to the choral medium. Singers and composers were eager to express through music the nationalistic sentiments of the Zionist ideology. Most popular among these choral societies were (and still are) arrangements of local popular songs. But composers also were writing original choral works, many of which were conceived in the new Mediterranean style. The specific nature of their texts, melodies, rhythms, and harmonizations anchored these works in the stream of Israeli nationalism.

Like Ben-Haim, most of the Israeli nationalistic composers included in this study were born in Europe but eagerly immersed themselves in the local folklore of their adopted country. Yechezkel Braun was brought to Israel from his native Breslau at the age of two. His interest in chant, including several years’ study at the Sollemnes monastery in France, is evident in the lyricism of his works, many of which are derived from traditional Jewish chants. Tsvi Avni was born in Saarbrücken in 1927 and settled in Israel in 1935. His education in Israel with Ben-Haim and Mordecai Seter was supplemented with studies in the United States under Vladmir Ussachevsky, Aaron Copland, and Lukas Foss. Moshe Wilenski, born in Warsaw in 1910, settled in Israel in 1932. A multifaceted musician, he is known primarily for his inspirational popular songs whose texts are based either on the Bible or on themes of the contemporary Middle East.

Texts

For textual inspiration, these composers turned most often to the Bible. Certain Biblical verses represented for the modern Jewish settlers a historical link with the ancient Hebrew kingdom: songs of praise from the Psalms, songs of love from Solomon’s Canticle, songs from the Pentateuch describing Israel’s earliest connection with the land, and verses from the Prophets predicting their nation’s eventual restoration to that land.4 There were hardly any songs dealing with life in the diaspora or in the languages of the diaspora. Hebrew was used exclusively.

Certain musical implications are inherent in the structure of Classical Hebrew. In Biblical poetry, lines are linked in pairs, not by the rhyming of terminal vowels and consonants, but by a rhyming of ideas known as “parallelismus membrorum.” In this form of parallelism, the second line of each pair acts as an intensification, an antimony, or an echo of the first. In Psalm 1, verses 5–6 demonstrate this feature:

Therefore the wicked will not survive judgment, 
Nor will sinners in the assembly of the righteous. 
For the Lord cherishes the way of the righteous; 
But the way of the wicked is doomed.

These poems were performed responsorially by antiphonal choirs during Temple services in ancient Jerusalem. This practice has been kept alive in both church and synagogue. Antiphonal effects can be found in settings of psalm texts by contemporary Israeli composers. The example given in Figure 1 illustrates the antiphonal process in Yechezkel Braun’s Hallel. The male and female choirs each sing alternating half-verses from Psalm 111.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verse</th>
<th>Text</th>
<th>Voicing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td><em>Gedolim ma'asey Adonai</em>, The works of God are sublime,</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td><em>derushim lechol chefitshem</em>, dear to all who seek them.</td>
<td>TB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td><em>Had vehehad pa'olo</em>, His works are full of glory and majesty;</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and His righteousness endureth forever.</td>
<td>TB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td><em>Zeicher asch leniflet osav</em>; He allows us to commemorate</td>
<td>SA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>His marvels;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td><em>chanun verachan Adonai</em>, God is merciful and tenderhearted.</td>
<td>TB</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1. Antiphony in Braun’s “Hallel” (mm. 25–30)
The inflection of Hebrew speech generally moves from weak to strong, i.e., most polysyllabic words begin with an unaccented syllable (e.g., de-ru-SHIM le-CHOL chef-tsei-HEM). The overall pattern is different from that of such languages as Latin, German, and English, which are generally front-accented (e.g., PLE-ni sunt COE-li et TER-ra; FREU-de SCHÖ-ne GÖT-ter-fun-ken; BLESS-ing and HON-or, GLO-ry and POW-er be UN-to HIM). Accordingly, most Hebrew vocal music moves rhythmically from weak to strong (Figure 2).

Scales

The folk music of the Middle East is characterized by scales whose interval patterns are, in many cases, quite different from those of Western Europe. These include primitive di-, tri-, and pentatonic scales; modes which resemble the ecclesiastical Dorian, Aeolian, Mixolydian, Phrygian, and Lydian; and chromatic scales of various configurations. These modes were embraced by the composers of Israel as the very building blocks of a new nationalistic musical language. In the words of Israeli composer Ben-Zion Orgad:

Western nations display in our era a kind of exhaustion. The artist turns to the exotic to rouse his artistic blood, but actually this exoticism hasn't brought about a substantive change... There is a difference between our exoticism and that of the West. Ours arises out of a desire to be absorbed into an old-new ethnic region. We have a strong desire to bridge our contemporary culture with our ancient culture.5

The most primitive of the Middle Eastern scales is the two- or three-step scale, basically a monotone, occasionally decorated with a step above and below (Figure 3).6 The third movement of Paul Ben-Haim's Roni Akara begins with just such a melody. The reiterated tonic is decorated by tones a step above and below it (Figure 4). The anhemitonic pentatonic scale can be seen in the first six measures of Yehezkel Braun's Shir HaShirim (Figure 5).
Perhaps the most characteristic scales of Semitic-Oriental music are the various chromatic forms. Two hallmarks of these scales are the interval of the augmented second (Figure 6) and melodic motion of two consecutive half steps (Figure 7).

Melodic ornamentation is common in the performance of Semitic-Oriental folk music. Two of the most common ornaments are the turn and the grace note. Paul Ben-Haim, attuned to this performance practice as a result of his experience accompanying Yemenite singers, incorporated these decorative touches into many of his scores (Figures 10 and 11).

Several authors have pointed to the tetrachordal nature of Hebrew melodies. In the ancient traditions of cantillation, one finds motives that outline a tetrachord or prominently feature the leap of a fourth away from the tonic (Figure 12). Similar melodic tendencies are to be found in the choral music of Braun (Figure 13).

Braun argues that, in most cases, the tetrachord can be broken down into a minor third, with the addition of a major

Motives

Fragments of extant folk songs are often found in compositions by the nationalist composers. While some composers consciously quote folk sources, in most cases the quotation seems to be the result of the ethnic material having been integrated into the composer's subconscious.

In settings of Biblical texts, nationalist composers often employ motifs derived from liturgical cantillation. These melodies normally appear as identifiable fragments within a larger melodic span. They are not used consistently for more than a few measures, and they do not necessarily correlate with the proper tropal form for the text set. In the example given below, a motive from the cantillation of the Song of Solomon (Figure 8) is applied to a Psalm text (Figure 9).

Motive for the Ashkenazic cantillation of the Song of Solomon

Motive from Psalm 48

Figure 6. "Rahamana," Sephardic song from Saloniki

Figure 7. Avni, "Miznarei Tehillim" (mm. 11–20)

Figure 8. Motive for the Ashkenazic cantillation of the Song of Solomon

Figure 9. Avni, "Miznarei Tehillim," movement 2 (mm. 1–2), from Psalm 48

Figure 10. Ben-Haim, "Kabbalat Shabbat" (mm. 8–14)

Figure 11. Ben-Haim, "Kabbalat Shabbat" (mm. 3–4)

Figure 12. Cantillation of the Prophetic Lesson, Lithuanian Jewish tradition
second above or below (Figure 14).\textsuperscript{11} This hypothesis is supported by the example in Figure 13 and by the speculation that the minor (or “neutral”) third is the core interval of all primitive melody.\textsuperscript{12}

![Figure 13. Braun, “Shir HaShirim” (mm. 1–8)](image)

![Figure 14. Ur-motif](image)

**Texture**

The composer who attempts to integrate Western compositional forms with Eastern folk melodies is faced with the problem of imposing polyphony upon a body of monophonic music whose nature may be incongruous with Western harmony. One solution to this dilemma is to avoid polyphony altogether and employ unison or octaves. While this texture is found occasionally within the context of larger works, its use is probably not any more frequent in Israeli choral music than in the standard choral repertoire.

Other solutions involve the utilization of some simple polyphonic devices used by folk musicians. Middle Eastern folk singers, like their counterparts throughout the world, instinctively improvise some sort of polyphony as a form of “vertical decoration” on a monophonic tune. The techniques most commonly used are heterophony, parallel part-singing, drones, and canons.\textsuperscript{13}

Heterophony is the simultaneous appearance of a melody in two or more voice parts, where one voice presents the melody in a simple form, and the other(s) in a variant form. Heterophony can be the result of a conscious artistic embroidery or an unconscious variation in pitch on the part of one or more singers. Frequent clashes of a major or minor second are not uncommon in such a texture.\textsuperscript{14} Ben-Haim has made use of heterophonic texture in a number of his choral works. Generally, a melody is traced in parallel octaves with the addition of ornamental turns (Figure 15).

![Figure 15. Ben-Haim, “Roni Akara” (mm. 4–5)](image)

In parallel part-singing, octaves, fifths, fourths, thirds, and even seconds are widespread. Composers wishing to evoke a primitive texture often score voices in parallel fourths or fifths (Figure 16).

Drones of various types are common to primitive folk styles. In its simplest form, the drone is an accompaniment consisting of a single pitch, either sustained indefinitely or broken up into reiterations. Drones are used in the following example to evoke a hypnotic effect (Figure 17).

Canons and other simple imitative devices may have originated from one singer’s lagging behind and overlapping another, with the practice eventually becoming integrated into the repertoire of primitive polyphonic techniques. Simple canons are occasionally used by nationalistic composers to evoke a folklike character (Figure 18).

![Figure 16. Ben-Haim, “Roni Akara” (m. 7)](image)

![Figure 17. Braun, “Shir HaShirim” (mm. 19–38)](image)
Harmonic Structure

One of the most conspicuous features of nearly all the Middle Eastern modes is the lack of a scale degree one half-step below the tonic. The leading tone is often either replaced by a "sub-tonic" note a whole-step below the tonic or omitted altogether. In the nineteenth century, composers attempting to harmonize modal melodies were loath to give up the leading tone and its strong harmonic implications. In the twentieth century, however, many composers were able to take a fresh look at harmonizing these old melodies. As Béla Bartók wrote in his Autobiography (1921):

The study of all this peasant music had the decisive significance for me that it led me to the possibility of a complete emancipation from the exclusive rule of the traditional major-minor system. For the overwhelming proportion of the repertory of melodies, and the most valuable of them, adhere to the old church modes or the ancient Greek modes and contain still older modes (especially pentatonic).... Thus it was clear that the old scales, disused in our art music, had by no means lost their vitality. Returning to their use, moreover, made possible novel harmonic combinations.15

The American-Jewish composer Isadore Freed devised a system of "modal harmony" by building chords out of only those pitches contained within the chant being harmonized. He explained the system in this way:

Jewish modal harmony is based more on the restriction of the harmonic resources than on their expansion. But the resulting process, when artistically used, creates an aesthetic freshness nevertheless: for the practice of deliberately avoiding the most commonly used progressions of traditional harmony results in a new arrangement of harmonic forces. This in itself represents an extremely desirable end.16

Each of the traditional synagogue modes has its own characteristic motivic patterns. One of the most common melodic formulas in both the Aeolian and Mixolydian modes is the cadential progression from the flat-seventh degree to the tonic. When harmonizing these cadences, composers frequently employ either the minor dominant or the major subtonic triad resolving to the tonic (Figure 19).

Rhythm

In folk songs from Eastern Mediterranean lands, long narrative texts (especially those of a sacred nature) are delivered as a free recitative with no fixed meter. The rhythm flows according to the natural accentual patterns of the words; unstressed syllables are generally rendered by short notes, and stressed syllables are set to longer notes or melismas. The example given below illustrates this style in the Babylonian Jewish tradition (Figure 20).17

Traditionally, these recitatives are performed as solos. Because of the improvisatory nature of their rhythm, a true unison ensemble performance would be extremely difficult to achieve. Thus, attempts at choral settings in this style normally sacrifice a measure of this rhythmic suppleness. Composers have, nonetheless, tried to approximate this style in a number of ways. The penultimate movement of Braun's Shir HaShirim is scored for soprano solo. Although notated in a conventional meter, the music displays the rhythmic freedom (as well as many of the actual motives) of Jewish cantillation (Figure 21).

Ben-Haim created a unique polyphonic recitative in the fourth movement of his motet, Roni Akara. The predominant texture of parallel fourths and octaves tends to suppress any harmonic accents which would interfere with the free flow of this quasi-organum (Figure 22).

In marked contrast to the rhapsodic freedom of Biblical chanting is the highly rhythmic style that is characteristic of dance music. Israeli composers (most notably Avni and Braun), intrigued by the unique additive meters of many Middle Eastern folk songs, attempted to match these meters with the irregular rhythms of Hebrew Biblical poetry.
Eastern music, however, is in many cases “additive” or “heterometric,” constructed of a chain of short, dissimilar metric units. It is not unusual to encounter such meters as 3+2, 3+3+2, 3+2+2, and 2+2+2+3. In Greece, the most common folk dance, the Kalamatianos, uses a repeated rhythmic pattern of either \( j\j j (3+2+2) \) or \( j\j j (2+2+3) \).

Yemenite Jewish songs are often built on even longer, more complex heterometric units. The talesas (or recurring rhythmic patterns) consist of irregular patterns of threes and twos. In the following example (Figure 24), the meter is \( J(3+4+3+4+3) \).

The spirit of these unusual metric patterns has been captured by Avni in the first movement of his Mizmorei Tehillim. The composer uses a rhythmic device akin to the musique mesuree of sixteenth-century French composers. Generally, he allows a half note to monosyllabic words as well as to syllables that receive a primary or secondary stress, and a quarter note to unstressed syllables. In the excerpt shown in Figure 25, all primary and secondary stressed syllables are italicized.

Unlike the symmetrical structure characteristic of so much music and poetry of the Western European traditions, the poetry of the Hebrew Bible has an irregular rhythm based on the relative positions of the accented syllables within each verse. There is no given metrical framework; no regular pattern of dactyls or anapests is evident. Rather, each line contains either two, three, four, or six poetic feet of various sizes. In the second and third verses from Psalm 47, each line contains four feet varying in size from one to four syllables, resulting in an asymmetrical rhythmic flow.

KOL ha-a-MiM tik-U CHAF ha-RI-u leit-lo-HIM be-KOL ri-NAH.

A similar asymmetry can also be detected in the dance music of the Middle East. Most Western music is “multiplicative” in its temporal structure; for example, in common time, phrases are generally built of two groups of two beats balanced by another two groups of two beats. The meter of Middle...
Another phenomenon that characterizes the Mediterranean school is the evocation of the hora dance rhythm. Ironically, the dance most commonly associated with the land of Israel is not indigenous to the Middle East; the hora was imported in the early part of this century from Romania. Nonetheless, its characteristic syncopation, \( \frac{1}{3} \), was adopted by many of the composers of this school (Figures 26 and 27).

![Figure 26. Moshe Wilenski, "Uri Tsiyon" (mm. 25–32)](image)

![Figure 27. Ben-Haim, "Roni Akara" (mm. 20–21)](image)

Musical Bridges

Composers in Israel today represent virtually every band of the musical spectrum. Their idioms are nationalist and internationalist, aleatoric and dodecaphonic, neoromantic and minimalist, electronic and concrete. This article has attempted to isolate and define one body of music, show some of the historical reasons for its emergence at a particular time in history, determine its roots, and examine its characteristics.

The following features of these works have been noted. First, these compositions are simple. This reflects not only the composer's desire to emulate primitive folk styles but also the practical consideration of the performing forces at hand. Second, in works based on Psalm texts, an antiphonal scoring often occurs, reflecting the parallel structure of the verses. Third, these composers utilize the modes of Semitic-Oriental folk music, largely avoiding that mainstay of Western tonal music, the major scale. Fourth, these composers employ folk materials: the common ur-motif of minor third plus major second, the typical embellishments of folk musicians, motifs from cantillations and prayer modes, and the primitive polyphonic devices of folk musicians. Fifth, while the music is by no means atonal, a certain bipolarity or ambiguity of tonal centers is found. Finally, in their approach to rhythm, these composers frequently attempt to imitate either the free flow of recitative or the additive meters of Middle Eastern folk dances and Biblical poetry.

The styles observed are, in a sense, a musical metaphor for the modern state of Israel: a people striving to move into the future while retaining and revitalizing the roots of the past; a people enjoying the technology and culture of the West while trying to reenter the world of the East; linguists, artists, politicians, and philosophers struggling to bridge East and West, past and present.

Musical examples used by permission.


NOTES

4 Despite the prevalence of Biblical texts, most of these choral works are in no sense liturgical. Their music transcends the synagogue; it deals with concepts of national redemption that were a daily obsession with the secularized Zionist settlers. Exceptions are found only in the few liturgical works commissioned by American synagogues.
5 Michal Zemora, *Yevadi Mitzarakhjym Umaraayjym Beemuiska Bgeinad* [Eastern and Western Foundations of Music in Israel] (Tel Aviv: Israel Music Institute, 1968), 46.
Yechezkel Braun, *Seventy-seven Traditional Jewish Melodies* (Tel Aviv: Mi'alei Tarbut VeChinuch, 1981), no. 61. In this folk song, many pitches have been rounded off to the nearest tempered scale degree; in actual performance practice, certain notes may be sung as much as a quarter-tone above or below the notated pitch. In the choral music examined for this article, not one composer calls for choral singing in quarter tones. One would assume that this is due to the fact that the Western-trained singers who would perform these works might have difficulty executing these microtonal shadings of pitch.

Zemora, 67–70.


Braun, *Jewish Melodies*, no. 71.

Braun, interview by the author, Boston, Massachusetts, January 18, 1982.


Nettl, 80; Sachs, *Wellsprings*, 77.


Braun, *Jewish Melodies*, no. 69.

Sachs, *Rhythm and Tempo*, 69–70; Sendrey, 246.

Idelsohn, no. 176b.

---

**Position Available**

Full-time Director of Music for growing 3700-member church, with emphasis upon Worship, Evangelism, and Missions. To begin July 1993. Established Music Ministry with a fully graded choir program and commitment to excellence, including performances at national, regional, and ACDA conventions. Multi-million dollar complex includes full music suite, 83-rank Cassavant, and Steinway concert grand. Graduate degree with excellent experience and administrative skills. Send résumé and references to: Music Search Committee/Briarwood Presbyterian Church 2200 Briarwood Way/Birmingham, Alabama 35243

---

**1993 World Symposium on Choral Music**

Vancouver, August 1–7, 1993

An intensive week of workshops, lectures and concerts with leading international choral musicians.

A global sharing of ideas with choral colleagues from more than 50 countries.