Re-imagining Public Employment Programmes
The case of South Africa’s Presidential Employment Stimulus

Kate Philip
Programme Lead: Presidential Employment Stimulus

Assessing Global Progress in Advancing the Jobs Guarantee
Virtual Panel: Bard College NY
25 January 2023
Unemployment: A crisis in South Africa
Exacerbated by the pandemic

35%  Unemployment
45%  Including discouraged work seekers
55.97%  Youth unemployment
As part of the Economic Recovery...
Over a million jobs and opportunities
October 2020 - October 2022

Jobs created
Achieved: **771,574**
Target: **879,031**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Achieved</th>
<th>Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DBE</td>
<td>596,109</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DTIC</td>
<td>50,728</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DWYPD</td>
<td>41,640</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFFE</td>
<td>29,088</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCOGTA</td>
<td>14,855</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOT</td>
<td>10,245</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOH</td>
<td>6,961</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NT Cities</td>
<td>6,234</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSD</td>
<td>5,399</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSAC</td>
<td>3,838</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPDW</td>
<td>1,881</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DHET</td>
<td>1,701</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DALRRD</td>
<td>1,464</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism</td>
<td>941</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEL</td>
<td>177</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Livelihoods supported
Achieved: **258,923**
Target: **311,269**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Achieved</th>
<th>Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DALRRD</td>
<td>161,055</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSD</td>
<td>57,839</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSAC</td>
<td>38,024</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DWYPD</td>
<td>2,005</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DBE</td>
<td>31,114</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSAC</td>
<td>8,356</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSD</td>
<td>1,076</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Jobs retained
Achieved: **40,526**
Target: **60,742**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Achieved</th>
<th>Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DBE</td>
<td>31,114</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSAC</td>
<td>8,356</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSD</td>
<td>1,076</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Budget for Phases 1+2**
Phase 1: **R12.6 billion**
Phase 2: **R10.9 billion**

**Beneficiaries**
1,071,023 (86% of total target)
Target: 1,251,042

**Performance**
83% youth
63% female

Achieved: **88%**
Target: 879,031

Achieved: **83%**
Target: 311,269

Achieved: **67%**

Under-utilised funds for job retention during strict lockdown were used to extend the duration of selected programmes.

The challenge of designing for scale...
What the PES delivered in record time:
Over a million jobs and opportunities
October 2020 - October 2022

Benefits

- 1,071,023 beneficiaries
  - 86% of total target
  - Target: 1,251,042

Performance

- 83% youth
- 63% female

Livelihoods supported

- Achieved: 258,923
  - Target: 311,269

Jobs retained

- Achieved: 40,526
  - Target: 60,742

Budget for Phases 1+2

- Phase 1: R12.6 billion
- Phase 2: R10.9 billion

A key question for job guarantees – the interface with self-employment, precarity and the gig economy?

Under-utilised funds for job retention during strict lockdown were used to extend the duration of selected programmes.
Highlights from the 15 programmes in the Presidential Employment Stimulus
A portfolio approach.

See https://www.stateofthenation.gov.za/employment-stimulus-dashboard
The Basic Education Employment Initiative

• Nearly 600,000 youth placed so far in 2 cohorts – 255,000 more starting from 1 Feb 2023.
• High quality work experience: mentorship often 1:1 with a teacher.
• Time management, task management, communication, admin, IT, and much more.
• Largest single youth employment programme in SA’s history.
Reaching the ‘jobs deserts’ for youth …..

**Figure 1:** Youth Employment Density by South African Municipality (2020)

*Source:* Harambee EJ Survey (2020) n = 161,097

*EJ responses for 2020 who reported having a job were overlaid with municipality. Grey indicative of a jobs desert

**Figure 2:** DBE Teacher Assistant School Locations by South African Municipality (2021)

*Source:* Density of school location by municipality for DBE teacher assistant placements. *DBE data showing the location of schools where teachers assistants were placed per municipality
This can work anywhere in the world.

Enabling spatial targeting

Creating real social value.

And going to scale, quickly.
Supporting the Creative Sector to create their own jobs

Over 32,000 creatives received support.

- Calls for proposals to the sector to propose work to create jobs for themselves and others.
  - Not a classic PEP model. Majority small entities, self-employed.
  - Recognising and responding to precarity in the gig economy as part of the employment landscape
  - Allowing them to sustain their enterprises rather than leave them to take up a classic employment contract in a PEP.
- Creating outputs of cultural/social value in the sector – movies, plays, music, performances and more
- Many of these outputs able to earn additional income – eg movie and theatre tickets, sale of rights.
- **Leveraging** the public investment to create further income – enhancing incomes for participants – supporting GDP of the sector.
Supporting Ecological Infrastructure and Biodiversity

• Eg Catchment management involves many stakeholders – communities, private landholders, traditional authorities, metros, mines.
• Requires integrated approaches – yet efforts often fragmented.
• Catchment management delivers better water quantity and quality and reduces siltation of dams i.e. economic (and social) value. Robust science.
• Scope for PEP jobs to act as a catalyst for Payments for Environmental Service – transitioning to sustainable jobs.

Using PEPs for Market Development
Cities challenge

**Eg Streetscapes** – an NGO in partnership with the Cape Town metro and the private sector. Employing homeless people in precinct management.

And urban food gardens on public land.

- Digitisation of city records
- Innovation in waste recycling
- Community safety
- Improvements to informal trader spaces
- Public art and placemaking
The Social Employment Fund
Part of the Social and Solidarity Economy Strategy

Supporting work that serves the common good in communities

• 26 Strategic Implementing Partners appointed from the non-state sector, contracted to employ 50,000 people;
• Each SIP supports a network of mainly informal local community-based organisations; creating access to support for local initiative.
• Unlocking agency in communities and supporting local development priorities.
• Work includes combating GBV, food security, ECD, community safety, placemaking and much more.
• Central payments system, biometric enrolment, digital outputs reports.
• Part-time work supports interface with self-employment, livelihoods.
• The Learning Forum has met regularly to enable peer learning and capacity building.

‘There’s no shortage of work to be done to make South Africa a better place’.

President Cyril Ramaphosa
Crowd-Sourced Ideas for Social Employment

“Oh, the thinks you can think up if only you try”  
Dr Seuss
One children’s book was all it took for Litha Sam-Sam from Vygrond in Cape Town to start a children’s reading and literacy initiative at the height of the Covid-19 pandemic - now supported through the Social Employment Fund.

This ECD Centre in Joliivet forms part of an integrated approach to supporting mothers and their children - starting while mothers are still pregnant.

In Ugu and Umdoni in KZN, Siyavuna Development Trust is supporting the transfer of indigenous agricultural knowledge from older farmers to 992 young people - creating inter-generational engagement in the process.

“Wanneer jy nie werk nie, want daar is nie werk nie, is jy niks. Ons is moeg van niks wees nie. SEF gaan ons help en dit gaan ons mense help.” – SEF applicant, Fraserburg, NC
For example: Addressing the burden of unpaid care work

- Care: an unresolved gender issue
- Paying for care through PEPs gives it social recognition – and an economic value.
- Institutionalising community-based care, augmenting stretched health systems.
- Translating an individualized burden within the household into a shared – and socialized - form of work.
- Giving both carers – and those receiving care – access to wider networks of support.
Institutionalising and enabling community-driven forms of solidarity.

- The importance evident once more in the pandemic
- Eg community food kitchens - run by volunteers, many of whom were unemployed.
- With support from restaurants, farmers, public bodies and many others in society.
- Vital solidarity: but it becomes hard to sustain.
- Social employment as an instrument for sustaining solidarity.
(Re)Building the commons

- Additional social instruments and institutions are needed to build and optimize the use of common resources, the sense of common ownership in communities.

- To build civic capital, strengthen social ties, networks and social co-operation.

- Building problem-solving capabilities in communities.

- This requires organization. **Sustaining organization requires social/ public investment.**

- This is part of ‘work for the common good’. 
Unlocking the social value of labour.

Because even when labour has no market value, it has—and can create—social value.

What we need are social instruments to unlock that value.

Value that is currently all too often a wasted—and wasting—asset.

Unlocking the social value of labour is a critical part of breaking the bonds of market primacy in labour markets.

A critical part of the social construction of markets
PEPs & the Just Transition

• Even in best case scenarios, moving from dependence on eg coal-mining jobs in mining communities is unlikely to involve a seamless transition to sparkly new jobs for all in a given local economy.

• Green PEP jobs – yes

• But any and all decent jobs in the right place at the right time are part of a just transition.

• Need to embed in the discourse.
The portfolio approach enabled experimentation, diversity of forms of work, contextual responses.

Building the institutional architecture for scale
- Not the same as ‘replicating’ projects

Programme management matters. So resource it as if it does.
- Huge pushback on PM fees

There is a limit to labour intensity
- Few programmes need NO tools and materials etc for the work to be performed

Quality of outcomes requires skills mix on site.

Antipathy to ‘intermediaries’ but enables state contracting to reach the grassroots

Opportunities from digital, transversal G2P payment and reporting systems, digital identity

Work experience undervalued relative to formal training.

Fund mechanisms enable innovation and partnership, which are hard to ‘procure’
And some policy and research issues

- **The interface with cash transfers / BIG**
  - Poverty multi-dimensional – solutions are too. Not a binary choice.

- **Unlocking the social value of labour – the ‘market-shaping’ element**
  - The labour market implications of institutionalized alternatives to market primacy in labour markets
  - Role in setting a labour market floor
  - As an instrument to mitigate precarity – the role of support ‘scaffolding’ from eg part-time work
  - The potential for ‘social employment’: publicly-funded, driven by non-state actors. Embracing new forms of work and public value creation

- **The impact of participation in work is poorly researched and rarely evaluated**
  - Mitigating the psycho-social impacts of unemployment
  - Inclusion and social cohesion effects; (re)building the commons, institutionalizing support for solidarity
  - Social and economic functioning, organisation
  - Productivity and economic dynamism

- **The link to pathways into employment, entrepreneurship and livelihoods – but the challenge where unemployment deeply structural.**
  - In our context, work experience ‘de-risks’ youth employment for employers

- **Stimulus effects in local economies, macro-economic effects at scale.**
  - Particularly hard to reach and marginalized areas.
  - A bottom-up stimulus mechanism.
Let’s re-imagine them as a transformative one.

‘Socially-constructing’ labour markets differently in the process ... Institutionalising ways of unlocking the social value of labour.

PEPs - a versatile development instrument.