On Chintan

Conference Paper - July 2010

1 author:

Joshua Nash
University of New England (Australia)
66 PUBLICATIONS  128 CITATIONS

Some of the authors of this publication are also working on these related projects:

Norfolk Island placename research View project

Linguistics, toponymy, and geography View project
1. Introduction

Difficulties are often encountered when crossing the emic-etic divide and describing relationships between the personal and the scientific in ethnographic research. The possibility of describing and embodying a self-constitutive subjective relation (Foucault, 2005) means that people and indeed researchers “are becoming more comfortable with the focus on the self-in-relation that this subjective relation entails” (Lea, 2009: 72). Recent literature dealing with the Indian experience of yoga practice and auto-observation and auto-reporting, e.g. Smith (2007); Lea (2009), demonstrate the prospect of the effectiveness of involving the self-subject not only in more common ethnographic analyses and in the analysis of ‘New Age’ practices but also in the cross-cultural setting. Such thought can be summarised in claims by scholars like Taylor (1991) who have argued that there has developed a massive subjective turn in and of modern culture. Such theory and current findings have serious ramifications for how researchers undertake and write ethnographies that incorporate the personal, spiritual experience. Modern ethnographic theory and methods (Jackson, 1989), self-reporting in anthropology (Salzman, 2002), rethinking the cultural divide between ‘other’ and ‘self’ (Kusserow, 1999) and doing cross-cultural ethnography pose the possibility of a new auto-writing of ethno-spiritual experience.

Retreating to ‘Nature’ (Lea, 2008) and developing an awareness of the relationship between self and nature and self and inner nature is a constant theme in ‘Therapeutic Landscapes’ (e.g.

---

1 This paper was presented to the 18th Biennial Conference of the Asian Studies Association of Australia in Adelaide, 5-8 July 2010. It has been peer reviewed via a double referee process and appears on the Conference Proceedings Website by the permission of the author who retains copyright. This paper may be downloaded for fair use under the Copyright Act (1954), its later amendments and other relevant legislation.
Williams, 2008). There appears the idea that notions of stillness, calm and peace are integral to the living of and practice of an experiential relationship between self, spirit and nature (Conradson, 2008). While the realisation of such personal experiences and their incorporation to form a system of contemplative practice may be considered ‘religious’ (Stifler et al., 1993; Stone, 1978) and even involve (religious) institutional structures, there still remains the possibility that personal practice and the description of such practice can take place somewhat removed from the stringencies of institutionalised religion. This paper presents such a possibility and suggests that a non-denominational contemplative practice in nature is a worthy field of investigation for therapeutic landscapes and the anthropology of religion.

2. Definitions and aims
I will use several Sanskrit and Hindi terms in this paper because:

1. Indian thought forms the major part of the epistemology I present.
2. This research was conducted entirely in India where Sanskrit and Hindi terms are commonly used and understood without the need of their English equivalents.
3. Certain Sanskrit and Hindi terms capture very concisely the philosophical and practical import of this paper.

This will not detract from the applicability of the method and conclusion beyond an Indian context. Like Williams (2008), I posit that while emic conceptions in ethnography and especially the use of Indian terminology may appear non-transferrable to the Western setting, there are several common themes in the anthropology of religion and the actual spiritual ‘quest’, e.g. achievement of stillness, peace and enlightenment, that can be considered ‘etic’.

The concept I employ throughout this paper is chintan, a Hindi term which means ‘meditative reflection’ or ‘contemplation’. I maintain that while the use of chintan has its emic basis in Indian thought and spiritual practice, it also has etic transference beyond the Indian situation. My use of the term is based in over a decade of environmental fieldwork and spiritual practice in

2 Chintan is not a common word in everyday Hindi parlance. The concept and use of chintan should not be confused with the more common chinta ‘worry, anxiety’.
Vrindavan, Uttar Pradesh, India (this involvement is detailed below in Section 3). In the theology of certain spiritual traditions in Vrindavan especially the Radha-Vallabh temple tradition (Snell, 1991), *chintan* and contemplative activities in general are seen as a connecting tool for the individual to inner self. *Chintan* forms a type of ‘ecological spirituality’ involving two elements: *prakriti-chintan* (contemplation of and on nature) and *atma-chintan* (contemplation on self). These dualistic relations between the individual *atma* (self) and *paramatma* (Self) are emphasised in Krishna philosophy (Nelson, 2007) and in dualistic approaches in Indian philosophy (Clements, 2005).

I will define, outline and refine the meaning and significance of *chintan* throughout this paper. I will also report on the contradictions of crossing the borders of being a pilgrim cum environmental practitioner while simultaneously being an ‘objective’ scientific observer and ethnographer. What I am reporting on is my own experience of *chintan* while describing the importance of this notion for understanding the history and philosophy of certain Vrindavan environmental perspectives. The aims of this paper are threefold:

1. To outline the relevance of *chintan* to the environmental philosophy that has developed during the Vrindavan conservation movement’s history in Uttar Pradesh, India.
2. To suggest how *chintan* is essential to understanding not only the Vrindavan perspective on environmental matters but also the relationship between small ‘s’ self and big ‘S’ Self.
3. To put forward the possibility of both a philosophical and empirical approach to understanding *chintan* using a personal example.

This paper addresses and considers a question, namely my own question I have had for many years, of how a Westerner poses and perceives an apparently Indian point of view of living a life of contemplative meditation during a stipulated period of training. How can training equip individuals of Eastern or Western origin to live a similar life away from the training location? That is, how can students of *chintan* take their experiences back home and live them away from life in an Indian ashram? In addition to the theory presented in the introductory paragraphs, this research is also related to deeper ethnographic perspectives, e.g. Feld and Basso (1996),
emotional geographies, e.g. Kearney and Bradley (2009) and pilgrimage studies, e.g. Coleman and Eade (2004).

3. **Vrindavan environmentalism**

My involvement with Vrindavan began in 1998. I travelled to India as an environmentalist to work on World Wide Fund for Nature – India’s *Vrindavan Conservation Project* (VCP). This initial fieldwork is summarised in Nash (1998). The VCP was established to preserve and replant the sacred gardens as they had fallen into disarray. It was the result of national and international interest in the reforestation of Vrindavan as well as the possibility for Vrindavan to represent a key pilot study in the relationship between religion and ecology (Prime, 1992). Several non-government organisations and institutional bodies have been established in Vrindavan since the VCP’s inception in 1989 that were and still are dedicated to the conservation of the holy pilgrimage town (see Sullivan (1998) for a historical account of the environmental movement in Vrindavan and Shinde (2008) for a description of environment in Vrindavan vis-à-vis pilgrimage).

What started off as an environmental interest became a personal philosophical passion. While the work of WWF-India has since concluded in Vrindavan, my involvement with the area is ongoing and of a personal nature. I have continued to collaborate on the development of a philosophical precept termed the ‘Vrindavan environmental concept’. *Chintan* is a key principle in the Vrindavan environmental concept because it helps found a practical and meditative environmental ethic based in personal experience in interaction with and in contact with the sociocultural world. A practice of *chintan* based in the devotional traditions of Vrindavan and particularly those traditions that encourage direct contemplative engagement within nature and with ‘nature as teacher’, e.g. White (1977), Goswami (1991), does not have to be at odds with worldly engagement. Practical examples of the possibility of *prakriti-chintan* and a natural and integrated environmentally directed meditative practice and ethic are outlined in Sections 7, 8 and 9.
4. **Vrindavan – The Human Sanctuary**

According to the medieval Hindu literature associated with the Krishna cult, Vrindavan is the manifest earthly terrestrial playground of the god Krishna and his eternal consort Radha. It is considered the holiest of holy places - a temple of nature. Vrindavan is said to be a paradise. The modern town was founded in the early 1500s and the remnants of this city planning are still present in the architecture and streetscape of the old town.

Just as Shiva is the destroyer and Brahma is the creator, Krishna is the enjoyer. Thus Vrindavan and its forest groves exist as a worldly home for the Divine Couple to enjoy. This worldly home is also accessible to humans. Just as Krishna and Radha manifested human form to experience the bliss of the gardens of Vrindavan, there is also the possibility of this sanctuary for mortals. Through the practice of higher or divine thought coupled with a respectful relationship with nature, it is said that humans can experience the wisdom and bliss of the divine pair in this place. This notion is described as the ‘Human Sanctuary’ and forms the basis of the environmental thought that underpins the Vrindavan Environmental Movement.

This schism between the natural and the cultural has caused mass environmental destruction in the medieval holy town. Although the Vrindavan situation and that of the entire Braj region, the greater region surrounding Vrindavan, is common to many other religious centres and places of cultural and spiritual significance in India, I maintain that the integrity of Vrindavan as a *dham* or holy place of worship should be upheld in accordance with directives given in revealed and realised Krishna scriptures and literature. This formed the basis for the evolution of the modern environmental movement in Vrindavan of which *atma* and *prakriti-chintan* are major parts.

This Human Sanctuary idea presents a perspective that there is a terrestrial Divine in the world and a transcendent Divine abstracted from the world. Religious thought and scriptural perspectives from Vrindavan propose the possibility of a synthesis of these two through a balanced yet dynamic ecological state consisting of divine humans in nature. In order to understand and live this apparent contradiction of God and nature, spirit and world, Big Self and little self, Krishna’s example of how to live life necessitates and demonstrates the concept of *chintan*. 
5. **Practice of chintan**

The practice of *chintan* requires a return to the symbolic representation and peacefulness of nature in human life. *Chintan* is a type of return, a sojourn into transcendence, to the Other, through the realisation of the inherent divinity and immanence of nature and of the human condition in relation to the rest of existence. This vision is common to both Indian and Western ‘deep’ environmental perspectives and is similar to the philosophy of deep ecology (Fox, 1990).

The relationship between scriptural injunctions, Vrindavan conservation and the practice of *chintan* can give insight into natural environmental change in the town and elsewhere and individual and group based reasons for this breakdown between the human, nature and self. In order to understand these and what and where some of these breakdowns may be, I will now explore various definitions of *chintan*.

6. **Some definitions of chintan**

Before presenting the empirical analysis, I present some broad definitions of *chintan*, which help to grasp and describe this fundamental concept for this paper:

1. *Chintan* is more than a concept or state of mind; it is an abstract personal reflective space. This internal space becomes humanised in nature.
2. *Chintan* requires a rethinking of how we act in the world and how we should slow down in order to see the movements and ‘statements’ of nature.
3. *Chintan* enables the de-secularisation of Krishnaite philosophy.
4. *Chintan* focusses on ‘here and now’ rather than ‘there and then’.
5. *Chintan* is a method to realise the sacredness in nature.
6. *Chintan* is a retreat, a method of aware escape from the external world.
7. *Chintan* questions the ‘doing’ model and allows the ‘being’ model to become more prominent.
8. *Chintan* is ‘emotional work’.
How can this relationship between the practice of chintan and the ‘attainment’ of balanced inner and outer dealings be tested and/or measured? In order to explicate and report on such a possibility I now turn to the personal and auto-reporting aspect.

7. Methodology
The data that I report on were obtained during three fieldtrips where I spent around one year in seclusion in a garden hermitage (ashram) on the outskirts of Vrindavan. By ‘seclusion’ I mean that although I had contact with the other people in the ashram, I spent large periods of the day in solitude. Living in natural and quiet surroundings, I would rise at 3.30am and spend the following six hours engaged in meditation and contemplative activities, chintan. These activities were of two kinds:

1. Individual – I would meditate by myself in silence being and becoming aware of my breath and my inner mental and emotional workings. This always took place in the period from 3am to 6am. This was considered the most intense and deepest time for personal meditation practice.

2. Group – I would meditate together with my mentor, his wife and other members of the ashram. This meditation was similar to individual meditation in that the focus of the meditation was always on the movements of the breath. It was dissimilar, however, in that it involved creating an awareness of a combined group meditation force, the idea of crossing cultural boundaries through meditation, i.e. this practice involved Western and Indian participants, and often involved some chanting or singing based activities. The latter facet of this group meditation differs greatly from the silent aspect of the individual meditation practice.

This period from 3am to 6am was termed the atma-chintan or ‘contemplation on self’ period while the period from 6am to 9am was the ‘prakriti-chintan’ or ‘contemplation on nature’ period. Prakriti-chintan or ‘nature watch’ was important because during this time, the natural surroundings in the Vrindavan ashram appear very fresh and obvious. There is not the great amount of anthropogenic noise common in this part of India during this period; individual
meditation was conducted during this time. In the ashram was termed ‘a conversation with nature’.

At around 9am, after bathing and taking breakfast, I would participate in the daily workings of the ashram. I was encouraged to meditate on what I had garnered from the morning chintan and keep this in my thoughts and emotions throughout the day. Activities such as gardening, other physical work and my own personal upkeep, e.g. washing clothes and cleaning, diary, other writing and research and teaching English and Hindi, took up the rest of the day. I ate a simple diet of vegetarian food in quite small amounts three times a day. There were informal and more formal discussions with my mentor from time to time and regarding the theory of atma-chintan and prakriti-chintan and meditating on nature which was important for general mental and emotional well-being and balance. This daily schedule would wind up around 6pm where daily stocktaking and socialising would take place after which I would sleep. I would wake the following morning at the same time and begin this daily routine again. In this programme, even sleep was encouraged to be meditative. This built on an understanding that during sleep we have the possibility to become connected to our subconscious mind or inner self (Baars et al., 2003). If it is unimpinged by the workings of our conscious and often distracted mind, it can serve as a powerful tool in chintan and understanding our inner workings (Flanagan, 2001). Although constantly remaining flexible to change and movements in the outer world, sleep was typically between 9.30-10pm and 3am. This lifestyle was often very physically and emotionally stringent and taxing.

This methodology is similar to the method employed by Smith (2007: 31) in his auto practice of Iyengar Yoga:

Although my research includes observation and discussion with other practitioners, like any research that attempts to grapple with embodied experience it is, of necessity, informed by the researcher’s own experience as well as the exegesis of others (see also Strauss, 2004: 60). In such cases there is ‘no other solution but to practice . . . oneself, to become one’s own informant, to penetrate one’s own amnesia, and try to make explicit what one finds unstateable in oneself’ (Favret-Saada, 1980: 22). Consequently, a key site for my
research into the embodied experience of the practice of Ashtanga Vinyasa Yoga is my own practice of asana.

8. **Chintan Symbol**

Personal chintan helped produce a schema for dividing the day into eight sections, which corresponds with the *ashta-yama* concept in Indian thought. This whole 24-hour cycle can be represented in and superimposed on the following Chintan Symbol:

![Chintan Symbol](image)

Figure 1: The Chintan Symbol and its superimposition on the 24-hour time cycle

The Chintan Symbol developed in Vrindavan has been an integral part of the contemplative activities of the Vrindavan environmental movement. In brief, it is one symbolic representation of the human sanctuary idea, i.e. of the balance between humans and nature, inner and outer, male and female, and is an icon of the practice and possibility of chintan.

This symbol is dualistic in its depiction. If we start from the centre, and we move outwards, we can go in two directions. One direction goes one way and leads us back inside, the other goes outside into the world while still being connected to the centre. If we think of our existence as consisting of life energy at the centre, followed by our emotional, mental and physical set up, this cyclic symbol takes shape. By being balanced internally and externally through the practice of chintan, and by being in tune with nature and the outer dealings of society, we attain a
situation represented by this symbol – a stable yet dynamic state where we have balanced inner dealings with ourselves and external dealings with the environment.

This symbol also represents the division of extroverted and introverted activities within the daily cycle. In this schema, 6pm to 9am is dedicated to introverted activities. 9am to 6pm is dedicated to work based and societal activities. The reason for this division can be explained through understanding the movements of time in nature. The ‘quietest’ and less active periods of the day in nature are from around dusk till dawn. These are more congenial to chintan. The ‘societal period’ is more suited to testing the efficacy of one’s chintan in the world and for reflecting on the nature of human dealings.

9. Results
While chintan is a rigorous regime to put into practice, it can achieve some very effective results. The process did not necessarily produce a goal but helped the practitioner, that is, me, become much more aware of my physical, mental and emotional surroundings. This was evidenced in auto-writings of my time and experiences in the chintan process in the Vrindavan ashram and through being observed and monitored by others (cf. “the exegesis of others” (Smith, 2007: 31)). A few examples of these auto-writings and reflections on chintan are:

How I’ve learnt here in this garden about life, mathematics, the Mathematician, nature and come to use the word which sums up the lot – chintan. How this Cosmic System is going on and how I’ve come to see it removed from religion, philosophy and even India. (From diary entry 24 June 2006)

The breath comes in and then goes out. The days come and then go, night/day, big/small but there’s an entity behind this dual existence and it is a part of me. I have come to observe this entity through chintan. (From diary entry 5 March 2005)

Practising chintan and living in the natural surroundings of Vrindavan resulted in time appearing to become slowed. Over the one-year chintan period I experienced a greater sense of the present moment, changes in sensory and cognitive alertness and experienced a large perception shift – a
shift away from my own personal experiences in the chintan location to a much greater appreciation of the relationship I had developed with Vrindavan. I also became much more aware of the particular social and ecological significance of Vrindavan and my deepening relationship with it. Chintan not only became a practice with palpable changes; it became a meditation technique where surrender of ‘doership’ and awareness of the role the Divine or Cosmic Consciousness had played in my own personal development had become very clear. It was obvious to others and experientially real to myself that through this retraction from well-established everyday routines, I had come to be able to deal with the push-pull of life in a more balanced way than when I arrived in Vrindavan back in 1998. A degree of tangible stillness (Conradson, 2008) developed where I became less concerned with events in the world, particularly during the introverted and chintan periods (6pm to 9am) and more able to be silent and aware during periods of societal and work activity during the extroverted time periods (9am to 6pm). The better, deeper or more effective the chintan period was used, the more productive, effective, balanced and trouble free the time spent in extroverted work dealings in the societal hours resulted. This valorises the efficacy of chintan not only as a personal tool for stillness and awareness creation but it suggests applicability beyond the time and place of Vrindavan, i.e. from the emic to the etic domain. That is, while this paper has presented a personal example of chintan, it provides some theoretical and practical foundations upon which a broader and more detailed application of chintan can evolve. The results from this paper form a set of key suggestions for which other practitioners in future can utilise a similar process in their own time and their own place of chintan practice. These suggestions are:

1. **Chintan** is effective when done in a natural environment.
2. **Chintan** can be undertaken individually or in a group situation.
3. **Chintan** can achieve better results when the *chintan*-er (the practitioner of chintan) is guided by a more experienced *chintan*-er.
4. **Chintan** is a non-sectarian activity although it can be incorporated with any other religious practice.
5. **Chintan** has several iconic and symbolic representations. These can also be incorporated with the eight major time divisions of the 24-hour cycle.
6. **Chintan** as a practice is not restricted to the geographical location of Vrindavan, India.
10. Conclusion
The concept and practice of *chintan* is a method of understanding relationships. First, it considers the relationship between self and the Divine. Secondly, it is a method and tool for us to understand our relationship with nature. Thirdly, it helps us understand and experience the nature of inner and outer, introverted and extroverted activities and ultimately the dualistic movements of the Divine in nature. This living and experiential approach does a lot to help us appreciate relationships between humans and nature as a dialectic.

This personal research has related directly to personal practice and has considered the problems in defining *chintan* across the emic-etic divide. Personal and group spiritual practices and their relevance to non-partisan science are continually questioned in science and anthropology (see Williams (2008) for details). Current thought in the anthropology of religion, however, demonstrates a much greater leniency and acceptance of the methodological and theoretical implications of auto-reporting and the embracing of such personal positions in the quest to validate data (e.g. Lea, 2009). Recent theory and methods and longitudinal studies in public health (Sternberg, 2009) have shown that there is a strong correlation between lower levels of stress and well-being. Personal control of one’s home and work environment and contemplative ‘me time’ tend to correlate highly with a heightened sense of self-worth, increased work output and job satisfaction. Much of this research (see Salzman (2002)) uses mind quietening and meditation techniques similar to the method of *chintan* present in this paper.

The geographical location of the forest groves of Vrindavan is important in the field of practice of *chintan* because this is where Radha and Krishna enjoyed and played. They are posed on the canvas of the world as the Divine Contradiction and the Cosmic Polarity of the human male and female; this is the reason so many pilgrims undertake Vrindavan pilgrimage every year. *Chintan* is a method to observe the relationship between the human and nature, epitomised by Radha and Krishna, and how through pilgrimage and self-awareness creation the perspective of *Vrindavan – The Human Sanctuary*, a literal depiction of human-nature dealings in the present modern town of Vrindavan, and a figurative interpretation of the human-nature-divinity trinity can evolve. This is the perspective with which the Vrindavan environmental movement understood its reforestation and education work and ultimately the practice of personal meditation, *chintan* and
personal development and evolution. Such practice was encouraged to take place with one foot
in the world and the serving of society while introverted activities would maintain a constant
grounding in self and introversion. The religious and ecological history and ontology of
Vrindavan offer a clear contribution to understanding personal contemplation in light of modern
research in the social sciences.

11. References

*Upadeshasahasra*, Ishvarakrshna's *Samkhyakarika* and Patanjali's *Yogasutra*, in K.A
Leiden: Brill, 75-97.

Routledge.


USA: Oxford University Press.


Environmentalism*. Boston: Shambhala.


