THE MINNEAPOLIS CREATIVE INDEX 2015

Understanding the Scale and Impact of Minneapolis’ Creative Sector
A report from the City of Minneapolis’ program on Arts, Culture and the Creative Economy
INTRODUCTION

In 2013 the Arts, Culture and the Creative Economy program commissioned the first Creative Index report for the City of Minneapolis. In this first report, we set out to establish a measure that begins to capture the impact of Minneapolis’ arts and cultural offerings. We selected the Creative Vitality Index (CVI), an economic measure developed by Western States Arts Federation (WESTAF), because it offered one way for us to make tangible some of the creative vibrancy that many arts supporters, fans, and creative makers feel in our city.

The information provided by CVI data allowed us to surface some of the economic impacts of the creative sector by measuring our region’s share of creative jobs, arts spending, and creative for-profit and nonprofit organizations. The CVI measure also allowed us to pay attention to some aspects of our local creative economy that other measures miss. For instance, we were able to measure our city’s creative employment by zip code, allowing us to map out the spread of creative fields and activities in our city.

As data provided by the CVI is reliable and annually available, we can track creative sector developments in our region over time. Through annual tracking we have seen some changes, and the good news is that Minneapolis’ creative sector is performing well. Overall, creative sales have remained consistent and we’ve seen an increase in creative sector employment.

The Minneapolis/St. Paul metropolitan region has maintained our CVI ranking as sixth in the nation—this score is almost four times the national average for “creative vitality” in a region. While this is good news, we are also interested in exploring opportunities for the City to strengthen its creative sector. As a tool for policy makers and arts advocates, this report seeks to proactively ask questions on how Minneapolis’ creative sector can increase its performance and ranking.

As research has repeatedly shown, Minneapolis is the arts and cultural powerhouse for our state as measured by the number of creative workers and economic outputs. Yet this hotbed of activity also exhibits opportunities for improvement and growth.

In 2014, the City took the opportunity to explore creative sector growth through data gathered from local artists and creative workers during an 18-month long cultural planning process called the Minneapolis Creative City Road Map. The planning process was driven by the City’s One Minneapolis goal that, “disparities are eliminated so all Minneapolis residents can participate and prosper.” Thus our planning question for the process became, “is everyone benefiting from the economic abundance of our local creative sector?”

In a survey that accompanied the planning process, we asked artists and creative workers questions about their economic circumstances and what resources they needed to propel their careers forward. Dramatic differences in survey respondents’ responses indicated racial and gender disparities exist in Minneapolis’ creative employment and income, showing that not everyone is benefiting from the city’s robust creative economy.

As a result, we have taken the opportunity in this year’s report to dig deeper and augment our initial research with economic data from the CVI and other sources. Our findings reveal a healthy creative sector and strong economic activity in the region, yet there is dramatic income and employment disparities around race, and to a lesser extent, gender lines. To add depth to our understanding of the creative economy, the City chose to more intentionally complement the economic numbers with narrative.

To tell this story, we built on demographic employment trends through conversations with people of color who work in two prominent, growing, and highly paid creative occupational categories with serious disparities for people of color: architects and producers/directors. Conversations with working creatives explored barriers and opportunities for success in their fields, and what is needed to move the needle forward on racial equity, both locally and nationally.

We see this year’s report as a tool for community engagement around these issues for policy makers, arts professionals, grantmakers, artists, and audiences. We hope our findings will shed some light on disparities in employment trends, trigger dialogue on opportunities for improvement, and show the potential for the City of Minneapolis to more fully leverage the human capital and creative assets already present in our community.

Gulgün Kayım
Director, Arts, Culture and the Creative Economy
City of Minneapolis

1. CVI data in 2010 demonstrated that Minneapolis’ CVI score placed us 6th among our peer cities; in 2013, we placed 5th.
2. Research by Americans for the Arts has demonstrated that nonprofit arts in Minneapolis deliver $540.7 million in economic value to Minneapolis.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Using Numbers to Tell the Story of Minneapolis’ Creative Economy ................................. 3
What is the Creative Vitality Index? .................. 3
How to Use This Report .................................. 4
Key Findings .................................................. 5
Demographics of Creative Workers ....................... 7
Workers of Color in Creative Occupations ........... 9
Women in Creative Occupations ..................... 11
Jobs & Employment ........................................ 13
2014 Creative Occupations by Zip Code ............ 14
Creative Industry Sales .................................. 15
Nonprofit Community .................................... 16
How We Measure Up ..................................... 17
Defining the Creative Sector ........................... 19
Racial Equity in Minneapolis’ Creative Occupations .................................................. 21
A Conversation with Architectural Professionals .......... 22
A Conversation with Producers & Directors .......... 25
Next Steps ................................................... 29
Notes ......................................................... 30
Credits & Acknowledgements ........................... Back Cover

Northern Spark 2015: Cloud Cult
Photo: Kory Lidstrom
USING NUMBERS TO TELL THE STORY OF MINNEAPOLIS’ CREATIVE ECONOMY

In this report, we use creative industry sales, creative nonprofit revenues, and information on creative workers, including their gender and racial/ethnic demographics, to paint a picture of Minneapolis’ creative economy. In 2013 and 2014, we reported on 36 creative occupations and ten creative industries. This year, we take advantage of more occupations and industries now available through our data provider, WESTAF. In this report we incorporate data from 40 occupations and 72 creative industries.

The data in this report:
• Provides a framework for conceptualising and understanding the creative economy as a network of many actors that range from fine artists to educators to nonprofit organisations.
• Tracks and compares the creative economy regionally, and nationally, as a significant driver of economic growth and a key factor in an area’s quality of life.
• Helps the City government lead, by bringing stakeholders in the creative sector together around strategies to address local creative sector deficiencies.

WHAT IS THE CREATIVE VITALITY INDEX?

The Creative Vitality Index (CVI) is a tool that measures annual changes in the economic health of highly creative industries using information about organizational revenue, jobs, and other measures from creative businesses and nonprofits. One of its key benefits is that it captures occupational employment, a better way of measuring creative employment than the census misses. Because it uses nationally available annual data sources, the CVI allows us to compare Minneapolis to other geographic areas like the metropolitan region, other cities, the state, or nation each year by assigning each area an index number that reflects its comparative creative vitality. The CVI methodology has stayed consistent over time, allowing for an ‘apples-to-apples’ way to measure ourselves against other geographic areas.

While the CVI does an excellent job of describing many elements of the creative sector, it also presents some shortcomings. The CVI relies heavily on business transactions and employment, leaving out many non-commerce related arts impacts such as greater community cohesion and safety, feelings of well-being, expressions of identity, and even rates of attendance. In addition, it does not include the newly expanded list of what the City of Minneapolis considers creative industries and occupations. However, the CVI is an excellent baseline tool to grasp the size and overall impact of the creative sector and compare it to cities across the country.

WHAT THE CVI MEASURES

COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION based on per capita revenues of arts-related goods and services

Measurements of per capita OCCUPATIONAL EMPLOYMENT in the arts

This report is for policymakers, arts professionals, grantmakers, artists, and arts audiences.
KEY FINDINGS

The CVI helps us see how Minneapolis stacks up within the metropolitan region and nation as a powerhouse of creative economic and social activity. CVI scores compare Minneapolis to the national average of 1.

CREATIVE SALES PUMPED OVER

$4.5B ↑

into the Minneapolis economy. As a comparison, creative industry sales are nearly 8 TIMES the size of Minneapolis sports sector revenues.

Minneapolis’ CVI score outpaces the national average

3.6x OVER

In 2014, the Minneapolis/St. Paul metropolitan region had the

6TH HIGHEST CVI SCORE IN THE NATION

THE AVERAGE CREATIVE WORKER IN MINNEAPOLIS HAS A MEDIAN HOURLY WAGE OF

$20.79

MORE WOMEN (49% vs. 48%), but FEWER PEOPLE OF COLOR (9% vs. 14%) WORK IN CREATIVE OCCUPATIONS than for all metropolitan area workers

NONPROFIT REVENUES TOPPED

$285M IN 2014

HIGHLY CREATIVE ZIP CODES:

55414 2,305 creative jobs, 11% of total zip code jobs

55419 849 creative jobs, 11% of total zip code jobs

TOP 5 CREATIVE OCCUPATIONS IN MINNEAPOLIS

Creative jobs make up

3.4% OF ALL METROPOLITAN AREA JOBS

4.8% OF ALL MINNEAPOLIS JOBS

TOP 5 OCCUPATIONS Where Minneapolis has a competitive advantage

1. Set & Exhibit Designers ................. 4.8
2. Landscape Architects .................. 2.9
3. Dancers .................................. 2.9
4. Media & Communication Workers, All Other ............. 2.8
5. Public Relations & Fundraising Managers ............... 2.5

GROWING OCCUPATIONS (2011-2014)

1: Agents (+13%)
2: Sound Engineering Technicians (+13%)
3: Actors (+11%)
4: Camera Operators, Television, Video, And Motion Picture (+11%)
5: Audio And Video Equipment Technicians (+11%)

SHRINKING OCCUPATIONS (2011-2014)

1: Makeup Artists, Theatrical & Performance (-10%)
2: Floral Designers (-6%)
3: Broadcast Technicians (-5%)
4: Musical Instrument Repairers & Tuners (-3%)
5: Directors, Religious Activities & Education (-1%)

TOP 5 CREATIVE OCCUPATIONS

1: Musicians & Singers (2,446)
2: Photographers (2,412)
3: Writers & Authors (2,411)
4: Graphic Designers (1,866)
5: Public Relations Specialists (935)

Creative jobs

1: Musicians & Singers
2: Photographers
3: Writers & Authors
4: Graphic Designers
5: Public Relations Specialists

1. Set & Exhibit Designers
2. Landscape Architects
3. Dancers
4. Media & Communication Workers, All Other
5. Public Relations & Fundraising Managers

Minneapolis’ competitive advantage is measured using Location Quotient (LQ), an index value measuring the per capita concentration of an occupation within the area being measured. LQ values here are measured against a national LQ of 1.
A higher percentage of women work in creative occupations compared to all metropolitan area workers (49% vs. 48%). By way of comparison, nationally women make up 47% of both creative workers and all workers. The creative occupations with the highest share of women workers in the metropolitan area are: makeup artists, theatrical and performance (90%), librarians (87%), and choreographers (81%).

A lower percentage of people of color work in creative occupations compared to all metropolitan area workers (9% vs. 14%). Nationally, people of color make up 17% of creative workers, and 26% of all workers. People of color are most highly represented in the following creative occupations within the metropolitan area: media and communication workers, all other (32%); makeup artists, theatrical and performance (24%), and dancers (20%).

The average creative worker in Minneapolis has a lower hourly wage than that of all other Minneapolis workers combined (median hourly wage of $20.79 vs. $25.13, respectively). Despite this, creative workers in Minneapolis still have a slightly higher hourly wage than that of other creative workers at the national level ($20.79 vs. $19.19, respectively).

Craft artists in Minneapolis make the lowest median hourly wage ($6.59), public relations and fund-raising managers make the most per hour ($52.85), and square in the middle are interior designers ($20.73).
This visualization shows the total number of creative jobs in the metropolitan area in 2014, what percent of each occupation is held by workers of color, and the occupation’s median hourly earnings.

The median hourly wage for all metro workers is $22.48.
This visualization shows the total number of creative jobs in the metropolitan area in 2014, what percent of each occupation is held by women, and the occupation’s median hourly earnings.

48% of all metro workers are women.

The median hourly wage for all metro workers is $22.48.
Since 2006, creative jobs in Minneapolis have grown by 10.4%, a larger increase than the overall job growth at 7.2%. Clearly, the creative sector helped fuel Minneapolis’ overall job growth. Creative occupations followed the trend for overall employment, dipping during the recession and bouncing back more robustly after 2009.

Over the last three years, the creative occupations that experienced the most growth were: agents (13%), sound engineering technicians (11%), and actors (11%). These three occupations also have LQ values over one, meaning Minneapolis supports a higher concentration of these jobs than the national average.

Occupations boasting the highest LQ values in Minneapolis are: set and exhibit designers (4.8), landscape architects (2.9), and dancers (2.9). Only three creative occupations fall below the national LQ average of one: librarians (.93), floral designers (.69), and musical instrument repairers and tuners (.49).

The political boundaries of Minneapolis and the zip codes within Minneapolis do not align perfectly. Some zip codes with extremely minimal area within Minneapolis were excluded while some zip codes with some area outside of Minneapolis were included. For more detail see endnotes.

Creative occupations comprise 2.8% of workers nationally. Knowing which occupations flourish and which ones lag behind is useful as the City and its partners develop strategies to support creative job growth.
There are many ways in which the creative industry sells its products. Say you’re running to be the next Mayor of Minneapolis and you need to communicate to the city’s residents why you’re fit for office. The people involved as you craft, make, and distribute your campaign materials are all part of the creative sector—the oil that juices the city’s communications. They range from advertising firms to production teams for local commercials to photographers to graphic designers to publishers. As you invest in your campaign materials, you’re also consuming creative goods and services, contributing to sales in the creative sector.

Creative industries experienced over $4.5 billion in sales in 2014, about the same as in 2011. Sales from creative industries account for 5.5% of all industry sales in Minneapolis. As a comparison, creative industry sales are roughly eight times the size of Minneapolis’ sports sector revenue.

The top performing industry in Minneapolis in 2014 was publishing, with over $1 billion in sales. Within the publishing industry, software publishers made up nearly half of total industry sales. The second highest performing industry was advertising, with design services—including architectural, interior, and graphic design services—coming in third.


Creative nonprofits earned nearly $286 million in total revenues in 2014, a 6% decrease from 2011. Of the $114 million in program revenues, theaters contributed 33%, radio was responsible for 16%, and art services nonprofits made up 10%. Total revenues for creative nonprofits are derived from two main streams: 1) program revenues and investment income and 2) special events revenues, and contributions, and gifts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Creative Sector</th>
<th>2014 Sales (in millions)</th>
<th>2011 Sales (in millions)</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>$4,547,167,058</td>
<td>$4,547,167,058</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performing Arts</td>
<td>$174,642,639</td>
<td>$174,642,639</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art Gallery/Dealer &amp; Independent Artists</td>
<td>$264,564,866</td>
<td>$264,564,866</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media Production &amp; Distribution</td>
<td>$475,275,271</td>
<td>$475,275,271</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercial Printing</td>
<td>$522,675,383</td>
<td>$522,675,383</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design Services</td>
<td>$537,994,775</td>
<td>$537,994,775</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising</td>
<td>$924,562,829</td>
<td>$924,562,829</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publishers (Print, Software, Music)</td>
<td>$1,026,923,969</td>
<td>$1,026,923,969</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Book, Record, Music, &amp; Photography Supply Stores</td>
<td>$522,675,383</td>
<td>$522,675,383</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>$242,744,170</td>
<td>$242,744,170</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOP 3 CREATIVE NONPROFITS IN MINNEAPOLIS

- Theaters: 13%
- Organizations that preserve and promote artistic expressions within a particular culture or ethnic community: 10%
- Dance: 7%
- All Other: 10%
- Art Services: 10%

Nonprofit arts and culture organizations provide employment and community spaces in which to experience the arts, volunteer, and learn. They also provide important auxiliary education services, serving schools, colleges, and adult learners. Organizations that promote artistic expression within a particular ethnic community work for the preservation and promotion of the traditions, values, and lifestyles of different cultural groups; organize activities and events which promote cultural exchange locally or nationally; and encourage understanding and respect for different cultural heritages among youth in the group as well as the mainstream population. All these activities have economic and social impacts, and contribute to the livability of our city.

Minneapolis nonprofits with annual incomes of $50,000 and more are reflected in the CVI data. Data on 216 creative nonprofits was collected in 2014, up from 212 in 2011. Of total creative nonprofits in Minneapolis, theaters boast the highest numbers (29 in number or 13% of the sector nonprofits). Organizations that preserve and promote artistic expressions within a particular culture or ethnic community are next (21 in number or 10% of the sector nonprofits). Dance nonprofits were a close third (15 in number or 7% of sector nonprofits).

Creative nonprofits earned nearly $286 million in total revenues in 2014, a 6% decrease from 2011. Of the $114 million in program revenues, theaters contributed 33%, radio was responsible for 16%, and art services nonprofits made up 10%. Total revenues for creative nonprofits are derived from two main streams: 1) program revenues and investment income and 2) special events revenues, and contributions, and gifts.

Theaters
Organizations that preserve and promote artistic expressions within a particular culture or ethnic community
Dance
All Other
Art Services
Minneapolis is the core of a regional network of creativity, revenue, and creative services flowing in and out of the area. With a CVI nearly four times that of the national average, 26% of all creative jobs in the metropolitan area are located in the city. Further, the Minneapolis metropolitan area is home to the largest portion of creative jobs in the state; 75% of Minnesota’s creative occupations are found here.

Within Minneapolis, we see high concentrations of creative jobs in the Southeast (Marcy Holmes, Southeast Como, and Prospect Park) and the Southwest (Kenny, Windom, and Tangletown) neighborhoods of the city.

### CVI VALUES BY METROPOLITAN AREA

Of the 35 most populous metropolitan regions nationally, Minneapolis/St. Paul ranks as the sixth most creatively vital. From 2011 to 2014, we saw a 5% decrease in our CVI score much like other metropolitan areas. During this period, over half of the 35 most populous Metropolitan Statistical Areas (MSA) also experienced a lower CVI value.

#### METROPOLITAN STATISTICAL AREAS (MSA)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Metropolitan Statistical Areas (MSA)</th>
<th>CVI Value 2011</th>
<th>CVI Value 2014</th>
<th>% Change (2011-2014)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Washington-Arlington-Alexandria, DC-VA-MD-WV</td>
<td>2.68</td>
<td>2.48</td>
<td>-7.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Los Angeles-Long Beach-Anaheim, CA</td>
<td>2.25</td>
<td>2.19</td>
<td>-2.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 San Francisco-Oakland-Hayward, CA</td>
<td>2.08</td>
<td>2.01</td>
<td>-3.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 New York-Newark-Jersey City, NY-NJ-PA</td>
<td>1.87</td>
<td>1.87</td>
<td>-1.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Boston-Cambridge-Newton, MA-NH</td>
<td>1.70</td>
<td>1.59</td>
<td>-6.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Minneapolis-St. Paul-Bloomington, MN-WI</td>
<td>1.49</td>
<td>1.42</td>
<td>-4.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 San Jose-Sunnyvale-Santa Clara, CA</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td>1.38</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Austin-Round Rock, TX</td>
<td>1.32</td>
<td>1.34</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Seattle-Tacoma-Bellevue, WA</td>
<td>1.38</td>
<td>1.32</td>
<td>-4.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Portland-Vancouver-Hillsboro, OR-WA</td>
<td>1.21</td>
<td>1.23</td>
<td>3.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Denver-Aurora-Lakewood, CO</td>
<td>1.21</td>
<td>1.18</td>
<td>-2.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Las Vegas-Henderson-Paradise, NV</td>
<td>1.24</td>
<td>1.11</td>
<td>-10.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Chicago-Naperville-Glenview, IL-IN-WI</td>
<td>1.42</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td>-23.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 San Diego-Carlsbad, CA</td>
<td>1.11</td>
<td>1.08</td>
<td>-2.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 Philadelphia-Camden-Wilmington, PA-NJ-DE-MD</td>
<td>1.08</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td>-2.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 Cleveland-Elyria, OH</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>-1.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 Dallas-Fort Worth-Arlington, TX</td>
<td>1.03</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>-4.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 Miami-Fort Lauderdale-West Palm Beach, FL</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>-5.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19 Pittsburgh, PA</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>2.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 Sacramento-Roseville-Arden-Arcade, CA</td>
<td>0.89</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>10.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21 Columbus, OH</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22 Orlando-Kissimmee-Sanford, FL</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td>3.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23 Atlanta-Sandy Springs-Roswell, GA</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>-2.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24 Baltimore-Columbia-Towson, MD</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 Kansas City, MO-KS</td>
<td>0.97</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>-3.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26 Cincinnati, OH-KY-IN</td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td>0.93</td>
<td>-20.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27 Indianapolis-Carmel-Anderson, IN</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>0.93</td>
<td>-3.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28 Houston-The Woodlands-Sugar Land, TX</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.89</td>
<td>3.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29 Detroit-Warren-Dearborn, MI</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>12.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 St. Louis, MO-IL</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td>-3.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31 Charlotte-Concord-Gastonia, NC-SC</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>-1.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32 Tampa-St. Petersburg-Clearwater, FL</td>
<td>0.80</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>-2.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33 Phoenix-Mesa-Scottsdale, AZ</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>-27.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34 San Antonio-New Braunfels, TX</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>-2.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 Riverside-San Bernardino-Ontario, CA</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>-2.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DEFINING THE CREATIVE SECTOR

We know from CVI data that art and artists are drivers in our city’s economy. Yet how to describe the complexities of the sector is a subject of debate within the arts community. A creative ecosystem model developed by the Arts, Culture, and the Creative Economy program (ACCE), represents the sector as a system of exchanges, revealing the complexities that help explain the interdependence of arts participation and economic drivers.

Within the creative ecology we include not only artists, but also architects and designers, arts educators, foundation funders, and theater-goers. This visual system maps out the creative sector as a dynamic ecology of economic and social relationships.*

Creative Ecology Highlights

ART MAKERS
Highly skilled creative producers are central to our creative ecology. The core purpose of these artists and organizations is to create artwork. Without their artmaking activities, there would be no system of economic or social exchange.

ART SERVICE ORGANIZATIONS
Support skilled producers

ARTS EDUCATION
Educate the next generation of producers/supporters/consumers

CREATIVE INDUSTRIES
Producers with indirect arts goals

ARTS FESTIVALS
Participation/vibrancy/creative placemaking/cultural celebration

CROSS-SECTOR ARTS
Producers with indirect arts goals

PHILANTHROPY & PUBLIC SECTOR SUPPORT
Community infrastructure/framework or support

CREATIVE INDUSTRIES
The creative industries use creativity to add monetary value to a functional product such as a chair or a house. Thus, designer shoes are more expensive than a department store brand, an artisan crafted piece of furniture more expensive than a factory product. The value of creativity and the skill and labor that goes into that creative activity is the driving force behind these cost differences. This added value to functional products is what makes creative industries key players in the creative economy.

ARTS EDUCATION
Arts education is a key component of our ecology. It is through arts education that the next generation of consumers and producers of art and creativity are nurtured. It also plays an important role in the creative ecology by employing artists in teaching positions.

ART MAKERS
Skilled producers/direct participants

ART FANS
Indirect participants

ECONOMIC & SOCIAL EXCHANGE
The interdependence of arts participation and economic drivers


IN MINNEAPOLIS’ CREATIVE OCCUPATIONS

As noted in the Key Findings, there are fewer people of color employed in creative jobs compared to all metropolitan area workers (9% and 14%, respectively). We also know that many creative occupations are “good jobs,” meaning that they’re growing and pay high hourly wages. Architects and producers/directors are two such occupational categories. These occupations also have greater disparities for people of color (as well as women) than the average labor force in Minneapolis’ metropolitan area. We set off to explore the challenges people of color face in achieving success as architects, producers, and directors in Minneapolis and the region.

To shed light on these issues, we facilitated two conversations: one with three architectural professionals of color and the other with three producers and directors of color. These creative professionals shared their views on the climate in Minneapolis for people of color in their fields, barriers and opportunities they encountered professionally, and action steps that would help improve racial equity in these creative occupations.

The views expressed in the following conversations are from six individuals. They do not represent all people of color working in creative fields in the metropolitan area. Nevertheless, we hope these conversations begin to raise awareness and push the field to value greater diversity.

1. Architect 2011; Kaplan 2006
2. Hunt and Ramón 2015
3. Goldhagen 2013; Goldstein 2005; Mock 2015; Smith, Pieper and Choueiti 2013
4. Goldhagen 2013; Hunt and Ramón 2015; Smith, Pieper and Choueiti 2013
5. Kaplan 2006

A CONVERSATION WITH ARCHITECTURAL PROFESSIONALS OF COLOR

When Sam Babatunde Ero-Phillips, Paola Sánchez-Garrett, and Alicia Belton talk about their proudest moments as architectural professionals, they share one thing in common: projects that serve communities they care about. Sam, as a Fulbright Scholar, built a primary school in his family’s Nigerian village; Paola designed a clinic in the Dominican Republic; and Alicia designed the University of Minnesota’s Robert J. Jones Urban Research and Outreach-Engagement Center in North Minneapolis.

Sam and Paola work at 4RM+ULA, an all-black architectural firm. Sam also supports community development work at Justposition Arts, Intermedia Arts, and Pillsbury House and Theatre. In the Dominican Republic, from where she hails, Paola has taught urban planning. Alicia, principal at Urban Design Perspectives, is a licensed architect with experience in the public and private sector.

On the need for systemic change in education

Sam: I see a big parallel between the achievement gap and lack of black designers in Minnesota. The biggest systemic hurdle is not investing in education for black and brown communities. You need a lot of schooling to become an architect. You need an undergraduate degree to be an intern, a masters to be a registered architect, and then a certain amount of hours and experience to get licensed as an architect. Younger folks hear all the barriers and they ask, “Why would I go into architecture?”

Alicia: Scholarship money is very important. I served as president of the Minnesota Architectural Foundation and our goal was to build a pipeline of more diverse architects by identifying high potential students of color who show promise of completing architecture school. We awarded scholarships to both undergraduate and graduate students. If they’re not in school, they’re not going to get in the profession.

Sam: Yes! I got a full ride to go to grad school at University of Illinois Urbana-Champaign. They invested in me and have a commitment to make the field more racially diverse.
Paola: Universities definitely have a role to play in improving racial equity. I think the University of Minnesota does a great job bringing in architecture students from Asia. But then they are going back to Asia! So why not invest in students who are from here and probably are going to stay here? This is something good for us [4RM+ULA], because we’re trying to hire more staff members; it’s difficult to find black architects and sometimes we recruit from other states.

Sam: Architecture school is also very Eurocentric and instructors can’t teach what they don’t know. When I was in undergrad, I asked about Afrocentric architecture. Rather than admitting that it’s a void in their knowledge, the instructors told me there’s no Afrocentric architecture with technical merit. I had to take African studies, art history classes, read books. It expanded the time it took for me to graduate. How can professors better engage with students of color?

On not being seen as qualified

Paola: At 4RM+ULA, every day we have to run, struggle, demonstrate, be first in line. For me, as a person of color and also a Spanish speaker coming from a Latino community, it’s even a little more difficult because language is a barrier. So, I have to work a little harder because English is not my first language and people think you’re not capable.

Alicia: Sometimes there’s a perception that there aren’t any architects of color here in town and that they don’t really understand how to do really, really good quality design work, or projects of scale. I get asked all the time, “Where are all the other architects of color?” I say, “They’re here! Have you taken time to look for them?” Especially with a lot of public projects, project inclusion goals are determined for minority-owned businesses, women-owned businesses, and small businesses. If those mandates are not put in place maybe they might not have looked our way that’s a missed opportunity. Quite frankly, unless required, big firms often don’t seek racial equity. In my experience, I have been approached by big firms who need to meet a percentage for diversity due to the requirements by an owner. One firm suggested that I could attend meetings and answer questions if I knew the answer. Needless to say, I declined that offer as that’s not what my firm is about—also it’s discouraging to see big projects that we have two or three on our team. “Okay, we’re good because we have two or three on our team.” I’m like, “Well, no, it’s still something you have to work on!”

Clients think they’re doing you a favor by bringing you to the table but they’re excluding the fact that you’re a qualified, good designer. Then we do something tight and they’re surprised. We ask, “Well, why are you doubting us?” We are doing good design work. We want to be recognized as designers, not as social promotion.

Paola: Big companies that have big projects want you to demonstrate experience, but you have to hire us to give us the opportunity to get the experience. It’s a challenge every day because we have to demonstrate that we’re good enough to design to manage big projects.

On mentorship and role models

Paola: Architecture schools have maybe one or two black professors so young students don’t see professors who look like us. I think that James [Garrett Jr., co-founder of 4RM+ULA] is the only black professor in the University of Minnesota’s architecture program. When you are the only one, it’s difficult.

Alicia: To get students interested in the profession, they have to see something that they can achieve. I didn’t know any architects growing up. The National Organization of Minority Architects was inspirational for me to see successful architects of color. I’ve been really fortunate because I’ve had some really wonderful mentors who helped me along the way. I had an African American mentor, Robert Morgan, FAIA [Fellow of the American Institute of Architects]. He invested time and expertise with me and showed me what I needed to know to pass the architectural exam. I have a female woman of color on my staff, a first year grad student. I still see sexism in the field and it’s disheartening, so I encourage her all the time to speak up for herself.

Sam: Young kids of color need mentors of color to show them that they can get jobs in creative fields.

On valuing diversity in the workplace and peer support

Paola: The first thing is to acknowledge that we have a racial equity issue in the field. We need to get to know each other. We’re working on organizing black architects in Minnesota to create a chapter. Marilyn Porter [founder of the Assembly of Architects] did an amazing job connecting architects of color. She still does.

Alicia: Corporate America gets why diversity is important. As a profession, we don’t value the points of view diverse people can bring to the table from the beginning. I think you need to look at many of us who started our own practices is because we’ve worked in bigger firms or corporations and it felt like we’re not really getting the kinds of experiences that we need to grow and develop. So, we sought that out on our own. Big architecture firms can take a leading role. They need to ask themselves some hard questions like, “What does it mean to have a diverse and inclusive workplace?” and “How can we influence change in the profession?” Big firms can support people of color with internships and take a look at their hiring practices, not just entry level but leadership, too. It’s important to have a workforce that reflects the client base.

Sam: To be at that place to get licensed, it takes a long time to even navigate the process and you encounter systemic barriers if no one is showing you the way. Sometimes you don’t want to ask questions because it feels like I’m bothering my manager, and if I’m intimidated, that really limits my potential in terms of my future growth. I’m working towards my architectural license now and value the guidance and support I get working at 4RM+ULA. I feel very fortunate that I’ve had the guidance of black architects a little bit older than me to help push me through and navigate this process. It’s inspired me to work harder.

Paola: At 4RM+ULA, we have eight people working together, looking the same way as you. It’s amazing and inspiring. It’s really hard, but we are opening the doors for the people of color who want to be architects in the future.
A CONVERSATION WITH PRODUCERS & DIRECTORS OF COLOR

D.A. Bullock, owner of Bully Creative Shop, is a filmmaker, commercial director, and cinematographer. Marcela Lorca has worn many hats at the Guthrie Theater: director, movement director, choreographer, educator, and administrator. Dipankar Mukherjee is the artistic director of Pangea World Theater. All three have a passion for amplifying the voices of people who aren’t heard through traditional media and theater.

D.A. points to his cinematography work on Vanishing Pools, a documentary that tells the story of black oyster fishermen after the BP oil spill in Louisiana. Through her stage work, Marcela most enjoys bringing people of different cultures and races together to tell stories of universal humanity, such as in her productions of Blood Wedding and Caroline, or Change.

Dipankar: We’re interested in equitable and progressive collaboration. We’re interested in diversity.

The world of theater directors has also been male dominated for a very long time. I’ve had to work very hard to demonstrate that I have the skills, that I have the ability, that I have the vision. Even when you have a great success, that doesn’t mean that automatically all the doors open—you have to keep proving yourself.

On the need for coordinated, systemic change

Marcela: Minneapolis has a wonderful philanthropic culture and it supports all kinds of artistic endeavors. This has provided good opportunities for people of color, but sometimes an opportunity here and there is not enough to develop their artistry and launch careers. It takes a ton of work and effort for an artist of color to thrive, and much financial sacrifice.

More sustained support to those artists who show talent and promise would change the landscape of artistic leadership. These could be year-long paid internships or grants, implemented at the state-level, to train and nurture someone’s artistry and skills under the guidance of established leaders. Leaders of all organizations need to be involved in this conversation: state government, corporations, and artistic organizations.

Dipankar: I see a simple solution to improve racial equity: equalize the funding mechanism and produce artists who represent a diverse demographic, i.e., race, gender, sexuality, and age. These artists are visionary, creative thinkers but they’re not resourced. It becomes about accountability—you can’t talk about racial equity if you’ve created an organization only for yourself, so we present other artists and it keeps us humble.

D.A.: Even though my work has been appreciated by ad agencies across the country, I had a hard time getting my foot in the door when I moved to Minneapolis. There’s an insular sense that, “If I don’t know you by now, you’re not worth knowing.” Real creativity comes from a lot of different places that I don’t think are appreciated here in the Twin Cities.

On valuing diversity

Dipankar: At Pangea, we consciously present and produce artists who represent a diverse demographic, i.e., race, gender, sexuality, and age. These artists are visionary, creative thinkers but they’re not resourced. It becomes about accountability—you can’t talk about racial equity if you’ve created an organization only for yourself, so we present other artists and it keeps us humble.

“Even when you have a great success, that doesn’t mean that automatically all the doors open—you have to keep proving yourself.”
On mentorship and cultivating young talent

**Marcela:** I’m really grateful to this city for the platform that it has given me. I go all over the United States to recruit young artists from different cultures to come and learn from us at the Guthrie. Mentoring young artists and empowering people of color to become mentors to people of color is also really crucial; people have to see themselves represented in order to feel that they can carve a future for themselves. When you see more leaders of color in the arts, you’ll start to see a generation of younger artists who are hungry to get there and who will find a way to get there.

Unfortunately, at the high school level, many younger artists get incredibly discouraged on their way up the education ladder because they can’t succeed on standardized tests. These young artists need to be valued for their unique contributions, intelligence, creativity, and for their potential. But in a system that seems to only value measurable results, young artists find little inspiration to find their way.

In order for people of color to get cast, we need to have women directors and directors of color. We’re working on a National Institute for Directing and Ensemble Creation [at Pangea]. We’re interested in multiple aesthetics and forms, so we’ve created an Institute where directors and ensemble leaders from multiple generations and traditions learn from one another. The program trains the next generation of people of color in the field.

**Dipankar:** When I judge youth theater festivals, I can always count on my fingers how many Latina, Asian American, and Indigenous youth are in the plays. Chris Fisher, a former Southwest High School teacher, invited us to work with the fine arts faculty to introduce them to Non-Western theater that speaks to students of color. But when Chris left, they went back to doing their regular Guys and Dolls, Neil Simon, and so on. A school does Guys and Dolls and wonders why students of color don’t audition—they can’t relate to it.

In order for people of color to get cast, we need to have women directors and directors of color. We’re working on a National Institute for Directing and Ensemble Creation [at Pangea]. We’re interested in multiple aesthetics and forms, so we’ve created an Institute where directors and ensemble leaders from multiple generations and traditions learn from one another. The program trains the next generation of people of color in the field.

**D.A.:** I think film, video, and digital storytelling locally is at its infancy compared to some of the other art forms, especially for people of color and marginalized groups. Theater has strong foundations like Pillsbury House, Pangea, and Mixed Blood. There’s no place to go view cinema in North Minneapolis. It’s incredible. You have this mostly youthful demographic and they don’t have a cinema as an outlet. I trained at a community film workshop where I arrived with my desire to make films. I didn’t have to come with university credentials. In the absence of places like that, there’s a missing piece to get people from the desire to be a storyteller to the technical ability to do that.

There’s no question that the talent is here. I look around and see young geniuses all the time and they actually make me a better filmmaker. I would really love to see more accessible places where they can train, actual buildings they can walk into and know that they’re going to be embraced, taught, supported, and developed.

I think that we must embrace diversity and aesthetics in all its different forms. To find opportunities, platforms, resources, and audiences to present stories of people of color takes a lot of persistent effort, a lot of knocking on doors and wrestling with funding. The work also might not conform with the usual structures of theater, it may feel foreign and unfamiliar to some critics who may not appreciate the results. That at times can feel discouraging.

**D.A.:** When I go to filmmaker meetings or the independent commercial producers’ happy hours, I don’t see people from different ethnic or cultural backgrounds. And I don’t necessarily see a desire to go out and find that either. The desire has to be there to actually value different points of view.

I’ve worked as an advertising creative and a director in Chicago, Los Angeles, and New Orleans. The Twin Cities are particularly interesting—there seems to be a great appreciation for culture, but a cognitive dissonance about who’s at the table. Culture is appropriated. There’s no value placed on the individual who created the culture and their life experience. There’s a great level of hip-hop here in the Twin Cities but there’s not really recruitment of directors or producers who come from those cultures—brown and black folks from North Minneapolis or East St. Paul.

“In order for people of color to get cast we need to have women directors and directors of color.”
This is the second Minneapolis Creative Index report published by the City, which gave us an opportunity to dig deeper into research and learn more about the barriers and opportunities for economic growth in the creative sector. The data captured in our first report has helped set the stage for continued tracking and communication to sector stakeholders, and also called the attention of many others interested in how the creative sector contributes to the well-being of the region. Over the last two years, the 2013 Minneapolis Creative Index report has received request requests from regional arts centers interested in using the report as a recruitment tool, endorsement from large corporations interested in attracting creative workers to the metropolitan area, and from developers interested in leveraging the economic power of the sector. We also know that non-profits, community development agencies, urban designers, artists, advocacy groups, and planners have found a variety of uses for the information. No matter how the information is used, data from the Minneapolis Creative Index report remains a way for the City to annually demonstrate the importance of the creative sector to the health of the broader economy. It also helps us shine a light on the issues that need to be addressed if the creative economy is to continue to grow and thrive. And finally, the Minneapolis Creative Index report aligns us with the City’s racial equity policy, which is “the development of policies, practices and strategic investments to reverse disparity trends, eliminate institutional racism, and ensure that outcomes for all are equal or improve predictably by race.” While findings in the 2015 report demonstrate that there is reason to celebrate the overall health of Minneapolis’ creative economy, we should also actively seek solutions to the racial and income disparities in the sector. As the metropolitan region’s demographic trends change, and the economy continues to grow, these disparities, if not addressed, are likely to adversely affect everyone in the creative economy. The City of Minneapolis will continue to use CVI data to augment its programs and policies in order to address racial disparities that hinder participation and prosperity of city residents.

NOTES
Methodology
The Creative Vitality Index (CVI) was initially developed in 2005 as a year-long collaborative research project that included WESTAF (Western States Arts Federation) researchers, consultants at helium Research, the senior staff of the Washington State Arts Commission, and the City of Seattle Office of Arts and Culture. CVI data inputs were selected to be highly reliable, readily available, and aged to be controlled. Measures of levels of arts participation (demand for arts products and services) and occupational employment for the arts. WESTAF developed The Creative Vitality Suite (CVSuite), an online tool we used to produce this report.

Occupational Data
Occupation data in the CVI come from Economic Modeling Specialist Intl. (EMSI). EMSI’s proprietary labor market data and modeling provide data on art workers who are full-time, part-time, and contract workers, including artistic workers. This is referred to as the Occupations in the Secret Sector. This employment set includes full-time, part-time, and contractor workers, including artistic workers. One could compare full-time creative workers to full-time workers, but the nature of art workers as regularly part-time or full-time contractors would dramatically undercount this workforce.

Selection of occupations to be considered in the CVSuite was accomplished through a process of cross-walking occupations by Standard Occupational Classification codes with Department of Labor resources for matching particular skill sets with occupations. The CVI measures 36 selected occupational categories that are highly correlated with measured skill sets in thinking creatively, organizing, and fine arts knowledge as measured by the Employment and Training Administration’s (ETAs) “Occupational Employment and Salary Survey.” Given this meticulous selection of occupations, the CVI presents a justified way to measure the creative economy.

In 2014, WESTAF expanded the list of creative occupations based on feedback from the Minneapolis Creative Index review committee. WESTAF used the original O*NET competencies and chose to include codes that scored higher in some competencies, as allowed for a broader scope and the inclusion of more occupations. To choose the occupations for the revised CVI report, we relied on a 2015 audit of the CVI by EMSI and the expertise of the Minneapolis Creative Index review committee. We included occupations recommended in the audit and by at least a third of the review committee. They are artists, craft workers, makeup artists, theatrical and performance, and merchandise displayers and window trimmers.

We included occupations recommended in the audit and by at least a third of the review committee. They are artists, craft workers, makeup artists, theatrical and performance, and merchandise displayers and window trimmers.

Neighborhood Data
Neighborhood data is also available from Economic Modeling Specialist Intl. (EMSI). Federal statistical agencies use NAICS codes for the collection, tabulation, presentation, and analysis of economic statistics. The Western States Arts Federation (WESTAF) selected additional industries offered by EMSI’s data sets based on relevance to the creative economy and input from CVI Suite clients. In 2014, WESTAF expanded the list of creative industries available through the CVSuite from 10 to 72. WESTAF selected additional industries based on share of employment by newly expanded list of creative occupations.

Two industries, comer stores (443100) and second stores (452200), have been combined into a new industry, electronic stores (444100). Beginning with 2011, the CVSuite team retroactively updated the index to include the new industry electronic stores code and removed the decommissioned codes. Based on the employment ratios published by the Complete Employment Statistics (CES) program, only 29.2% of “electronic store” revenues are included within the index calculation because this percentage of revenues represents the previous CVI indicators, camera and record stores total. The full list of creative industries is available by request.

Geographic Determinism Of Minneapolis
This report defines Minneapolis as the collection of zip codes that have all of a large share of their area within the boundaries of the City of Minneapolis. The zip code methodology was used because of the CVI’s measurement. Because the precise boundaries of Minneapolis and the zip codes within Minneapolis do not align perfectly, some zip codes with extremely minimal area within Minneapolis were included while some zip codes with some area outside of Minneapolis were included. For complete list of zip codes included, please contact the authors.

The Minneapolis/St Paul Metropolitan Statistical Area (MSA) is comprised of 16 counties. In placing the Minneapolis metropolitan area into a more regional ranking, we chose to compare ourselves to the 35 most populous MSAs in the U.S., (not counting Puerto Rico). This slightly different from our MSA comparison in the 2015 report in which we also included regional MSAs and MSA’s of comparable size.

Literature Review
We conducted a literature review to establish context and gain insights related to opportunities and barriers for people of color working in creative occupations, and we also explored gender equity issues within these occupations. The conversations published in this report emphasize racial in gender equity. Our systematic approach revealed a negative correlation between median hourly incomes and percentages of people of color working in creative occupations, but a slightly positive correlation between median hourly incomes and percentages of women working in creative occupations. We used literature review findings to inform interview questions and frame the Twin Cities-specific research within a national context.

Works Cited
http://architecturerecord.com/articles/528-crushing-the-boy-club
Smith, Stacy L., Katherine Peper, and Marc Christensen. “Opening the Barriers and Opportunities for Independent Female Filmmakers.” Annenberg School for Communication & Journalism, University of Southern California, 2013.
CREDITS & ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Authors:
Gülgün Kayim, Director Arts, Culture, and the Creative Economy
Rachel Engh, Metris Arts Consulting
Anne Gadwa Nicodemus, Metris Arts Consulting

Staff:
Jenny Chayabutr, Senior Resource Coordinator, City Coordinator’s Office

Project Committee:
Tom Borrup, Principal, Creative Community Builders
Andrew Dahl, Economic Research Analyst, Business Development Community Planning and Economic Development
Hayley Finn, Minneapolis Arts Commission; and Associate Artistic Director, The Playwright’s Center
Council Member Elizabeth Glidden, Ward 8

Brenda Kayzar, Asst. Professor, Urban Studies, Dept. of Geography, University of Minnesota; and Chair, Northeast Minneapolis Arts Association
Haila Maze, Principal Planner, Long Range Planning Community Planning and Economic Development
Kathy Mouacheupao, Program Officer, Creative Placemaking, Twin Cities Local Initiatives Support Corporation
Kjersti Monson, Director, Long Range Planning, Community Planning and Economic Development
Kristen Murray, Program Developer, Center for Urban and Regional Affairs, University of Minnesota
Sara Lopez Lara, Aide to Council Member Glidden, Ward 8
Council Member Kevin Reich, Ward 1
Erick Garcia Luna, Policy Aide, Mayor’s Office

Designer:
Keiko Takahashi

Acknowledgements:
Alicia Belton, Principal, Urban Design Perspectives
Sam Babatunde Ero-Phillips, Designer, 4RM + ULA
D.A Bullock, Owner, Bully Creative Shop
Marcela Lorca, Director of Company Development, Guthrie Theatre
Dipankar Mukherjee, Artistic Director, Pangea World Theatre
Paola Sánchez-Garrett, Project Manager, 4RM+ULA

For reasonable accommodations or alternative formats please contact Gülgün Kayim, Director, Arts, Culture and the Creative Economy program, City of Minneapolis at gulgun.kayim@minneapolismn.gov or 612-673-2488. People who are deaf or hard of hearing can use a relay service to call 311 at 612-673-3000. TTY users call 612-673-2157 or 612-673-2626. Para asistencia 612-673-2700, Rau kev pab 612-673-2800, Hadii aad Caawimaad u baahantahay 612-673-3500.