



Minutes

June 17, 2016

Project	Pillar Point Harbor – West Trail Repairs Project (Phase 1)	From	Kirsten Burrowes
Subject	Design Charrette	Tel	(707) 523-1010
Location/Time	Half Moon Bay Yacht Club Tuesday, June 7, 2016 10 AM – 12 Noon	Job No	11121528
C:	Randy Murphy (SMCHD), File		

I. Introductions led by Randy Murphy

Attendees:

- Randy Murphy
San Mateo County Harbor District (SMCHD)
- Steve McGrath
San Mateo County Harbor District (SMCHD)
- Dave Davis
GHD Inc.
- Lorraine Htoo
GHD Inc.
- Kirsten Burrowes
GHD Inc.
- Summer Bulison
San Mateo County Planning (SMCO)
- Neal Sharma
Peninsula Open Space Trust (POST)
- Naomi Schowalter
US Army Corps of Engineers (USACE)
- Jeannine Manna
California Coastal Commission (CCC)
- Renee Ananda
California Coastal Commission (CCC)
- Marlene Finley
County Parks
- Michelle Dragony
Yacht Club/Coastside Buzz

II. Project Overview led by Dave Davis

- Issues with hillside drainage and culvert
- Restoration of hillside – experiencing erosion
- An emergency permit was issued from the CCC. As a condition, the Harbor District must file a Coastal Development Permit by July 28, 2016.
- CEQA review will be completed in the next project phase

III. Alternatives Overview led by Lorraine Htoo and Dave Davis

- a. Lorraine and Dave presented the four alternatives currently under consideration from two vantage points along the trail. The first view was looking at the trail from the beach. The second view was from the labyrinth back towards the trailhead.

1. Soldier Pile Wall

- a. The soldier pile wall system was described as being an engineered solution either pile driven or vibrated into place. It would take up less space, but was certainly the most visually displeasing. This type of trail repair, while very industrial, could be visually softened with a textured wall.

2. Rip-Rap

- a. Rip Rap (or Rock Slope Protection [RSP]) could be used with rock having a typical diameter of 3.5 feet. Smaller rock and/or grout could be placed in the voids between the larger rocks.

3. Rip-Rap with Planting

- a. Plantings could be placed in the voids between the rocks used for the RSP treatment. Certain plants have been identified appropriate to where they would be established along the rock slope face. All plants considered would be native species that would thrive in a predominantly saltwater environment. No planting would be considered at low tide and below, but just above. Pickleweed may be an option. For elevations above the mean monthly maximum tide line, salt grasses could be used and for areas subject to the least amount of wave action, sagebrush and coyote bush could be utilized.

4. "Do Nothing"

- a. The Alternative to take no action will also be explored as part of the alternative analysis.

IV. Open Discussion

• Steve McGrath:

- Is it reasonable to say that wave action, as determined by the study, could indicate if beach nourishment would be an option? Could wave action affect the decision to place any ADA compliant handrail? Dave indicated that the wave analysis would help determine if beach nourishment was a viable option. Lorraine indicated that code would be reviewed to see if handrails are required.
- Will Alternative 4, the "do nothing" alternative, be looked at in CEQA? Dave responded that the "do nothing" alternative, while not required by CEQA for a Mitigated Negative Declaration, could be considered.
- What are the chances that the vegetation on rip-rap with planting (Alternative 3) survives? Dave responded that the appropriate species would be proposed.

Steve suggested to use more angular boulders, so they are stackable and take up less space on the shore. Dave indicated that the study will help refine the rock selection. In selecting the rock for the presentation schematic, the thought process was such that rounded rock would allow for more pockets of planting.

- Is the hillside erosion (as seen on the graphic provided at the meeting) part of the project? GHD concurred and referred to the area delineated with a red boundary, labeled hillside erosion, in the graphic provided. Steve asked if the erosion from the hillside caused the plume of soil over the labyrinth. GHD indicated that a desktop study would be performed to help determine the cause.

• Neal Sharma:

- Would the Soldier Pile alternative (Alternative 1) impede access to the water's edge at this location? GHD added that access to the beach would be considered and took note of

the suggestion to add stairs. Would there need to be a curb, rail, or a wall between the rip-rap or wall and trail? Lorraine indicated that conservatively, yes, but that it would be verified with the local code. *GHD to determine if a three foot buffer for ADA compliance or an ADA railing would be needed.*

- **Jeannine Manna:**

- Have you seen success in rip-rap with planting? GHD indicated that they would verify with our team in Eureka. The consensus from the group was to have the wall appear more natural looking, if used.
- Is there a certain trail width we are aiming for? Randy noted that there will need to be emergency vehicle access. Lorraine indicated that currently, the path is anywhere from 8 feet to 15 feet wide. Randy stated that the minimum width should be kept to 12 feet. GHD to incorporate in the alternative.

- **Renee Ananda:**

- Is there or has there been coordination with the U.S. Air Force? Randy indicated that they have been contacted and coordination is ongoing.
- The currently biological resources assessment [conducted for the culvert repair] would need to be updated.

- **Michelle Dragony:**

- States that the Harbor District will have a hard time getting the soldier pile wall (Alternative 1) to pass by residents. Rip-rap would be the more popular choice among locals, simply because there are other places around the area that have used this method.
- At the Maverick's Bluff, sand is being blown off by storms and dredging. People who walk along the bluff cause erosion as well.

- **Naomi Schowalter:**

- States that the project should not propose rip-rap with planting as an alternative if it has never been done before and its success has not been determined.

Suggested studies to review:

1. San Mateo Water Conservation Study – RCD
2. NOAA Shoreline/Coastal Vulnerability Study

Items to consider in the alternatives analysis:

1. Access
2. Visual

V. West Trail Project Site Visit

The following narrative is a compilation of notes and recollections from the Harbor District and GHD Team. The site visit involved a walk along West Trail to observe the culvert repair and existing trail conditions. The walk was not structured and the group quickly dispersed along the trail; therefore, the following notes do not follow a set order of occurrence.

- Charrette attendees led by Randy Murphy from the parking lot, on West Trail to the labyrinth and indicated the approximate start of the erosion of the beach. He pointed out the recent repair culvert, which was viewed by Coastal Commission and Corps attendees. The Corps representative inquired as to whether the sandbags overlying the culvert would be permanent.

Randy and Dave Davis confirmed that they were put in place at the request of the Coastal Commission and would be temporary.

- A number of users were utilizing the trail, walking their dogs, etc. Several beachgoers were observed looking for lizards and crabs along the rocky shoreline below the edge of trail.
- The Marine Mammal Center took their truck on the trail to rescue a seal around the trail bend.
- The group took some time to take site photos and walk both along the trail and the shoreline. Large concrete blocks and voids were present along the shoreline, though not visible from the trail.
- Generally, the group would like to see an aesthetically pleasing alternative in place. Renee, from the California Coastal Commission, suggested a perch like setting similar to Lands End. Michelle Dragony, Yacht Club, Coastal Buzz, and a local resident, noted that the public would support a solution that still provided access and opens up the opportunity for the general public to enjoy the setting more. She mentioned a plan to create accessible access for users with the larger beach wheel chairs to be able to make it from the past the Yacht Club to the West Trail. The group asked that we look into the idea of a combination of partial soldier pile wall, rip rap and vegetated rip rap rather than one alternative versus the other.
- The labyrinth is barely evident in comparison to past years. The stones are gone and outline is hardly noticeable except for the vegetation now growing between the grooves of the maze.
- The existing culvert repair needs some immediate maintenance attention. Surrounding soil and leaves from nearby trees have covered the grate at the base of the hillside. Randy noted that he would bring it to the attention of District Maintenance.
- The group did not climb up the hillside to look at the culvert or conditions up top.

Attachments

1. Sign-in Sheet
2. Design Charrette Agenda
3. Alternatives Packet



SIGN-IN SHEET
Pillar Point Harbor – West Trail Repair Project
Design Charrette
June 7, 2016

Name (Please Print)	AFFILIATION	ADDRESS	E-MAIL ADDRESS
Summer Bulliam NEAL SHARMA	SMCO Planning	455 County Center, 2nd fl Redwood City	sbulliam@smcogov.org
Naomi Schowalter	POST	202 176th St. PALO ALTO	nsharma@openspacetrust.org
Jeannine Manza	USACE	1455 Market St. SF	naomi.a.schowalter@usace.army.mil
Renée Ananda	CCC	45 Fremont St, Suite 2000 SF, CA 94105	jeannine.manna@costal.ca.gov
Marlene Finley	Coastal Comm	"	reneeananda@coastal.ca.gov
STEVE MCGRAH	County Parks	455 County Center	mfinley@smcogov.org
Michelle Pragony	SMCHD		SMCGRATH e mcgrah@smcogov.org
Ramon Murray	Yacht Club		mdragony@coastsidebuzz.com
Kirsten Burrowes	SMCHD		RMurray@smcogov.org
Dave Davis	GHD	2255 Mercury Way, Santa Rosa, CA	kirsten.burrowes@ghd.com
Lorraine Htoo	GHD	"	dave.davis@ghd.com
	GHD	651 Montgomery St Suite 1010 SF, CA 94111	lorraine.htoo@ghd.com

Pillar Point Harbor – West Trail Repairs Project (Phase 1)

Design Charrette Agenda



Tuesday – June 7, 2016

10 AM – 12 Noon

West Trail begins at the public parking area off West Point Avenue and extends approximately 2,300 feet west along the harbor shoreline at the base of the ridge forming Pillar Point. Beginning at a point about 500 feet west of the public parking area, approximately 300 feet of the trail is affected by erosion from wave action. The erosion has resulted in an approximately 6-foot high near-vertical slope that is within a few feet of the trail edge. In a few areas, the erosion has encroached into the trail and reduced the trail width from its typical 13-foot width to about a 10-foot width. Hillside erosion has also occurred on the upslope side of the trail along a 150-foot-long section of hillside, just west of the shoreline erosion and across from the stone labyrinth. Within this area, there is also an approximately 50-foot long section where shoreline erosion has reduced the trail width.

I. Welcome

II. Introductions

III. Project Background

- A. Project Need/Objective
- B. West Trail Repair Actions to Date
- C. Current Project Summary
- D. Future West Trail Plans

IV. Current Goal: CDP Application [by July 28, 2016]

V. Current Scope: Required Studies & Actions

- A. Hillside Drainage Analysis
- B. Coastal Erosion/Wave Analysis
- C. Alternatives Analysis (including "Do Nothing")
- D. CDP Application
- E. Agency Scoping Memorandum

VI. Questions

(Allow 15 minutes commute to West Trail parking lot)

VII. Site Walk



View 1 Do Nothing



View 1 Soldier Pile Wall



View 1 Do Nothing



View 1 Rip-rap



View 1 Do Nothing



View 1 Rip-rap with Planting





