

# New York City Rent Guidelines Board

1 Centre Street, Suite 2210 • New York, NY 10007 (212) 669-7480 • Web: nyc.gov/rgb

Chair Nestor Davidson Executive Director
Andrew McLaughlin

## Memorandum

To: All Board Members
From: Brian Hoberman
Date: June 1, 2023

Re: Analysis of I&E Data by Proportion of Stabilized Units in Buildings Constructed before 1974

Last year, RGB staff distributed a memo analyzing data from the NYC Department of Finance of buildings constructed before 1974. This year's *I&E Study* added comparisons between pre-1974 and post-1973 buildings, and this memo further compares additional select pre-1974 data. To simplify the comparison, buildings are grouped into these four categories:

- Buildings that contain at least one stabilized unit (all years and pre-1974 only)
- Buildings where 50% or more of residential units are stabilized (pre-1974 only)
- Buildings where 80% or more of residential units are stabilized (pre-1974 only)
- Buildings where 100% of residential units are stabilized (all years and pre-1974 only)

These groupings are also broken down by location as well.

A further discussion of income and expense statistics, with numbers discussed highlighted in yellow in each table, accompany each of the five tables that follow.

## **Location of Buildings by Stabilized Proportion**

Table 1 (below) illustrates the proportion of buildings of any age that are entirely rent stabilized (100% stabilized); pre-1974 50% or more stabilized; pre-1974 80% or more stabilized; and pre-1974 100% stabilized. Only Core Manhattan<sup>1</sup> and Staten Island see a difference of more than one percentage point between proportions of 100% stabilized buildings of any age and those 100% stabilized buildings constructed before 1974.

Table I

|  | 100%<br>Stabilized<br>(All Years) | 50%<br>Stabilized<br>(Pre-1974<br>Buildings Only) | 80%<br>Stabilized<br>(Pre-1974<br>Buildings Only) | 100%<br>Stabilized<br>(Pre-1974<br>Buildings Only) |
|--|-----------------------------------|---|---|--|
| Percentage of Buildings,<br>by Stabilized Proportion |                                   |   |   |  |
| Citywide   | 53%                               | 65%   | 57%   | 49%  |
| Manhattan  | 28%                               | 46%   | 34%   | 27%  |
| Bronx  | 76%                               | 83%   | 81%   | 76%  |
| Brooklyn   | 66%                               | 77%   | 72%   | 65%  |
| Queens   | 50%                               | 77%   | 66%   | 49%  |
| Staten Island*                                       | <mark>52%</mark>                  | 65%   | 61%   | <mark>46%</mark>                                   |
| Core Manhattan                                       | <mark>16%</mark>                  | 32%   | 18%   | <mark>1%</mark>                                    |
| Upper Manhattan                                      | 51%                               | 76%   | 65%   | 50%  |
| City w/o Core Manhattan                              | 68%                               | 78%   | 72%   | 67%  |

Source: NYC Department of Finance, RPIE Filings

Note that there are only 83 buildings of any year, and only 69 pre-1974 buildings, that contain at least one rent stabilized unit in Staten Island.

## Average Rent, Income, and Costs: Citywide and by Borough

Table 2 (on the next page) examines average rent, income, costs, and NOI in 2021 per unit per month by location among buildings of any age and compares them to pre-1974 buildings. Looking at 100% stabilized buildings in Core Manhattan, NOI is \$537 in pre-74 buildings, compared to \$693 among buildings of all ages, a \$156 difference. By comparison, among 100% stabilized buildings in the rest of the City, NOI is \$378 in pre-74 buildings, compared to \$456 among buildings of all ages, a \$78 difference.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Core Manhattan represents the area south of W 110th and E 96th Streets. Upper Manhattan is the remainder of the borough.

Table 2

|                              | Rent    | Income  | Costs   | NOI                |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|---------|--------------------|
| Citywide All Years*          | \$1,495 | \$1,667 | \$1,091 | \$576              |
| Pre-74*                      | \$1,343 | \$1,495 | \$1,059 | \$436              |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,263 | \$1,403 | \$983   | \$419              |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,214 | \$1,339 | \$931   | \$408              |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | \$1,240 | \$1,370 | \$899   | \$470              |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | \$1,168 | \$1,290 | \$900   | \$390              |
| Manhattan All Years*         | \$1,913 | \$2,245 | \$1,560 | \$685              |
| Pre-74*                      | \$1,664 | \$1,957 | \$1,448 | \$509              |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,423 | \$1,687 | \$1,227 | \$460              |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,290 | \$1,526 | \$1,091 | \$435              |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | \$1,377 | \$1,636 | \$1,133 | \$503              |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | \$1,261 | \$1,505 | \$1,077 | \$429              |
| Bronx All Years*             | \$1,495 | \$1,667 | \$1,091 | \$413              |
| Pre-74*                      | \$1,100 | \$1,222 | \$865   | \$357              |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,100 | \$1,234 | \$867   | \$367              |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,093 | \$1,226 | \$863   | \$363              |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | \$1,097 | \$1,232 | 837     | \$395              |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | \$1,078 | \$1,212 | \$858   | \$355              |
| Brooklyn All Years*          | \$1,495 | \$1,667 | \$1,091 | \$663              |
| Pre-74*                      | \$1,278 | \$1,362 | \$925   | \$436              |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,266 | \$1,351 | \$914   | \$437              |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,247 | \$1,329 | \$896   | \$432              |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | \$1,380 | \$1,473 | \$899   | \$575              |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | \$1,232 | \$1,312 | \$887   | \$425              |
| Queens All Years*            | \$1,439 | \$1,537 | \$996   | \$541              |
| Pre-74*                      | \$1,360 | \$1,453 | \$1,001 | \$452              |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,357 | \$1,444 | \$1,006 | \$437              |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,332 | \$1,416 | \$984   | \$432              |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | \$1,380 | \$1,473 | \$899   | \$575              |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | \$1,262 | \$1,334 | \$931   | \$403              |
| Staten Island All Years*     | \$1,041 | \$1,173 | \$774   | \$399              |
| Pre-74*                      | \$1,180 | \$1,341 | \$896   | \$445              |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,130 | \$1,297 | \$895   | \$402              |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,110 | \$1,279 | \$883   | \$396              |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | \$931   | \$946   | \$654   | \$293              |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | \$1,067 | \$1,083 | \$760   | \$323              |
| Core Manhattan All Years*    | \$2,356 | \$2,746 | \$1,918 | \$828              |
| Pre-74*                      | \$2,048 | \$2,428 | \$1,818 | \$610              |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,750 | \$2,089 | \$1,529 | \$560              |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,582 | \$1,868 | \$1,325 | \$544              |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | \$1,789 | \$2,119 | \$1,427 | <mark>\$693</mark> |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | \$1,525 | \$1,820 | \$1,283 | \$537              |
| Upper Manhattan All Years*   | \$1,358 | \$1,617 | \$1,112 | \$505              |
| Pre-74*                      | \$1,297 | \$1,507 | \$1,096 | \$412              |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,257 | \$1,482 | \$1,073 | \$409              |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,213 | \$1,436 | \$1,030 | \$407              |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | \$1,227 | \$1,461 | \$1,027 | \$434              |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | \$1,195 | \$1,427 | \$1,025 | \$402              |
| City w/o Core Man All Years* | \$1,337 | \$1,463 | \$940   | \$523              |
| Pre-74*                      | \$1,238 | \$1,349 | \$948   | \$401              |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,228 | \$1,343 | \$941   | \$402              |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | \$1,200 | \$1,317 | \$918   | \$398              |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | \$1,224 | \$1,338 | \$882   | \$456              |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | \$1,161 | \$1,269 | \$891   | <mark>\$378</mark> |

Source: NYC Department of Finance, RPIE Filings

Note: There are only 83 buildings of any year, and only 69 pre-1974 buildings, that contain at least one rent stabilized unit in Staten Island.

<sup>\*</sup>All buildings that contain at least one rent stabilized unit in row.

#### Cost-to-Income Ratios: Core Manhattan vs. City w/o Core

Table 3 (below) breaks down the adjusted and unadjusted cost-to-income ratios in 2021 by Citywide, Core Manhattan, and the City excluding Core Manhattan among buildings containing stabilized units of all ages and compares them to pre-1974 buildings.

Examining all pre-74 buildings containing at least one stabilized unit vs. 100% stabilized pre-74 buildings, there is a greater difference in Core Manhattan compared to the rest of the City. For example, in Core Manhattan, the adjusted cost-to-income ratio is 71.2% among all pre-74 buildings and 67.0% among 100% stabilized pre-74 buildings, a 4.2 percentage point difference. Meanwhile, in the rest of the City, the adjusted cost-to-income ratio is 66.8% among all pre-1974 buildings and 66.7% among 100% stabilized pre-74 buildings, a minimal 0.1 percentage point difference.

Table 3

|                                      | All Buildings<br>Containing<br>Stabilized<br>Units | All Buildings<br>Containing<br>Stabilized<br>Units<br>(Pre-1974<br>Buildings Only) | 50%<br>Stabilized<br>(Pre-1974<br>Buildings<br>Only) | 80%<br>Stabilized<br>(Pre-1974<br>Buildings<br>Only) | 100%<br>Stabilized | 100%<br>Stabilized<br>(Pre-1974<br>Buildings<br>Only) |
|--------------------------------------|--|--|--|--|--------------------|---|
| Adjusted Cost-to-Income              |  |  |  |  |                    |   |
| Ratios                               |  |  |  |  |                    |   |
|                                      |  |  |  |  |                    |   |
| Citywide                             | 62.2%  | 67.4%  | 66.6%  | 66.1%  | 62.4%              | 66.3%   |
| Core Manhattan                       | 66.4%  | <mark>71.2%</mark>   | 69.6%  | 67.4%  | 64.0%              | <mark>67.0%</mark>                                    |
| City w/o Core Manhattan              | 61.1%  | <mark>66.8%</mark>   | 66.6%  | 66.3%  | 62.7%              | <mark>66.7%</mark>                                    |
|                                      |  |  |  |  |                    |   |
| Unadjusted Cost-to-<br>Income Ratios |  |  |  |  |                    |   |
| Citywide                             | 65.4%  | 70.9%  | 70.1%  | 69.5%  | 65.7%              | 69.8%   |
| Core Manhattan                       | 69.8%  | 74.9%  | 73.2%  | 70.9%  | 67.3%              | 70.5%   |
| City w/o Core Manhattan              | 64.3%  | 70.3%  | 70.1%  | 69.8%  | 65.9%              | 70.2%   |

Source: NYC Department of Finance, RPIE Filings

#### Average Growth in Rent, Income, Costs, and NOI: Citywide and by Borough

Table 4 (on the next page) breaks down average longitudinal rent, income, costs, and NOI changes from 2020 to 2021 per unit per month, by location among buildings of any age and compares them to pre-1974 buildings. Among all pre-74 vs 100% stabilized pre-74 buildings, there was a greater difference in the change in NOI among Core Manhattan buildings, compared to the rest of the City. In all pre-74 Core Manhattan buildings, NOI fell 23.3%, while among 100% pre-74 stabilized buildings, it fell 16.7%, a 6.6 percentage point difference. Meanwhile, in the City excluding Core Manhattan, NOI fell 6.6% among all pre-74 buildings and 3.9% among 100% pre-74 stabilized buildings, a 2.7 percentage point difference.

Table 4

|                              | Avg. Rent<br>Change | Avg. Income<br>Change | Avg. Cost<br>Change | Avg. NOI<br>Change  |
|------------------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
| Citywide All Years*          | -1.2%               | -0.2%                 | 5.2%                | -9.1%               |
| Pre-74*                      | -0.6%               | 0.2%                  | 5.2%                | -10.1%              |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | 0.2%                | 1.1%                  | 5.6%                | -8.1%               |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | 0.8%                | 1.6%                  | 5.2%                | -5.9%               |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | 1.7%                | 2.2%                  | 5.3%                | -4.4%               |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | 1.4%                | 2.0%                  | 5.5%                | -4.0%               |
| Manhattan All Years*         | -5.0%               | -3.5%                 | 5.3%                | -19.1%              |
| Pre-74*                      | -4.6%               | -3.2%                 | 4.9%                | -20.7%              |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | -3.3%               | -1.7%                 | 6.3%                | -18.1%              |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | -3.2%               | -1.4%                 | 5.4%                | -15.1%              |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | -0.8%               | -0.2%                 | 6.2%                | -13.1%              |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | -1.3%               | -0.6%                 | 6.3%                |                     |
| Bronx All Years*             | 2.4%                |                       | 5.8%                | -13.3%<br>-1.9%     |
|                              |                     | 3.1%                  |                     |                     |
| Pre-74*                      | 2.9%                | 3.7%                  | 6.1%                | -1.7%               |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | 2.6%                | 3.5%                  | 5.9%                | -1.7%               |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | 2.6%                | 3.5%                  | 5.9%                | -1.7%               |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | 2.8%                | 3.4%                  | 5.8%                | -2.0%               |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | 2.6%                | 3.2%                  | 5.8%                | -1.9%               |
| Brooklyn All Years*          | 1.0%                | 1.7%                  | 5.3%                | -2.8%               |
| Pre-74*                      | 0.8%                | 1.3%                  | 4.6%                | -5.0%               |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | 1.0%                | 1.5%                  | 4.6%                | -4.5%               |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | 1.1%                | 1.5%                  | 4.3%                | -3.9%               |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | 1.4%                | 1.6%                  | 4.2%                | -3.3%               |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | 1.2%                | 1.8%                  | 4.7%                | -2.4%               |
| Queens All Years*            | -0.2%               | 0.4%                  | 4.5%                | -6.3%               |
| Pre-74*                      | 0.4%                | 1.0%                  | 5.4%                | -7.5%               |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | 0.3%                | 0.7%                  | 5.4%                | -8.5%               |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | 0.7%                | 1.3%                  | 5.3%                | -6.8%               |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | 1.4%                | 1.9%                  | 5.3%                | -4.8%               |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | 1.1%                | 1.7%                  | 5.6%                | -5.0%               |
| Staten Island All Years*     | 3.1%                | 3.7%                  | 1.6%                | 8.1%                |
| Pre-74*                      | 3.0%                | 3.8%                  | 2.6%                | 35.5%               |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | 0.8%                | 1.6%                  | 4.4%                | -4.0%               |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | 0.9%                | 1.8%                  | 4.0%                | -2.8%               |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       |                     | Too few l             | ouildings           |                     |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | 3.3%                | 3.3%                  | 2.6%                | 4.8%                |
| Core Manhattan All Years*    | -6.0%               | -4.9%                 | 4.3%                | -21.0%              |
| Pre-74*                      | -5.6%               | -4.5%                 | 4.1%                | <mark>-23.3%</mark> |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | -4.6%               | -3.8%                 | 6.3%                | -23.7%              |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | -5.1%               | -4.9%                 | 4.0%                | -21.3%              |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | -0.2%               | -2.7%                 | 4.7%                | <mark>-16.7%</mark> |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | -1.2%               | -2.9%                 | 5.7%                | -16.7%              |
| Upper Manhattan All Years*   | -2.8%               | -0.4%                 | 7.4%                | -14.8%              |
| Pre-74*                      | -3.0%               | -1.1%                 | 6.1%                | -16.5%              |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | -2.3%               | -0.1%                 | 6.3%                | -13.7%              |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | -2.5%               | -0.1%                 | 6.0%                | -12.8%              |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | -1.0%               | 0.7%                  | 6.7%                | -11.9%              |
| 100% Stabilized All Years    | -1.3%               | 0.6%                  | 6.6%                | -11.2%              |
| City w/o Core Man All Years* | 0.5%                | 1.5%                  | 5.6%                | -5.1%               |
| Pre-74*                      | 0.7%                | 1.5%                  | 5.5%                | -6.6%               |
| 50% Stabilized Pre-74        | 0.8%                | 1.7%                  | 5.5%                | -6.1%               |
| 80% Stabilized Pre-74        | 1.0%                | 1.9%                  | 5.3%                | -5.1%               |
| 100% Stabilized Pre-74       | 1.8%                | 2.4%                  | 5.3%                | -3.1%<br>-3.9%      |
| 100/0 3tabilized F16-/4      | 1.5%                | 2.3%                  | 5.4%                | -3.3%               |

Source: NYC Department of Finance, RPIE Filings

Note: Note that in the longitudinal analysis, there are only 77 buildings of any year, and only 30 pre-1974 buildings, that contain at least one rent stabilized unit in Staten Island.

<sup>\*</sup>All buildings that contain at least one rent stabilized unit in row.

## Rate of Distressed Properties: Core Manhattan vs. City w/o Core

Buildings that have operating and maintenance costs that exceed gross income are considered distressed. Table 5 (below) breaks down the proportion of distressed properties in 2021 among buildings of any age containing stabilized units and compares them to pre-1974 buildings in three areas: Citywide; in Core Manhattan; and in the City excluding Core Manhattan. Distressed rates are a great deal higher among Core Manhattan buildings than elsewhere in the City. Looking at pre-74 buildings in Core Manhattan, the proportion of distressed properties is 3.0 percentage points higher among 100% stabilized buildings (16.6%) compared to all pre-74 buildings (13.6%). By contrast, in the rest of the City, the proportion of distressed properties is 1.2 percentage points lower among 100% pre-74 stabilized buildings (6.2%) than among all pre-74 buildings (7.4%).

Table 5

|                           | All Buildings<br>Containing<br>Stabilized<br>Units | All Buildings<br>Containing<br>Stabilized Units<br>(Pre-1974<br>Buildings Only) | 50%<br>Stabilized<br>(Pre-1974<br>Buildings<br>Only) | 80%<br>Stabilized<br>(Pre-1974<br>Buildings<br>Only) | 100%<br>Stabilized | 100%<br>Stabilized<br>(Pre-1974<br>Buildings<br>Only) |
|---------------------------|--|---|--|--|--------------------|---|
| Distressed Proportion     |  |   |  |  |                    |   |
| (Proportion of Buildings) |  |   |  |  |                    |   |
| Citywide                  | 8.8%   | 9.1%  | 7.7%   | 7.3%   | 6.9%               | 7.1%  |
| Core Manhattan            | 13.4%  | 13.6%   | 16.5%  | 17.8%  | 15.9%              | 16.6%   |
| City w/o Core Manhattan   | 7.1%   | <mark>7.4%</mark>   | 6.4%   | 6.3%   | 6.1%               | <mark>6.2%</mark>                                     |
|                           |  |   |  |  |                    |   |
| Distressed Proportion     |  |   |  |  |                    |   |
| (Actual Building Counts)  |  |   |  |  |                    |   |
| Citywide                  | 1,313  | 1,273   | 704  | 584  | 520                | 489   |
| Core Manhattan            | 534  | 520   | 199  | 125  | 104                | 97  |
| City w/o Core Manhattan   | 779  | 753   | 505  | 459  | 416                | 392   |

Source: NYC Department of Finance, RPIE Filings