Deep Roots:

On the Persistence of American Populism

Ze Han ¹, Helen V. Milner ¹, Kris James Mitchener ²

¹Princeton University

²Santa Clara University

- 1. Key Takeaways
- 2. Theory
- 3. ESTIMATING PERSISTENCE
- 4. MECHANISMS OF PERSISTENCE
- 5. Conclusion

KEY TAKEAWAYS

- PUZZLE: Does American populism persist?
- FINDING: Yes!

THEORY

GLOBALIZATION AS THE KEY FACTOR FUELING POPULISM

- Significant structural transformations in agriculture due to globalization in the 1890s
 - · Agriculture was increasingly commercially oriented
 - Farmers' fortunes were tied to global supply shocks and commodity-price fluctuations
- Post-1990s: A long era of deep globalization
 - International supply chains and offshoring
 - Chinese import competition
 - Skill-biased technological changes
- · Charismatic leaders in both periods
 - James Weaver (1892)
 - William Jennings Bryan (1896)
 - Donald Trump (2016/2020)

| | TF-IDF | | SBERT | | USE | |
|------------------------|--------|------|-------|------|------|------|
| | 1892 | 1896 | 1892 | 1896 | 1892 | 1896 |
| Republican (2016/2020) | 0.34 | 0.35 | 0.75 | 0.71 | 0.76 | 0.71 |
| Democrat (2016) | 0.25 | 0.22 | 0.58 | 0.55 | 0.73 | 0.68 |
| Democrat (2020) | 0.22 | 0.21 | 0.69 | 0.63 | 0.74 | 0.69 |

• Counties that voted more for populist parties in the 1890s congressional elections will have higher vote shares for Trump in 2016 and 2020.

ESTIMATING PERSISTENCE

 $ShareTrump_{c,t} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 SharePopulist_{c,189X} + \beta_2 Z'_{c,t} + \alpha_s + \epsilon_{c,t}$

- c: County
- *t*: Either 2016 or 2020
- ShareTrump_{c,t}: Trump's vote share in 2016 or 2020
- SharePopulist_{c,189X}: Crosswalked populist vote share in House elections in the 1890s (1892, 1894, 1896, or 1898)
- $Z'_{c,t}$: A vector of controls
- $\alpha_{\rm s}$: State fixed effects
- $\epsilon_{c,t}$: Stochastic error



7

INSTRUMENTAL VARIABLE

- Causal identification via instrument for 1890s globalization
- **"Market access" change between 1870 and 1890** (Donaldson and Hornbeck 2016)
- Reasons
 - Farmers' frustrations over railroad monopolies were a core part of the rise of populism.
 - Railroads connected farmers to national and global markets and their prices.
- "Market access" rises when trade gets cheaper, particularly with populous counties having higher trade costs



9

· "POPULIST" COUNTIES:

Populist vote share in county i > Median across all counties

• PRE-TREATMENT COVARIATES:

- The share of the Catholic population
- The share of the black population
- \cdot The share of the urban population
- The share of the foreign-born population



MECHANISMS OF PERSISTENCE

Populist Attitude_{*i*,s,t} = $\beta_0 + \beta_1$ Populist_{s,189X} + $\beta_2 Z'_{i,s,t} + \alpha_s + \alpha_t + \epsilon_{i,s,t}$

- *i*: Individual
- s: State
- t: Survey year
- + Populist_{s,189X}: Crosswalked populist vote share in the 1890s by state
- + $\alpha_{\rm s}$: State fixed effects
- α_t : Year fixed effects
- $\epsilon_{i,s,t}$: Stochastic error



CONCLUSION

CONCLUSIONS

- $\cdot\,$ American electoral populism persists.
 - Counties that voted more for populist parties in the 1890s congressional elections will have higher vote shares for Trump in 2016 and 2020.
- Place-based political beliefs and attitudes can be transmitted and endure over long periods of time.
- Shocks like globalization can reinvigorate these beliefs.
- Charismatic leaders can propel populism into a significant political force.
- But does populism have viability as a long-term political movement?

THANK YOU for your attention and any comments.

Supporting Information

- 2020 results (link)
- CES results (ink)
- Placebo results (ink)
- Populist vote shares in 1892/1898 (int)
- Alternative measurement of populist vote shares
- Alternative measurement of Chinese import penetration
- Population-based crosswalks (M4, M6) (International Content of C
- Region FE + Conley SE (ink)
- Congressional results
- Matching Frontier
- Perot (1992) link
- Weaver (1892) and Bryan (1896) 💷
- Election maps link











| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | | | | |
|----------------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1892 | 0.092*** (0.018) | 0.092*** (0.018) | 0.054*** (0.017) | 0.100*** (0.011) | 0.032*** (0.011) | | |
| Chinese import penetration | | \checkmark | V | √ | √ (| | |
| Demographic controls | | | v | \checkmark | v v | | |
| Observations | 2729 | 2728 | 2728 | 2728 | √ 2728 | | |
| ${\rm R}^2$ Adjusted ${\rm R}^2$ | 0.010 0.010 | 0.010 0.009 | 0.157 0.156 | 0.647 0.644 | 0.822 0.817 | | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | | | | |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|------------------|--|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1898 | 0.228*** (0.025) | 0.228*** (0.025) | 0.263*** (0.025) | 0.241*** (0.019) | 0.010 (0.016) | | |
| Chinese import penetration | | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | | |
| Industry controls | | | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | | |
| Demographic controls | | | | \checkmark | \checkmark | | |
| State dummies | | | | | \checkmark | | |
| Observations | 2893 | 2891 | 2891 | 2891 | 2891 | | |
| \mathbb{R}^2 | 0.021 | 0.021 | 0.169 | 0.655 | 0.822 | | |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.020 | 0.020 | 0.168 | 0.653 | 0.818 | | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | | | | |
|---|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1892 | 0.098*** (0.018) | 0.099*** (0.018) | 0.054*** (0.017) | 0.100*** (0.011) | 0.029*** (0.011) | | |
| Chinese import penetration Industry controls | | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | √ √ | | |
| Demographic controls State dummies | | | | \checkmark | \checkmark | | |
| Observations | 2728 | 2727 | 2727 | 2727 | 2727 | | |
| \mathbb{R}^2 | 0.011 | 0.015 | 0.194 | 0.707 | 0.852 | | |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.011 | 0.014 | 0.193 | 0.705 | 0.848 | | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | | | | |
|---|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|-------------------|--|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1898 | 0.210*** (0.027) | 0.210*** (0.027) | 0.247*** (0.026) | 0.217*** (0.018) | -0.008 (0.016) | | |
| Chinese import penetration Industry controls | | \checkmark | √ √ | √ √ | \checkmark | | |
| Demographic controls State dummies | | | | \checkmark | \checkmark | | |
| Observations | 2892 | 2890 | 2890 | 2890 | 2890 | | |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.017 | 0.019 | 0.198 | 0.717 | 0.853 | | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | | |
|--|----------------------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) |
| Populist vote share in 1892 | 0.731*** | 0.733*** | 0.757*** | 0.565*** | 0.337*** |
| | (0.095) | (0.095) | (0.095) | (0.085) | (0.115) |
| Chinese import penetration | | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| Industry controls | | | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| Demographic controls | | | | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| State dummies | | | | | \checkmark |
| Observations | 2729 | 2728 | 2728 | 2728 | 2728 |
| F statistic for weak identification | 98.496 | 97.926 | 97.297 | 96.555 | 31.746 |
| Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 73.582 | 73.740 | 75.273 | 78.148 | 29.993 |
| p-value of Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 |
| Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 66.099 | 65.726 | 73.721 | 60.063 | 13.896 |
| p-value of Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 |

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | | |
|--|----------------------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) |
| Populist vote share in 1898 | 0.916*** | 0.912*** | 0.952*** | 0.651*** | 0.479*** |
| | (0.119) | (0.119) | (0.113) | (0.096) | (0.149) |
| Chinese import penetration | | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| Industry controls | | | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| Demographic controls | | | | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| State dummies | | | | | \checkmark |
| Observations | 2893 | 2891 | 2891 | 2891 | 2891 |
| F statistic for weak identification | 99.695 | 99.423 | 98.208 | 92.337 | 32.119 |
| Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 65.666 | 65.800 | 66.684 | 65.883 | 28.851 |
| p-value of Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 |
| Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 67.713 | 66.954 | 77.330 | 48.587 | 17.165 |
| p-value of Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 |

| | | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | | |
|--|---------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--------------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | |
| Populist vote share in 1892 | 0.729*** (0.095) | 0.741*** (0.096) | 0.760*** (0.094) | 0.475*** (0.074) | 0.233** (0.096) | |
| Chinese import penetration | | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | ~ | |
| Industry controls | | | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | |
| Demographic controls | | | | \checkmark | \checkmark | |
| State dummies | | | | | \checkmark | |
| Observations | 2728 | 2727 | 2727 | 2727 | 2727 | |
| F statistic for weak identification | 99.068 | 98.953 | 99.233 | 97.809 | 31.992 | |
| Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 73.975 | 74.354 | 76.310 | 79.050 | 30.260 | |
| p-value of Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | |
| Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 64.977 | 64.447 | 74.417 | 51.115 | 8.019 | |
| p-value of Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.005 | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | | |
|--|----------------------------|----------|--------------|--------------|--------------|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) |
| Populist vote share in 1898 | 0.967*** | 0.973*** | 1.006*** | 0.580*** | 0.333*** |
| | (0.127) | (0.127) | (0.119) | (0.088) | (0.125) |
| Chinese import penetration | | √ | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| Industry controls | | | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| Demographic controls | | | | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| State dummies | | | | | \checkmark |
| Observations | 2892 | 2890 | 2890 | 2890 | 2890 |
| F statistic for weak identification | 99.624 | 100.263 | 99.712 | 92.620 | 32.127 |
| Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 65.624 | 66.081 | 67.338 | 66.142 | 28.855 |
| p-value of Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 |
| Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 71.468 | 70.947 | 83.795 | 47.367 | 9.781 |
| p-value of Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.002 |

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | | | | |
|-------------------------|----------------------------|-------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--|--|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | | | |
| Populist county in 1892 | 0.012** (0.005) | 0.009* (0.005) | | | | | |
| Populist county in 1898 | | | 0.036*** (0.009) | 0.039*** (0.006) | | | |
| Full controls | | \checkmark | | \checkmark | | | |
| Observations | 2,497 | 2,496 | 2,230 | 2,229 | | | |
| R ² | 0.001 | 0.630 | 0.011 | 0.678 | | | |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.001 | 0.627 | 0.011 | 0.675 | | | |
| | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | | |
|-------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | |
| Populist county in 1892 | 0.014*** (0.005) | 0.009** (0.004) | | | |
| Populist county in 1898 | | | 0.039*** (0.010) | 0.041*** (0.006) | |
| Full controls | | \checkmark | | \checkmark | |
| Observations | 2,497 | 2,496 | 2,230 | 2,229 | |
| R ² | 0.002 | 0.690 | 0.013 | 0.731 | |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.002 | 0.688 | 0.012 | 0.729 | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | | |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------|-------------------|---------------------|------------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | |
| Populist vote share in 1892 | 0.029*** (0.009) | | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | | 0.019* (0.010) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 0.057*** (0.010) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1898 | | | | 0.021 (0.014) | |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | |
| State Fixed Effects | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | |
| Observations | 2700 | 2836 | 2793 | 2851 | |
| \mathbb{R}^2 | 0.823 | 0.823 | 0.823 | 0.821 | |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.819 | 0.819 | 0.819 | 0.817 | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | | |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------|---------------------|------------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | |
| Populist vote share in 1892 | 0.023*** (0.008) | | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | | 0.018** (0.009) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 0.051*** (0.009) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1898 | | | | 0.008 (0.013) | |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | |
| State Fixed Effects | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | |
| Observations | 2700 | 2835 | 2792 | 2850 | |
| \mathbb{R}^2 | 0.849 | 0.852 | 0.853 | 0.852 | |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.846 | 0.849 | 0.849 | 0.849 | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | |
|--|----------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|---------------------|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) |
| Populist vote share in 1892 | 0.300*** (0.110) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | | 0.508** (0.210) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 0.856** (0.424) | |
| Populist vote share in 1898 | | | | 0.549*** (0.188) |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| State Fixed Effects | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| Observations | 2700 | 2836 | 2793 | 2851 |
| F statistic for weak identification | 27.769 | 13.201 | 6.033 | 20.168 |
| Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 26.756 | 13.392 | 6.287 | 19.112 |
| p-value of Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.012 | 0.000 |
| Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 12.020 | 14.737 | 16.314 | 17.153 |
| p-value of Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 0.001 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 |

| | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | |
|--|----------------------------|--------------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) |
| Populist vote share in 1892 | 0.213** (0.094) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | | 0.352** (0.168) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 0.574* (0.319) | |
| Populist vote share in 1898 | | | | 0.382** (0.154) |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| State Fixed Effects | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| Observations | 2700 | 2835 | 2792 | 2850 |
| F statistic for weak identification | 27.813 | 13.373 | 6.042 | 20.120 |
| Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 26.853 | 13.584 | 6.302 | 19.074 |
| p-value of Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.012 | 0.000 |
| Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 7.209 | 8.598 | 8.719 | 9.706 |
| p-value of Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 0.007 | 0.003 | 0.003 | 0.002 |

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|------------------|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) |
| Populist vote share in 1892 | 0.034*** (0.011) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | | 0.039*** (0.010) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 0.061*** (0.014) | |
| Populist vote share in 1898 | | | | 0.009 (0.016) |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| State Fixed Effects | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| Observations | 2723 | 2832 | 2853 | 2887 |
| \mathbb{R}^2 | 0.827 | 0.828 | 0.827 | 0.827 |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.823 | 0.825 | 0.823 | 0.823 |

| | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|-------------------|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) |
| Populist vote share in 1892 | 0.029*** (0.011) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | | 0.038*** (0.010) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 0.049*** (0.014) | |
| Populist vote share in 1898 | | | | -0.010 (0.016) |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| State Fixed Effects | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| Observations | 2723 | 2832 | 2853 | 2887 |
| \mathbb{R}^2 | 0.852 | 0.853 | 0.852 | 0.853 |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.848 | 0.850 | 0.849 | 0.849 |

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | |
|--|----------------------------|---------------------|--------------------|---------------------|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) |
| Populist vote share in 1892 | 0.317*** (0.111) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | | 0.386*** (0.144) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 0.688** (0.288) | |
| Populist vote share in 1898 | | | | 0.456*** (0.145) |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| State Fixed Effects | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| Observations | 2723 | 2832 | 2853 | 2887 |
| F statistic for weak identification | 31.944 | 20.778 | 11.188 | 32.263 |
| Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 30.184 | 20.788 | 11.815 | 28.992 |
| p-value of Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.001 | 0.000 |
| Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 12.681 | 13.558 | 14.599 | 15.947 |
| p-value of Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 |

| | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | |
|--|----------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|---------------------|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) |
| Populist vote share in 1892 | 0.230** (0.096) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | | 0.282** (0.123) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 0.492** (0.242) | |
| Populist vote share in 1898 | | | | 0.331*** (0.125) |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| State Fixed Effects | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| Observations | 2723 | 2832 | 2853 | 2887 |
| F statistic for weak identification | 31.944 | 20.778 | 11.188 | 32.263 |
| Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 30.184 | 20.788 | 11.815 | 28.992 |
| p-value of Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.001 | 0.000 |
| Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 7.854 | 8.447 | 8.556 | 9.648 |
| p-value of Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 0.005 | 0.004 | 0.003 | 0.002 |

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | | |
|-------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | |
| Populist county in 1892 | 0.009* (0.005) | | | | |
| Populist county in 1894 | | 0.040*** (0.005) | | | |
| Populist county in 1896 | | | 0.022*** (0.005) | | |
| Populist county in 1898 | | | | 0.038*** (0.006) | |
| Full controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | |
| Observations | 2,492 | 2,445 | 2,429 | 2,225 | |
| R ² | 0.629 | 0.650 | 0.659 | 0.678 | |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.626 | 0.647 | 0.656 | 0.675 | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | |
|-------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) |
| Populist county in 1892 | 0.008** (0.004) | | | |
| Populist county in 1894 | | 0.041*** (0.005) | | |
| Populist county in 1896 | | | 0.019*** (0.005) | |
| Populist county in 1898 | | | | 0.041*** (0.006) |
| Full controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| Observations | 2,492 | 2,445 | 2,429 | 2,225 |
| R ² | 0.690 | 0.705 | 0.713 | 0.731 |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.687 | 0.703 | 0.711 | 0.729 |

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | 0.169*** (0.011) | 0.044*** (0.010) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 0.126*** (0.012) | 0.061*** (0.014) |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| State Fixed Effects | | \checkmark | | \checkmark |
| Observations | 2764 | 2764 | 2749 | 2749 |
| R ² | 0.674 | 0.825 | 0.647 | 0.824 |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.671 | 0.821 | 0.644 | 0.819 |

| | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | | |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | 0.164*** (0.010) | 0.043*** (0.010) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 0.103*** (0.011) | 0.051*** (0.014) | |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | |
| State Fixed Effects | | \checkmark | | \checkmark | |
| Observations | 2763 | 2763 | 2748 | 2748 | |
| R ² | 0.730 | 0.854 | 0.708 | 0.854 | |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.728 | 0.851 | 0.706 | 0.850 | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | | |
|--|----------------------------|--------------------|---------------------|------------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | 0.581*** (0.076) | 0.970** (0.414) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 1.480*** (0.430) | 2.653 (2.220) | |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | |
| State Fixed Effects | | \checkmark | | \checkmark | |
| Observations | 2578 | 2578 | 2566 | 2566 | |
| F statistic for weak identification | 101.846 | 7.300 | 11.059 | 1.511 | |
| Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 82.522 | 7.369 | 11.392 | 1.576 | |
| p-value of Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 0.000 | 0.007 | 0.001 | 0.209 | |
| Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 71.200 | | 56.203 | 25.501 | |
| p-value of Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 0.000 | | 0.000 | 0.000 | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | | |
|--|----------------------------|--------------------|---------------------|------------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | 0.484*** (0.066) | 0.683** (0.312) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 1.306*** (0.390) | 1.817 (1.571) | |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | |
| State Fixed Effects | | \checkmark | | \checkmark | |
| Observations | 2577 | 2577 | 2565 | 2565 | |
| F statistic for weak identification | 102.872 | 7.319 | 10.937 | 1.524 | |
| Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 83.136 | 7.393 | 11.249 | 1.588 | |
| p-value of Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 0.000 | 0.007 | 0.001 | 0.208 | |
| Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 61.190 | | 54.326 | 14.422 | |
| p-value of Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 0.000 | | 0.000 | 0.000 | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | | |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | 0.168*** (0.011) | 0.051*** (0.013) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 0.122*** (0.013) | 0.083*** (0.016) | |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | |
| State Fixed Effects | | \checkmark | | \checkmark | |
| Observations | 2148 | 2148 | 2136 | 2136 | |
| R ² | 0.727 | 0.843 | 0.702 | 0.843 | |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.725 | 0.839 | 0.700 | 0.838 | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | | |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | 0.166*** (0.011) | 0.055*** (0.012) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 0.104*** (0.012) | 0.073*** (0.015) | |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | |
| State Fixed Effects | | \checkmark | | \checkmark | |
| Observations | 2147 | 2147 | 2135 | 2135 | |
| R ² | 0.776 | 0.871 | 0.756 | 0.871 | |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.774 | 0.867 | 0.754 | 0.867 | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | | |
|--|----------------------------|--------------------|---------------------|------------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | 0.419*** (0.071) | 0.421** (0.191) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 1.066*** (0.353) | 1.125 (0.735) | |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | ~ | |
| State Fixed Effects | | \checkmark | | \checkmark | |
| Observations | 2051 | 2051 | 2040 | 2040 | |
| F statistic for weak identification | 105.294 | 13.969 | 8.549 | 3.113 | |
| Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 80.819 | 13.146 | 9.029 | 3.295 | |
| p-value of Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.003 | 0.069 | |
| Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 40.185 | | 32.332 | 9.370 | |
| p-value of Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 0.000 | | 0.000 | 0.002 | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | | |
|--|----------------------------|------------------|---------------------|------------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | 0.345*** (0.061) | 0.237 (0.145) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 0.926*** (0.314) | 0.642 (0.509) | |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | ~ | \checkmark | √ | |
| State Fixed Effects | | \checkmark | | \checkmark | |
| Observations | 2050 | 2050 | 2039 | 2039 | |
| F statistic for weak identification | 106.648 | 14.694 | 8.414 | 2.974 | |
| Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 81.733 | 13.800 | 8.881 | 3.147 | |
| p-value of Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.003 | 0.076 | |
| Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 34.067 | | 30.353 | 3.540 | |
| p-value of Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 0.000 | | 0.000 | 0.060 | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | | | |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | 0.165*** (0.010) | 0.133*** (0.009) | | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 0.121*** (0.011) | 0.101*** (0.010) | | |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | | |
| Region Fixed Effects | | \checkmark | | \checkmark | | |
| Observations | 2835 | 2835 | 2856 | 2856 | | |
| R ² | 0.672 | 0.708 | 0.646 | 0.693 | | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | | | |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | 0.160*** (0.010) | 0.128*** (0.009) | | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 0.099*** (0.011) | 0.079*** (0.010) | | |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | | |
| Region Fixed Effects | | \checkmark | | \checkmark | | |
| Observations | 2835 | 2835 | 2856 | 2856 | | |
| R ² | 0.727 | 0.753 | 0.706 | 0.743 | | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | | |
|-------------------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | 0.444*** (0.060) | 0.327*** (0.052) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 1.349*** (0.424) | 1.018*** (0.381) | |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | |
| Region Fixed Effects | | \checkmark | | \checkmark | |
| Observations | 2835 | 2835 | 2856 | 2856 | |
| F statistic for weak identification | 131.789 | 122.175 | 10.117 | 7.571 | |

| | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | | |
|-------------------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | 0.379*** (0.054) | 0.268*** (0.047) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | 1.227*** (0.394) | 0.924*** (0.358) | |
| Full Controls | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | \checkmark | |
| Region Fixed Effects | | \checkmark | | \checkmark | |
| Observations | 2835 | 2835 | 2856 | 2856 | |
| F statistic for weak identification | 132.087 | 121.317 | 10.065 | 7.394 | |

| | | Presidential Support Score | | | | | | |
|------------------------------|---------------------|----------------------------|-------------------|---------------------|-------------------|-------------------|--|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | 0.379*** (0.094) | 0.202** (0.094) | -0.206 (0.129) | | | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | | 0.367*** (0.118) | 0.164* (0.092) | -0.054 (0.185) | | |
| Full Controls | | \checkmark | \checkmark | | \checkmark | \checkmark | | |
| Congress-State Fixed Effects | | | \checkmark | | | \checkmark | | |
| Observations | 752 | 752 | 752 | 744 | 744 | 744 | | |
| \mathbb{R}^2 | 0.019 | 0.502 | 0.628 | 0.013 | 0.502 | 0.626 | | |
| Adjusted \mathbb{R}^2 | 0.018 | 0.488 | 0.596 | 0.012 | 0.488 | 0.594 | | |

| | Presidential Support Score | | |
|--|----------------------------|---------------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | 4.380*** (0.747) | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | 6.847*** (1.836) | |
| Observations | 752 | 744 | |
| F statistic for weak identification | 62.030 | 11.379 | |
| Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 19.260 | 11.799 | |
| p-value of Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 0.000 | 0.001 | |
| Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 88.636 | 88.408 | |
| p-value of Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | |









| | Perot's vote share in 1992 | | | | | | |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | 0.078*** (0.008) | 0.052*** (0.005) | 0.013*** (0.005) | | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | | 0.066*** (0.008) | 0.038*** (0.006) | 0.034*** (0.007) | |
| Full Controls | | \checkmark | \checkmark | | \checkmark | \checkmark | |
| State Fixed Effects | | | \checkmark | | | \checkmark | |
| Observations | 2761 | 2761 | 2761 | 2742 | 2742 | 2742 | |
| \mathbb{R}^2 | 0.042 | 0.625 | 0.812 | 0.023 | 0.603 | 0.814 | |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.042 | 0.622 | 0.808 | 0.023 | 0.601 | 0.810 | |

| | Perot's vote share in 1992 | | | | | |
|--|----------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|-------------------|---------------------|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| Populist vote share in 1894 | 0.218*** (0.022) | 0.217*** (0.024) | 0.359*** (0.097) | | | |
| Populist vote share in 1896 | | | | 0.711*** (0.158) | 1.147* (0.667) | 0.467*** (0.157) |
| Full Controls | | \checkmark | \checkmark | | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| State Fixed Effects | | | \checkmark | | | \checkmark |
| Observations | 2761 | 2761 | 2761 | 2742 | 2742 | 2742 |
| F statistic for weak identification | 230.203 | 121.166 | 17.785 | 17.980 | 2.574 | 8.555 |
| Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 143.966 | 104.727 | 17.645 | 18.208 | 2.640 | 9.043 |
| p-value of Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.104 | 0.003 |
| Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 78.116 | 75.722 | 31.399 | 84.996 | 48.637 | 18.931 |
| p-value of Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 |

| | | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | | | | | |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|----------------------------|--------------------|---------------------|---------------------|-------------------|--|--|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | | | |
| Weaver's vote share in 1892 | 0.167*** (0.018) | 0.160*** (0.012) | 0.034** (0.015) | | | | | | |
| Bryan's vote share in 1896 | | | | 0.054*** (0.013) | 0.093*** (0.010) | -0.009 (0.011) | | | |
| Full Controls | | \checkmark | \checkmark | | \checkmark | \checkmark | | | |
| State Fixed Effects | | | \checkmark | | | \checkmark | | | |
| Observations | 2955 | 2953 | 2953 | 2974 | 2972 | 2972 | | | |
| \mathbb{R}^2 | 0.032 | 0.662 | 0.826 | 0.006 | 0.649 | 0.824 | | | |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.032 | 0.660 | 0.822 | 0.006 | 0.646 | 0.820 | | | |

| | | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | | | | | |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|----------------------------|------------------|---------------------|---------------------|-------------------|--|--|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | | | |
| Weaver's vote share in 1892 | 0.155*** (0.019) | 0.133*** (0.012) | 0.015 (0.015) | | | | | | |
| Bryan's vote share in 1896 | | | | 0.067*** (0.014) | 0.101*** (0.009) | -0.007 (0.010) | | | |
| Full Controls | | \checkmark | \checkmark | | \checkmark | \checkmark | | | |
| State Fixed Effects | | | \checkmark | | | \checkmark | | | |
| Observations | 2954 | 2952 | 2952 | 2973 | 2971 | 2971 | | | |
| R ² | 0.026 | 0.718 | 0.854 | 0.009 | 0.717 | 0.854 | | | |
| Adjusted R ² | 0.026 | 0.716 | 0.851 | 0.008 | 0.715 | 0.851 | | | |

2SLS RESULTS: WEAVER (1892) AND BRYAN (1896)

| | Trump's vote share in 2016 | | | | | |
|--|----------------------------|--------------|--------------|---------|--------------|--------------|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) |
| Weaver's vote share in 1892 | 0.698*** | 0.578*** | 0.316*** | | | |
| | (0.094) | (0.098) | (0.099) | | | |
| Bryan's vote share in 1896 | | | | 2.432** | 1.703** | 1.512 |
| | | | | (1.024) | (0.739) | (1.223) |
| Full Controls | | \checkmark | \checkmark | | \checkmark | \checkmark |
| State Fixed Effects | | | \checkmark | | | \checkmark |
| Observations | 2955 | 2953 | 2953 | 2974 | 2972 | 2972 |
| F statistic for weak identification | 97.985 | 64.302 | 49.882 | 6.163 | 5.399 | 1.610 |
| Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 80.170 | 62.577 | 47.666 | 5.523 | 4.985 | 1.605 |
| p-value of Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.019 | 0.026 | 0.205 |
| Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 64.191 | 47.895 | 15.072 | 65.213 | 45.528 | 15.923 |
| p-value of Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 |

2SLS Results: Weaver (1892) and Bryan (1896)

| | Trump's vote share in 2020 | | | | | | |
|--|----------------------------|--------------|--------------|---------|--------------|--------------|--|
| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | |
| Weaver's vote share in 1892 | 0.723*** | 0.501*** | 0.208** | | | | |
| | (0.099) | (0.089) | (0.087) | | | | |
| Bryan's vote share in 1896 | | | | 2.575** | 1.500** | 1.003 | |
| | | | | (1.067) | (0.636) | (0.828) | |
| Full Controls | | \checkmark | \checkmark | | \checkmark | \checkmark | |
| State Fixed Effects | | | \checkmark | | | \checkmark | |
| Observations | 2954 | 2952 | 2952 | 2973 | 2971 | 2971 | |
| F statistic for weak identification | 97.875 | 64.611 | 49.835 | 6.195 | 5.580 | 1.698 | |
| Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 80.091 | 62.758 | 47.630 | 5.550 | 5.147 | 1.693 | |
| p-value of Kleibergen-Paap rk LM statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.018 | 0.023 | 0.193 | |
| Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 65.630 | 44.169 | 7.604 | 69.546 | 44.560 | 8.603 | |
| p-value of Stock-Wright LM S statistic | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.006 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.003 | |

ELECTION MAP (1892 HOUSE ELECTION)


ELECTION MAP (1894 HOUSE ELECTION)



ELECTION MAP (1896 HOUSE ELECTION)



ELECTION MAP (1898 HOUSE ELECTION)

